

**MINUTES  
KNOXVILLE DOWNTOWN DESIGN REVIEW BOARD  
MEETING OF MAY 19, 2010  
SMALL ASSEMBLY ROOM**

**Present:**

*Kim Henry  
David Dewhirst  
Anne Wallace  
John Sanders  
Joe Petre  
Bob Alcorn  
Jeffrey Nash  
Mark Donaldson  
Steve King  
Tom Reynolds  
Ollantay Corujo  
Sam McKamey  
David Hutchins  
Rick Burnett  
Gale Honeycutt  
Mike Reynolds  
Charlotte West*

**Organization:**

*APA Representative  
Dewhirst Properties  
City of Knoxville  
AIA Representative  
Business Representative  
Downtown Resident  
CBID  
MPC  
City Engineering  
City of Knoxville  
Applicant  
Property Owner  
Applicant  
Signco  
Business Owner  
MPC  
MPC*

Kim Henry, Chair, called the meeting to order. There was a quorum present, and they introduced themselves. Board members present are shown in italics.

**A motion was made by Joe Petre and seconded by Anne Wallace to approve the April 21 minutes as revised. The motion carried unanimously.**

Kim Henry turned the meeting over to Joe Petre, Vice Chair.

**Certificates of Appropriateness:**

***Certificate No. 3-C-10-DT***

137 S Gay St - Ollantay's Havana Nights (Ollantay Corujo)  
Pre-development meeting: 3/12/2010

**Description of Work**

This proposal is for the modification of an existing storefront. There was damage to the existing storefront which required the removal of the existing storefront glass and copper framing. Subsequently, during the reconstruction of the sidewalk in front of the building, the building structure below the entryway began to fail which required the removal of the tile and mortar bed. The damage to the storefront can be seen in the attached images and will most likely require the removal of the storefront from the sidewalk to the front door to fix the structural issues.

The applicant proposes to remove the remaining portions of the storefront and replace it with a similar storefront (see attached drawings). This proposal will shorten the recessed entry from a depth of approximately 12 feet, to 6 feet 2 inches. The bulkhead will be 1 foot 6 inches and have raised panels. The floor elevation of the new storefront will all be at the same level as the first floor of the building; the current storefront casings have a raised floor. It is anticipated that the storefront glass will be held in place using remnants of the copper framing that was used in the existing storefront. The existing door and sidelights will be reused and repositioned. The new tile entry will mimic the tile entry that was damaged and removed.

### **Staff Comments**

Section 1.C.2 states that bulkheads should be 18-24 inches tall and have clear storefront windows, and the storefronts should be restored and maintained as they were originally. Section 1.C.3 states that entrances should be recessed.

Due to the structural issues that need to be resolved, the removal of the existing storefront is necessary. This storefront is most likely not original to the building so a new storefront design that is complimentary to the building style is appropriate.

### **Staff Recommendation**

APPROVE Certificate 3-C-10-DT subject to the following conditions: 1) The storefront be made of wood, 2) The storefront glass be clear, and 3) The tile entry should be similar in style as the one that was removed.

Ollantay Corujo, 137 S. Gay Street, stated there is a new picture of the proposed tile to be used, which as included in the packet. He said the proposed tile design is similar to the tile design that was found under the storefront casings, which is not the same as the tile design that was removed from the entryway. Sam McKamey stated that he is the owner of the building. John Sanders wants them to use the tile design as that was just removed, not the tile design they proposed.

Sam McKamy asked Mike Reynolds what he meant by staff recommendation number one, “the storefront be made of wood.” Mike Reynolds stated that this means that the trim of the storefront must be made of wood, and the structure of the storefront can be made out of any material that is required by code, such as metal. Tom Reynolds stated that this property is in the fire district, which means that any structural component of a storefront has to be noncombustible and this structure can be wrapped in wood.

David Dewhirst asked if the original door will be reused. Sam McKamy stated that the original door and sidelights will be reused.

Tom Reynolds stated that the door should swing out. The diagram shows the door swinging in and if there are going to be over 50 people inside, the door has to swing out.

**A motion was made by Anne Wallace and seconded by Bob Alcorn to approve the staff recommendation with the following amendments: 1) The storefront kick plates be made of wood and the rest of storefront be made of structural metal and wrapped in wood, 2) Use the original tile design with the square checker board border with white hexagonal tile infill (not including the letters inlaid with tile), and 3) That the storefront structural vertical elements align with the vertical elements in the storefront transom. The motion**

**passed unanimously with Kim Henry recusing.**

Kim Henry presiding.

***Certificate No. 5-B-10-DT***

506 S Gay St. - Nama (Hutchins Associates P.C.)

Pre-development meeting: N/A

**Description of Work**

This proposal is for new signs and awnings for the retail space adjacent to the Regal Theater ticket office and the pedestrian walkway.

The proposed projecting signs will be located on the front façade and on the side of building along the pedestrian walkway (see attached drawings). The sign on the front façade will have 3 faces, each face being 3 feet 3 inches wide and 9 feet 3 inches tall (30 sq.ft.), and will be 14 feet above the sidewalk. The sign in the pedestrian walkway will have 2 faces, each face being 2 feet 9 inches wide and 8 feet tall (22 sq.ft.), and will be 14 feet 6 inches above the walkway. The projecting signs will be made of metal and will have two layers on each face. The silver area with the name "Nama" will be raised 1.5 inches from the red background. The Nama letters will be made of acrylic and will be pushed through the routed aluminum panel .5 inches. The letters will be internally illuminated with LED's or fluorescent lamps. The fish logo will be made of .25 inch plate aluminum. The raised silver panel will have red LED's or neon around the top and right side for halo lighting.

There are awnings proposed for the first and second floor of the front façade (see attached drawings). The awning material will be fabric. The first floor awning will extend 9 feet 6 inches from the façade and maintain a clear height with the sidewalk of 9 feet. This awning will have posts that extend to the sidewalk. There will be a 36 inch metal railing with metal mesh screen panels that infill between the awning posts to enclose the proposed outdoor seating. There will be text and images on the valence of the awning that are 5 inches tall. The second floor awnings are rounded will be placed over the three second story windows. They will extend 3 feet 5 inches from the façade and will be 4 feet tall by 7 feet 8 inches wide. There will be text and images on the valences that are 6 inches tall.

**Staff Comments**

Section 1.C.7 states that projecting signs shall not be greater than 9 square feet (unless approved by the Board); and do not light signs internally. Signs that have only allow light to penetrate the letters and have halo lighting have been deemed appropriate in most cases in the past and staff feels this is an appropriate location for such illumination because of the proximity to the movie theater. The projecting sign on the front of the building is in a location that may warrant a larger size than the maximum 9 square feet because of its proximity of the movie theater. The Board had previously approved a sign for this same location at 17.25 square feet and approved a sign for couple blocks away at 16 square feet.

Article 2 of the Knoxville Zoning Ordinance defines awning and canopy signs as "a sign that is printed or sewn onto durable material and hung over doorways and storefronts that provide shelter and shade for pedestrians, which shall be limited to street level businesses". This is interpreted to mean that signs on awnings shall be limited to the ground floor, which means the signs on second floor awnings are not allowed.

City Engineering has expressed that they do not favor having awning posts attached to the public sidewalk. Staff agrees with this and suggests removing the posts from the plan.

### **Staff Recommendation**

APPROVE Certificate 5-B-10-DT subject to the following conditions: 1) The first floor awning must not have posts that extend to the sidewalk, 2) No signs or images on the second story awnings, 3) The projecting sign on the front façade shall only have two sides and be a size that is appropriate for the location, and 4) The projecting sign in the pedestrian walkway shall be no more than 9 square feet.

Mike Reynolds explained the staff recommendations. He stated that City Engineering does not want awnings to have posts on the sidewalk; awning signs by definition are meant to be for first floor tenants only which is interpreted to mean that awning signs are only allowed on first floor awnings; and, the projecting sign on the front of the building should be in character with its surrounding and, for reference, the board approved a 17.25 square foot sign for the same location which was never installed; and, the projecting sign in the pedestrian pathway should not be over 9 square feet because of the limited visibility of the sign to only those that are in the pedestrian pathway.

David Hutchins, architect for project, does not agree with all the recommendations. The city owns the pathway down the side. They will have to get an easement through the Law Department. Anne Wallace stated that the city has to decide if the space they want to use for outdoor seating is usable space. This board does not review the use of the city property, but does review the design of the awning and railings.

Tom Reynolds stated there are two categories for them to gain use of the Gay Street and pedestrian pathway. Gay Street is a right-of-way, and the pedestrian pathway is private city property. To gain use of Gay Street is different from gaining use in the pedestrian pathway. They will have to get easements to be able to use the pathway and may have to get permission on Gay Street for the awning easements. The board has to approve the awnings and signs and how the streetscape looks. To get a permit for the awnings, the owner will still have to get easements from the city for the use of the sidewalk and pathway.

Steve King from City Engineering stated he will not approve awning posts on the sidewalk.

Mr. Hutchins stated that the sidewalk seating on Gay Street will be raised two or three inches and will be made equal to the height of the front door. The door is the highest point in the sidewalk. Steve King stated that what they are building to make the sidewalk level would have to go to City Council for approval.

Kim Henry suggested we review one item at a time to make it easier to approve this complicated proposal. Mike Reynolds recommended a smaller sign be installed in the pedestrian pathway and a two-sided sign on the front along Gay Street. Mr. Hutchins stated that the owner feels the sign in the pedestrian pathway should be bigger than 9 square feet. The owner wants to use the same proportion like he has at another location.

Joe Petre stated that he counted more than 20 individual sign elements for approval, including the graphics on the awnings.

Rick Burnett, Signco, stated he thought Gridiron's sign was approved at 17 square feet. The sign in the pedestrian pathway is 22 square feet. John Sanders added that the pedestrian pathway sign should be bigger than the one in front. Anne Wallace responded that you will see the sign from

the State Street garage and not from Gay Street, and because it is a pedestrian space, it should not be big. Honeycutt suggested they could take the name off the awnings in the pedestrian pathway if they could keep the projecting signs the size they proposed.

Bob Alcorn likes the three-part sign along Gay Street but thinks it should be smaller. Gale Honeycutt, owner of Nama, stated that they are next to an 82 square foot sign for the cinema, which will dwarf his sign. Mr. Honeycutt asked if the board could approve the sign along Gay Street at the request size because it is the most important one. They want to be seen beside the cinema. They will agree to reduce the projecting sign in pedestrian pathway.

**A motion was made by Bob Alcorn and seconded by John Sanders to approve the projecting sign in the pedestrian pathway at 15 square feet, using the same proportions as the proposed sign; to approve the three-sided projecting sign along Gay Street reduced to 3 feet wide x 8 feet 3 inches tall; to approve with the awning signs on the first floor awnings; and to approve the internal illumination on the two projecting signs. The motion carried unanimously.**

**A motion was made by John Sanders and seconded by Anne Wallace to approve the awning as submitted in the pedestrian pathway and not approve the awnings on Gay Street. The applicant must resubmit the drawings for the awnings along Gay Street (first and second floor) that will meet the requirements of City Engineering and the Law Department. Motion carried unanimously.**

**A motion was made by John Sanders and seconded by David Dewhirst to amend the motion to clarify that the signs and awnings that were approved, are done so in accordance with the presented drawings labeled SK-1 and SK-2, dated 4/26/2010 . The amended motion carried unanimously.**

The meeting was suspended until Friday, May 21 at 1 p.m. in the Small Assembly Room, if available, to continue the meeting.

The meeting resumed Friday, May 21 at 1 p.m. in the Small Assembly Room, with the following present at the meeting: Board – Bob Alcorn, Kim Henry, Mike Reynolds, Jeffrey Nash, Joe Petre, Anne Wallace, John Sanders, and David Dewhirst; Ex-officio – Tom Reynolds and Steve King; Others – Gale Honeycutt and David Hutchins.

David Hutchins past out a revised plan for the first and second floor awnings along Gay Street and explained the changes. The first floor awning now has four support brackets that are evenly spaced across the front façade. The brackets that attach to the front façade have the Nama logo on the sides of the brackets. The second floor awnings now extend 1 foot from the front façade and are approximately 47 inches tall by 82 inches wide.

Jeffrey Nash asked if the property owners know that you will be penetrating the façade to anchor the brackets. Gale Honeycutt said that the owners know that they will be penetrating the façade to attach the projecting sign, so they are aware that there will need to be some penetration of the front façade for support brackets as part of their renovations of the space.

Jeffrey Nash asked if the awning is going to be retractable or a permanent fixture. David Hutchins stated that it will be a permanent fixture.

Joe Petre stated that the projecting sign is on a bracket that extends the sign 1 foot off the façade, which will extend the sign beyond proposed second story awnings.

Jeffrey Nash asked if the applicant picked a 1 foot extension from the facade for the sign for any particular reason, did they consider an extension further from the façade? David Hutchins

explained that they did consider an extension greater than 1 foot but then the bracketing for the sign becomes more complicated and the sign manufacturer suggested not extending it further than 1 foot.

Mike Reynolds asked Tom Reynolds if the board needs to approve the projecting sign extending one foot from the façade since their original approval for the sign showed it being against or very close to the façade? Tom asked if the sign size has changed. David Hutchins stated that the revised drawing shows the approved sign size. Tom Reynolds stated that the board would not need to reapprove the sign bracket.

Mike Reynolds stated that when he talked to the awning company about the material of the awning, they stated it would be fabric, this plan states the material is Ferrari vinyl, what is the material that is proposed? Gale Honeycutt explained that since the first floor awning has so little slope, the awning company suggested a vinyl because there will be a greater chance of water pooling on the awning with fabric (canvas). Kim Henry asked if the vinyl will have a matte finish. Gale Honeycutt said yes it will be a matte finish.

Joe Petre asked if the seating are they are proposing meets all city requirements. Mike Reynolds stated that the board does not need to address those issues, we just need to determine if the design is appropriate. There has only been one other instance where the board has made a determination of appropriateness for a railing and that was for Le Parigo; their railing was attached to a deck they built on a public sidewalk. In this case, we have the information available to us and if they board feels that the design is appropriate, it should make a determination to clarify any questions later when they ask for permits. If the design needs to be changed, staff can make the determination if it is appropriate or needs to come back to the board.

**A motion was made by Joe Petre and seconded by Anne Wallace to approve the awnings and railing as shown on sheet SK-4, dated 5/21/2010.**

Steve King asked if the awning extends more than 2/3 of the sidewalk width. Tom Reynolds stated that the sidewalk width is 16 feet 3 inches to the curb, which means the awning is less than 2/3 the width of the sidewalk.

Steve King asked if the board was approving the leveling of the sidewalk. Kim Henry said no, that is up to the city to approve.

**The motion carried unanimously.**

### **Staff Report:**

Mike Reynolds reviewed the staff approvals.

Staff Approvals:

- 4-B-10-DT – Projecting sign for The French Market (6 sq.ft.)
- 5-A-10-DT – New rooftop sign for the First Tennessee Tower

### **Other Business:**

Anne Wallace stated that the rezoning of World's Fair Park has passed City Council and is now zoned C-2/D-1.

There was no other business and the meeting was adjourned.