

MINUTES

**KNOX COUNTY HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION
KNOXVILLE HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION**

October 17, 2019

Knox County Historic Zoning Commission				
Commissioner	Present	Absent	Excused	Arrived
Bill Belser	N/A			
Mike Crowder	N/A			
George Ewart, Chair	N/A			
Kim Isenberg	N/A			
Scott Smith, Vice-Chair	N/A			

Staff/Others Present	Affiliation
N/A	

There was no county business therefore the Knox County Historic Zoning Commission did not convene.

Staff Reports

N/A

Reports to Commission

There was no report to Commission.

KNOX COUNTY CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS

Other Business

None

Knoxville Historic Zoning Commission				
Commissioner	Present	Absent	Excused	Arrived
Rick Blackburn	X			
Bart Carey, Chair	X			
Steve Cotham	X			
Faris Eid	X			
Dasha Lundy			X	
Lorie Matthews	X			
Dationa Mitchell, Vice-Chair	X			
Sandi Swilley	X			
Stanton Webster	X			

Staff/Others Present	Affiliation
Amy Brooks	Knoxville-Knox County Planning
Lindsay Crockett	Knoxville- Knox County Planning
Laura Edmonds	Knoxville- Knox County Planning
Lisa Hatfield	City Law Department
Peter Ahrens	City Plans Review and Building Inspections
Arin Streeter	Fourth & Gill Neighborhood Representative
John Ackley	Owner/Applicant
Susan Schottin	Applicant/Owner Representative
Doug Boals	Andersen Windows Representative
Cody Rau	Design Innovations Architects

Knoxville Historic Zoning Comm. Chair Bart Carey called the meeting to order at 8:30 a.m. Roll call was taken and it was noted there was a city quorum. Comm. Carey stated that the meeting is being televised and recorded. He also asked that speakers limit their presentations to five minutes and to sign in when they reach the podium. Applicants or members of the public who wished to speak on an Agenda Item were sworn in. He further noted that any appeals to Commission decisions can be taken to Chancery Court if appealed within 60 days.

Approval of Amended Agenda

Action: Comm. Matthews moved to approve the Amended Agenda adding a workshop for property located at 835 N. Central Street. The Motion was seconded by Comm. Webster. The Motion carried unanimously.

Approval of Minutes

Action: Comm. Swilley moved to approve the September 19, 2019 Knoxville Historic Zoning Commission Minutes. The Motion was seconded by Comm. Mitchell. The Motion carried unanimously.

Result: Approved.

Staff Reports

Lindsay Crockett reported the Level 1 Certificates approved since the last meeting.

Reports to Commission

There were no reports to Commission.

KNOXVILLE CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS

Edgewood-Park City H-1

1616 Jefferson Ave. / Parcel ID 82 P E 007 – Installation of skylights; replacement windows in dormer; gable vent replacement; rear door modifications (10-D-19-HZ)

Discussion: Lindsay Crockett reviewed the staff report and staff recommendation of approval.

John Ackley, 1616 Jefferson Avenue, was present to discuss the application for review. Mr. Ackley added that in the past skylights that were minimally visible were acceptable. Mr. Ackley provided the Commission with additional pictures of the house from street view with minimal visibility of the proposed area for skylights.

The Commission inquired about the specific location of the skylights in the house and whether or not

any of the proposed skylights were being used as egress.

Action: Comm. Eid moved that the application submitted for 1616 Jefferson Avenue be approved based on the evidence submitted, the information provided, and per staff recommendation, also recognizing that there is an alternative for the egress that can be installed on the back side of the house and not visible. The Motion was seconded by Comm. Matthews. The Motion carried unanimously.

Comm. Eid amended his motion by adding that an additional skylight can be added to the rear of the house as an egress window with the new location administratively approved by staff. The amended Motion was seconded by Comm. Matthews. The Motion carried unanimously.

Result: Approved.

Fourth and Gill H-1

1024 Eleanor St. / Parcel ID 81 M J 012 - Porch flooring replacement; porch column modifications (10-A-19-HZ)

Discussion: Lindsay Crockett reviewed the staff report and staff recommendation of approval.

Susan Schottin, 1024 Eleanor Street, was present to discuss the application for review. Ms. Schottin explained the reasoning behind the installation of the new Aeratis Heritage brand, extruded PVC flooring is due to the rotting of the front porch elements and significant foundation issues. The applicant shared with the Commission that the new flooring is the same color as the original wood, much stronger in comparison to wood, can handle moisture, and is long-lasting without affecting the foundation of the house.

Arin Streeter, 925 Eleanor Street, Fourth & Gill Neighborhood Representative was present to discuss the application for review. Mr. Streeter stated that the Neighborhood is in agreement with staff recommendation. However, Mr. Streeter explained that Ms. Schottin provided the neighborhood with samples of the flooring and the neighborhood recognizes that this material was not around when the Guidelines were formed. Therefore, this may be the case where a substitute material may be appropriate but the guidelines just do not address it. As long as the material matches dimensions of wood tongue-and-groove flooring, looks, feels, and provides the same structural stability as wood, the neighborhood would be in favor of the proposed flooring. Mr. Streeter stated that the neighborhood recognizes that this guideline is not necessarily meant to be interpreted as strictly as it was written, as this particular material did not exist when the guidelines were written.

Brief discussion ensued amongst Commissioners on their thoughts about the proposed alternative material. Ms. Matthews inquired about the edge of the extruded PVC flooring on the front porch and how it will be handled. Lindsay Crockett explained that the manufacturer states the floorboard does allow for the installation of a half-round drip edge. Ms. Schottin clarified that the end grain is not visible and there will be an additional piece of the extruded PVC material that runs horizontally.

Lisa Hatfield, City Law Department, addressed the Commission and recognized that if the Commission wanted to include an observation that the condition of the house, including the safety and structural integrity of the house, requires a use of the alternative material, that could assist in addressing the issue of precedence.

Further discussion ensued amongst Commissioners on the reconstruction of the capitals that would work in this situation without compromising the foundation of the house.

Action: Comm. Eid moved that the application submitted for 1024 Eleanor Street be approved

based on the evidence submitted, the information provided, and per staff recommendation with the exception of approving the floor that is currently installed, being the Aeratis Heritage brand extruded PVC flooring that was shown to the Commission at this meeting. The Motion was seconded by Comm. Blackburn. The Motion carried unanimously.

Result: Approved.

Market Square H-1

325 Union Ave. / Parcel ID 94 L E 030 – Replacement of second-story windows (fronting both Union Avenue and Market Square) (10-E-19-HZ)

Discussion: Lindsay Crockett reviewed the staff report and staff recommendation of approval.

Doug Boals, 1686 Meadow Chase Lane, was present in representation of Renewal by Andersen, the proposed window company. Mr. Boals is not present in place of the applicant. Mr. Boals stated that he's not able to do the rounded window for the estimated price for the applicant. However, there is no contractual obligation the applicant if the Commission requires the applicant to use another material and/or window type. Mr. Boals went on to further explain that their products are installed in countless historic places around the Country. The Fibrex material is made up of 40% wood by weight, and 60% by volume and the other part if polymer. The product actually smells like wood but is made up of a composite material.

Comm. Eid inquired if the existing windows on the building are wood, and if there have been any exceptions for anything other material than wood. Mr. Eid also pointed out that in the Oliver Hotel pictures provided in the packet, in addition to the arched brick, there is additional trim around the window exterior to make the square top window appear as if it has a true arched top.

Lindsay Crockett reiterated that the decision before the Commission today is to determine the both appropriate window material and the shape for the building.

Further discussion ensued on the header of the window being installed higher to hide the header, appearing as if the window has a true arched top. Mr. Boals stated that it is possible to manufacture a taller window for the building to hide the header of the window.

Action: Comm. Eid moved that the application for 325 Union Avenue be approved based on the evidence submitted and the information provided, recognizing that, in contradiction to the Guidelines regarding wood windows, the Board has approved alternative window materials in the past, and that new alternative materials have been designed since the original Guidelines were adopted. Comm. Eid made a motion to approve the proposed window material, with approval based on the condition that if the window has a rectangular top, it has a full appearance of an arched window from the street, and if that cannot be accomplished, it should be a round-arched window to fit the exterior opening. The motion was seconded by Comm. Blackburn. The Motion carried unanimously.

Result: Approved.

Action: Comm. Blackburn moved to adjourn the Knoxville Historic Zoning Commission meeting at 9:39 A.M. The Motion was seconded by Comm. Webster. The Motion carried unanimously and the meeting was adjourned.

The workshop for 835 N. Central Street began at 9:46 a.m. and concluded at 10:10 a.m.