

## **AGENDA**

### **KNOXVILLE DOWNTOWN DESIGN REVIEW BOARD**

#### **MEETING OF NOVEMBER 20, 2019 - SMALL ASSEMBLY ROOM, 4:00 P.M.**

- ♦ Call to Order
- ♦ Introduction of Ex Officio Members and Visitors
- ♦ [Approval of Minutes of Previous Meeting](#)
- ♦ Certificates of Appropriateness
- ♦ Staff Report
- ♦ Other Business

#### **Certificates of Appropriateness:**

##### **1) [Certificate No. 10-A-19-DT](#)**

625 Market St. / Parcel ID 94 L G 013 - 625 Market St (Jeffrey Johnson / McCarty Holsaple McCarty Architects)

Pre-development meeting: N/A

#### **Description of Work**

Replacement of the existing revolving door that faces Market Street with a single metal door with sidelites. The door will have a full lite glass panel and sidelites that closely matches the original doors on the building. The door will be located in the opening that is adjacent to the sidewalk, not recessed like the doorway to the right (north).

Install new emergency LED light on the north elevation of the building.

#### **Staff Comments**

The General Building is listed on the National Register of Historic Places, so the Historic Resources section of the guidelines are applicable. The proposed door and sidelights are consistent in design with the original doors as documented by historic photographs and original construction drawings for the building. The main difference is the doorway original had double doors that were not as wide, however, the current building code requires a wider door for egress and two doors will not fit within the opening so the applicant is proposing a single door with sidelites.

The applicant has proposed awnings over the second story windows and a neon illuminated sign at the Market Street and Church Avenue corner of the building, however, the required information was not provided for staff or the board to review these elements. If the applicant chooses to move forward with these items, a new application must be submitted or this application must be postponed until the necessary information is provided.

Applicable guidelines:

#### **Section 1.C.3. (ENTRANCES)**

Formal entrances to front facades should be retained. This includes entrances that are located above street level and accessed by exterior stairs. Altering or removing the main entrance to grant street-level access is not appropriate.

#### **GUIDELINES:**

3a. Establish recessed entries, either rectangular or with slightly canted sides, which are appropriate in storefronts.

3b. Allow for multiple entries on the first floor of the building, giving access to commercial space that may be divided into bays.

3c. Provide access to upper stories through additional entries.

3d. Maintain original height and materials for doors that are consistent with the use of the building, such

as residential, commercial, or banking purposes.

**Section 1.C.7. (RECOMMENDED SIGNS)**

Commercial establishments need to advertise. However, advertising signs should be effective and appropriate to historic areas without contributing to visual clutter. Primary concerns are a sign's location, size, material, and illumination.

**GUIDELINES:**

7a. Locate signs above storefront windows, below second-story windows on the sign board, or on the storefront windows themselves (30% is maximum coverage), or off the front of the building as a projecting sign (maximum size: 9 square feet).

7b. Create signs that are proportional to the building where they are located.

7c. Do not light signs internally.

**Section 1.C.8. (AWNINGS)**

Awnings are allowed on historic buildings when they are appropriate to the building and are designed with traditional shapes, forms, and materials. If awnings are used, their overall size, shape, and projection from the building must be in proper proportion and scale to the building and contained within the window or door they shelter, and not cover adjacent wall surfaces. Canvas is usually the appropriate material for awnings.

**GUIDELINES:**

8a. Allow awnings in traditional shapes and materials.

**Staff Recommendation**

APPROVE Certificate 10-A-19-DT for the new Market Street entry door and sidelites, and new exterior emergency light on the north elevation. The second floor canopies and illuminated sign must be submitted as a new application with the information outlined on the application checklist.

**2) [Certificate No. 11-A-19-DT](#)**

205 W. Jackson Ave. / Parcel ID 94 E F 042 - Jackson Terminal (Carl Keaney)

Pre-development meeting: N/A

**Description of Work**

Installation of a new identification wall sign that is 14" tall by 144" (12'-0") wide and internally illuminated. The face of the sign is aluminum with routed copy and white acrylic in the copy. The sign identifies the name of the building (Jackson Terminal) and is located near to the top of the west elevation of the building (facing the Gay Street viaduct).

**Staff Comments**

This building is located within the Jackson Avenue Warehouse (National Register) Historic District so the Historic Resources section of the guidelines are applicable. The guidelines recommend that signs should be non-illuminated or externally illuminated and that wall signs be located on sign boards. The guidelines also recommend building name signs but do not provide any guidance for location or size. This building has a non-traditional design for downtown with its gabled roof and large overhang on the Jackson Avenue façade. It is common for building identification signs to be located near the top of a building. Because of the atypical design of the building, the location of the sign may be appropriate. The type of illumination consistent with previous approvals by the board because the background (face) of the sign is made of an opaque material (metal) and the light only passes through the sign copy.

Applicable guidelines:

**Section 2.C.1. (RECOMMENDED SIGNS) -- The Warehouse District**

The entire Warehouse district is already listed on the National Register of Historic Places and these buildings are also eligible for local overlays. Signs should therefore be governed by historic standards. These recommendations recognize that certain types of signs are dominant in the Warehouse District and should be encouraged in the future.

**GUIDELINES:**

1b. Wall signs on sign boards mounted flush to the building facade

1e. Building name sign and/or building directory

**Staff Recommendation**

APPROVE Certificate 11-A-19-DT as submitted.

**3) Certificate No. 11-B-19-DT**

428 S. Gay St. / Parcel ID 95 I A 032 - Hope Brothers (Oren Yarbrough / Design Innovation Architects)  
Pre-development meeting: N/A

**Description of Work**

This proposal is to clean, retouch and paint the existing masonry façade, install new metal and glass suspended canopy on the Gay Street façade, remove existing double hung windows and replace with new aluminum windows, remove existing decals on the ground floor storefront glazing and restore transom glazing with a back lit frit pattern based off the historic photos, replaced existing storefront at the promenade with a moveable partition wall and retail entry for the ground floor tenant and new private entry for upstairs tenants, enlarge one window opening on the rear of the building for each upper floor to install a door, and install one new metal balcony on each of the upper floors.

**STOREFRONT (GAY STREET ELEVATION)**

Remove existing product decals and repair/re-apply frit to glazing per the original design. The spandrel glass is to be backlit per the original images provided on plan sheet A-111.

**CANOPY (GAY STREET ELEVATION)**

Remove existing fabric awning and install a new pre-finished metal and opaque glass canopy. The canopy will be supported by pre-finished metal canopy support rods and embed plates mounted to the face of the building. LED strip lighting will be located on the underside of the canopy, along the building, to illuminate the existing entry signage and sidewalk seating area.

**WINDOWS (UPPER FLOORS, GAY STREET ELEVATION)**

Remove existing wood, double-hung windows and replace with new aluminum casement windows with similar dimensions, exterior characteristics, and profiles as existing. The existing wood framing around the windows are to be repaired or replaced with aluminum with similar dimensions, exteriors characteristics, and profiles as existing.

**MASONRY (GAY STREET ELEVATION)**

All existing brick is to be cleaned, retucked, and painted. The existing stone around the storefront on the ground level is to be cleaned and repaired as necessary.

**STOREFRONT (PROMENADE ELEVATION)**

Remove the existing storefront/wall system and install a new moveable/folding glass partition wall system and a secondary entry for the upstairs tenants. The new storefront system will be made of metal and glass. The existing storefront is built over the property line and onto the Promenade structure. The new storefront will not extend any further onto the Promenade structure but will enclose more of the Promenade by squaring off the existing angled wall where the moveable partition wall is proposed.

**WINDOWS (UPPER FLOORS, PROMENADE ELEVATION)**

Remove existing wood, double-hung windows and replace with new aluminum casement windows in existing openings. The middle windows on each of the upper floors will be replaced with an aluminum door and transom window, which will require the opening to be enlarged by removing brick to the finished floor elevation.

**MASONRY (PROMENADE ELEVATION)**

All existing brick is to be cleaned and retucked.

**BALCONIES (UPPER FLOORS, PROMENADE ELEVATION)**

Install new balconies that are approximately 26'-0" wide on all floors and 6'-0" deep at the 2nd floor and 5'-0" deep at floors 3-5. The balconies will have pre-finished metal supports and guardrails, and pressure treated wood decking.

**BASEMENT LEVEL (FIRE STREET ELEVATION)**

Remove and replace existing window with new aluminum casement window in existing opening. Install new doors in existing door opening for future exterior stair, landing and entry vestibule.

**Staff Comments**

The Arnold, Henegar, Doyle & Co. Building (circa 1898), also known as the Hope Brothers Building, is within the Gay Street Commercial (National Register) Historic District so the Historic Resources section of the design guidelines do apply. The primary concern is retaining the historic architectural features of the character defining elevation(s) of a building. In this case the, the Gay Street elevation is the only character defining elevation because the rear elevation was not intended to be as highly visible as it is today and was constructed without ornamentation. In the National Register nomination, the building is described as having a Vernacular Victorian Commercial design with Romanesque influences. The rear elevation does not have a distinguishable architectural style.

The existing windows on the upper floors of the Gay Street elevations are single pane, double-hung wood windows, with the exception of the transom windows and arched windows on the 4th floor. The existing windows are a character defining element of the building and the windows should either be repaired or replaced in-kind, which is a recommendation of the design guidelines. Changing the style, size and profile of the windows is not recommended.

The use of a rigid canopy is historically atypical downtown but there were used. Fixed and retractable canvas awnings were much more common on Gay Street but are (were) canopies at the Sterchi Brothers (Lofts) and Farragut Hotel (Hyatt Place), and at least one smaller retail building (jewelry store) on the 600 block where the Centre Square buildings are currently located. Another notable place where canopies are historically more common is along Union Avenue with the Daylight, Pembroke, and Grand Union buildings. The Arnstein Building is also on Union Avenue but its canopy is on the Market Street frontage. The proposed canopy meets the guidelines by being scaled to fit within (above) the opening it shelters and does not cover adjacent wall surfaces, and it is the use of metal is a traditional material for canopies. However, the extensive use of glass and the thin profile are not a traditional shape or material. The board must determine if the proposed canopy, design, materials, shape, form, scale and materials meet the recommendations and intent of the design guidelines for this building and location.

The storefront on the Gay Street elevation is not being modified other than to remove the existing applied decals (advertisements) and restoring the transom glazing with a back lit frit pattern. Since this is based on historic documentation, this meets the guideline recommendations. The space in the storefront displays will be reused as a mailroom for the tenants and for stairs that provide access to the basement level. Only the handrails for the stairs will be visible from the sidewalk because the stairs go down, so visibility into the space will not be blocked as recommended by the guidelines.

On the rear of the building, the proposed window replacement, door installation and balconies can be supported by recommendations from the National Park Service because this elevation is not character defining for the building. In order for the balconies to be installed, an easement must be approved by City Council since they extend over public right-of-way. A potential concern that the applicant may need to address before City Council approval is the potential damage to the Promenade roof by anything that may fall or be thrown off the balconies. If the board approves the balconies but applicant decides not to install them, staff is recommending that the window openings not be enlarged and a window be reinstalled rather than the proposed door.

The rear storefront along the Promenade is currently constructed on the Promenade structure but the proposal will increase the enclosed area on the Promenade the existing rear wall that is angled back toward the building is squared off. This storefront system must be approved by the City of Knoxville and/or City Council before they can obtain permits.

Applicable guidelines:

**Section 1.C.2. (STOREFRONTS)**

Throughout downtown, historic buildings present a front elevation with an individual facade that is usually 25-35 feet wide. The storefronts are divided horizontally into three sections: bulkheads, solid or opaque, usually 18-24 inches tall; a plate glass storefront window 6-8 feet tall; and above it, a clear or patterned glass transom.

**GUIDELINES:**

2a. Restore and maintain storefronts as they were originally.

Section 1.C.4. (WINDOWS)

Appropriate window appearance is significant in finishing a rehabilitation project. From a preservation standpoint, the first and best answer when determining a treatment for windows is to repair rather than replace them. If that is not possible, replacing only deteriorated portions is the next best alternative to total replacement. It is possible to replace window sills, rebuild all or parts of window sashes, and replace window glass, making original windows energy efficient and functional.

GUIDELINES:

- 4a. Repair rather than replace historic windows.
- 4b. Replace windows if repairs are not possible with matching windows, including duplicating design, operation, material, glass size, muntin arrangements, profiles, and trim.
- 4c. Insert windows with the same pane configuration, materials and size as other buildings of the same general construction date, if no original windows are present.
- 4d. Maintain the relationship of solids to voids with new construction that is similar to other buildings in the district, including the typical width, height, spacing, and horizontal alignment of windows.

Section 1.C.5. (MASONRY)

Masonry features should be retained and repaired; materials, including mortar, should match the original mortar in color and composition. Mortar joints should be sized and struck to match the original. Belt courses, string courses, dripstones, quoins and contrasting brick and stone are common. These features should be preserved and repaired if necessary, and should be introduced on infill buildings.

GUIDELINES:

- 5a. Repair masonry with stone or brick and mortar that match the original.
- 5b. Do not paint masonry that has never been painted.

Section 1.C.8. (AWNINGS)

Awnings are allowed on historic buildings when they are appropriate to the building and are designed with traditional shapes, forms, and materials. If awnings are used, their overall size, shape, and projection from the building must be in proper proportion and scale to the building and contained within the window or door they shelter, and not cover adjacent wall surfaces. Canvas is usually the appropriate material for awnings.

GUIDELINES:

- 8a. Allow awnings in traditional shapes and materials.

Section 1.C.9. (LIGHTING)

Storefront windows may be lit with interior fixtures, entrances may be lit with overhead fixtures, and gooseneck fixtures can be used to highlight signs. Illumination may also be used to wash the building in light, emphasizing its distinctive architectural finishes.

GUIDELINE:

- 9a. Use indirect lighting of the building facade where appropriate.

Section 1.C.11. (INAPPROPRIATE PRIOR CHANGES)

Buildings may have been altered over time; some of those alterations may be inappropriate. In planning exterior rehabilitation, inappropriate changes should be reversed.

GUIDELINE:

- 11a. During rehabilitation of historic buildings, restore components to the original or an approximate design.

**Staff Recommendation**

APPROVE Certificate 11-B-19-DT subject to the following conditions:

- 1) Repair the existing windows on the upper floors of the Gay Street elevation or replace them in-kind, duplicating design, operation, material, glass size, profiles and trims.
- 2) Obtaining approval from the City of Knoxville and/or City Council to install the balconies over the Promenade structure on the rear (east) elevation. If the applicant does not obtain approval for the balconies or otherwise decides not to install the balconies, windows shall be installed within the existing opening rather than the proposed doors.
- 3) Obtaining approval from the City of Knoxville and/or City Council to allow the storefront and entry for upstairs tenants to be located on the Promenade structure.

4) Attaching the canopy support rods to the building through the mortar joints of the stone pilasters. Staff may approve an alternative if it is shown that connecting solely through the mortar joints is not possible, however, this should be done so as to damage the stone as minimally as possible.

**4) Certificate No. 11-C-19-DT**

530 S. Gay St. / Parcel ID 95 I G 019 - Hyatt Place (Design Innovation Architects)

Pre-development meeting: N/A

**Description of Work**

This proposal is to expand the existing rooftop deck by constructing 1,337 sqft of interior space with a bar and seating, and a new 1,294 sqft exterior deck. Only a small portion of the existing rooftop deck and structures will be modified to accommodate the new construction.

**NEW STRUCTURE (INTERIOR SPACE)**

Location: The new interior space (structure) is located approximately 42' from the Gay Street (west) elevation, 77' from the rear (east) elevation, and 5'-6" from the Clinch Avenue (south) elevation.

Height: The top of the roof is approximately 14'-6" about the top of the parapet wall. The finished floor elevation of the addition (and exterior deck) is approximately 1' below the parapet wall so the top of the roof is approximately 15'-6" above the finished floor elevation.

Materials: The proposed materials will match those used on the existing rooftop deck and additions, including fiber cement board siding and black aluminum storefront.

Mechanical: The mechanical equipment for the interior space, such as HVAC, will be located to the rear (north) of the new addition and will sit on top of an existing structure that is lower in height so the unit(s) will be hidden from view.

**EXTERIOR DECK**

Location: The new deck will be set back from the back side of the parapet wall approximately 4' from the Gay Street and Clinch Avenue elevations, and approximately 6' from the north elevation. There is a walkway that connects the existing and new exterior decks that is located between the new addition and the parapet wall along the Clinch Avenue (south) elevation. This walkway has gates on either end and is for emergency egress purposes only and not intended to be open for general use by patrons. The handrails that wrap around the exterior deck and the walkway extend approximately 2'-9" above the top of the parapet wall.

Height: Approximately 1'-9" above the existing roof.

Materials: Steel railing, and IPE wood decking to match the existing rooftop deck.

**Staff Comments**

The Hyatt Place hotel (Farragut Building) is within the Gay Street Commercial (National Register) Historic District so the Historic Resources section of the design guidelines do apply. The proposal meets the recommendations of the guidelines by preserving the historic roofline features, using complimentary materials and color, and designing the addition so it is not visible from adjoining streets and sidewalks.

Applicable guidelines:

**Section 1.C.1. (ROOFLINES AND ADDITIONS)**

Alterations of the rooflines of historic buildings are not appropriate. A one-story rooftop addition, including railings, may be possible on taller buildings if it is inconspicuous from the public right-of-way. Additions should be set back from the primary elevation of the building, and should not damage character-defining features, including parapets and side walls. These walls are often topped by coping stones offering contrasting color or texture, or contain cornices, decorative grills, chimneys, corbelled brickwork and other architectural elements. Rooftop additions are almost never appropriate on buildings less than four stories in height.

**GUIDELINES:**

- 1a. Preserve or restore historic roofline features, including parapet walls and cornices.
- 1b. Design rooftop additions to be complementary to the historic building in terms of materials and color.
- 1c. Avoid construction that maintains only the historic facade.
- 1d. Do not alter, obscure or destroy significant features of historic resources when constructing additions.
- 1e. Design rooftop additions so that they are not seen from adjoining streets and sidewalks.

**Staff Recommendation**

APPROVE Certificate 11-C-19-DT as submitted.

**Certificate No. 11-D-19-DT**

125 E. Jackson Ave. / Parcel ID 95 H A 023 - (Meagan Grohol / R2R Studio, LLC)

Pre-development meeting: N/A

**Description of Work**

The proposal is a revision to COA 9-C-19-DT and include modifications to the courtyard only.

- 1) Modify the large planter located on the central axis in the upper terrace into seating around a fire table element.
- 2) Add a bar at the upper terrace, located below the stairs to the balcony at the rear of the courtyard. These elements have been added to provide more equal amenities for the two future restaurant tenants. See sheets L101 and L14 for the current layout and planting plan.
- 3) Modify the entry wall adjacent to Jackson Avenue to address the changes in elevation and screen the low interior walls and ramp elements. See plan sheet L200.

**Staff Recommendation**

APPROVE Certificate 11-D-19-DT as submitted.

**Staff Report:**

None

**Other Business:**

- 5) [Review the amendments to the Administrative Rules and Procedures and make recommendation of approval to the Planning Commission.](#)
- 6) [Review the amendments to the Downtown Design Guidelines and make recommendation of approval to the Planning Commission and City Council.](#)
- 7) A workshop to discuss a proposal at the former State Supreme Court building, located at the corner of Locust Street and Cumberland Avenue, will begin immediately following the board meeting in the Small Assembly Room.