

MINUTES

KNOX COUNTY HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION KNOXVILLE HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION

January 16, 2020

Knox County Historic Zoning Commission				
Commissioner	Present	Absent	Excused	Arrived
Bill Belser			X	
Mike Crowder	X			
George Ewart, Chair	X			
Kim Isenberg	X			
Scott Smith, Vice-Chair	X			

Staff/Others Present	Affiliation
Amy Brooks	Knoxville-Knox County Planning
Lindsay Crockett	Knoxville- Knox County Planning
Mike Reynolds	Knoxville-Knox County Planning
Laura Edmonds	Knoxville- Knox County Planning
Christina Magrans	City Law Department
Peter Ahrens	City Plans Review and Building Inspections

Knox County Historic Zoning Commission Chair George Ewart called the meeting to order at 8:30 a.m. Roll call was taken and it was noted there was a county quorum. Comm. Ewart stated that the meeting is being televised and recorded. He also asked that speakers limit their presentations to five minutes and to sign in when they reach the podium. Applicants or members of the public who wished to speak on an Agenda Item were sworn in. He further noted that any appeals to Commission decisions can be taken to Chancery Court if appealed within 60 days.

Staff Reports

None

Reports to Commission

There was no report to Commission.

Boyd-Harvery House Individual HZ Landmark

1321 Harvey Road / Parcel ID 162 02944 – Exterior rehabilitation work; addition of a pergola on the side elevation; modifications to carriage house/garage (1-H-20-HZ)

Chair George Ewart recused himself from Agenda Item 1-H-20-HZ.

Discussion: Lindsay Crockett reviewed the staff report and staff recommendation of approval.

Action: Comm. Crowder moved that the application submitted for 1321 Harvey Road be approved based on the evidence submitted, the information provided, and per staff recommendation. The Motion was seconded by Comm. Isenberg. The Motion carried unanimously.

Result: Approved.

Other Business

Election of Knoxville Historic Zoning Commission Chair and Vice-Chair

Action: Comm. Crowder moved that George Ewart be appointed as Chair for the Knox County Historic Zoning Commission. The Motion was seconded by Comm. Smith. The Motion carried unanimously.

Action: Comm. Crowder moved that Kim Isenberg be appointed as Vice-Chair for the Knox County Historic Zoning Commission. The Motion was seconded by Comm. Smith. The Motion carried unanimously.

Action: With there being no further business, the Knox County Historic Zoning Commission meeting adjourned at 8:39 A.M.

Knoxville Historic Zoning Commission				
Commissioner	Present	Absent	Excused	Arrived
Rick Blackburn	X			
Bart Carey, Chair	X			
Faris Eid	X			
Casey Fox			X	
Dasha Lundy	X			
Lorie Matthews	X			
Dationa Mitchell, Vice-Chair	X			
Sandi Swilley			X	
Stanton Webster	X			

Staff/Others Present	Affiliation
Amy Brooks	Knoxville-Knox County Planning
Lindsay Crockett	Knoxville- Knox County Planning
Laura Edmonds	Knoxville- Knox County Planning
Mike Reynolds	Knoxville-Knox County Planning
Christina Magrans	City Law Department
Peter Ahrens	City Plans Review and Building Inspections
Adrienne Webster	Ft. Sanders Neighborhood Representative
John Holmes	Owner/Applicant
David Nix	Edgewood-Park City Neighborhood Representative
Chris Bush	Applicant

Knoxville Historic Zoning Comm. Chair Bart Carey called the meeting to order at 8:39 a.m. Roll call was taken and it was noted there was a city quorum. Comm. Carey stated that the meeting is being televised and recorded. He also asked that speakers limit their presentations to five minutes and to sign in when they reach the podium. Applicants or members of the public who wished to speak on an Agenda Item were sworn in. He further noted that any appeals to Commission decisions can be taken to Chancery Court if appealed within 60 days.

Approval of Minutes

Action: Comm. Eid moved to approve the December 18, 2019 Knoxville Historic Zoning Commission Minutes. The Motion was seconded by Comm. Blackburn. The Motion carried

unanimously.

Result: Approved.

Staff Reports

Lindsay Crockett reported the Level 1 Certificates approved since the last meeting.

Reports to Commission

There were no reports to Commission.

KNOXVILLE CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS

Edgewood-Park City H

1800 Jefferson Ave. / Parcel ID 82 P H 009 – Installation of solar panels (1-D-20-HZ)

Discussion: Lindsay Crockett reviewed the staff report and staff recommendation of approval.

Action: Comm. Eid moved that the application submitted for 1800 Jefferson Avenue be approved based on the evidence submitted, the information provided, and per staff recommendation. The Motion was seconded by Comm. Mitchell. The Motion carried unanimously.

Result: Approved.

Edgewood-Park City H

2301 Jefferson Ave. / Parcel ID 82 J U 023 – Construction of a new house (1-E-20-HZ)

Discussion: Lindsay Crockett reviewed the staff report and staff recommendation of approval.

Chris Bush, owner and contractor for the project, was present to discuss the application for review. Mr. Bush briefly reviewed staff recommendation and the conditions proposed. Mr. Bush requested that the Commission consider removing condition #4, and instead allowing awnings over the existing windows. Mr. Bush also spoke to condition #5 and explained that he's already submitted for a 13 ft setback with the Board of Zoning Appeals and hopes to be approved soon. Lastly, Mr. Bush requested that Commission also consider removing condition #2, because adding an additional two feet to the front porch would require changing the floor plan of the house and additional costs to the project.

Chair Bart Carey asked the applicant how changing the porch would specifically affect the current design of the house. Chair Carey also noted a few discrepancies between the plans and renderings provided by the applicant and explained how important the small details are when making a decision on a new construction.

David Nix, Park Ridge Community Organization, which also governs the Edgewood Historic Overlay, was present to discuss the application for review. Mr. Nix explained that once he was able to speak with the applicant and learn more specifics on the project, he feels more comfortable with the applicant's request. Mr. Nix went on to discuss some of the neighborhood concerns regarding the overhang, windows on the left side of the house, proposed awnings, and porch depth/railings.

Comm. Eid brought to attention that there are two scaled drawings in the packet and wanted to verify which set of drawings are before the Commission today. Comm. Eid proceeded to ask Peter Ahrens, Chief Building Official, if the drawings that have been submitted meet the requirements for Plans Review or if their department would require more detailed drawings before issuing building permits. Mr. Ahrens replied by saying that the department would require more detailed construction drawings before issuing building permits. Mr. Eid also inquired about whether or not the code allows chimneys, bay windows, and other elements to extend over the setback as an overhang.

Mike Reynolds, Senior Planner, clarified that chimneys are permitted to extend 18 inches over the required setback.

Action: Comm. Eid moved that the application submitted for 2301 Jefferson Avenue be approved the application based on the following recommendations: 1) the windows and door trim to be 4 inches wide, it's preferred that window sills are provided in lieu of just the bottom trim (recommendation not required), 4 inches wide for the corner boards and horizontal trim under the gable field to be 6 inches wide per staff recommendation 2) the porch may remain 6 ft. deep as proposed, recognizing that there's an additional overhang beyond the front of the porch based on the drawings submitted 3) the roof overhangs are 16 inches in lieu of 8 inches, and 4) on the elevation facing N. Olive Street, the elevation receive additional complexity via the addition of elements such as either a bay window, or projecting bays, or chimney or overhangs, basically fixed roof over awnings, similar to what was submitted in response to the staff report. 5) The house set-back at the front property line is reduced to be between 11 and 14 feet, and also 6) a finalized revised design that is to-scale that shows the floor plan, site plan, elevations and roof plan all corresponding to be submitted to staff for the final review. The motion was seconded by Comm. Matthews. The Motion carried unanimously.

Amy Brooks, Planning Services Manager, asked Comm. Eid for clarification on if the applicant chooses to pursue the overhang, should it be for only one window or all of the windows. Comm. Eid answered by stating that he will leave that decision for staff to review and determine what is appropriate once all of the finalized plans have been submitted.

Result: Approved.

Ft. Sanders NC

115 James Agee St. / Parcel ID 94 K J 013 – Demolition of non-contributing structure (1-F-20-HZ)

Discussion: Lindsay Crockett reviewed the staff report and staff recommendation of approval.

Comm. Webster asked staff if the applicant is required to give a reason for demolition even though it's a non-contributing structure in the NC Overlay. Comm. Webster stated that even though this house is a non-contributing structure, he still hates to see another structure go down in Ft. Sanders.

Lindsay Crockett pointed out that the house was approved for demolition by staff in 2002, but the COA for demolition expired in April 2004. HZC Rules and Procedures now require approval of the Commission for demolition of a non-contributing structure, thus the property being brought back before the Commission today. It has also been brought before the Public Officer for codes violations multiple times.

Action: Comm. Eid moved that the application for 115 James Agee Street be approved based on the submitted application, and per staff recommendation. The motion was seconded by Comm. Lundy. The Motion carried with one Commissioner voting “no.”

Result: Approved.

Other Business

Recommendation on H Overlay: 4683 Old Broadway / Parcel ID 69 D A 006

Discussion: Lindsay Crockett reviewed the staff report and staff recommendation of approval for the Hull Dobbs Ford – Fountain City property at 4683 Old Broadway. If the H overlay is adopted, the

property will adhere to the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation.

Action: Comm. Blackburn moved that the property located at 4683 Old Broadway meets criteria for an H Landmark Overlay zoning. The motion was seconded by Comm. Mitchell. The Motion carried unanimously.

Result: Approved.

Action: Comm. Blackburn moved to adjourn the Knoxville Historic Zoning Commission meeting at 9:23 A.M. The Motion was seconded by Comm. Mitchell. The Motion carried unanimously and the meeting was adjourned.