



- Call to Order and Welcome
- Introduction of Ex Officio Members and Visitors
- [Approval of Minutes of Previous Meeting](#)
- Certificates of Appropriateness
- Staff Report
- Other Business

CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS

1. **2-C-20-DT**

117 S. Central St. / Parcel ID 94 E G 017 - Carleo's Rooftop Addition
(Smee and Busby Architects)

Description of Work

Installation of a 1-story rooftop addition on the existing 1-story building. The addition will be setback approximately 14 to 19 feet from the front parapet and will have a roof height of approximately 17 feet above the top of the parapet. The roof will also be approximately 4 feet taller than the adjacent 2-story building.

The design incorporates a butterfly roof design the roof angling up toward the front of the building. The roof will be supported by steel structure on the outer edge of the unenclosed deck and the underside of the roof will be finished with a composite wood plank soffit. The deck will have a steel guardrail.

The enclosed portion of the building is located behind the unenclosed deck and has aluminum storefront walls with glass and composite wood plank siding between the roof and the storefront walls. The stair enclosure is on the south (left) side of the addition, adjacent to the two-story building, and this will not be covered by the butterfly roof and will have corrugated metal siding.

Lighting will be installed just above the east (Central St.) storefront, below the roof, to illuminate the underside of the roof above the deck.

Staff Comments

This proposal is within the Southern Terminal and Warehouse (National Register) Historic District so the 'Historic Resources' section of the design guidelines are applicable. The staff recommendation is to deny this request because it does not meet the recommendations of the "Rooflines and Additions" section. In addition to the inconsistencies outlined in the staff recommendation, this section also states that one-story additions "may be possible on taller buildings" and "Rooftop additions are almost never appropriate on buildings less than four stories in height." The board has approved one-story additions on buildings less than four stories before but the additions were located further back on the roof and designed so as to be minimally visible ("inconspicuous") from the public sidewalk. Exhibit A is a visibility study for an approved one-story addition at 141 S. Gay Street which also shows an approved one-story addition at 129 S. Gay Street in the background. Both of these additions only had a small portion of the roof visible from the sidewalk on the opposite side of Gay Street, which has a much wider right-of-way in this block than Central Street at the subject property, making it harder for the Gay Street additions to meet the intent of the guidelines.

Applicable guidelines

SECTION 1.C.1. (ROOFLINES AND ADDITIONS)

Alterations of the rooflines of historic buildings are not appropriate. A one-story rooftop addition, including railings, may be possible on taller buildings if it is inconspicuous from the public right-of-way. Additions should be set back from the primary elevation of the building, and should not damage character-defining features, including parapets and side walls. These walls are often topped by coping stones offering contrasting color or texture, or contain cornices, decorative grills, chimneys, corbelled brickwork and other architectural elements. Rooftop additions are almost never appropriate on buildings less than four stories in height.

Guidelines

- 1a. Preserve or restore historic roofline features, including parapet walls and cornices.
- 1b. Design rooftop additions to be complementary to the historic building in terms of materials and color.
- 1c. Avoid construction that maintains only the historic facade.
- 1d. Do not alter, obscure or destroy significant features of historic resources when constructing additions.
- 1e. Design rooftop additions so that they are not seen from adjoining streets and sidewalks.

Staff Recommendation

DENY the one-story addition as requested because it is not consistent with the guideline recommendation to "Design rooftop additions so that they are not seen from adjoining streets and sidewalks" (Section 1.C.1e. -- Rooflines and Additions) and the general description of this section that states "A one-story rooftop addition, including railings, may be possible... if it is inconspicuous from the public right-of-way."

2. 3-A-20-DT

525 & 531 Henley St. / Parcel ID 94 L J 001 & 00105 - Marriott Conversion (Kathryn Greer / McCarty Holsaple McCarty)

Description of Work

This proposal is to convert the existing Holiday Inn to a full-service Marriott hotel. The scope of the project for the exterior of the building includes the guest room tower facade, new entry canopy and porte cochere, and World's Fair Park façade. There will also be modifications driveway connection to Clinch Avenue and vehicle circulation on the site. The work consists of the following:

GUEST TOWER FACADE

- 1) Removing the existing windows, EIFS, and louvers for the guest rooms
- 2) Replacing guestroom PTAC horizontal louvers for a vertical VRP mechanical unit and louver system.
- 3) Adding new storefront windows.
- 4) Painting all exterior walls for the guest tower.
- 5) Marriott Signage per branding requirements to replace existing Holiday Inn Signage.

ENTRY CANOPY + PORTE COCHERE + PUBLIC SPACE ENTRY

- 1) New Trellis canopy and monumental sign at Marriott Entry
- 2) New site circulation and landscaping
- 3) New wood + metal panel soffit at new entry porte cochere
- 4) Exterior local artist murals elements at new entries
- 5) New coffee shop entry and operable garage doors

WORLD'S FAIR PARK FAÇADE

- 1) New punched opening windows and operable garage style doors.
- 2) New exterior patio, landscaping, and site planters
- 3) Painting the exterior existing brick facade
- 4) New branding signage above the existing shed roof

SITE IMPROVEMENTS

- 1) Replace the large, single driveway access with three lanes to a separated, angled driveway entrance and exit.
- 2) Modify the flow of vehicle traffic on the site so incoming traffic has to go under the porte cochere and exiting traffic has to cross back over the incoming traffic near Clinch Avenue.

SIGNAGE

- 1) Installation of three Marriott signs of the same size that include the word "Marriott" is 1'-2 3/8" tall by 11'-0 7/8" wide and the "M" logo is 6'-0" tall by 7'-8" wide. The overall height of the sign is 7'-7 13/16" tall by 12'-11 5/16" wide (approximately 99 sqft).
- 2) The sign letters will be internally illuminated.
- 3) The signs will be located on the south (Clinch Avenue) elevation, north (Western Avenue) elevation, and on both sides of the monument sign structure along Henley Street. NOTE: The signs labeled as "monument sign" may be considered wall signs because of the way the structure is proposed.
- 4) All other signs shown on the plans are not being requested for approval as part of this application.

Staff Comments

DRB staff is recommending postponement of the driveway modifications for one month to allow additional time to evaluate safety concerns with the design for the following reasons:

- Proximity to the intersection with Henley Street.
- Heavy pedestrian traffic when there are events at the conference center or World's Fair Park.
- Clinch Avenue is also a major bicycle route between downtown and Fort Sanders/UT campus.
- Without left turn movements being restricted by a barrier in the middle of Clinch Ave, drivers will be encouraged to use the wrong driveway based on the direction they are entering/exiting the site, or make a sharp turn into/out of the site from the opposite

direction of the driveway angle (left turn movements).

- A traditional driveway design could be a safer option because it will reduce conflict points and eliminate the concern of vehicles using the wrong driveway.

Applicable guidelines

SECTION 1.A.1. (PEDESTRIAN AND BICYCLIST SAFETY)

Consider pedestrians first, then transit, then the automobile in designing and developing downtown places. Public utilities and streetscape amenities should be located to support safe, convenient, and unimpeded pedestrian flow. Due to the nature of the narrow downtown streets with low traffic speeds it is relatively safe to bike within the downtown area. However, bike lanes and greenways leading to downtown, and places to store bicycles once downtown should also be considered. For more information, please see the Knoxville Regional Bicycle Plan (2002).

GUIDELINES:

1g. Consolidate curb-cuts and locate driveways near mid-block, when necessary; alley access should be provided for service and parking, if feasible.

SECTION 1.B.2. (BUILDING LOCATION)

It is important to establish a strong relationship among buildings, sidewalks, and streets. This is typically accomplished through consistent setbacks that locate buildings on the same line.

GUIDELINES:

2b. Consider using landscape elements to define the sidewalk edge where a building is to be set back from the sidewalk.

SECTION 1.B.4. (ARCHITECTURAL CHARACTER)

Buildings should be visually interesting to invite exploration by pedestrians. A building should express human scale through materials and forms that were seen traditionally. This is important because buildings are experienced at close proximity by the pedestrian.

GUIDELINES:

4b. Enhance pedestrian interest in commercial and office buildings by creating a largely transparent and consistent rhythm of entrances and windows.

SECTION 2.A. THE BOULEVARD DISTRICT

1. YARDS/SETBACKS

Create yards that complement the green space of adjacent buildings.

GUIDELINES:

- 1a. Separate new buildings from the sidewalk with lawn or other landscaped area.
- 1b. Plant native or naturalized trees and other landscape materials in the open spaces. 1c. Compliment the architecture and landscaping of adjoining property.
- 1d. Allow for plazas or similar quasi-public spaces in a portion of these private open spaces.

2. BUILDING CONSIDERATIONS

Enhance the architectural harmony of all buildings along the street.

GUIDELINES:

- 2a. Design building entrances to be clearly oriented to the street.
- 2b. Encourage building forms that are complimentary to the mass of adjacent buildings.
- 2c. Design building elevations to compliment the buildings along the side or back streets when buildings are to face more than one street.
- 2d. Screen service facilities or incorporate them into the design of new buildings so that they are not obtrusive.

3. RECOMMENDED SIGNS

Signs within downtown Knoxville are regulated by Article 13 of the Zoning Ordinance for Knoxville, Tennessee. These guidelines for the boulevard district recognize that certain types of signs are more appropriate to specific areas and should be encouraged within these areas.

GUIDELINES:

- 3a. Wall signs, mounted flush to the building facade or on the building's sign board 3b. Monument signs

Staff Recommendation

APPROVE Certificate 3-A-20-DT as requested with the exception of the driveway modifications.

POSTPONE consideration of the driveway modifications until the April 15th board meeting to allow additional time for staff to review the design and its impact on safety for all users of the Clinch Avenue roadway.

3. 3-C-20-DT

531 S. Gay St. / Parcel ID 94 L E 019 & 010 - Holston Building (Brian Pittman / Johnson Architecture, Inc.)

Description of Work

This proposal is a revision to a previously approved Certificate of Appropriateness and includes changes to the storefront facing Krutch Park, the patio design, access to the patio from the Gay Street sidewalk, lighting, and new signage.

Storefront (north elevation, facing Krutch Park) – The door layout and the transom design has changed but the opening in the Holston Building for the storefront will not change and the previously installed cornice above the storefront will remain. The brick veneer between the storefront bays and on the left and right sides of the storefront will remain as previously approved. The transom will have a design similar to the historic windows on the ground floor of the Holston Building, with a combination of tall single-pane windows on either side of a six-pane window. The storefront will have an aluminum finish to match the existing on the west (alley) elevation, and it will be constructed of fixed and operable doors and storefront infill between the doors. There are two sets of operable double doors, one in the left and right storefront bays. The main entrance to the restaurant will be the left (east) doorway. The storefront system will be slightly recessed from the exterior wall of the Holston Building. The operable doors will swing out over a portion of the proposed patio but it is unknown if they will swing over the Krutch Park property. All windows in the storefront will have clear glass.

Patio (Krutch Park) – The patio surface is proposed to be constructed of ADA accessible pervious pavers and will be surrounded by a metal railing that will have a similar design as the balcony

railing on the upper floors. A walkway from the patio to the Gay Street sidewalk is proposed. The ADA accessible path to the main entrance may need to be constructed a different surface, such as concrete, but that will be determined during permitting.

Sign (north elevation, facing Krutch Park) – A 9' x 12 (108 sqft) painted sign on the east side of the elevation, near the Gay Street sidewalk. The sign will be painted on the brick wall that was previously painted and it will be externally illuminated. The light fixture will be ground-mounted and focused on the sign area. The fixture will be masked from view by landscaping.

Lighting – The storefront will have four sconce fixtures, located on the brick pilasters and to the sides of the storefront. The applicant is also considering gas lanterns in lieu of the electric sconces fixtures.

Landscaping – Installation of shrubs along the external boundary of the patio fencing and along the brick wall near the Gay Street sidewalk.

Staff Comments

The proposed work within Krutch Park requires approval from the administrator of the Krutch family estate and from City Council. The previous approvals for Clinch River Brewing Company were only applicable to that owner and any subsequent owners are required to obtain a new approval (agreement). The Krutch estate administrator can modify the previous agreement or deny patio and egress use of the park completely. Until there is an agreement in place for use of the park, the parameters for which the project must be designed are unknown. However, even if the board did approve the request as requested by the applicant, the portions of the project that require use agreements could not be issued permits until those are finalized.

Some of the concerns expressed by the Krutch estate administrator that needs to be addressed by the applicant include, maintaining the tranquil atmosphere of the park, protecting the existing trees from damage, and restricting direct access to Krutch Park from the restaurant with an exception for emergency egress.

Being that the use agreement between the restaurant owner and the Krutch estate administrator is not finalized, as well as the license and indemnity agreement with the City of Knoxville, there may be changes required to this plan that will require further review by the Design Review Board.

Applicable guidelines

SECTION 1.A.4. (DOWNTOWN BEAUTIFICATION)

Beautifying downtown can occur through many different elements including architecture, landscape architecture, horticulture, art, and performing art. These elements provide expressions of local history and culture. They contribute to local identity and unique qualities of downtown. Public spaces should be designed to include art and beautification.

GUIDELINES:

4a. Foster downtown beautification with landscaping and plantings, public art, and public open space.

SECTION 1.C.2. (STOREFRONTS)

Throughout downtown, historic buildings present a front elevation with an individual facade that is usually 25-35 feet wide. The storefronts are divided horizontally into three sections: bulkheads, solid or opaque, usually 18-24 inches tall; a plate glass storefront window 6-8 feet tall; and above it, a clear or patterned glass transom.

SECTION 1.C.3. (ENTRANCES)

Formal entrances to front facades should be retained. This includes entrances that are located above street level and accessed by exterior stairs. Altering or removing the main entrance to grant street-level access is not appropriate.

GUIDELINES:

3a. Establish recessed entries, either rectangular or with slightly canted sides, which are appropriate in storefronts.

3b. Allow for multiple entries on the first floor of the building, giving access to commercial space that may be divided into bays.

SECTION 1.C.5. (MASONRY)

Masonry features should be retained and repaired; materials, including mortar, should match the original mortar in color and composition. Mortar joints should be sized and struck to match the original. Belt courses, string courses, dripstones, quoins and contrasting brick and stone are common. These features should be preserved and repaired if necessary, and should be introduced on infill buildings.

GUIDELINES:

5a. Repair masonry with stone or brick and mortar that match the original. 5b. Do not paint masonry that has never been painted.

SECTION 1.C.7. (RECOMMENDED SIGNS)

Commercial establishments need to advertise. However, advertising signs should be effective and appropriate to historic areas without contributing to visual clutter. Primary concerns are a sign's location, size, material, and illumination.

GUIDELINES:

7b. Create signs that are proportional to the building where they are located. 7c. Do not light signs internally.

7d. Allow painted signs on building walls in the warehouse area along Jackson Avenue, and in some other locations along Gay Street.

SECTION 1.C.9. (LIGHTING)

Storefront windows may be lit with interior fixtures, entrances may be lit with overhead fixtures, and gooseneck fixtures can be used to highlight signs. Illumination may also be used to wash the building in light, emphasizing its distinctive architectural finishes.

GUIDELINES:

9a. Use indirect lighting of the building facade where appropriate.

SECTION 1.C.10. (NEW CONSTRUCTION WITHIN OR ADJACENT TO AN HISTORIC DISTRICT OR BUILDING)

Infill construction should be designed to reflect architectural and historic qualities. Designs should not duplicate current buildings. Issues of concern will be the siting, size, shape, proportion, materials, and the relationship of all of those to the prevalent character of the historic district.

GUIDELINES:

10c. Design windows to be of similar proportions to the adjacent historic building windows.

10f. Incorporate storefronts that complement the openness, bulkheads, and transoms of historic buildings.

Staff Recommendation

APPROVE Certificate 3-C-20-DT as requested, subject to the following conditions:

- 1) Meeting all requirements of the City of Knoxville Zoning Ordinance.
- 2) Meeting all requirements of the Krutch estate administrator.
- 3) Meeting all requirements of the City of Knoxville License and Indemnity Agreement that is to be approved by City Council.

4. 3-D-20-DT

300 & 316 W. Magnolia Ave. / Parcel ID 94 E F 003 & 004 - Free Service Mixed Use Development (Michael Aktalay / Sanders Pace Architecture)

Description of Work

This proposal is to renovate 300 & 316 West Magnolia Avenue.

300 West Magnolia Avenue consists of (2) buildings constructed at different periods, Rayl School Shop (1934) & Free Service Tire (1952). The Rayl School Shop will have all the existing brick relaid/repared & painted facing Williams Street and the Alley. The existing windows will be replaced with new painted steel windows with clear insulated glazing to match the existing. An architectural metal panel system will be used at the alley side of the building to fill in the void at the windows and the roof line. The Free Service Building will have a back-lit perforated architectural metal panel system that will be applied to the existing painted CMU. The existing garage bays will be infilled with a new aluminum storefront system. A portion of the ground level facade will have a weathering architectural metal panel system with a canopy to be clad with the same material.

316 West Magnolia (constructed in the 1940's) will have the existing brick repointed/repared and painted on the front and alley facade. The existing opening will be infilled with a traditional stick built wood storefront system and transoms w/ clear insulated glazing. A new metal canopy will be installed at the existing steel line just above the storefront. The west side of the building will have the existing concrete repaired and painted. The alley side of the building will have new window openings that will have new painted steel windows with clear insulated glazing. The

existing garage door at the alley will be infilled with a new aluminum storefront system, activating the former alley for pedestrian use.

Demolition:

- 1) Remove all existing windows, doors, and storefront systems.
- 2) Create new windows openings in the masonry walls on the building wall on the west side of the Magnolia Avenue patio and the west side of the south elevation.

General repairs:

- 1) Repoint, repair, and repaint the existing masonry walls.
- 2) Install new kynar finished, 2-piece snap-on coping on top of the parapet walls.

Materials:

- 1) All windows shown with multiple panes will be true divided light painted steel windows with clear glass (east and south elevations). Some windows will be operable as noted on the south elevation.
- 2) Cementitious stucco to cover the existing concrete block walls on the central building of the north (Magnolia Ave.) elevation.
- 3) Perforated architectural metal panel system with metal furring every 4'-0" to be installed over the concrete block of the old Free Service Tire building on the north (Magnolia Ave.) elevation and the northern portion of the east (Williams St.) elevation.
- 4) Wood siding at the recessed entry on the east (Williams St.) elevation.
- 5) Aluminum storefront system to replace the existing garage doors and windows, as noted, on all elevations except the west elevation.
- 6) Painted "stick built" wood storefronts with transoms on the western on the north (Magnolia Ave.) elevation, as noted.
- 7) Architectural weathering metal panel system and canopy on the Free Service Tire building above the storefront system and wrapping around the northwest corner of the building to the Williams St. elevation.

Lighting:

- 1) Install new exterior wall sconces on the western storefront of the north (Magnolia Ave.) elevation, east (Williams St.) and the east side of the south (alley) elevation, as shown on the plans. See the attached manufacturer information for the proposed fixed.

- 2) Install lighting behind the perforated architectural metal panel system on the old Free Service Tire building. These light fixtures will not be visible.
- 3) Decorative string lights over the Magnolia Ave. patio, attached to the building and painted steel columns located along the edge of the planters at the periphery of the patio.

Landscaping:

- 1) Install board formed concrete planters between the patio and the public sidewalk on Magnolia Avenue and Williams Street.

Staff Comments

This building is not located within a National Register Historic District, so the Historic Resources section of the guidelines do not apply. The property is located on the south side of W. Magnolia Avenue, across from the I-40 viaduct and public parking located underneath. The new Regas Square mixed use building is located to the rear of this property.

The property is zoned DK-W (Downtown Knoxville – Warehouse) district which has specific design requirements listed in Table 5-4 in Section 5.5 (link) of the zoning ordinance, and building material restrictions listed in the same section. The design requirements do not apply to this proposal because this is not new construction and the building is not being expanded by 30 percent or more in square footage. The building material restrictions will apply to any changes to building materials. No proposed material is restricted.

Applicable guidelines

SECTION 1.A.4. (DOWNTOWN BEAUTIFICATION)

Beautifying downtown can occur through many different elements including architecture, landscape architecture, horticulture, art, and performing art. These elements provide expressions of local history and culture. They contribute to local identity and unique qualities of downtown. Public spaces should be designed to include art and beautification.

GUIDELINES:

- 4a. Foster downtown beautification with landscaping and plantings, public art, and public open space.

SECTION 1.B.1 (BUILDING MASS, SCALE AND FORM)

Building form should be consistent with the character of downtown as an urban setting and should reinforce the pedestrian activity at the street level. Creating pedestrian-scale buildings, especially at street level, can reduce the perceived mass of buildings. Historically, building technology limited height and subsequently created pedestrian-scaled buildings typically less than 10 stories. Building technology no longer limits the height of buildings and there are no height limitations imposed by the zoning ordinance for downtown Knoxville. However, there is still a need for buildings that respond to pedestrians. The use of 'human-scale' design elements is necessary to accomplish this. Human-scale design elements are details and shapes that are sized to be proportional to the human body, such as, upper story setbacks, covered entries, and window size and placement.

GUIDELINES:

1a. Maintain a pedestrian-scaled environment from block to block. 1e. Avoid blank walls along street-facing elevations.

SECTION 1.B.2. (BUILDING LOCATION)

It is important to establish a strong relationship among buildings, sidewalks, and streets. This is typically accomplished through consistent setbacks that locate buildings on the same line.

GUIDELINES:

2b. Consider using landscape elements to define the sidewalk edge where a building is to be set back from the sidewalk.

2d. Limit grade separations above or below the sidewalk, generally no more than 3 feet. Allow for clear sightlines into and out of buildings and plazas.

2e. Design private plazas to be pedestrian-friendly. Provide human-scale amenities and include landscaping.

SECTION 1.B.3. (BUILDING MATERIALS)

New building materials should relate to the scale, durability, color, and texture of the predominate building materials in the area.

GUIDELINES:

3a. Use complimentary materials and elements, especially next to historic buildings.

SECTION 1.B.4. (ARCHITECTURAL CHARACTER)

Buildings should be visually interesting to invite exploration by pedestrians. A building should express human scale through materials and forms that were seen traditionally. This is important because buildings are experienced at close proximity by the pedestrian.

GUIDELINES:

4a. Encourage first floor uses that draw walk-in traffic; businesses that do not require pedestrian traffic should be located on other floors.

4b. Enhance pedestrian interest in commercial and office buildings by creating a largely transparent and consistent rhythm of entrances and windows.

4f. Encourage the use of 'green roofs' and other sustainable practices, while minimizing the visual impact from the street.

SECTION 1.B.5. (GROUND FLOOR DOORS AND WINDOWS)

Entrances and ground floor windows should foster pedestrian comfort, safety and orientation. Not every building in downtown needs to have the same window or entry designs; however, repeating the pattern of historic openings helps to reinforce the character of downtown, differentiating it from suburban areas. GUIDELINES:

5a. Use consistent rhythm of openings, windows, doorways, and entries.

5b. Orient primary front entrances to the main street; secondary entrances should be clearly defined and oriented to streets or alleys, as appropriate.

5c. Design entrances according to the proportions of the building's height and width. 5d. Consider corner entrances at the ends of blocks.

5e. All windows at the pedestrian level should be clear.

5f. Recess ground floor window frames and doors from the exterior building face to provide depth to the facade.

Staff Recommendation

APPROVE Certificate 3-D-20-DT as submitted.

STAFF REPORT

5. CERTIFICATE NO. 3-B-20-DT

125 S. Central Street / Parcel ID 094EG02103 – Minor modifications to a non-historic storefront to accommodate ADA accessibility into the ground floor space.

OTHER BUSINESS

6. NONE