

Staff Report

Infill Housing Design Review Committee

File Number: 11-D-21-IH

Meeting:	11/17/2021					
Applicant:	Rick Fagan					
Owner:	James Gallman					
Property Information						
Location:	1506 Ohio Ave.	Parcel I	D 81 P 008			

Zoning:RN-2 (Single-Family Residential Neighborhood)District:Lonsdale Infill Housing Overlay District

Description of Work

Level III New Primary Structure

New primary residence fronting Ohio Ave. Modular manufactured house measuring 60' wide by 25'-4" deep, with a 5' deep concrete patio in front of the door. The house is proposed to be set 20' from the front property line, 30' from the right side property line, and 57' from the left side property line. Parking is accessed off Ohio Avenue via a driveway, with a large parking pad to the right side of the house.

The 3/12 pitch, side-gable roof is clad in asphalt shingles, the house is clad in vinyl Dutch lap siding, and the house rests in a 16" tall stuccoed foundation. There are four bays of windows and a centrally located door on the façade. A secondary entry is located on the rear elevation.

Applicable Design Guidelines

Heart of Knoxville Infill Housing Design Guidelines

1. Front Yards

- Consistent front yard space should be created along the street with the setback of a new house matching the older houses on the block.

- When several infill houses, porches and the habitable portion of each house should be about the same distance from the street as the original houses.

- A walkway should be provided from the sidewalk or street to the front door. Along grid streets, the walk should be perpendicular to the street.

- Healthy trees that are outside the building footprint should be preserved. The root area should be marked and protected during construction.

- 2. House Orientation and Side Yards
- New housing should be proportional to the dimensions of the lot and other houses on the block.

- Side yard setbacks should be similar to older houses on the block, keeping the rhythm of spacing between houses consistent.

3. Alleys, Parking, and Services

- Parking should not be in front yards.

- Alley access should be used for garage or parking pad locations.

- On streets without alleys, garages or parking pads should be at least 20' behind the front façade of the infill house with access limited to one lane between the street and the front façade.

- On those streets which have alleys, driveways should not be permitted from the front of the house.

- Alley oriented parking pads, garbage collection points, and utility boxes should be screened with a combination of landscaping and fencing.

4. Scale, Mass, and Foundation Height

- The front elevation should be designed to be similar in scale to the other houses along the street.

- The front façade of new houses should be about the same width as original houses on the block.

- If extensions or bays were typically part of the neighborhood's historic house design, such elements should be incorporated into infill housing.

- New foundations should be about the same height as the original houses in the neighborhood.

5. Porches and Stoops

- Porches should be part of the housing design in those neighborhoods where porches were commonplace.

- Porches should be proportional to original porches on the block, extending about 8-12' toward the street from the habitable portion of the house.

- Porches should extend into the front yard setback, if necessary, to maintain consistency with similarly sited porches along the street.

- Porch posts and railings should be like those used in the historic era of the neighborhood's development.

6. Windows and Doors

- When constructing new houses, the windows and door styles should be similar to the original or historic houses on the block.

- To respect the privacy of adjacent properties, consider the placement of side windows and doors.

- The windows and doors on the front façade of an infill house should be located in similar proportion and position as the original houses on the block.

- Attention should be paid to window placement and the ratio of solid (the wall) to void (the window and door openings).

- Contemporary windows such as "picture windows" should not be used in pre-World War II neighborhoods.

7. Roof Shapes and Materials

- New roofs should be designed to have a similar pitch to original housing on the block.

- More complex roofs, such as hipped roofs and dormers, should be part of new housing designs when such forms were historically used on the block.

- Darker shades of shingle were often used and should be chosen in roofing houses in Infill neighborhoods.

8. Siding Materials

- Clapboard-like materials should be used in constructing new housing where painted wood siding was traditionally used.

- Faced stone, vertical siding, and other non-historic materials should not be used in building new houses.

11. Landscape and Other Considerations

- One native or naturalized shade tree should be planted in the front and rear yards of infill lots with 25 feet or more in depth to front of house

Comments

1. The house is proposed for the center/center right of a 200' wide lot. The lot is uniquely large for the context, measuring approximately 200' wide and 115' deep. The house is proposed to be set 20' from the front property line, 57' from the left side property line, and 30' from the right side property line. The block lacks sufficient context

for an average front setback. A recently-approved house at 1520 Ohio Avenue was approved to be set 20' from the front property line. The side setbacks will be wider than the typical neighborhood pattern and create an inconsistent rhythm of houses if the adjacent lots are developed. The front setback will be consistent with the other house on the block. The site plan includes a grey circle, possibly indicating a walkway to the street.

2. While the block does not retain sufficient historic context, the new house is disproportionate in form (significantly wider than) the historic houses in the surrounding neighborhood. The block does not retain many historic structures from which to draw context.

3. Parking is proposed for the front yard, which is discouraged by the Infill Housing design guidelines and City Engineering standards. This block has an operable alley; the driveway access and parking should extend from the alley. The site plan does not include dimensions or material on the driveway or parking area; these should be included in the final site plan. Engineering has also noted the presence of a 30' buffer zone from the top of the bank, which should be noted on the site plan, along with the distance from the buffer zone to the proposed house.

4. The proposed house is not similar in scale or massing to the surrounding context; the proposed house is a Ranchstyle house which is significantly wider than original houses in the neighborhood. The house does not include extensions or bays. The application references a Minimal Traditional/Transitional Ranch house at 1521 Ohio Avenue for context. In the opinion of staff, the referenced house is not representative of the broader historic house forms or styles found in Lonsdale. Some Ranch-style houses have been constructed as contemporary Infill construction, namely by Habitat for Humanity, including on the 3300 block of Thomas Street. These Ranch houses incorporate additional complexity via steeper-pitched roofs and proportionate front porches.

The house will be placed on a 16" foundation, which is generally compatible in height with historic houses in the neighborhood.

5. The house does not incorporate a porch proportionate to original houses in the neighborhood. The steps accessing the door do not qualify as a porch or stoop.

6. The proposal does include sufficient transparency on the front, side, and rear elevations. The door shown in elevation drawings is not compatible with the historic context.

7. The roof has a 3/12 pitch, which is significantly lower than historic houses in the neighborhood. The minimum pitch approved by the board has generally been 6/12. The house incorporates no additional roofline complexity, which is frequently added by projecting bays or at minimum, porch roofs.

8. The proposed vinyl siding, stuccoed foundation, and asphalt shingle roof does meet the design guidelines; however, the vinyl Dutch lap siding is discouraged in Infill Housing reviews. Lap siding with an overlap to resemble wood clapboard siding would be more appropriate.

9. The site plan indicates green circles, which may be trees to meet the design guidelines

Recommendation

Staff recommends denial without prejudice of Certificate 11-D-21-IH, due to the proposal not meeting a sufficient amount of Infill Housing design guidelines.

If Certificate 11-D-21-IH is approved, the approval should be conditioned on: 1) a steeper-pitched roof (6/12 or higher) with 12" or more eave overhangs; 2) the addition of a porch, with roof, detailing, and placement to meet design guidelines; 3) the revision of parking placement to meet Infill Housing guidelines and City Engineering standards; 4) the use of lap siding instead of Dutch lap siding; 5) the use of appropriately sized window trim and a revised front door to meet guidelines.





DESIGN REVIEW REQUEST

DOWNTOWN DESIGN (DK)

□ HISTORIC ZONING (H)

INFILL HOUSING (IH)

james gallman

Applicant			
10-29-21	11/17/2021	11-D-21-IH	
Date Filed	Meeting Date (if applicable)	File Number(s)	
CORRESPONDENCE			

CORRESPONDENCE

All correspondence related to this application should be directed to the approved contact listed below.

Owner	Contractor	🗌 Engineer	Architect/La	ndscape Architect		
rick fagan				cmh		
Name				Company		
4606 clinto	on hwy			knoxville	tn	37912
Address				City	State	Zip
865-382-6	32-6376 richard.fagan@claytonhomes.com					
Phone			Email			

CURRENT PROPERTY INFO

james gallman	3115 Burnside street	8658032084
Owner Name (if different from applicant)	Owner Address	Owner Phone
1506 ohio ave, knoxville, tn 37921	081	IP008
Property Address	Parce	IID
Neighborhood	Zonin	g
AUTHORIZATION		
Lindsay Crockett	Lindsay Crockett	10-29-21
Staff Signature	Please Print	Date
FL	rick fagan	10-29-21

Applicant Signature

Please Print

Date

REQUEST

DOWNTOWN DESIGN	Level 1: Signs Alteration of an existing building/structure Level 2: Addition to an existing building/structure Level 3: Construction of new building/structure Site design, parking, plaz See required Downtown Design attachment for more details. Brief description of work:		
HISTORIC ZONING	Level 1: Signs Routine repair of siding, windows, roof, or other features, it Level 2: Major repair, removal, or replacement of architectural elements or mathematication of a new primary building Level 3: Construction of a new primary building Level 4: Relocation of a contributing structure Demolition of a contributing structure Brief description of work:	erials 🗌 Additions and a	accessory structures
INFILL HOUSING	Level 1: Driveways, parking pads, access point, garages or similar facilities Level 2: Additions visible from the primary street Changes to porches visib Level 3: New primary structure Site built Modular Multi-Sectional See required Infill Housing attachment for more details. Brief description of work: install modular home, tru modular home which app for his mother at this address.	ole from the primary street	Gallman is building a home
STAFF USE ONLY	ATTACHMENTS Downtown Design Checklist Historic Zoning Design Checklist Infill Housing Design Checklist ADDITIONAL REQUIREMENTS Property Owners / Option Holders	FEE 1: FEE 2: FEE 3:	TOTAL:

ADDITIONAL	REQUIREMENTS
Property Ow	ners / Option Holde/

ADDITIONAL REQUIREMENTS	
Property Owners / Option Holders	FEE 3:
Level 1: \$50 • Level 2: \$100 • Level 3: \$250 • Level 4: \$500	











DESIGN GUIDELINES CHECK LIST

Use the following check list to determine the appropriateness of proposed infill housing design for the Heart of Knoxville. For each unchecked item, please refer to the appropriate Heart of Knoxville Infill Housing Design Guidelines section.

Front Yards

Section 1, page 5

- Setback and front door are in line and consistent with original houses on the block.
- Porch and habitable portion of house is offset from street equal to neighboring houses.
- Walkway is proposed from sidewalk (when available) to front door, perpendicular to street.
- Fencing is constructed of traditional materials and excludes chain link, masonry, wide boards, and other contemporary materials.
- Healthy trees are marked for preservation.

House Orientation and Side Yards Section 2, page 6

- Proposed infill is proportional to dimensions of lot and original houses on the block.
- Ma Proposed infill on corner lots has applied for any necessary zoning variance to locate closer to side street.
 - Proposed infill keeps the spacing between houses consistent with original houses on the block.

Alleys, Parking, and Services

Section 3, page 7

- Proposed parking avoids the front yard.
- Proposed infill house has access from alley only (where available) for garage or parking pad. (If no alley access exists, proposed garage or parking pad extends 20 feet beyond the front façade of proposed infill house.)
- MA Proposed garages accessed by alley are setback at least 18 feet from centerline of alley pavement.
 - Proposed parking pads, utility boxes, and waste collection points are visually screened by landscaping and/or fencing.

Scale, Mass, and Foundation Height

Section 4, page 8

- Proposed infill elevation is proportional in scale to the original houses on the block.
- Proposed infill façade respects width of older houses on the block.
- Proposed infill attempts to incorporate historic elements of the block into the design.
- Foundation height is consistent with original houses on the block.
- Additions that cannot conform to scale and height of streetscape are located to the side or rear of infill lot.

Porches and Stoops

Section 5, page 9

- Proposed infill includes plans for a porch in a neighborhood where porches are dominant.
 - Proposed porch is proportional to existing porches on block.
 - Proposed porch maintains consistency with existing porches in setback along the street.
 - Proposed porch materials and details complement the historic character and style of neighborhood (refer to Appendix C).

Windows and Doors

Section 6, page 10

- Proposed window and door styles complement historic character and style of block (refer to appendix).
- Proposed window or door positioning does not violate the privacy of neighboring homes.
- Proposed infill excludes contemporary window styles in pre-1940 areas.
- Proposed infill respects window and door placement of older houses on the block.

Roof Shapes and Materials

Section 7, page 12

- Proposed infill specifies similar pitch to existing houses on block.
 - Proposed infill respects complex roof forms of historic blocks (refer to appendix).
 - Proposed infill for a pre-1940 neighborhood specifies darker shades of shingle roofing.

Siding Materials

Section 8, page 13

- □ In a neighborhood dominated by painted wood siding, the proposed infill specifies clapboard or similar substitutes.
- □ In a neighborhood with mixed architectural styles, the proposed infill specifies appropriate material and detail.
- □ The proposed infill excludes faced stone, vertical siding, and other nonhistoric materials.

Additions

Section 9, page 14

- Proposed additions to existing houses respect siding and roof materials, as well as door and window styles original to the house.
- Proposed window or door replacements should respect original style (refer to Appendix C).
- Proposed additions are located to the side or rear of original house.
- Proposed additions which require additional height are located to the rear of the house.
- □ Specified roof line and roofing materials for proposed addition respect original house.
- Proposed addition does not violate openness or character of front porch.

Multi-unit Housing

Section 10, page 15

- Proposed multi-unit housing respects traditional front yard setbacks of neighborhood.
- Proposed multi-unit housing respects height of original houses in the neighborhood.
- Proposed multi-unit housing respects rhythm and proportion of historic homes on the block.
- Proposed parking for multi-unit housing accesses existing alleys.
- Proposed housing specifies landscaping to include shade trees, in front and back yards.

Landscape and Other Considerations

Section 11, page 16

- For proposed infill with 25 feet or greater front yard depth, at least one shade tree is specified for planting.
- Specified fencing and/or hedges will not exceed 42 inches in height in front yard.
- Front yard fences avoid chain link and specify appropriate historic material.

Small Lot 1930-1950 Era Houses

Section 12, page 17

- Off-street parking is located in the side or rear yard or parallel to the street.
- Multi-unit housing is in scale with other houses on the block and across the street.
- \Box A porch or stoop is part of the design.
- Decks or patios are located behind the house.