

MINUTES
KNOXVILLE DOWNTOWN DESIGN REVIEW BOARD
MEETING OF FEBRUARY 20, 2013
SMALL ASSEMBLY ROOM
4:00 P.M.

<i>Bob Alcorn</i>	Architect, Resident Representative (Arrived late)
<i>Chad Boetger</i>	Downtown Resident/Architect
<i>Kim Henry</i>	APA Representative
<i>Lori Matthews</i>	Historic Zoning Commission
<i>Joe Petre</i>	Business Representative
<i>Anne Wallace</i>	City of Knoxville
Rick Emmett	City of Knoxville
Jeff Johnson	McCarthy Holsaple McCarthy Architects
Camden Turner	Benchmark Development, LLC
Mike Reynolds	MPC

The meeting was called to order by Chair Kim Henry. It was established that there was a quorum. Attendees were asked to sign in. Board members present are shown in italics. Rick Emmett, City of Knoxville, was recognized.

Action: A Motion was made by Anne Wallace and seconded by Chad Boetger to approve the January 16, 2013 Minutes. The Motion carried unanimously.

Certificates of Appropriateness:

Certificate No. 11-B-12-DT

100 S Broadway – 100 S Broadway (John L. Sanders)
Pre-development – N/A

Description of Work

This property has a plan approved (Certificate 8-A-10-DT) to renovate the structure and grounds. This proposal will supersede the previous approval.

The demolition plans for the building are shown on sheets AD1.1, AD 2.0 and AD 2.1, which includes the demolition/removal of the following: storefront, windows, doors, ADA ramp, surface mounted lights under the canopy and roof overhangs, and expanding two window openings and creating a new opening on the north elevation to create three new doorways.

Portions of the impervious (concrete/asphalt) area will be removed for landscaping and will be edged with curbing (see sheet AS1.0). The existing bollards are to be removed and removal locations patched. Parking is not required in the C-2 (central business) district but there will be 16 parking spaces incorporated into the site. There will be a new 42 inch fence along the sidewalk as shown in sheet AS1.0 and example images of the proposed fence are attached.

A new aluminum framed storefront will be installed on the southeast elevation with matching aluminum framed windows and doors on the north elevation (see sheets A1.0, A2.0, A2.1 and A2.2). All new glass

well be clear.

The existing garage doors on the east elevation will remain. On the south elevation, the existing restroom doors and frames will be replaced with new hollow metal doors and frames. Above the garage doors and storefront, corrugated metal siding with exposed fasteners will be installed.

The area in front of the garage doors and under the canopy will have a new slab on grade patio to match the finished floor elevation of the building (see sheet A1.0). The patio areas will have a 36 inch metal railing at the edge (see sheets A1.0, A2.0, A2.1 and A2.2). The railing will either be painted steel, painted aluminum or wrought iron.

The existing perimeter lighting on the canopy will be restored and returned to working condition (see sheet A2.0). New lighting will be installed over the two bathroom doors on the south elevation and over the three new doors on the north elevation.

New stairs are proposed on the north end of the site, where existing grown over stairs exist, and will connect the sidewalk with the flat upper portion of the site (see sheets AS1.0 and AS2.0). The stairs will be made of wood and have concrete landings and painted steel railings.

Staff Comments

Within Section 2 of the guidelines, this property is in the Warehouse District, which includes all of Jackson Ave and the majority of the Old City. The original structures in this district are typical of most of downtown with buildings being multi-story and built at the sidewalk edge. This building is single story, sits well back from the sidewalk and is auto oriented. The guidelines are intended to enhance the pedestrian experience along the public right-of-way and protect historic assets, so in this case the guidelines will need to be interpreted to make an auto oriented property as pedestrian friendly as possible.

Section 1.A.3d of the guidelines states, "Screen surface lots, where they abut a public sidewalk, with decorative walls, fencing and landscaping". This plan proposes a thin landscaping area between the parking lot and the sidewalk along Broadway and proposes a fence for the length of the Broadway frontage and separating the parking and sidewalk along Jackson Avenue.

Section 1.A.3e of the guidelines states, "Distribute shade trees within surface lots at a ratio of 1 tree per 8 parking spaces. Trees may be planted in wells between spaces". This proposal incorporates 16 surface parking spaces, so two shade trees are recommended by the guidelines.

Staff Recommendation

APPROVE Certificate 11-B-12-DT with the following condition: Two shade trees must be planted either in landscaping islands in the parking lot, or adjacent to the parking lot.

NOTE: The applicant is requesting the application be Tabled.

Discussion: The Applicant has requested the Item be tabled. It was clarified that tabling means the Item will not come back on the Agenda until the Applicant requests it be placed back on. The Applicant would appear at a meeting to request the Item be taken off the table and then it would be heard at the following meeting.

Action: A Motion was made by Chad Boetger and seconded by Lorie Matthews to table this Item. The Motion carried unanimously.

Certificate No. 2-A-13-DT

207 W Church St - Elliott Building (Benchmark Development, LLC) Pre-development – N/A

Description of Work

Modify the western entrance by removing the existing non-historic door to allow a larger landing at the top of the stairs. The historic door framing with sidelights and transoms will remain. The rear wall of the vestibule that will be visible from the street will have wood paneling with a complimentary design to the front door framing.

Staff Comments

This building is in the Gay Street Commercial Historic District on the National Register. The proposed modification is to remove a non-historic element. The removal of the door does not compromise the historic integrity of the structure and an appropriate door could be installed at a later date.

Staff Recommendation

APPROVE Certificate 2-A-13-DT as submitted.

Discussion: The Applicant has two previous approvals from the Board (2008 and 2009) and this is a modification to those approvals. The entry will remain the same except for removal of the non-historic door and will leave that doorway area open, finishing out the landing area with doors to either side and mail receptacles.

Action: A Motion was made by Joe Petre and seconded by Lorie Matthews to approve the Certificate as submitted per staff recommendation. The Motion carried unanimously.

NOTE: Bob Alcorn joined the Board after the discussion for certificate 2-A-13-DT and before the discussion began for certificate 2-B-13-DT.

Certificate No. 2-B-13-DT

430 S Gay St - Tailor Lofts (430 Gay Street, LLC)
Pre-development – N/A

Description of Work

Rehabilitate the exterior of the building, including a new storefront and windows, and a new rooftop deck.

West elevation, facing Gay Street (see Sheets A201 and A202) - 1) Patch, repair, clean and repoint the existing unpainted brick, 2) Patch, repair and clean existing cornice above the storefront and top of building, 3) Replace all windows with new wood framed windows that match the existing windows, 4) Restore the existing transoms, 5) Install new wood trimmed storefront with a recessed main entry and an entrance for the residential units flush with the façade. The bulkhead will be brick and 1-foot 6 inches tall. The recessed entrance has angled sides that match that of the existing transom above, 6) Install new iron awning and support brackets between the two glass designs of the transom, 7) Install a metal 2 square foot non-illuminated sign next to the residential entrance.

South elevation, facing Union Avenue (see Sheets A201, A202 and A105) - 1) Complete the work as described for the West elevation for the portion of the façade with same design and unpainted brick, 2) Patch, repair, clean, repoint and repaint the existing painted brick, 3) Replace all windows with new wood framed windows that match the existing windows, 4) Create an opening and install one new window on fourth floor (the short window without an arch), 5) On the first floor (basement/alley level), infill three existing door openings along the sidewalk with new brick to match the existing size, joints and spacing, and

install new wood framed windows for all window openings to match the muntin pattern of the similar adjacent windows. In addition, install exhaust and dryer vents, 6) Reduce the scale of the existing promenade screen and install a new metal guardrail along the promenade roof edge, 7) Remove the existing metal fire escape.

East elevation, facing alley (see Sheet A201) - 1) Patch, repair, clean, repoint and repaint the existing painted brick, 2) Replace all windows with new wood framed windows that match the existing windows, 3) Create one new door opening for both the third and fourth floor by removing the brick below the middle windows down to the floor level. Install new french doors and metal railing attached inside masonry opening, 4) Install new stair and loading dock along alley, 5) Remove the existing metal fire escape and patch promenade roof.

Roof additions (see Sheets A201 and A105) - 1) Install two new stair towers and one new elevator shaft. These will have a stucco finish with integral coloring to match adjacent brick wall. The windows in the western stair tower will have a pre-finished metal frame and fixed glass, 2) Install new rooftop deck near the west elevation with painted steel railings and composite decking and screen wall.

Staff Comments

This building is in the Gay Street Commercial Historic District on the National Register so the board should consider the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation (page 47 of the guidelines) when approving exterior alterations. The applicant has indicated that they will be seeking historic tax credits so the proposed work will be reviewed by the Tennessee Historical Commission and the National Park Service for conformity with their standards. If the owner decides not to seek historic tax credits, however, the board's approval of appropriateness will be the only review.

The large windows on the second floor (former Arby's space) are currently broken into two windows with a recessed panel separating them. The applicant states that they believe these were originally one window and later changed to create a dropped ceiling for a mezzanine. The current design has its own historic significance and could be the required design by the National Park Service for the tax credits. The staff recommendation would allow either window configuration to be installed so the applicant would not need to modify their approval.

Historic windows are encouraged to be repaired and reused when possible. The applicant states that the large single pane glass would create an environmental problem inside and the windows are in come to less than 18 inches to the floor and are not tempered. Left as is they are a safety hazard. Some of these issues could be resolved by properly refurbishing the windows, caulking and adding internal storm windows. Staff, however, feels that the replacement of these windows may be warranted.

The rooftop deck, railing, screen wall and associated stair tower is designed to no be visible from the sidewalk at a minimum from the corner opposite the building's corner (Union Avenue and Gay Street).

The large projecting signs shown in the plans on the Gay Street and Union Avenue corner of the building are not intended for approval as part of this submission. Once a tenant is secured for the commercial space a sign package will be proposed for approval.

There are a few elements of the proposal that will need further approval from the City: all modifications to the promenade structure, any doors that swing out over the public right-of-way and the rear loading dock and stair that extends into the alley

Staff Recommendation

APPROVE Certificate 2-B-13-DT with the following conditions: 1) Clean and repoint brick in accordance with the National Park Service's Preservation Brief #1 (Assessing Cleaning and Water-Repellent Treatments

for Historic Masonry Buildings) and #2 (Repointing Mortar Joints in Historic Masonry Buildings), 2) The large second story windows along Union Avenue can be replaced with new windows as proposed, or to match the existing split configuration in-kind.

Discussion: Joe Petre recused himself. Mike Reynolds reviewed the description of work. The look of the building will be retained and they will repoint and repaint the brick and replace all of the windows with matching wooden windows. On the Union Avenue second story, the Applicant thinks the original opening was one large widow as opposed to the two there now. The Union Avenue side would also have a new window installed on the top floor. On the sidewalk level in the basement, the existing doorways will be turned into windows and they will leave only one doorway. The largest change would be to the storefront itself. The historic transoms will be retained and repaired as needed. The storefront will be new with a wooden frame and clear glass, a brick bulkhead and metal canopy/awning to protect the lower transom from weather. There will be signage on the ground floor but once a tenant is retained they will come back before the Board for approval for a signage package. The changes to the promenade roof will require approval from City Council. The rooftop deck is designed to not be visible from the Union/Gay Street corner. The stair tower will be stuccoed with a color to match the brick. The deck will have a metal railing. He then reviewed the staff recommendation which is approval with multiple conditions.

Jeff Johnson, McCarthy Holsaple McCarthy Architects, pointed out that with regards to the windows, what they are proposing to replace are just the sashes, all of the existing wood trim on the sills and the rest of the building will be patched and restored.

Joe Petre, owner representative, noted that the renderings reflect what they feel was more true to the original building. He further noted they do not plan on actually doing any signs themselves. He also stated they do not plan on pursuing balconies on the rear of the building. They do, however, still want to convert the middle windows to French doors.

Action: A Motion was made by Bob Alcorn and seconded by Lorie Matthews to approve this application per staff recommendation with conditions. The Motion carried unanimously.

Staff Report: There were no staff reports.

Other Business:

Discussion of potential amendments to the Administrative Rules and Procedures and zoning overlay district.

Discussion: There is state legislation that allows some electronic voting but only when there is a necessity and there is no practical means to gather together. Our meetings are public and such any communication/voting on an Item would need to be public. An additional parameter than once an Application is deemed compete we are required to take action on it within a specific time period. In regards to tabling, the current language allows for the Board to table an Item without the Applicant requesting it. Mike Reynolds stated that it may be best practice to let the Applicant know that their Item may well be tabled at a following meeting. He also noted that the Board can explore adding “deny without prejudice” to its administrative rules and procedures, which allows an Applicant to come back the next month with the exact application as opposed to having to wait a year to reapply. There was discussion about whether not this Board was structured to be able to do that. Consensus was that with the option of being able to table an Item, the Board is positioned to prevent extensive postponements.

Action: A Motion was made by Anne Wallace and seconded by Bob Alcorn to adjourn.