



February 19, 2019

4:00 P.M. | Main Assembly Room
City County Building

- Call to Order and Welcome
- Introduction of Ex Officio Members and Visitors
- **Approval of Minutes of Previous Meeting**
- Certificates of Appropriateness
- Staff Report
- Other Business

CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS

1. **2-A-20-DT**

415 W. Depot Ave. / Parcel ID 94 E K 005 - O'Hanlon Garage (Andrew Godwin) Pre-development meeting: N/A

Description of Work

Removal of the existing garage doors on the south (Depot Street) elevation and installation of the garage doors on the west (rear) elevation. The new openings on the west elevation will match the size openings on the south elevation and the existing garage doors will be installed in the new openings.

The wall openings on the south elevation will be infilled with a wall and windows trimmed to simulate the look for a storefront. The trim material will be fiber cement and middle portion of the wall will have four panels with a stucco finish. The four windows will be an aluminum storefront system with frosted privacy window film applied to the back side of the windows.

Staff Comments

The existing garage doors face a parking lot located at the intersection of Depot Avenue and Gay Street. The garage is located to the rear of the buildings that front onto N. Gay Street, so the proposed work will not be highly visible from the adjacent streets and will have little impact on nearby development. The guidelines recommend that "access to parking garages should not limit options for future development of contiguous or adjacent space, especially on corners." This is meant to address entrances to larger parking structures, however, this proposal is consistent with this guideline because it further reduces encumbrances to redevelop the adjacent property, if the owner chooses to do so.

There is an existing access easement to Gay Street over the adjacent parking lot drive aisle that will remain and be extended to allow access to the rear of the building.

Applicable guidelines

SECTION 1.A.3. (PARKING FACILITIES)

It is important to ensure that parking facilities (both public and private) are safe, accessible, and clearly marked. New parking facilities should be designed to be attractive, compatible additions to downtown. In general, new parking facilities should remain subordinate to the street scene.

GUIDELINES

- 3g. Access to parking garages should not limit options for future development of contiguous or adjoining space, especially on corners.

SECTION 1.B.3. (BUILDING MATERIALS)

New building materials should relate to the scale, durability, color, and texture of the predominate building materials in the area.

GUIDELINES

- 3a. Use complimentary materials and elements, especially next to historic buildings.

Staff Recommendation

APPROVE Certificate 2-A-20-DT as submitted.

2. 2-B-20-DT

410 W. Magnolia Ave. / Parcel ID 94 E K 002 - AT&T Chiller (Raymond Norman / EXP) Pre-development meeting: N/A

Description of Work

Installation of a parking pad, sound wall, fencing and landscaping to buffer sound and visibility of a trailer-mounted HVAC chiller proposed at the W. Magnolia Avenue and alley (AKA Conrad Street) corner of the property. The trailer-mounted chiller is needed to allow the replacement of the HVAC chiller within the AT&T building and this is the only location available on the property. AT&T may also use this as a location to store the chiller for use on other sites on an as-needed basis.

Sound wall: The sound wall will be located along the east (alley) frontage of the property to block sound to the nearby residential uses to the east. The wall will be supported by steel columns on concrete piers. The absorptive wall system is constructed with tongue and groove PVC panels that are stacked between steel columns. The wall panels will have a smooth finish and a color that closely matches the existing brick screen wall along the alley to the south. The sound wall will abut the existing brick screen wall.

Fencing: The existing 6' tall black steel open mesh fence around the planting area and sidewalk will be partially removed to accommodate the new 6' tall screen fence and gate around the chiller. The new 6' tall screen fence will have smooth, horizontal slats with small gaps partially between the slats (see attached image).

Landscaping: One of the two existing magnolia trees needs to be removed. The remaining magnolia tree will have a barrier located at the branch drip line to protect the tree and its roots during construction. There will be five new silhouette sweetgum trees planted along the west side of the new screen fencing to provide additional screening.

Parking pad: Access to the concrete parking pad will require approximately 30' of the existing sidewalk and curb to be replaced with a reinforced concrete sidewalk and mountable curb. The road will be striped to indicate no parking in front of the gated entrance to the parking pad. No existing on-street parking spaces will be removed or modified to accommodate this project.

Staff Comments

With the adoption of the new City zoning ordinance, as of January 2020, the AT&T building is located within the review boundary of the Design Review Board. Previously, this building would not have been reviewed by the board or subject to the Downtown Design Guidelines.

AT&T is beginning the process to replace the HVAC chiller for this facility which requires the trailer-mounted chiller until the work is complete, which could take up to two years. Because of the duration of the project, the sound wall is required because the chiller will be continuously running and there are nearby residences. The sound wall has to be made of a lightweight system because it sits over buried fuel lines that cannot be easily relocated and must use as small of foundations/piers as possible.

The zoning ordinance does not permit ground-mounted mechanical equipment to be located within a front yard, which is defined as the area between the primary building and the front property line.

Because this building has multiple road frontages, it was determined that the W. Depot Avenue

frontage is considered the “front” because it has the main entrance to the building. The W. Magnolia Avenue frontage is considered the “rear” so the trailer-mounted chiller is permissible. The zoning regulations also require that ground-mounted mechanical equipment be “screened from public view by a decorative wall, solid fence, or year-round landscaping that is compatible with the architecture and landscaping of a development site. The wall, fence, or plantings must be of a height equal to or greater than the height of the mechanical equipment being screened.” The guidelines have similar recommendations; locate mechanical equipment on non-primary facades and provide screening.

The guidelines do not address long term storage of equipment such as parking a trailer. The most similar type of use the guidelines do address is surface parking lots, which are recommended to be screened with decorative walls, fencing and landscaping. The proposal has taken this into consideration by providing the 6’ tall screen fencing, retaining one mature magnolia tree, and installing five new silhouette sweetgum trees.

Applicable guidelines

SECTION 1.A.3. (PARKING FACILITIES)

It is important to ensure that parking facilities (both public and private) are safe, accessible, and clearly marked. New parking facilities should be designed to be attractive, compatible additions to downtown. In general, new parking facilities should remain subordinate to the street scene.

GUIDELINES

- 3c. Locate surface parking lots to the side or rear of buildings. No surface parking lots should be created in front of buildings.
- 3d. Screen surface lots, where they abut a public sidewalk, with decorative walls, fencing and landscaping.

SECTION 1.B.7. (MECHANICAL EQUIPMENT AND SERVICE UTILITIES)

Utilities can include telephone and electrical lines, ventilation systems, gas meters, air conditioners, fire protection, telecommunication and alarm systems. Adequate space for these utilities should be planned in a project from the outset and they should be designed such that their visual and noise impacts are minimized.

GUIDELINES

- 7a. Minimize the visual impact of mechanical equipment through screens or recessed/low-profile equipment.
- 7b. Do not locate units on a primary facade.

- 7c. Screen rooftop vents, heating/cooling units and related utilities with parapet walls or other screens. Consider sound-buffering of the units as part of the design.
- 7d. Locate utility connections and service boxes on secondary walls.
- 7e. Reduce the visual impacts of trash storage and service areas by locating them at the rear of a building or off an alley, when possible.

Staff Recommendation

APPROVE Certificate 2-B-20-DT as submitted.

3. 2-C-20-DT

117 S. Central St. / Parcel ID 94 E G 017 - Carleo's Rooftop Addition
(Smee and Busby Architects) Pre-development meeting: N/A

Description of Work

Construction of a one-story addition to the rooftop of this one-story building.

Staff Comments

The applicant has requested a workshop to get feedback from the board that can be incorporated into a revised submittal for the March board meeting.

Applicable guidelines

SECTION 1.C.1. (ROOFLINES AND ADDITIONS)

Alterations of the rooflines of historic buildings are not appropriate. A one-story rooftop addition, including railings, may be possible on taller buildings if it is inconspicuous from the public right-of-way. Additions should be set back from the primary elevation of the building, and should not damage character-defining features, including parapets and side walls. These walls are often topped by coping stones offering contrasting color or texture, or contain cornices, decorative grills, chimneys, corbelled brickwork and other architectural elements. Rooftop additions are almost never appropriate on buildings less than four stories in height.

GUIDELINES:

- 1a. Preserve or restore historic roofline features, including parapet walls and cornices.
- 1b. Design rooftop additions to be complementary to the historic building in terms of materials and color.
- 1c. Avoid construction that maintains only the historic facade.

- 1d. Do not alter, obscure or destroy significant features of historic resources when constructing additions.
- 1e. Design rooftop additions so that they are not seen from adjoining streets and sidewalks.

Staff Recommendation

POSTPONE this request until the March 18, 2020 board meeting as requested by the applicant.

4. 2-D-20-DT

612 S. Gay St. / Parcel ID 95 I F 034 - Tennessee Theatre Expansion
(Whitney Manahan) Pre-development meeting: N/A

Description of Work

This proposal is to renovate the Mechanics Bank and Trust Company building at 612 S. Gay Street and add an addition to the rear that will connect to the Tennessee Theatre building and provide access between the two buildings.

DEMOLITION (SHEETS AD300, AD301, AD302, AD303, AD103)

- 1) Remove all existing windows except the arched, stained glass window above the main entrance and three large metal framed windows on the south (alley) elevation (Level 1 & 2).
- 2) Remove the awning on the Gay Street elevation.
- 3) Remove the fire escapes on the north and south elevations.
- 4) Remove doors and brick infill for new windows on the south elevation, as noted.

WINDOWS (SHEETS A300, AX300, AX301, A710)

- 1) Install new metal clad windows as proposed on sheet A300 and A710. All windows are to have insulated, clear glass, except those proposed with spandrel glass or tinted glass.
- 2) Gay Street elevation -- Spandrel glass is proposed in all windows on the left (north) side of the elevation (all Levels), the upper portion of the right (south) window (Level 2 only).
NOTE: The spandrel glass is proposed to hide the existing elevator and associated wall that is behind the windows on the left side of the building. The spandrel glass on the Level 2 portion of large window to the right of the main entrance is proposed to hide an existing interior wall.
- 3) Gay Street elevation – The lower portion of the large window to the right of the main

entrance is proposed with black tinted glass. NOTE: This is proposed to better more closely match the spandrel glass in the other windows and the interior space is utilitarian in nature.

- 4) South (alley) elevation – Spandrel glass will be used in the upper portion of five windows on Level 1 and all of three small windows on Level 2. NOTE: The spandrel glass is proposed to hide existing floor joists for Level 2 and existing interior walls Level 2.

GAY STREET ELEVATION (SHEETS A301, AX301)

- 1) Replace the existing, non-original, sconces with new sconces that illuminate the façade vertically. The sconces will remain in the same location, on either side of the main entrance of the building.
- 2) Replace the existing, non-original, metal storefront door system and replace with a new single wood door with glass and decorative hardware to mimic the design of the original doors. New mosaic tiles will also be installed at the entry. NOTE: A single door is required to meet the current building codes because two doors of the appropriate width will not fit within the existing opening.

SOUTH (ALLEY) ELEVATION (SHEETS A302, AX300)

- 1) Infill three existing basement level windows and one Level 2 doorway with brick to match the existing.
- 2) Remove existing grills and infill openings with brick to match the existing.
- 3) Repair stone and brick cornice to match existing.

NORTH ELEVATION (SHEET A303)

- 1) Infill wall openings with brick to match the existing, as indicated on sheet A303.
- 2) Remove and infill one existing, small window on Level 6 with brick to match the existing.

EAST (REAR) ELEVATION AND ADDITION (SHEETS AX300, A304, A170)

- 1) Construct addition that is the full height of the subject property, and one-story taller than the Tennessee Theatre building where it will attach. The addition will be inset from the south (alley) elevation approximately 1'-0" and inset from the north elevation approximately 0'-6".
- 2) The new addition will have horizontally oriented corrugated metal siding and insulated translucent wall panels. The translucent panels will only be on the south elevation.
- 3) There will be an opening under the addition that provides access to the rear of the adjacent building to the north and egress door for the subject building and access to the basement level Tennessee Theatre building.

- 4) The wall covering under the addition will be aluminum composite panels.

Staff Comments

This building is located within the Gay Street Commercial (National Register) Historic District so the Historic Resources section of the design guidelines are applicable. The addition to the rear of the building will attach to the Tennessee Theatre which is located within the H (Historic) overlay district, so the connection must also be approved by the Historic Zoning Commission. This building was previously approved for similar renovations (8-A-16-DT) with exception to the addition to the rear.

The spandrel and tinted glass on the ground level of the Gay Street elevation are not recommended by the guidelines, however, because of the existing conditions within the building, staff is recommending approval in this particular case. Regarding the tinted glass, this should have little impact on visibility into the ground floor because the windows are elevated higher than a typical storefront and the Level 1 and 2 window glass will have a more consistent look.

The addition to the rear of the building is for a new stair and provides access between the subject building and the Tennessee Theatre, which has purchased the majority of the subject building. The addition will also have to be approved by the Historic Zoning Commission since the Tennessee Theatre is within the H (Historic) overlay district. The location and materials of the addition are in conformance with the recommendations of the design guidelines, which are to locate additions to the rear, do not alter, obscure or destroy significant features, and differentiate the new addition from the historic structure.

Applicable guidelines

SECTION 1.C.1. (ROOFLINES AND ADDITIONS)

Alterations of the rooflines of historic buildings are not appropriate. A one-story rooftop addition, including railings, may be possible on taller buildings if it is inconspicuous from the public right-of-way. Additions should be set back from the primary elevation of the building, and should not damage character-defining features, including parapets and side walls. These walls are often topped by coping stones offering contrasting color or texture, or contain cornices, decorative grills, chimneys, corbelled brickwork and other architectural elements. Rooftop additions are almost never appropriate on buildings less than four stories in height.

GUIDELINES

- 1a. Preserve or restore historic roofline features, including parapet walls and cornices.

- 1b. Design rooftop additions to be complementary to the historic building in terms of materials and color. 1c. Avoid construction that maintains only the historic facade.
- 1d. Do not alter, obscure or destroy significant features of historic resources when constructing additions.
- 1e. Design rooftop additions so that they are not seen from adjoining streets and sidewalks.

SECTION 1.C.2. (STOREFRONTS)

Throughout downtown, historic buildings present a front elevation with an individual facade that is usually 25-35 feet wide. The storefronts are divided horizontally into three sections: bulkheads, solid or opaque, usually 18-24 inches tall; a plate glass storefront window 6-8 feet tall; and above it, a clear or patterned glass transom.

GUIDELINES

- 2a. Restore and maintain storefronts as they were originally.

SECTION 1.C.3. (ENTRANCES)

Formal entrances to front facades should be retained. This includes entrances that are located above street level and accessed by exterior stairs. Altering or removing the main entrance to grant street-level access is not appropriate.

GUIDELINES

- 3a. Establish recessed entries, either rectangular or with slightly canted sides, which are appropriate in storefronts.
- 3b. Allow for multiple entries on the first floor of the building, giving access to commercial space that may be divided into bays.
- 3c. Provide access to upper stories through additional entries.
- 3d. Maintain original height and materials for doors that are consistent with the use of the building, such as residential, commercial, or banking purposes.

C. HISTORIC RESOURCES SECTION 1.C.4. (WINDOWS)

Appropriate window appearance is significant in finishing a rehabilitation project. From a preservation standpoint, the first and best answer when determining a treatment for windows is to repair rather than replace them. If that is not possible, replacing only deteriorated portions is the next best alternative to total replacement. It is possible to replace window sills, rebuild all or parts of window sashes, and replace window glass, making original windows energy efficient and functional.

GUIDELINES

- 4a. Repair rather than replace historic windows.
- 4b. Replace windows if repairs are not possible with matching windows, including duplicating design, operation, material, glass size, muntin arrangements, profiles, and trim.
- 4c. Insert windows with the same pane configuration, materials and size as other buildings of the same general construction date, if no original windows are present.
- 4d. Maintain the relationship of solids to voids with new construction that is similar to other buildings in the district, including the typical width, height, spacing, and horizontal alignment of windows.

SECTION 1.C.5. (MASONRY)

Masonry features should be retained and repaired; materials, including mortar, should match the original mortar in color and composition. Mortar joints should be sized and struck to match the original. Belt courses, string courses, dripstones, quoins and contrasting brick and stone are common. These features should be preserved and repaired if necessary, and should be introduced on infill buildings.

GUIDELINES

- 5a. Repair masonry with stone or brick and mortar that match the original. 5b. Do not paint masonry that has never been painted.

SECTION 1.C.11. (INAPPROPRIATE PRIOR CHANGES)

Buildings may have been altered over time; some of those alterations may be inappropriate. In planning exterior rehabilitation, inappropriate changes should be reversed.

GUIDELINE

- 11a. During rehabilitation of historic buildings, restore components to the original or an approximate design.

Staff Recommendation

APPROVE Certificate 2-D-20-DT as submitted.

STAFF REPORT

5. CERTIFICATE NO. 1-A-20-DT

503 W. Clinch Avenue / Parcel ID 094LH011 – Installation of new hanging sign that is approximately 5.33 sqft and non-illuminated.

OTHER BUSINESS

6. INFILL HOUSING OVERLAY DISTRICT/DESIGN REVIEW BOARD

Gerald Green, Executive Director of Knoxville-Knox County Planning – Discuss the Infill Housing (IH) Overlay District and the potential of the Design Review Board taking over the review of those applications.

7. WORKSHOP

to discuss the proposed rooftop addition at 117 S. Central Street to begin immediately following the board meeting.