



A video of this meeting will be available in the meeting archive pages here:

<https://knoxmpc.org/historic/>

KNOX COUNTY HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION				
Commissioner	Present	Absent	Excused	Arrived
Bill Belser	X			
Mike Crowder			X	
George Ewart, Chair	X			
Kim Isenberg	X			
Scott Smith, Vice Chair			X	

Staff/Others Present	Affiliation
Lindsay Crockett	Knoxville-Knox County Planning
Laura Edmonds	Knoxville-Knox County Planning
Christina Magrans	City Law Department
Peter Ahrens	City Plans Review and Building Inspections
Jonathan Abel	Owner/Applicant

Knox County Historic Zoning Comm. Chair George Ewart called the meeting to order at 8:30 a.m. Roll call was taken and it was noted there was a county quorum. Comm. Ewart stated that the meeting is being televised and recorded. He also asked that speakers limit their presentations to five minutes and to sign in when they reach the podium. Applicants or members of the public who wished to speak on an Agenda Item were sworn in. He further noted that any appeals to Commission decisions can be taken to Chancery Court if appealed within 60 days.

Action: *Comm. Isenberg moved to approve the May 21, 2020 Knox County Historic Zoning Commission Minutes. The Motion was seconded by Comm. Belser. A roll-call vote was taken. The Motion carried unanimously.*

RESULT: Approved 3-0.

STAFF REPORTS

None

REPORTS TO COMMISSION

There was no report to Commission.

Knox County Certificates of Appropriateness

Village of Concord HZ

10817 Third Dr. / Parcel ID 153 043 – Modifications to outbuilding (6-E-20-HZ)

Discussion: Lindsay Crockett reviewed the staff report and staff recommendation of approval.

Jonathan Abel, 10817 Third Drive, was present and made himself available for any questions or concerns the Commission may have.

Action: *Comm. Isenberg moved that the application submitted for 10817 Third Drive be approved based on the evidence submitted, the information provided, and per staff recommendation. The Motion was seconded by Comm. Belser. A roll-call vote was taken. The Motion carried unanimously.*

Result: Approved 3-0.

Other Business

None

The Knox County Historic Zoning Commission adjourned at 8:38 a.m.

KNOXVILLE HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION				
Commissioner	Present	Absent	Excused	Arrived
Rick Blackburn	X			
Bart Carey, Chair	X			
Faris Eid	X			
Casey Fox	X			
Dasha Lundy	X			
Lorie Matthews	X			
Dationa Mitchell, Vice-Chair	X			
Sandi Swilley	X			
Stanton Webster	X			

Staff/Others Present	Affiliation
Lindsay Crockett	Knoxville-Knox County Planning
Laura Edmonds	Knoxville-Knox County Planning
Christina Magrans	City Law Department
Peter Ahrens	City Plans Review and Building Inspections
Arin Streeter	Fourth & Gill Neighborhood Representative
Michael Amicucci	Owner/Applicant
Laurence Eaton	Applicant
Logan Higgins	Applicant
Amanda Tompkins	Owner/Applicant

Knoxville Historic Zoning Comm. Chair Bart Carey called the meeting to order at 8:39 a.m. Roll call was taken and it was noted there was a city quorum. Comm. Carey stated that the meeting is being televised

and recorded. He also asked that speakers limit their presentations to five minutes and to sign in when they reach the podium. Applicants or members of the public who wished to speak on an Agenda Item were sworn in. He further noted that any appeals to Commission decisions can be taken to Chancery Court if appealed within 60 days.

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

Action: Comm. Blackburn moved to approve the May 21, 2020 Knoxville Historic Zoning Commission Minutes. The Motion was seconded by Comm. Webster. A roll-call vote was taken. The Motion carried unanimously.

RESULT: Approved 9-0.

STAFF REPORTS

Lindsay Crockett reported the Level 1 Certificates approved since last meeting.

REPORTS TO COMMISSION

There was no report to Commission.

Knoxville Certificates of Appropriateness

Fourth and Gill H

1009 Gratz Street / Parcel ID 81 M G 007 – Modifications to outbuilding (6-B-20-HZ)

Discussion: Lindsay Crockett reviewed the staff report and staff recommendation of approval.

Michael Amicucci, 1009 Gratz St., was present to discuss the application for review. Mr. Amicucci stated that the tree stump caused significant damage to the masonry on the southeast corner of the outbuilding, so this was an attempt to revitalize it without changing the original look of the structure.

Arin Streeter, 925 Eleanor Street, Fourth & Gill Neighborhood Representative, was present discuss the application for review. Mr. Streeter explained to the Commission that he had not received any concerns regarding the proposed modifications to the outbuilding. Mr. Streeter stated that the Neighborhood is in agreement with the staff recommendation with a few aesthetic modifications to the house.

Action: Comm. Eid moved that the application submitted for 1009 Gratz Street be approved based on staff recommendation with the following aesthetic modifications: columns are painted, metal brackets are covered up, the soffit original to the outbuilding be repaired and continued behind the gutters, and that a ceiling is installed and painted in the porch. The Motion was seconded by Comm. Matthews. A roll-call vote was taken. The Motion carried unanimously.

Result: Approved 9-0.

Old North Knoxville H

134 Leonard Place / Parcel ID 81 L H 006 - Construction of shed (6-D-20-HZ)

Discussion: Lindsay Crockett reviewed the staff report and staff recommendation of approval.

Amanda Tompkins, 134 Leonard Place, was present to discuss the application for review, and made herself available for any questions or concerns the Commission may have.

Ms. Crockett read feedback from the Old North Neighborhood Representative, James Pierce, stating that based on materials, size and style of the proposed accessory structure, the neighborhood is in support of Staff's recommendation for approval.

Action: Comm. Matthews moved that the application submitted for 134 Leonard Place be approved per staff recommendation, adding a condition that the eave overhang also be on the gable face as well as the side elevation. The Motion was seconded by Comm. Mitchell. A roll-call vote was taken. The Motion carried unanimously.

Result: Approved 9-0.

Old North Knoxville H

1017 Thompson Place / Parcel ID 81 L E 020 – Exterior rehabilitation (6-G-20-HZ)

Discussion: Lindsay Crockett reviewed the staff report and staff recommendation of approval.

The applicant was not present.

Lindsay Crockett read a written statement from the Old North Neighborhood Representative James Pierce. Mr. Pierce noted it is preferred that detailed dimension plans be submitted to Commission for review, also recommending that frequent City inspections should be required to ensure that the reconstruction matches the original. The Neighborhood is also in support of staff requirements for the chimney to be rebuilt regardless, working or not, based on their character-defining contribution to the structure. Lastly, the Neighborhood fully supports Staff requirements for window and vent installations.

Peter Ahrens, Director of Plans Review and Inspection, was present and clarified that if a Certificate of Appropriateness has been issued by the Historic Zoning Commission, the plans submitted to the City of Knoxville must be in compliance with the approved COA. If Plans Review and Inspections feel that the construction is not matching what was approved, it's their policy to notify the Historic Preservation Planner with Knoxville-Knox County Planning to ensure the construction is in compliance with the issued COA. For this project in particular, site visits are recommended by both the Historic Planner and Plans Review and Inspections staff.

Discussion ensued amongst Commission on whether or not the chimneys should be reconstructed. Commissioner Eid mentioned that before requesting that the applicant reconstruct the chimneys, the applicant should reach out to a structural engineer to help determine whether or not the chimney can structurally handle the reconstruction of another chimney being built on top of it.

Action: Comm. Eid moved that the application submitted for 1017 Thompson Place be approved based per staff recommendation with the following conditions: 1) to-scale drawings are submitted showing the work to be reconstructed relevant to the roof, elevations, windows, chimneys and all elements to be reconstructed; 2) the chimneys are desired to be reconstructed per staff recommendation, pending review by a structural engineer to verify the adequacy of the existing chimneys/leftover components of the chimneys/fireplaces bases that support the load. The reconstructed chimney does not have to be all

brick; it can be stud constructed, concrete block, or any other type of construction they wish to use as long as the façade and finish has the same brick appearance as the original. The Motion was seconded by Comm. Matthews. A roll-call vote was taken. The Motion carried unanimously.

Result: Approved 9-0.

Old North Knoxville H

428 E. Scott Ave. / Parcel ID 81 L Q 01501 – Exterior rehabilitation (6-H-20-HZ)

Discussion: Lindsay Crockett reviewed the staff report and staff recommendation of approval.

Logan Higgins, 133 S. Gay Street, was present to discuss the application for review. Mr. Higgins briefly reviewed the proposed project and the information provided in the packet. Mr. Higgins specifically touched on the inspiration of the front façade of the building, modifications to the site plan, and the scale and proportions of the building being appropriate for the record of time.

Laurence Eaton, 2225 Riverside Drive, was present and provided additional comments on the project. Mr. Eaton addressed the concern that the addition is considered “too contemporary” or “too modern” for its time and location. Mr. Eaton stated that he is in favor of exterior materials being approved internally by staff.

Ms. Crockett read written comments from Old North Knoxville Representative James Pierce into the record. Mr. Pierce requested that the proposed use and materials of the building should fit the neighborhood. Mr. Pierce shared the neighborhood’s concerns with window placement, entry locations, and front porch entries and awning. Lastly, Mr. Pierce requested that the discussed details be brought back before Commission to avoid a contemporary element detracting from the overall integrity of the building.

Logan Higgins reaffirmed that the neighborhood organization was contacted early on in the planning process and there have been ample opportunities to review and provide feedback, including going before the Commission as a workshop in the May HZC meeting. Laurence Eaton also mentioned that this exact packet was the design provided to the City of Knoxville in order to obtain a grant from the Historic Preservation Fund which is made available to help with the improvement of historic buildings.

Action: Comm. Eid recognized the neighborhood’s concerns, noting the building is challenging as it is not a standard residence, but a commercial building with a modern rear addition of concrete block, intended for an adaptive reuse. There is no way to modify this building to look like a standard house. The design that has been reviewed presents a good scale, consistent proportions, and is not objectionable. The fact that this building is different from the neighborhood’s historic houses will only further enhance nearby historic houses. With this in mind, Comm. Eid made a motion to approve based on staff recommendation, and based on the applicant’s note that the maximum difference in side elevation window sizes approvable by staff is plus or minus 8%. Comm. Eid also gave staff the capacity to approve metal windows whether they are steel or aluminum, noting there is no way to get windows of that size in a wood framing that would be of quality in this market. The Motion was seconded by Comm. Webster. A roll-call vote was taken. The Motion carried unanimously.

Result: Approved 9-0.

Old North Knoxville H

424 E. Scott Ave. / Parcel ID 81 L Q 01502 – Exterior rehabilitation (6-I-20-HZ)

Discussion: Lindsay Crockett reviewed the staff report and staff recommendation of approval.

Laurence Eaton, 2225 Riverside Drive, was present to discuss the application for review. Mr. Eaton wanted to provide some clarification on the mortar. Mr. Eaton explained that he believes that there's some Portland in this mortar, and it's stronger than lime-based mortar. The readily-available restoration mortar use for construction is a type O mortar and therefore, he agrees with staff recommendation. Mr. Eaton went on to explain the metal roof choice and why he feels very strongly about using materials with better environmental profile and a greater longevity. Mr. Eaton expressed some concern on staff's recommendation to install a standing seam roof and how that poses a financial constraint. Mr. Eaton requested that the Commission consider approving a ribbed metal roof or a 5-V metal roof with an appropriate color palette approved by staff.

Logan Higgins, was present and provided additional comments on the project. Mr. Higgins wanted to add that a 5-V roof is extremely similar to a standing seam roof.

Lindsay Crockett explained that a house on Grainger was approved for a ribbed metal roof after-the-fact; other ribbed metal roofs in the district are on new construction or were installed without HZC approval. Ms. Crockett went on to read the Neighborhood's written comments in the record by stating that the metal roofing provided in the application has been approved on Infill new construction.

Brief discussion ensued amongst Commission on the specific color specifications noted in the guidelines.

Laurence Eaton stated that his supplier doesn't offer the five-V metal roofing in any color, only Galvalume. However, he could reach out to other suppliers that might offer specific colors recommended in the guidelines. Mr. Eaton also brought to attention the option of painting the metal roof an appropriate color as opposed to purchasing a metal roof with a specific color.

Commissioner Blackburn asked how often the roof would need to be repainted on a standing seam galvalume roof. Mr. Eaton responded by saying that the warranty from Central States (available from Heely-Brown) says that painted color will last 40 years on a metal roof, or 25 years on a galvalume 5-V roof.

Brief discussion ensued amongst Commission on the proposed replacement door and access platform being added to the garage door.

Action: Comm. Matthews moved that the application submitted for 424 E. Scott Avenue be approved based on the evidence submitted, the information provided, and per staff recommendation and given the conversation about the metal roof, showing preference toward a five-V roof but ultimately leaving selection for final approval by Staff on how well it resembles the historic standing-seam metal roofs. The Motion was seconded by Comm. Blackburn. A roll-call vote was taken. The Motion carried unanimously.

Result: Approved 9-0.

Old North Knoxville H

238 E. Oklahoma Ave. / Parcel ID 81 M A 014 – Exterior rehabilitation; enclosure of rear porch (6-J-20-HZ)

Discussion: Lindsay Crockett reviewed the staff report and staff recommendation of approval.

Logan Higgins, 133 S. Gay Street, was present to discuss the application for review. Mr. Higgins stated that there is extensive damage to the foundation of this home, due to neglect. Therefore, this application is focused around repair. Mr. Higgins briefly summarized the work as proposed in the application.

Lindsay Crockett informed the Commission that the neighborhood did not express any major concerns with the proposed project and supported the Staff Recommendation.

Action: *Comm. Matthews moved that the application submitted for 238 E. Oklahoma Avenue be approved based on the evidence submitted, the information provided, and per staff recommendation. The Motion was seconded by Comm. Webster. A roll-call vote was taken. The Motion carried unanimously.*

Result: Approved 9-0.

Action: *Comm. Webster moved to adjourn the Knoxville Historic Zoning Commission meeting at 10:31 a.m. The Motion was seconded by Comm. Mitchell. The Motion carried unanimously and the meeting was adjourned.*

Other Business

Workshop: 1702 Highland Ave (Parcel ID 94 N L 016): Exterior rehabilitation