

A video of this meeting will be available in the meeting archive pages here:

<https://knoxmpc.org/historic/>

KNOX COUNTY HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION				
Commissioner	Present	Absent	Excused	Arrived
Bill Belser	N/A	X		
Mike Crowder	N/A	X		
George Ewart, Chair	N/A	X		
Kim Isenberg	N/A	X		
Scott Smith, Vice Chair	N/A	X		

There is no County Business this month.

Staff/Others Present	Affiliation
Lindsay Crockett	Knoxville-Knox County Planning
Dori Caron	Knoxville-Knox County Planning
Christina Magrans	City Law Department
Peter Ahrens	City Plans Review and Building Inspections

## STAFF REPORTS

None

## REPORTS TO COMMISSION

None

## Knox County Certificates of Appropriateness

None

## Other Business

None

<b>KNOXVILLE HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION</b>				
<b>Commissioner</b>	<b>Present</b>	<b>Absent</b>	<b>Excused</b>	<b>Arrived</b>
Rick Blackburn	X			
Bart Carey, Chair	X			
Faris Eid	X			
Casey Fox	X			
Dasha Lundy			X	
Lorie Matthews	X			
Dationa Mitchell, Vice-Chair	X			
Sandi Swilley	X			
Stanton Webster	X			

<b>Staff/Others Present</b>	<b>Affiliation</b>
Lindsay Crockett	Knoxville-Knox County Planning
Dori Caron	Knoxville-Knox County Planning
Amy Brooks	Knoxville-Knox County Planning
Christina Magrans	City Law Department
Lisa Hatfield	City law Department
Peter Ahrens	City Plans Review and Building Inspections
Bryan Berry	City Plans Review and Building Inspections
Bob Whetsel	Representing Fourth & Gill Neighborhood on 3-G-20-HZ
James Pierce	Old North Knoxville Neighborhood Representative
Kelly Wilson	Applicant
Bryan Davis	Applicant
Christopher Morgan	Applicant
Marshall Prado	Applicant
John Holmes	Applicant
Logan Carpenter	Applicant
Gary and Vicki Koontz	Applicant
Randy Guignard	Applicant

Knoxville Historic Zoning Comm. Chair Bart Carey called the meeting to order at 8:31 a.m. Roll call was taken and it was noted there was a city quorum. Comm. Carey stated that the meeting is being televised and recorded. He also asked that speakers limit their presentations to five minutes. Applicants or members of the public who wished to speak on an Agenda Item were sworn in. He further noted that any appeals to Commission decisions can be taken to Chancery Court if appealed within 60 days.

### **APPROVAL OF MINUTES**

***Action: Comm. Webster moved to approve the June 18, 2020 Knoxville Historic Zoning Commission Minutes. The Motion was seconded by Comm. Casey. The Motion carried unanimously.***

**RESULT:** Approved 8-0.

### **STAFF REPORTS**

Lindsay Crockett reported the Level 1 Certificates approved since last meeting.

## REPORTS TO COMMISSION

There was no report to Commission.

# Knoxville Certificates of Appropriateness

## Bijou Theatre Individual H Landmark

803 S. Gay Street / Parcel ID 094 P A 006 – Exterior rehabilitation, installation of canopies (7-C-20-HZ)

**Discussion:** Lindsay Crockett reviewed the staff report and staff recommendation of approval. Applicant Kelly Wilson with Baird and Wilson Sheetmetal, 2703 Bond Street, Knoxville, TN 37917 was present and noted they are using a very similar profile and are trying to extend the copper canopies over the doors to further preserve the building. There was no opposition present. There was a brief discussion on the final finish of the canopy above the stairway which the applicant stated would be a powder coat, matte finish that will approximate oxidized copper, a bronzed patina look with a uniform finish. After further discussion he stated it will not be a patina green but a bronze color.

**Action:** *Comm. Eid moved that the application submitted for 803 S. Gay Street be approved as proposed based on staff recommendation with the following conditions 1) the masonry repair project utilize mortar and replacement bricks consistent with the historic structure; 2) when possible, the anchors installed to support the canopy attempt to be installed into mortar joints instead of new holes in bricks, and clarifying that the finish will be a dark bronze as stated by the applicant. The Motion was seconded by Comm. Matthews.* A roll-call vote was taken. *The Motion carried unanimously.*

**Result:** Approved 8-0.

## McIntire Rouleau House Individual H Landmark

3004 Kingston Pike / Parcel ID 108 G A 003 – Construction of a rear deck (7-A-20-HZ)

**Discussion:** Lindsay Crockett reviewed the staff report and staff recommendation of approval. Applicant Bryan Davis, 3004 Kingston Pike, Knoxville, TN 37919 was present and had nothing to add to the staff report. There was no opposition present.

**Action:** *Comm. Blackburn moved that the application submitted for 3004 Kingston Pike be approved as proposed per staff recommendation. The Motion was seconded by Comm. Mitchell.* A roll-call vote was taken. *The Motion carried unanimously.*

**Result:** Approved 8-0.

## Fairmont-Emoriland NC

1943 Emoriland Blvd. / Parcel ID 069 L C 045 – Construction of an accessory structure (7-H-20-HZ)

**Discussion:** Lindsay Crockett reviewed the staff report and staff recommendation of approval. Applicant Christopher Morgan, 4605 Oreal Drive, Knoxville, TN 37918 was present and further noted that they are going to do 12 inch eaves on the front and rear elevations and that the homeowner requested the faux wood grain siding because the current asbestos shingles have that same grain but they will agree to the

smooth finish. Steve Cotham, representing the Fairmont-Emoriland neighborhood noted via an email to staff that the neighborhood reviewed the project, feels it meets the guidelines and supports staff recommendation to approve.

**Action:** *Comm. Eid moved that the application submitted for 1943 Emoriland Blvd. be approved as proposed per staff recommendation with the following conditions: 1) fiber cement board siding be smooth-finished; 2) eave overhangs extend across front and rear elevations. The Motion was seconded by Comm. Swilley.* A roll-call vote was taken. **The Motion carried unanimously.**

**Result:** Approved 8-0.

#### **Fourth and Gill H**

820 N. 3rd Ave. / Parcel ID 81 M K 017 - Construction of a new house (3-G-20-HZ)

**Discussion:** Lindsay Crockett reviewed the staff report and staff recommendation for postponement of the design review process while giving an overview of the history of the application, noting that information regarding the status of the ROW being a street or alley had begun to come in late yesterday. Lisa Hatfield clarified that this right of way is an alley as it was originally platted. She stated the law department is currently working with their Technical Services department to further research original documents and could provide them to the Commission at the next meeting. Applicant Trenton Smith with Smithco Properties, LLC was not present. Bob Whetsel, 1015 Luttrell Street, Knoxville, TN 37917, representing the Fourth & Gill Neighborhood, was present to discuss the application for review. He noted the neighborhood was in support of staff recommendation to postpone. Peter Ahrens, weighed in on how this being identified as an alley would affect permitting. He noted the zoning code does not articulate how access is gained, and as silent, his department would recognize the alley as an access ROW and issue permits accordingly. He did note there would be differences between a street vs. alley regarding setback requirements, therefore clarification for that is clearly necessary. Amy Brooks further noted there are several unanswered questions with multiple facets of this project not having final approvals therefore staff are recommending postponement in order to bring a complete set of information to the Commission so they can make a decision on the final design.

**Action:** *Comm. Eid moved that the application submitted for 820 N. 3rd Ave. be postponed for one month period to allow for Plans Review and Inspections, City Engineering, Knoxville- Knox County Planning and the City Law Department to come back before the Commission with a precise determination on whether there is anything that would preclude construction on this site, recognizing that the alley is a substandard street by the way it appears. The Motion was seconded by Comm. Mitchell.* A roll-call vote was taken. **The Motion carried unanimously.**

**Result:** Postponed [one month] 8-0.

1111 Eleanor St. / Parcel ID 81 M H 005 – Rear addition (7-G-20-HZ)

**Discussion:** Lindsay Crockett reviewed the staff report and staff recommendation of approval. Applicant Marshall Prado, 4212 S. Garden Road, Knoxville, TN 37919 was present and stated they were interested in restoring the quality of the house. The house has had many substandard renovations over its lifetime and the proposed rear renovations are to correct a lot of that older construction. He described issues they are encountering in the rear and how that relates to their proposal. He noted the details of the addition are to shed water off to the side and to maintain the rear dormer. Regarding the chimney they

are requesting to remove Mr. Prado stated its poorly chosen location makes it difficult to properly flash. Discussion continued regarding the overall project. There was no neighborhood representative present although the applicant noted they have spoken with him (Arin Streeter) about the project.

**Action:** *Comm. Eid moved that the application submitted for 820 N. 3rd Ave. be approved as proposed, acknowledging that the request for the one chimney to be demolished be approved based on its condition and its location, that the roofline makes it difficult to properly flash as can be seen both above and below the roof, that the applicants have indicated that there is moisture in the basement which is also troublesome, and further based on the applicant planning to preserve the remaining chimney as well as the rest of the house. The Motion was seconded by Comm. Blackburn.* A roll-call vote was taken. **The Motion carried unanimously.**

**Result:** Approved 8-0.

### Fort Sanders NC

211 16th St. / Parcel ID 094 N E 018 – Exterior rehabilitation, rear addition (4-E-20-HZ)

**Discussion:** Lindsay Crockett reviewed the staff report and staff recommendation of approval. Applicant John Holmes, 5914 Green Gables Drive, Knoxville, TN 37931 was present and noted this was similar to the house next door [that came before the Commission] at 215 16<sup>TH</sup> St. Regarding Condition #1 he noted they would reduce that window to a smaller size if they can obtain approval for the egress window on the right side of the house. Regarding Condition #2 they can provide the measurements for the [north elevation] dormer. Regarding Condition #[4], these windows are in front of a [new] stairwell. He would propose to put a large stained-glass window above the stairs to prevent a tripping hazard. There was discussion about the type and size of window that could go there. It was noted this was exterior modification pursuant to interior modification. It was suggested by Comm. Eid that staff be authorized to make the final determination of this component of the proposal. Regarding Condition #[3, north elevation] Mr. Holmes noted the window would be in the bathroom and they are proposing to center them in the room. He proposed a third window, all shifted to be in the bedroom area (towards the front of the house) of that façade. Regarding Condition #5, the side foundations appear to be adequate.

**Comm. Swilley was excused from the meeting at 9:41 a.m.**

**Action:** *Comm. Eid moved that the application submitted for 211 16th St. be approved as proposed per staff recommendation, modified as follows subject to the conditions and modifications: 1) omit egress window in façade (east) gable field (smaller casement window for natural light, if necessary, could be approved by staff [this would not be an egress window]; 2) specifications on north elevation dormer addition measurements be submitted to staff for approval; 3) windows on right (north) elevation remain in existing locations with a third full size window approved to be added to the right of the 2 existing windows with the final design to be approved by staff ; 4) window on left (south) elevation to be installed to break up the massing with the final design to be approved by staff; 5) if foundation must be reconstructed in locations other than the front porch and rear addition, a revised application for a COA must be submitted. The Motion was seconded by Comm. Webster.* A roll-call vote was taken. **The Motion carried unanimously.**

**Result:** Approved 7-0

**Comm. Mitchell was excused from the meeting at 9:55 a.m.**

## Old North Knoxville H

241 E. Oklahoma Ave. / Parcel ID 081 L S 013 - Construction of an accessory structure (7-B-20-HZ)

**Discussion:** Lindsay Crockett reviewed the staff report and staff recommendation of approval. Applicant Logan Carpenter E. Oklahoma Avenue, Knoxville, TN 31917 was present. Mr. Logan noted there would be overhanging eaves, the doors will be upgraded to plank doors with cross bracing. It was noted that the proposed 4/12 pitch was quite low and Mr. Logan agreed to a 6/12 pitch instead. James Pierce, 122 Leonard Place, Old North Knoxville Neighborhood Representative, was present discuss the application for review. He noted they support staff's recommendation for this accessory structure to come into better compliance with the guidelines, specifically touching on lap or board and batten siding be required, that the doors be wooden, that the roof pitch be higher and agreed a 6/12 would be adequate, and lastly the carriage type door and window placements are typically on the gabled end of the building which is not the case here. Mr. Logan explained the door placement to is face the yard and not the street. He agreed the gable could be turned 90 degrees.

**Action: Comm. Eid moved that the application submitted for 241 E. Oklahoma Ave. be approved as proposed per staff recommendation with the following conditions and modifications: 1) that if lap siding is used it is to be 4 inches wide; 2) that wood doors be used; 3) that the roof pitch be 6/12; 4) that the gable be turned 90 degrees such that the gabled end is at the same location as shown in the drawings [submitted]; 5) that the applicant incorporate additional elements from the material requirements of the ONK design guidelines for outbuildings (ie: wood lap siding or board and batten siding, garage doors with x-bracing or perimeter reinforcing timbers, wood windows). The Motion was seconded by Comm. Blackburn. A roll-call vote was taken. The Motion carried unanimously.**

**Result:** Approved 6-0

417 E. Oklahoma Ave. / Parcel ID 081 L W 020 – Window replacements (7-F-20-HZ)

**Discussion:** Lindsay Crockett reviewed the staff report and staff recommendation. Applicant Gary Koontz, 1600 Ashland Springs road, Knoxville, TN 37922 was present and noted this house has been vacant for about 5 years and although they would prefer to restore these windows they are in significant disrepair. They have reached out to experts but would be at least a year out for someone to be available to assist them with working with the existing windows. They feel the windows they have chosen would be appropriate.

**Comm. Mitchell rejoined the meeting at this time.**

1008 James Pierce, 122 Leonard Place, Old North Knoxville Neighborhood Representative, was present to discuss the application for review. He noted they support staff recommendation and efforts to repair and retain as much historic materials as possible particularly such character defining elements as windows. They would support a recommendation to further pursue repairing, rather than replacement of these windows. Mr. Koontz reiterated that they have been exploring repair of these windows for 6 months and that the windows were in really bad shape. Discussion ensued regarding the applicants' potential options.

**Action:** *Comm. Eid moved that for the application submitted for 417 E. Oklahoma Ave., Option #1 would be to repair the windows, but if staff or the appropriate person from the City determines and verifies that the windows are not repairable, that the total replacement of the windows be approved per staff recommendation, and that if replaced they be the same size, pane division, material and muntin depth, width and profile as the existing. A further Option #2 is that there be a hybrid replacement where the sash is replaced but not the frame and window casing, and the sash be the same size as existing with modifications being done as needed.*

Further discussion surrounding repair verses replacement ensued and best practice options going forward.

**Comm. Eid withdrew his original motion.**

**Action:** *Comm. Eid moved that the application submitted for 417 E. Oklahoma Ave. be postponed for one month, two months if the applicant requires more time, for the applicant and staff to review the conditions together in the field and to explore all of the option for window repair. The Motion was seconded by Comm. Mitchell. A roll-call vote was taken. The Motion carried unanimously.*

**Result:** Approved 7-0

#### **Tazewell Pike NC**

4002 Tazewell Pike / Parcel ID 059 H A 023 – Modification to previously approved new construction (7-I-20-HZ)

**Discussion:** Lindsay Crockett reviewed the staff report and staff recommendation of approval. Applicant Randy Guignard, 5408 Fountaingate Road, Knoxville, TN 37918 was present and had nothing further to add to the staff report. There was no neighborhood representative present.

**Action:** *Comm. Blackburn moved that the application submitted for 4002 Tazewell Pike be approved as proposed per staff recommendation. The Motion was seconded by Comm. Matthews. A roll-call vote was taken. The Motion carried unanimously.*

**Result:** Approved 7-0.

**Action:** *Comm. Blackburn moved to adjourn the Knoxville Historic Zoning Commission meeting at 10:34 a.m. The Motion was seconded by Comm. Webster The Motion carried unanimously and the meeting was adjourned.*