

**MINUTES**  
**KNOXVILLE DOWNTOWN DESIGN REVIEW BOARD**  
**MEETING OF JULY 15, 2009**  
**SMALL ASSEMBLY ROOM**

**Present:**

*Kim Henry*  
*Mark Donaldson*  
*Amy Haynes*  
*Anne Wallace*  
*Joe Petre*  
*John Sanders*  
*Alice Fleenor*  
*Brian Ewers*  
*Stefanie Hopson*  
*Randall DeFord*  
*Finbarr Saunders*  
*Steve King*  
*Charlotte West*

**Organization:**

*APA Representative*  
*MPC*  
*Resident*  
*City of Knoxville*  
*CBID Representative*  
*AIA Representative*  
*Barley's*  
*Dollar and Ewers Architects*  
*R2R Studio*  
*C. Randall DeFord Architecture*  
*Knox County Commission*  
*City of Knoxville*  
*MPC*

Kim Henry, Chair, called the meeting to order. There was a quorum present. Board members present are shown in italics.

Board members introduced themselves.

**A motion was made by John Sanders and seconded by Joe Petre to approve the May 20 minutes. The motion carried unanimously.**

**Certificates of Appropriateness:**

***Certificate No. 6-A-09-DT***

***418 S. Gay St.*** – Prestige Cleaners/Downtown Grind (Randall De Ford, Architect)  
Pre-development meeting: N/A

**Description of Work**

This proposal is for an awning (sunshade) for a portion of the storefront for the Phoenix Building, which is in the National Register Gay Street Commercial Historic District. The awning is composed of three triangles, the center one being lower than the other two triangles. The awning will extend 7 feet 8 inches from the façade and will be the width of the business storefront area (approximately 1/3 of the façade). The awning will be a minimum height of 9 feet and maximum height of 12 feet.

The awnings will have a stainless steel ring at each corner. When attaching to brick, a shackle or turnbuckle will be used. At the existing storefront posts, a belt will be designed to go around both of posts or a bracket that spans them that has an attachment in the middle.

The business currently has an agreement with the City to allow a fenced sitting area on the sidewalk. In order to support the awning above the sidewalk, two posts will be incorporated into the fence. The posts will be approximately 18 feet tall and will have decorative finials and fabric pennants. The post design will match the existing fencing.

There is an existing banner that projects from the façade with the logo of both Prestige Cleaners and Downtown Grind. This banner will be removed and replaced with two smaller banners (17"x34"), one attached to each new post between the top of the awning and the pennants. The logos for the two businesses will be separated, one per banner. The banner images will be similar to the existing banner (see attached photo).

### **Staff Comments**

Section 1.C.8a (page 29) of the Guidelines states, "Allow awnings in traditional shapes and materials". Staff does not find the proposed awning design meets the intent of this guideline.

In addition, the intent of Section 1.C of the guidelines is to allow awnings if "their overall size, shape, and projection from the building (is) in proper proportion and scale to the building and contained within the window or door they shelter, and not cover adjacent wall surfaces". The design of the storefront area of this building makes it difficult for any one portion of the storefront to have an awning without the entire storefront being considered for the same awning treatment. The storefront is setback from the façade a few feet, with posts in front of the storefront. This makes the entire storefront the area to be contained because the design does not allow for an individual window or door area to be contained by itself.

Other considerations: Section 1.C.1d (Rooflines and Additions) states, "Do not alter, obscure or destroy significant features of historic resources when constructing additions". Though an awning may not be considered an addition, it will obscure significant detailing on the storefront.

The two awning support posts, which also have attached banners and pennants, are significant structures and an increase from the semi-permanent fence that is there now. An approval of this design should be subject to City approval.

### **Staff Recommendation**

DENY based on not meeting Section 1.C.8a of the Downtown Knoxville Design Guidelines.

Randall DeFord, architect for the project stated that he is an advocate for historic preservation. The Phoenix Building has a 2-story recessed front and extra deep entry area, which makes it hard to install an awning. They did not want to obscure the building detail and decided to use triangle sun shades that pedestrians can look up at through. He extended the poles up to give it a more historic look. The two awning support posts that have attached banners have to be approved by City Council.

Steve King stated that as long as it is within the specified height in the zoning ordinance, they do not have to go to City Council, but there is an issue of the support poles that would have to go to City Council. This would be in the city right-of-way. Anne Wallace stated there are three parts to this application, an awning, a banner and a pennant.

Amy Haynes asked if it is just a sun shade and Randall said it is. Anne Wallace asked about the wind and how the poles will attach to the sidewalk. Randall has hired a structural engineer to help with that. Kim Henry asked where the anchors will be installed, and he responded they will go on the brick wall probably into the mortar. John Sanders stated he does not have a problem with the nontraditional awning, but he is concerned about the flagpole because they will take away from the architecture of the building and wanted to know how they will be anchored. Anne Wallace added that the second alternative with the smaller pole is more in keeping with other businesses on Gay Street.

Joe Petre asked Randall if Insite had approved his design and they have.

Steve King stated that supports are not mentioned in the zoning ordinance.

**A motion was made by Joe Petre and seconded by Anne Wallace to accept the plan dated July 15, which is an alternative drawing excluding the markings on the plan. The motion carried unanimously.**

***Certificate No. 7-A-09-DT***

***411 S. Gay St.*** – 411 Building (Brian Ewers, Architect)

Pre-development meeting: N/A

**Description of Work**

This proposal is to remove the existing awnings and wood panel veneer above the storefront, and replace with new awnings, signs and repair façade behind wood panel veneer. The existing brick veneer at the storefront level will remain. The existing plaster between the upper windows will be repainted.

New awnings will be over each individual window on the upper stories and will project 2 feet from the façade. A new storefront awning will extend over all the storefronts and extend 5 feet from the façade. The awning clearance with the sidewalk will be 10 feet 9 inches. The awning will leave a clearance of 2.5 feet from the adjacent structures. The storefront awning will have signage on the valance, with 8 inch tall letters. The signage will be in front of each of the three storefronts and be a total of approximately 25.5 square feet.

There will be a new 411 Building sign that runs vertically on the left side of the façade from approximately the cornice line to the top of the awning. The sign will be centered on the existing marble panel. The sign will have a reverse back channel with “halo” effect lighting. The letters and numbers will be 18 inches in height for a total sign area of 51 square feet.

There are two existing hanging signs and one existing wall sign that will be removed for reuse. It is proposed that there will eventually be four projecting signs at 9 square feet maximum totaling 36 square feet and three wall signs at 20 square feet maximum totaling 60 square feet.

The existing wood veneer panels above the storefronts will be removed and the façade will be repaired with plaster with a .5 inch reveal in a pattern to match the existing marble panels. This area will be predominantly covered by the new awning above the storefront.

**Staff Comments**

This building is in the National Register Gay Street Commercial Historic District. Section 1.C.8a (page 29) of the Guidelines states, “Allow awnings in traditional shapes and materials”. In addition, the intent of Section 1.C of the guidelines is to allow awnings if “their overall size, shape, and projection from the building (is) in proper proportion and scale to the building and

contained within the window or door they shelter, and not cover adjacent wall surfaces”. This proposal does not break the awning up into individual awnings for each storefront bay. Since this building is not a contributing building in the historic district, allowing one continuous awning along the storefront as proposed can be considered.

The building is allowed 180 square feet of signage and the proposal consists of 172.5 square feet of signage.

### **Staff Recommendation**

APPOVE with the following conditions:

1. Existing signs are permitted to be replaced in approximately the same location as they are currently and must retain a minimum clearance with the sidewalk of 10 feet.
2. All new hanging (or projecting) signs and wall signs must be approved as a separate Certificate of Appropriateness than this approval to determine their appropriateness in the specified location.

Brian Ewers, who is the owner, stated that he would like to keep the existing signage. The blade signs will be underneath the canopy. Mr. Ewers stated that the original was a continuous awning, and he has an alternate of three separate awnings. This is a noncontributing building.

**A motion was made by Anne Wallace and seconded by Amy Haynes stating that either design fits the design guidelines which allow for a continuous or three separate awnings. The motion carried unanimously.**

### ***Certificate No. 7-B-09-DT***

***Various Locations*** – Cradle of Country Music Walking Tour signs (Alice Fleenor, Knoxville Tourism and Sports Corporation)

Pre-development meeting: N/A

### **Description of Work**

This proposal is to replace signage for the downtown Cradle of Country Music Walking Tour. Some markers for the tour have been removed by other parties over the years and not replaced. The replacement signs will be wall plaques rather than the free standing signs used previously. The plaques will be either 8x8 inches or 8x12 inches. There are five locations for this proposal: 1) East TN History Center - 601 S. Gay St, 2) TN Theatre - 604 S. Gay St, 3) Hotel Farragut Annex – 524 S. Gay St, 4) Harold’s Deli – 131 S. Gay St, and 5) FMB Advertising – 145 S. Gay St. See the attached documentation for the proposed locations on the buildings.

The plaque design will mimic the original design of the free-standing signs: bronze-colored aluminum plaques with attractive and durable grey/brown raised lettering.

### **Staff Comments**

Plaques are not recognized in the guidelines as an allowable sign but should be considered on a case-by-case basis. The signs as proposed will be located in unobtrusive locations and are minimal in size.

There should be minimal damage when attaching the signs, especially to historic structures. If using fasteners, drill holes should be limited to the mortar lines which can be more easily fixed than a tile or brick.

### **Staff Recommendation**

APPROVE with the following conditions:

1. On historic structures, any damage to bricks and tiles should be limited to maximum extent possible in the process of attaching the plaques.
2. All property owners must approve the attachment of the plaques to their building.

Alice Fleener of the Knoxville Tourism and Sports Corporation stated that she has received consent from all the property owners. There are five signs that are missing that need to be replaced. It is aluminum placard and designed to match the existing signage. It will be flush against the building and has depth and beveled edge. Anne Wallace asked if the tour is a self-guided tour, Ms. Fleener stated it is. If there is a large group, it can be a guided tour.

**A motion was made by Anne Wallace and seconded by Joe Petre to approve the signs listed in the staff report. The motion carried unanimously.**

### ***Certificate No. 7-C-09-DT***

**200 E. Jackson Ave** – Barley’s (Stephanie Hopson, R2R Studio)

Pre-development meeting: N/A

### **Description of Work**

This proposal is to add a new roof over the existing patio to the side of the building and a new ingress/egress stairs and deck to the rear of the building. The existing trees on the patio will need to be removed to accommodate the addition.

The roof over the existing patio will have a frame made of stained 8x8 inch posts and 8x12 inch beams. The metal strapping will be black. The roof will be Englart metal roofing (red) and have 2x12 inch stained rafters. The roof will be attached to the existing brick façade with blocking.

The rear ingress/egress structure will be made of steel, along with the railings and guardrails. This structure will be fully self supporting and will not be supported by the existing brick walls. The roof will be galvanized metal on a steel frame. At ground level, a dumpster enclosure will be built under the metal structure. The framing will be steel, but will have wood slats to mimic the 8-foot tall fencing to the right of the dumpster surround.

### **Staff Comments**

This building is in the National Register Jackson Avenue Warehouse District. The guidelines regulate changes to buildings oriented to a public-oriented space. The rear ingress/egress is not highly visible from a public-oriented space, but does need to be reviewed to make sure it does not damage the structure as a whole. The architect, along with a structural engineer, reviewed the condition of the building and determined that the rear wall and side walls need to be reinforced so strapping has been incorporated which can be seen in Elevation 2 – Partial B-B.

The addition of the roof and associated structure over the existing patio is highly visible from the public right-of-way. Staff feels that the proposed design is in keeping with the original warehouse uses of the building. The only part of the new structure that will be attached to the old structure is the roof blocking.

**Staff Recommendation**

APPROVE with the following condition:

1. All new construction attached to the old structure must be done in a sensitive manner; in such if the new construction is ever removed there is minimal visible impact to on the building.

Stephanie Hopson, representing R2R Studio, stated that the awning will be installed over the existing patio, and a deck and egress stairs will be built on the back. Anne Wallace stated that Ann Bennett, MPC's historic preservation planner, approves of the plans as submitted.

**A motion was made by Joe Petre and seconded by John Sanders to approve the staff recommendation. The motion carried unanimously.**

**Other Business:**

Anne Wallace stated the city is moving forward with the Wayfinding project. Public comments will be made available within the next couple of weeks. She also discussed special event parking signs.