

MINUTES
KNOXVILLE DOWNTOWN DESIGN REVIEW BOARD
MEETING OF AUGUST 18, 2010
SMALL ASSEMBLY ROOM

Present:

Kim Henry
Chad Boetger
Anne Wallace
John Sanders
Joe Petre
Carol Montgomery
Jeffrey Nash
David Dewhirst
Natalie Lester
Josh Flory
Rafik Hanna
JaMichael McGoy
Grant Asfour
Daniel Odle
Steve King
Mike Reynolds
Charlotte West

Organization:

APA Representative
Downtown Resident
City of Knoxville
AIA Representative
Business Representative
Historic Zoning Commission
CBID
Dewhirst Properties
The Knoxville Journal
Knoxville News Sentinel
Hanna's
Republic Parking System
Asfour and Associates
Sperry Van Ness/R. M. Moore
City of Knoxville
MPC
MPC

Kim Henry, Chair, called the meeting to order. There was a quorum present, and they introduced themselves. Board members present are shown in italics. Kim introduced Chad Boetger as a new member of the board.

A motion was made by John Sanders and seconded by Chad Boetger to approve the June 16 minutes. The motion carried unanimously.

Certificates of Appropriateness:

Certificate No. 8-A-10-DT

100 S Broadway - 100 S Broadway (John L. Sanders)
Pre-development N/A

Description of Work

This project is to renovate an existing building at the corner of Broadway and Jackson Avenue. This building is a former fuel and service station and is an atypical building style for the Downtown Design Overlay District. This building sits back from the street and has a large amount of impervious area.

The owner plans to remove portions of the impervious area for landscaping (see drawings AS1.0 and AS1.1). The landscaping areas will be edged with 6 inch curbing. The existing bollards are to be removed and not replaced. Parking is not required in the C-2 (central business) district but there will be 18 parking stalls incorporated into the site. The owner also plans to incorporate a bus shelter at the designated bus stop (adjacent to the existing pole sign near the intersection). If a permanent bus shelter is constructed, the owner will present plan for approval separate from this application.

The demolition plans for the building are shown in drawings AD1.1, AD 2.0 and AD 2.1. The owner plans to remove and replace the storefront and all windows with new installations, which will have aluminum frames and clear glass (see drawing A3.0 for the storefront and door schedule). The existing garage doors will remain. The existing surface mounted lighting under the canopy and building overhangs will be removed. The existing perimeter lighting on the canopy and building will be restored and returned to working condition (see drawing A1.1). On the south elevation of the building, the existing restroom doors on the exterior of the building will be removed and the masonry patched to match the existing brick. On the north elevation, one window will be enlarged to become a door.

Other new elements of the building are shown on drawing A1.0, A1.1, A2.0, A2.1 and A2.2. A new concrete slab under the canopy will raise the floor elevation to be the same as the building (A1.0). There will be a new screen wall integrated into the canopy that will face Broadway and will be supported by a tube steel structure and frame (A1.0, A2.1). This screen wall will be approximately 24.5 feet wide and will have clearance with the ground of approximately 1.5 feet. The screen will be veneered with corrugated metal and is anticipated to also be used as a signage wall.

Above the garage doors and storefront, corrugated metal siding with exposed fasteners will be installed (A2.0, A2.1, A2.2).

Staff Comments

This property is within the Warehouse District, which includes all of Jackson Ave and the majority of the Old City, within the D-1 boundary. The original buildings in this district are typical of most of downtown being multi-story, built at the sidewalk edge and pedestrian oriented. This building is a single story and sits well back from the sidewalk and is auto oriented. The guidelines are intended to make properties pedestrian oriented so the guidelines in this case will need to be interpreted to make an auto oriented property as pedestrian friendly as possible.

The guidelines have a repeating theme of making properties accessible for pedestrians on the sidewalk, whether this be by having clear storefront glass to allow visibility into the ground floor or having inviting entrances. In this case, the pedestrian access to the site is lacking. There is no clear way to enter the property via a paved walkway from Broadway and the only paved walkway from Jackson is on the outer edge of the parking lot that directs you to the back of the building. There should be a paved walkway from each road frontage that provides a clear path to the main entrance with minimal crossing of the parking lot.

Section 1.A.3d of the guidelines states, "Screen surface lots, where they abut a public sidewalk, with decorative walls, fencing and landscaping." This plan does propose a thin landscaping area between the parking lot and the sidewalk along Broadway but does not propose anything along the Jackson Avenue sidewalk. At a minimum, a fence should be installed along the public sidewalks, along with the proposed landscaping. There should be an allowance for openings in the fence for vehicular and pedestrian access to the site.

The proposed screen wall creates a blank wall that is discouraged by the guidelines in order to foster pedestrian comfort, safety and orientation. The screen wall will be approximately 10 feet from the sidewalk edge and will have landscaping between it and the sidewalk. Some sort of opening(s) in the screen wall may be appropriate to address the recommendations of the guidelines.

Staff Recommendation

APPROVE Certificate 8-A-10-DT with the following conditions: 1) There be a clear pedestrian connection to the main entrance on a concrete walkway from the Broadway and Jackson Avenue with minimal crossing of the parking lot, 2) A minimum of two shade trees located and species identified, to provide shade to the parking lot, 3) Screen the parking lot along all public sidewalks at a minimum with a decorative fence and all proposed landscaping with the allowance for openings in the fence for vehicular and pedestrian access, and 4) Remove the existing pole sign.

Mike Reynolds described the proposed project and reviewed the staff comments and recommendations.

John Sanders, 100 Jackson Avenue, stated that the reason for the screen wall is to cut down on noise for a restaurant with outdoor seating to create a buffer from Broadway. He felt that the guidelines recommendation against blank walls was intended for buildings that are built at the sidewalk edge.

John Sanders stated that he can adjust the site plan to put a walkway from Broadway and Jackson Avenue that leads to the main entrance of the building. He said that it will be difficult to add a walkway from Jackson Avenue that will not require the removal of a parking stall.

John Sanders said he would like the board to consider allowing him to screen the parking lot with landscaping only and not require a fence along the public sidewalks. He said he can create a four foot wide planting strip between the parking lot and the Jackson Avenue sidewalk.

John Sanders questioned why staff recommended the removal of the existing pole sign. Mike Reynolds stated that staff felt this was an opportunity to remove a sign type that is not recommended in the guidelines for the Warehouse District. John stated that he would like to keep the sign because it is valuable to attracting tenants.

David Dewhirst stated that this site is not a traditional building, and he does not have a problem with the design. This plan will add visual interest and will be unique and different. He stated that he would like to see a landscape barrier between the parking lot and the sidewalk. He does not

want him to install a fence. He asked John what is intended for the southern triangle of asphalt, accessed from Broadway. John responded that it will be used for deliveries and trash pickup.

Joe Petre asked if a sign will be on the screen wall and on the pole sign. John responded he will do whatever is allowed. Joe also asked where the garbage will be located. John stated the garbage would be picked up on the Summit Hill/Broadway side and not on the Jackson Avenue side of the building.

Anne Wallace stated that there a potential for three signs on the site. She stated that the corrugated wall would look better if a sign is painted on it. Also, state law does allow the pole sign to be grandfathered as long as the only change is to the sign faces.

Steve King stated that the location for deliveries and garbage collection might necessitate a vehicle backing out on Broadway, which would be a problem. Access on Jackson Avenue is not an issue. Vehicular site distance turning right on Broadway could be a problem depending on the landscaping.

Jeffrey Nash stated that sensible landscaping can act as a fence, which would satisfy the requirements of the guidelines.

A motion was made by David Dewhirst and seconded by Carol Montgomery to approve the project with the stipulation that a landscape strip be included along Jackson Avenue. The motion carried with John Sanders recusing and Joe Petre not voting.

Certificate No. 8-B-10-DT

314 Church St - 314 Church Street (Asfour & Associates)

Pre-development - 7/29/2010

Description of Work

This project has three components; sign refurbishment, new emergency door and stairs, and window alteration.

An exiting "Park" sign on the building is in need of refurbishment (see Image 1). The operator of the parking facility is proposing to replace the existing sign faces with new sign faces that look exactly like the original but will be made of acrylic. The face of the lower part of the sign that says "Pryor Brown Garage" will be replaced with the Republic Parking System corporate image shown in the lower right corner of Image 1. The signs will not be internally illuminated; they will be externally illuminated with existing lights.

A new emergency exit is being installed in the building (see drawings S-1 and S-2). The emergency exit will require a door with a stair to be installed toward the back of the building on the Gay Street facing elevation (the red dot on the attached aerial image is the approximate location of the door). The door is 8 feet above the adjacent parking lot and the stair will lead to the surface parking lot. An easement must be obtained to allow the egress into the parking lot. The door, stair and railings will be made of metal.

The building operator is proposing to place a wire mesh behind the fourth story window frames.

The wire mesh is intended to keep pigeons from roosting in the ceiling joists. The proposed wire mesh will have openings of 4 inches by 4 inches and will be a black steel wire mesh. The wire mesh will sit in the window opening directly behind the window frames (see Window drawing, section A-A). The wire mesh will be anchored into the existing wall using 1/8 inch ramset bolts. The wire mesh will also be anchored to the existing window frame with 1/8 inch steel u-bolts every 36 inch on center.

Staff Comments

The window panes in the upper stories of this building were recently removed in response to issues with the panes falling out and because of air circulation. This proposal for the wire mesh in the fourth floor windows in response to a pigeon problem. In staff's opinion, anchoring the wire mesh to the window frames using the u-bolts will allow the mesh to be removed without damaging the window frames.

Staff Recommendation

APPROVE Certificate 8-B-10-DT with the following conditions: 1) The emergency door and stair have a black finish.

Mike Reynolds discussed the applicant's plans for the building. They want to replace the sign faces, add an emergency exit and add metal mesh in the windows on the 4th floor. The mesh will not be permanently attached to the window frames. Mike suggested approving one component of the application at a time.

Grant Asfour – Asfour & Associates, 314 Church Street, is the applicant.

David Dewhirst stated that metal and wood signs not internally illuminated are what the guidelines call for. He suggested they repaint the existing faces of the sign and illuminate the sign externally. JaMichael McGoy, General Manager of Republic Parking stated that they want to reface the sign that says "Park" with new acrylic faces that look the same as the existing faces, and on the lower part of the sign that says "Pryor Brown" they want to replace the existing face with a new acrylic face with the new Republic Parking logo. He thinks the new sign faces will give it a better look. Mike Reynolds stated that this building is not in a National Register Historic District so we would not use the Historic Resources section of the guidelines for reviewing this building.

Anne Wallace asked if there is a problem with repainting the sign. Mr. McGoy stated they wanted to replace the sign with acrylic faces because it would give it a cleaner look. New metal faces would also be more expensive.

Chad Boetger asked if the other vertical sign on the building would remain. Mr. McGoy responded that sign will stay and that it is metal.

A motion was made by David Dewhirst and seconded by John Sanders to approve the sign with conditions the applicant either repaints the existing sign faces or replaces the faces with new flat metal faces. For the letters P-A-R-K, the font shall be the same as the current design. The sign faces shall not be made of acrylic or other plastic material. The sign can

be externally illuminated. The motion carried unanimously, with Joe Petre not voting.

Mike Reynolds explained where the new exit door is proposed and that the applicants will be required to get an easement from the adjoining property owners.

Anne Wallace asked if they have received the required easement. Mr. McGoy said it has not been finalized but the both properties are under the same ownership so this will not be a problem to get.

Anne Wallace asked what prompted the need for the emergency exit. Mr. Asfour stated the garage has been changed to a public use facility and that is why they have to have the fire exit.

John Sanders stated that he felt the board did not need to approve this staircase because it was far enough back on the property to not fall under the board review. John asked Mike Reynolds if staff approved the exit stair at the YWCA and Mike said they did.

A motion was made by David Dewhirst and seconded by Anne Wallace to approve the emergency exit. The motion carried with John Sanders abstaining and Joe Petre not voting.

Mike Reynolds stated that the applicant wants to put mesh behind the 4th floor windows to keep the pigeons out. The second, third and fourth floor window panes have been removed because the applicants understanding was that the fire marshal said they had to be open for ventilation. The mesh on the 4th floor will be attached behind the window frames to the side of the window openings and to the window frames with u-bolts.

John Sanders asked if they felt the 4 inch by 4 inch openings of the wire mesh would keep pigeons out. John felt it wouldn't. JaMichael McGoy thought they were going to use 2 inch by 2 inch wire mesh and Grant Asfour stated that he would change the wire mesh to 2 inch by 2 inch.

A motion was made by John Sanders to allow 2 inch by 2 inch wire mesh on the 4th floor windows. The motion failed for lack of a second.

John Sanders stated we should ask the fire marshal why they were directed the applicant to take out the window panes.

David Dewhirst stated that he has received several calls asking how an owner could knock window panes out of a building. If the window panes are falling out, you should repair them. Powered vents should be used in the building. He feels it was a poor decision to knock the window panes out. David stated that there is at least one other garage of the same age downtown that still has all of its window panes and it is not a problem. They keep the operable windows open for ventilation.

David stated this building looks blighted because of the upper stories windows and the plywood in some of the ground floor windows. He agrees with the 2 inch by 2 inch wire mesh could be used on the 4th floor to keep the pigeons out. He stated that the applicant should be required to

replace the windows on the first floor that have plywood in them. This would fix some of the blighting issues and create a better looking building. Some windows have mesh in them now, which need to be removed because they serve no purpose. The façade has been changed dramatically with the removal of the window panes. The window frames should be painted. He thinks they should take one window, put the wire mesh screen in it and let the board look at the installation and come back in 30 days.

A motion was made by Anne Wallace and seconded by Carol Montgomery to postpone this application until next month for the applicant to provide more information to the board. The applicant is to bring in samples of the type of material he is going to use. City officials should also be at the meeting to provide further detailed information about this project. The motion carried unanimously, with Joe Petre not voting.

Certificate No. 8-C-10-DT

415 S Gay St - 415 S Gay Street (Rafik Hanna)

Pre-development N/A

Description of Work

This proposal is a revision to the approved Certificate of Appropriateness 9-B-09-DT and 2-C-10-DT.

This proposal adds to the existing storefront approval a sign board above the transoms and decorative treatment to the left and right of the storefront. The sign board and decorative treatment cover brick that had been damaged during a previous renovation of the structure. These areas will have a raised trim to give a paneled look.

This proposal also has revisions to the existing approvals as follows: 1) The approved storefront transoms were for multiple, equally sized transoms. This proposal requests two small transoms above the right and left portions of the storefront and one large transom in the middle, above the main entrance. 2) The second story windows were approved to have half round windows with a single pane. The installed windows were half round, broken into four evenly sized panes (see image 1). 3) The panels below the second story windows and on the bulkhead of the storefront were approved to be a simple panel without a decorative design. The installed panels have a design that mimics the design of the second story half round window pattern.

Staff Recommendation

POSTPONE Certificate 8-C-10-DT until scaled plans are submitted showing what type of trim is to be applied to the sign board and decorative treatment to the left and right of the storefront.

Mike Reynolds discussed the staff recommendation and stated that staff felt there was not sufficient information for the board to vote. After speaking with Mr. Hanna, he said he is not interested in getting the sign board and decorative treatments to the storefront approved at this meeting if it is not possible, but he would like to get the second story windows and panels, and storefront bulkhead panels approved; and he would like to get the transoms approved.

Rafik Hanna, 415 S. Gay Street, is the owner. John Sanders stated that his carpenter told the

board he would make the three transoms. He took them out then put them back in. Anne Wallace told Mr. Hanna that he did not give the board clear plans on what he was going to do. The board does not want to approve something after the fact.

Mike Reynolds stated that the board needs to determine if what they have installed can be approved even though it did not match the original certificate.

John Sanders asked if Ann Bennett had comments about this transom plan. Mike Reynolds stated she wanted the transoms to be the same size but did not say what size they should be.

David Dewhirst complimented him on the brickwork. He approves of the upper windows, but the issue is he needs three evenly sized transoms. The two vertical elements in the between the two small transom should be removed to create three large transoms.

A motion was made by John Sanders and seconded by David Dewhirst to have the applicant remove the vertical elements within both sets of the small transoms, creating three transoms of equal size over the width of the storefront. The second story windows and panels, and storefront bulkhead panels can remain as they were installed. The motion carried with Jeffrey Nash voting against and Joe Petre not voting.

Other Business:

- Elect Chair and Vice chair.

Mike Reynolds stated that Kim Henry is the Chair and Joe Petre is the Vice Chair. There was a mix-up with the terms because of the shuffling of memberships and new appointments to the board. Joe should have been reappointment to the board at the last City Council meeting but was not. He will be nominated for reappointment at the next City Council meeting. Kim Henry and Bob Alcorn were reappointed to the board and Chad Boetger was appointed to fulfill Amy Haynes membership.

A motion was made by David Dewhirst and seconded by Carol Montgomery nominating Kim Henry for Chair and Jeffrey Nash for Vice Chair. The motion carried unanimously with Joe Petre not voting.