

**MINUTES
KNOXVILLE DOWNTOWN DESIGN REVIEW BOARD
MEETING OF JULY 20, 2016
SMALL ASSEMBLY ROOM
4:00 PM**

Board Member – Present	Board Membership
Brian Pittman	Downtown Resident Representative
Anne Wallace	City of Knoxville Representative
Mike Reynolds	MPC Representative (non-voting)
Marlene Davis	Urban Design Representative
Russ Watkins	Downtown Business/Development Representative
Kristina Wright	Downtown Resident Representative
Lorie Matthews	Historic Zoning Commission Representative
Chad Boetger	CBID Representative
Brandon Pace	AIA Representative
Mark Heinz	Downtown Business/Development Representative
Board Member - Absent	Board Membership
None	
Ex-officio & Staff Members	Department / Organization
Dori Caron	Metropolitan Planning Commission
Marty Clay	Plans Review and Inspections
Crista Cuccaro	City of Knoxville Law Department
Bill Lyons	City of Knoxville
Rick Emmett	City of Knoxville
Applicants & General Public	Affiliation
Chris Rea	Baskerville
James Rhoc	Baskerville
Faris Eid	Design Innovation Architects
Rick Dover	Dover Development
Jed Dance	Applicant
Rick Blackburn	Blackburn Development Corp.
Michael George	Blaine Construction
Brian Pierce	Michael Brady, Inc.

The meeting was called to order by Chair Russ Watkins. It was established that there was a quorum. Mr. Watkins asked that Board members and ex-officio members introduce themselves.

Action: A Motion was made by Anne Wallace and seconded by Brandon Pace to approve the June 15, 2016 Minutes. The Motion carried unanimously.

Certificates of Appropriateness:

Certificate No. 3-C-16-DT

210 W. Church Ave. - Dual Brand Hotel (Rick Blackburn)

Pre-development meeting: 2/8/2016

Discussion: Mike Reynolds briefly reviewed the submittal and the staff recommendation as the Applicant was prepared to present the project. He noted the main entrance to the hotel on Church Ave. has changed since the last submittal and has moved slightly towards the alley and the corner element, where the lobby is, has also changed slightly (corner of State St. and Church Ave). The overall exterior is essentially the same in design and materials. Mr. Reynolds noted one of the 2 conditions for approval in the staff recommendation denotes meeting the requirements of the American with Disabilities Act as there is no direct access for persons with disabilities to enter into the main entrance on Church Avenue without having to go through the drive aisle. The other condition reflects concern with regards to the State St.

garage access and its proximity to the James White Parkway ramp as well as how close the Church Ave. entrance is to the alley. Project architect Chris Rea was present and introduced project colleagues present. He began by describing the downtown location of the project with respect to placement/scale and massing, and then reviewed their proposal in detail describing design features and the reasoning behind them as well as touching on the hotel brand specific features. He noted they have included an ample amount of storefront at the corner of State St. and Church Ave. to allow the pedestrian to recognize that there is a lot of activity inside the building with a bar/lounge atmosphere there to lead people in. Mr. Rea stated he also felt that the rooftop courtyard will create interest for pedestrians. Mr. Rea noted they have not yet finalized their plan for exterior lighting/ illumination but it will be kept to a minimum, primarily being located on the interior side of the facility (inside the “L”). Mr. Rea clarified that the blade signs will be lit by directional downlight fixtures attached directly to the façade, 2 per sign, noting there will also be lighted bollards. He clarified that the horizontal [wall] signs will be internally (halo) lit. Mr. Rea noted the color of the mechanical louvers will match the EIFS adjacent to them. There was a brief discussion surrounding the view of the hotel from Gay Street. Anne Wallace suggested that externally lit signage facing the James White Parkway may be more appropriate further noting the Applicant has done a good job massing the building on what is a very difficult site. She stated she felt the project could be improved with regards to fenestration, light and breaking up some of the very large masses, in particular the stairwells which she felt were somewhat monolithic. She further felt that along the Cumberland Ave. façade the proposed windows at the third floor level could be carried further down the length of the façade. With regards to the Church Ave. elevation she noted she had concern with the height of the storefront with regards to the active pedestrian experience as well as the lack of a direct ADA compliant access from the sidewalk into the building other than through the motor vehicle access. Ms. Wallace then asked if the bar could be brought closer to the street to enhance that experience. Mr. Rea agreed with the request in theory however described their operational reasoning for keeping that corner as proposed, particularly why there is not a direct ADA access there. Mr. Rea noted it may be possible to include an accessible sidewalk at this location and asked if that would be acceptable. There was further discussion about access vs. safety as well as the blade signs with regards to the downtown residents living across the street. Mr. Rea noted that landscaping is not part of their scope of services but they would be engaging a landscape architect/ arborist for the trees. It was clarified that any landscaping/sidewalk work on public right of way would be brought back before the Board. Further discussion ensued regarding project design specifics.

Brandon Pace noted he did not have an issue with the proposed Church Ave. entrance as it is a very large building. A discussion then ensued surrounding the Church Ave. entrance and the proposed separation (of 6 ft.) from the sidewalk and could there be some compromise with this part of the project. Mr. Rea noted that the main level is 6 feet off the sidewalk to accommodate the ceiling height of the garage/parking and lowering it even a foot or two is a practical impossibility and then described those limitations. He noted they may be able to lower it a few inches. Mike Reynolds stated he was comfortable with the blade signs as proposed particularly due to their proposed height and type of lighting further noting he did not have an issue with the wall signs being internally lit as they do have actual street frontage, distinguishing them from previously approved externally lit signs directly facing the James White Parkway. He agrees with the idea of lowering the corner Church Avenue element but realizes it may not be possible to bring the separation down to 3 ft. and does not feel it would be that important in the overall scheme of the project. Mr. Rea again noted he felt they could make the Church Ave. sidewalk accessible with regards to the grades but noted concern with regards to the width and impact to the correct width of the entrance as well as not impacting the underground electrical vault.

Action: A Motion was made by Brandon Pace and seconded by Lorie Matthews to approve Certificate No. 3-C-16-DT per staff recommendation and its stated conditions: 1) Meeting all requirements of the City of Knoxville Department of Engineering, including but not limited to the design and location of the vehicular and service access points and internal drive aisles, and 2) Meeting the requirements of the Americans with Disabilities Act., as well as subject to the following additional condition 3) That an accessible access along Church Ave. be provided (not using the drive aisle). A brief discussion ensued regarding additional windows on Cumberland Ave. which Mr. Rea stated he felt would be possible. Mr. Pace amended his Motion to add a 4th condition that there be additional windows fronting Cumberland at the fitness center and employee breakroom areas (1st floor). Ms. Matthews seconded the amended Motion. The modified Motion carried unanimously.

Certificate No. 6-F-16-DT

530 Gay St. – Historic Farragut Hotel (Faris Eid)

Pre-development meeting: N/A

Discussion: Mike Reynolds reviewed the submittal and the staff recommendation. He noted that the Applicant had submitted a revised plan with respect to the storefront only which he noted he had shared with the Board by email which now shows the use of a more traditional storefront system as opposed to a NanaWall system, and that reflects comments from the National Park Service in the Applicant’s pursuit of historic tax credits for the project. He further noted the entire project is reviewed under much stricter NPS guidelines to obtain these tax credits. Faris Eid described the

components of the project: the rooftop renovations and patio addition, the canopies (designed to mimic the historic canopies), the storefront renovation for the front of the building on Gay Street and at the corner and the signage. Relative to the rooftop work he noted they studied the sightlines of the rooftop and they have identified that nothing they propose to have on the roof will be visible from Gay St. or Clinch Ave. He noted the proposed signage facing James White Parkway is mandated by the hotel operators. He noted the blade sign as proposed will not work and distributed what they now propose. Rick Dover noted the project is contingent on obtaining historic tax credits and including the signage proposed today they have been approved for tax credits, both part 1 and part 2. Mr. Eid clarified that the replicated pilaster would be modeled after the existing one on Clinch Ave. and would be constructed using EFIS. It was clarified that this use of EIFS was approved as part of Part 2 of the tax credit approval. There was a brief discussion surrounding window replacement and that the HVAC systems will all be internal. Further discussion ensued regarding the proposed signage and there was consensus to bring the sign package before the Board at a later date.

Action: A Motion was made by Anne Wallace and seconded by Mark Heinz to approve Certificate No. 6-F-16-DT as submitted not including the sign package and subject to the following condition: 1) The sign package will come back before the Board for approval. The Motion carried unanimously.

Certificate No. 7-B-16-DT

430 S. Gay St. – Five Restaurant Sign (Allen Sign Co.)

Pre-development meeting: N/A

Discussion: Mike Reynolds reviewed the submittal and the staff recommendation. The Applicant was not present. There was no discussion.

Action: A Motion was made by Anne Wallace and seconded by Brandon Pace to approve Certificate No. 7-B-16-DT as submitted per staff recommendation. The Motion carried unanimously.

Certificate No. 7-C-16-DT

301 State St. – Cal Johnson Building (Jed Dance)

Pre-development meeting: N/A

Discussion: Mike Reynolds reviewed the submittal and the staff recommendation. Bill Lyons stated the City's strong support for the Board moving forward with this application today as requested by the Applicant. Project architect Brian Pierce was present and noted that at this time they are mainly trying to preserve the building and basically dry the building in and as of yet do not have any proposed uses for it. There was a discussion surrounding the proposed replacement windows and it was noted that aluminum clad windows for this building were appropriate and Mr. Pierce stated that they would go back with windows that match the existing, original windows in the alley as closely as they can. He stated they appear to be double-hung windows.

Action: A Motion was made by Anne Wallace and seconded by Brian Pittman to approve Certificate No. 7-C-16-DT subject to the following conditions: 1) Brick cleaning and mortar repair be completed in accordance with the recommendations of Preservation Brief #1 (The Cleaning and Waterproof Coating of Masonry Buildings) and Preservation Brief #2 (Repointing Mortar Joints in Historic Masonry Buildings) from the National Park Service, per staff recommendation. There was further discussion surrounding the new storefront system with doors that will swing out onto the sidewalk. Mr. Peirce stated they were also aware that they will need to address the new sidewalk at this location as well. Additionally it was clarified that with an approval today the Applicant has a 3 year vested period within which to act on the Certificate or to come back before this body for any amendments/changes to the Certificate. Ms. Wallace amended her Motion to include the understanding that any Amendments to this Certificate of Appropriateness during the vested period (3 years) for this approval be brought back before the Board for approval. The amended Motion was seconded by Brian Pittman. There was further discussion surrounding what happens at the storefront level including the canopy. Ms. Wallace further amended her Motion to exclude the storefront and canopy from the approval and adding that the final storefront and canopy design be brought back before the Board with more detail for approval. The modified Motion was seconded by Brian Pittman. The modified Motion carried unanimously.

Certificate No. 7-D-16-DT

516 W. Jackson Ave. – Knox Whiskey Works (Robin Easter Design)

Pre-development meeting: N/A

Brandon Pace recused himself.

Draft Minutes – July 20, 2016

Downtown Design Review Board

Discussion: Mike Reynolds reviewed the submittal and the staff recommendation. Robin Easter was present and described their reasoning behind their design. She noted they would be OK with reducing the square footage of the sign on the door (Distillery) but had concern about reducing the side signage (Knox Whiskey Works). She showed the Board members a rendering of the signage that reflected the signage at 10%. Ms. Easter noted they designed the sign to be more in keeping with the neighborhood and the scale of the existing buildings and their signage. There was a brief discussion surrounding the sign ordinance which has a 10% coverage rule. Chad Boetger stated he felt the signage as proposed was more in keeping with the neighborhood, looking more like a mural than a sign. Other Board members shared their viewpoints both in favor of and not in favor of adhering to the 10% rule.

Action: A Motion was made by Chad Boetger and seconded by Mark Heinz to approve Certificate 7-D-16-DT as submitted, with the larger signs on both the roll up door and the side of the building as they are more in keeping with the spirit of the signs that have been painted on the sides of buildings in the Warehouse District. Crista Cuccaro clarified that if the Board moves to approve the larger (proposed) signs as they it exceed the sign ordinance the application will need to go before the Board of Zoning Appeals. She noted the Applicant will need to demonstrate to the BZA a hardship and some sort of demonstration that there is a sufficient basis to grant something that exceeds the zoning or sign code and noted she wanted the Applicant to understand that approval of the larger signs would require an additional approval (BZA). Ms. Easter stated she would be OK with going before the BZA and asked for clarification on her steps should she not receive approval from the BZA. **Mr. Boetger amended his Motion to approve either the smaller signage package recommended by staff (attached/painted signs to be no more than that allowed by the sign ordinance, approximately 70 square feet), or the large signage package as submitted by the applicant (approximately 237.625 square feet for new painted signs only), reiterating that the larger sign is the preference on both the overhead door and the side of the building because it is in keeping with the Warehouse District and the precedent set historically by the larger signs painted on the sides of the buildings [in the Warehouse District]. The Amended Motion was seconded by Mark Heinz.** It was clarified that the 10% rule is for the entire sign package for a building. **Board Chair Watkins called for a vote on the floor. The amended Motion carried unanimously.**

Staff Report:

Mike Reynolds reviewed the Level 1 Certificates approves since the last meeting.

Nomination for Chair and Vice Chair.

Mike Reynolds noted we can take nomination today for a vote in August. The nominations would not close until the August meeting.

Chad Boetger nominated Russ Watkins for Chair and Lorie Matthews for Vice Chair.
Mark Heinz seconded the nominations.

Tabled:

File No. 2-A-16-DT

100 N. Central Street – Project: Lonesome Dove

A Motion was made by Brandon Pace and seconded by Chad Boetger to adjourn the meeting. The Motion carried unanimously and the meeting was adjourned.