

Meeting Minutes

Historic Zoning

May 21, 2020

4:00 P.M. | Telemeeting via Zoom

A video of this meeting will be available in the meeting archive pages here:

https://knoxmpc.org/historic/

KNOX COUNTY HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION					
Commissioner	Present	Absent	Excused	Arrived	
Bill Belser	Х				
Mike Crowder	Х				
George Ewart, Chair	Х				
Kim Isenberg	Х				
Scott Smith, Vice Chair		X			

Staff/Others Present	Affiliation
Lindsay Crockett	Knoxville-Knox County Planning
Laura Edmonds	Knoxville-Knox County Planning
Amy Brooks	Knoxville-Knox County Planning
Mike Reynolds	Knoxville-Knox County Planning
Christina Magrans	City Law Department
Peter Ahrens	City Plans Review and Building Inspections
Jonn Harris	Neighborhood Representative

Knox County Historic Zoning Comm. Chair George Ewart called the meeting to order at 8:30 a.m. Roll call was taken and it was noted there was a county quorum. Comm. Ewart stated that the meeting is being televised and recorded. He also asked that speakers limit their presentations to five minutes and to sign in when they reach the podium. Applicants or members of the public who wished to speak on an Agenda Item were sworn in. He further noted that any appeals to Commission decisions can be taken to Chancery Court if appealed within 60 days.

Action: Comm. Crowder moved to approve the January 16, 2020 Knox County Historic Zoning Commission Minutes. The Motion was seconded by Comm. Isenberg. A roll-call vote was taken. The Motion carried unanimously.

RESULT: Approved 4-0.

STAFF REPORTS

None

REPORTS TO COMMISSION

There was no report to Commission.

Knox County Certificates of Appropriateness

Village of Concord HZ

10817 Third Dr. / Parcel ID 153 043 — Installation of above-ground pool (5-C-20-HZ) **Discussion:** Lindsay Crockett reviewed the staff report and staff recommendation of approval.

John Harris, 1009 Olive Road, Knoxville, TN was present to discuss to the application for review. Mr. Harris stated that the Neighborhood is in support of Staff's Recommendation.

Action: Comm. Crowder moved that the application submitted for 10817 Third Drive be approved based on the evidence submitted, the information provided, and per staff recommendation. The Motion was seconded by Comm. Isenberg. A roll-call vote was taken. The Motion carried unanimously.

Result: Approved 4-0.

Other Business

None

There being no further County Business, the Knox County Historic Zoning Commission Meeting was adjourned and turned over to the City.

KNOXVILLE HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION				
Commissioner	Present	Absent	Excused	Arrived
Rick Blackburn	Χ			
Bart Carey, Chair			Х	
Faris Eid			Х	
Casey Fox	Χ			
Dasha Lundy	Χ			
Lorie Matthews	Χ			
Dationa Mitchell, Vice Chair	Χ			
Sandi Swilley	Х			
Stanton Webster	Х			

Staff/Others Present	Affiliation
Lindsay Crockett	Knoxville-Knox County Planning
Laura Edmonds	Knoxville-Knox County Planning
Amy Brooks	Knoxville-Knox County Planning
Mike Reynolds	Knoxville-Knox County Planning
Christina Magrans	City Law Department
Peter Ahrens	City Plans Review and Building Inspections
Arin Streeter	Fourth & Gill Neighborhood Representative
James Pierce	Old North Knoxville Neighborhood Representative
Jim Klonaris	Owner/Applicant
Daniel Sanders	Owner/Applicant

Juan Mino	Owner/Applicant
Nina Reineri	Owner/Applicant
Laurence Eaton	Applicant
Logan Higgins	Applicant

Knoxville Historic Zoning Comm. Vice-Chair Dationa Mitchell called the meeting to order at 8:42 a.m. Roll call was taken and it was noted there was a city quorum. Comm. Mitchell stated that the meeting is being televised and recorded. She also asked that speakers limit their presentations to five minutes and to sign in when they reach the podium. Applicants or members of the public who wished to speak on an Agenda Item were sworn in. She further noted that any appeals to Commission decisions can be taken to Chancery Court if appealed within 60 days.

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

Action: Comm. Swilley moved to approve the April 16, 2020 Knoxville Historic Zoning Commission Minutes. The Motion was seconded by Comm. Webster. A roll-call vote was taken. The Motion carried unanimously.

RESULT: Approved 7-0.

STAFF REPORTS

Lindsay Crockett reported the Level 1 Certificates approved since last meeting.

REPORTS TO COMMISSION

There was no report to Commission.

Knoxville Certificates of Appropriateness

Fourth and Gill H

714 Haynes Place / Parcel ID 81 M G 015 — Retaining walls, basement modifications, porch repair (5-H-20-HZ)

Discussion: Lindsay Crockett reviewed the staff report and staff recommendation of approval.

Daniel Sanders, 714 Haynes Place, was present to discuss the application for review. Mr. Sanders wanted to add that the Design Guidelines state that secondary entrances should not mimic the primary entrance. Mr. Sanders further explained that he's decided to move towards the half-light in the secondary entrances so that they would mirror the new windows with three-light half glass. Mr. Sanders also stated that they are in agreement with Staff Recommendation.

Arin Streeter, 925 Eleanor Street, Fourth & Gill Neighborhood Representative, was present to discuss the application for review. Mr. Streeter stated that the Neighborhood did not have any concerns and is in agreement with Staff Recommendation particularly the details of the windows and door be approved per staff review.

Action: Comm. Matthews moved that the application submitted for 714 Haynes Place be approved based on the evidence submitted, the information provided, and per staff recommendation. The Motion was seconded by Comm. Blackburn. A roll-call vote was taken. The Motion carried unanimously.

Result: Approved 7-0.

610 Caswell Ave. / Parcel ID 81 M N 003 - Rear deck (5-J-20-HZ)

Discussion: Lindsay Crockett reviewed the staff report and staff recommendation of approval.

Nina Reineri, 140 E. Glenwood, Knoxville, TN. Mr. Reineri briefly explained the project for consideration and made herself available to any questions or concerns the Commission may have. Lastly, Ms. Reineri stated that she is in agreement with Staff Recommendation.

Arin Streeter, 925 Eleanor Street, Fourth & Gill Neighborhood Representative, was present to discuss the application for review. Mr. Streeter stated that the Neighborhood did not express any concerns with this project since it is located at the rear of the house and very minimally visible from anywhere.

Action: Comm. Swilley moved that the application submitted for 610 Caswell Avenue be approved based on the evidence submitted, the information provided, and per staff recommendation. The Motion was seconded by Comm. Webster. A roll-call vote was taken. The Motion carried unanimously.

Result: Approved 7-0.

Market Square

4 Market Square / Parcel ID 94 L E 031 - Installation of awning (5-F-20-HZ)

Discussion: Lindsay Crockett reviewed the staff report and staff recommendation.

Jim Klonaris, 719 Luttrell Street, was present to discuss the application for review. Mr. Klonaris explained the reasoning for the request to remove the existing canvas awning and installation of a metal standing seam awning of the same size, shape, and placement of the existing awning. Mr. Klonaris shared the difference in longevity and cost of a canvas awning versus a metal awning. Mr. Klonaris went on to explain that the request for a metal awning ultimately comes down to financial implication, and with COVID-19 and the cafe being closed for over two months and a large loss of revenue, it's not financially feasible to replace the existing awning with canvas. Lastly, Mr. Klonaris explained a few more challenges that pertain to the canvas awning such as the existing holes in the canvas, the nearby trees and natural leave problems, and the inability to clean the canvas results in it deteriorating rather quickly. Mr. Klonaris asked that the Commission truly consider the replacement of the existing canvas awning with a metal standing seam awning.

Commissioner Blackburn asked when the canvas awning was last replaced at this cafe, and if the applicant would consider an acrylic or vinyl awning. Lindsay Crockett agreed that vinyl would not be an appropriate material for the canopy.

Further discussion ensued on the slope of the awning, the expense of having it professionally cleaned, the color of the awning, and not wanting to set precedent with the approval of a metal awning.

Mr. Klonaris clarified that he would be leaving the frame of the existing awning, and the metal roofing system will solely replace the canvas with the metal awning.

Commissioner Matthews stated that the Café has such a prominent and beautiful patio, and she is struggling with approving the metal awning. Comm. Matthew feels that the metal awning really modernizes the building. Comm. Matthews asked Lindsay if she has any historical record of the building with an awning. Comm. Matthews went on to say that she would feel more comfortable with a smaller profile similar to that of Petros awning if the applicant insisted on metal.

Further discussion ensued amongst Commissioners on the precedent being set by the approval of a metal awning. The applicant said that he willing to look at alternative materials for the replacement of the canvas awning.

Action: Comm. Blackburn moved that the application submitted for 4 Market Square allowing staff to approve a replacement material on the existing frame. The Motion was seconded by Comm. Matthews.

Comm. Blackburn amended his motion to add that the applicant will vet the proposed material with HZC staff. The Amended Motion was seconded by Comm. Matthews.

Comm. Blackburn amended his motion to also approve the associated wood fascia repairs on the storefront system. The Amended Motion was seconded by Comm. Matthews. A roll-call vote was taken. The Motion carried unanimously.

Result: Approved 7-0.

Old North Knoxville H

1419 Harvey Street / Parcel ID 81 L R 015 - Demolition of contributing structure (5-I-20-HZ)

Discussion: Lindsay Crockett reviewed the staff report and staff recommendation of approval.

Juan Mino, 425 E. Scott Avenue, Knoxville, TN, was present to discuss the application for review. Mr. Mino wanted to add that the house was subject to a major fire.

Lindsay Crockett read comments from Old North Knoxville Neighborhood Representative, James Pierce. Mr. Pierce explained that he did meet with the applicant and by no means an expert, and will not try to claim what's best for the situation but from what he saw the shed-roof addition was in the worst condition and a strong argument could be made for its demolition. Mr. Pierce stated that it appeared that the shotgun section could to be sound construction and could be salvageable, but there were concerns of prior fire damage, and he did see those areas of charred wood that would appear unsound. However, he would refer to the experts for their opinions of the condition of the house. As a Neighborhood Representative, he feels that every effort should be made to save at least the main structure of the home or provide professional statements as to why that cannot be done. Mr. Pierce said that in an ideal situation, we would have at least a historical structure to work with and review additions bringing it back

to the character of the historical era that it was built in. Once the structure is demolished, all that we are left with is an empty lot with no requirement to build anything on it. He also went onto to say that he did not see any loss of the outbuilding to be demolished. Ms. Crockett briefly summarized Mr. Pierce's additional comments after seeing the structural engineers report of the house.

Peter Ahrens, Director of Plans Review and Inspections, City of Knoxville, was present to answer questions. Mr. Ahrens stated that after reviewing the engineer's letter, it was evident that the house was not a typical construction meaning that the house was not built with your traditional studs with sheathing and plaster on the inside. With the stacked and dimensional lumber, Mr. Ahrens would agree that it would make things significantly more difficult and expensive to repair. Mr. Ahrens explained that he would agree with the structural engineer when they recommend coming back with studs with a more traditional type construction. He went on to say that it really does make it more cost prohibitive if the house needs to be repaired, with the repair being much more extensive than a traditionally constructed wall.

Commissioner Webster asked if other demolitions have been approved or denied in this zone. Lindsay Crockett, with assistance from neighborhood resident Laurence Eaton, answered by saying that 1417 Cornelia Street was requested to be demolished in 2009 and the neighborhood denied that request. Comm. Webster noted a shotgun style house was prominent in that area, and the loss of this home would be devastating.

Laurence Eaton, 409 W. Glenwood Avenue, Knoxville, TN. Mr. Eaton stated that he served on the Old North Knoxville Neighborhood Board at the time of the mentioned demolition request and has experience in the renovation of structures that were in similar condition to that of this house. Mr. Eaton explained that with housing prices are at a level that make it feasible to do extensive rehabilitation and nice finishes and he would hate to see this one go, also noting that is important to the diversity of homes in this community. He went on say that its important to maintain the fabric of housing styles and diversity in the neighborhood.

Juan Mino briefly explained that he has experience in the rehabilitation of houses in the Old North Knoxville Neighborhood. However, he feels that none of the houses had comparable damage to that of this one. Mr. Mino emphasized that the damage to this house is extensive and it's not feasible to rehabilitate the house without extensive costs, and that the Structural Engineer Report states the same. Mr. Mino emphasized that he would love to rehabilitate the house if it were possible, however, with the significant damage, it's not feasible.

Further discussion ensued amongst Commissioners on the Neighborhood Representative's concerns with the request for demolition and whether or not sufficient information has been provided to prove that the house is structurally deteriorated to warrant demolition. Lindsay Crockett briefly reviewed the Staff Recommendation and findings.

Commissioner Webster emphasized that the house is salvageable, and any structure can be considered salvageable. However, he clarified that the decision ultimately falls on whether or not it is financially feasible for the owner to pursue that. Mr. Webster would like to see more a detailed report in regards to the specific damage of the house in order to move forward with demolition.

Commissioner Fox asked the applicant if he would consider a partial demolition while still retaining the original historic shotgun structure.

Mr. Mino inquired about the process of applying and receiving financial assistance if he is going to be required to rehabilitate the house. Ms. Crockett provided information on housing rehabilitation grants.

Action: Comm. Matthews moved that the application submitted for 1419 Harvey Street be denied without prejudice of the proposed demolition per staff recommendation. The Motion was seconded by Comm. Webster. A roll-call vote was taken. The Motion carried unanimously.

Result: Denied without prejudice 7-0.

Action: Comm. Blackburn moved to adjourn the Knoxville Historic Zoning Commission meeting at 9:43 a.m. The Motion was seconded by Comm. Matthews. The Motion carried unanimously and the meeting was adjourned.

Other Business

Workshop: Lintz Lofts, 428 E. Scott Ave (Parcel ID 081 L Q 01501): Exterior rehabilitation