

MINUTES

KNOX COUNTY HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION
KNOXVILLE HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION

May 16, 2019

Knox County Historic Zoning Commission				
Commissioner	Present	Absent	Excused	Arrived
Bill Belser	N/A			
Mike Crowder	N/A			
George Ewart, Chair	N/A			
Kim Isenberg	N/A			
Scott Smith, Vice-Chair	N/A			

Staff/Others Present	Affiliation
N/A	

Staff Reports

N/A

Reports to Commission

There was no report to Commission.

KNOX COUNTY CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS

Other Business

None

Knoxville Historic Zoning Commission				
Commissioner	Present	Absent	Excused	Arrived
Rick Blackburn	X			
Bart Carey, Chair	X		X	
Steve Cotham	X			
Faris Eid		X		
Dasha Lundy	X			
Lorie Matthews	X			
Dationa Mitchell, Vice- Chair	X			
Sandi Swilley	X			
Stanton Webster			X	

Staff/Others Present	Affiliation
Christina Magrans	City Law Department
Gerald Green	Knoxville-Knox County Planning

Laura Edmonds	Knoxville-Knox County Planning
Scott Elder	City Plans Review and Building Inspections
DeAnn Bogus	City Plans Review and Building Inspections
Peter Ahrens	City Plans Review and Building Inspections
Alice Basler	Owner/Applicant
Stephen Dail	Applicant
Harrison Boyd	Applicant
Stefanie Genua	R2R Studio, Inc.
Arin Streeter	Fourth & Gill Neighborhood Representative

Knoxville Historic Zoning Comm. Vice-Chair Dationa Mitchell called the meeting to order at 8:30 a.m. Roll call was taken and it was noted there was a quorum. Comm. Mitchell stated that the meeting is being televised and recorded. She also asked that speakers limit their presentations to five minutes and to sign in when they reach the podium. Applicants or members of the public who wished to speak on an Agenda Item were sworn in. She further noted that any appeals to Commission decisions can be taken to Chancery Court if appealed within 60 days.

Approval of Minutes

Action: Comm. Blackburn moved to approve the April 18, 2019 Knoxville Historic Zoning Commission Minutes. The Motion was seconded by Comm. Swilley. The Motion carried unanimously.

Result: Approved.

Staff Reports

Gerald Green reported the Level 1 Certificates approved since the last meeting.

Reports to Commission

There were no reports to Commission.

KNOXVILLE CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS

Ft. Sanders NC-1

1415 Highland Avenue – Removal of decking system & replaced with a covered porch (5-A-19-HZ)

Discussion: Gerald Green reviewed the staff report and staff recommendation of approval.

Alice Basler, 2017 Ponderosa Lane, was present and made herself available for any questions or comments the Commission may have.

Action: Comm. Blackburn moved that the application submitted for 1415 Highland Avenue be approved based on staff recommendation. The Motion was seconded by Comm. Matthews. The Motion carried unanimously.

Result: Approved.

Tazewell Pike NC-1

4002 Tazewell Pike – Demolition of house (5-B-19-HZ)

Discussion: Gerald Green reviewed the staff report and staff recommendation of approval.

Stephen Dail, 8219 Hill Road, Executor of Donna Pryor Estate, was present to discuss the application for review. Mr. Dail stated the home is beyond repair and reiterated Corum Engineering's recommendation

for a full demolition.

Comm. Blackburn inquired if anything of architectural value was salvaged after the fire. Mr. Dail answered by stating that some of the original hard wood flooring and roof trusses were recovered from the fire.

Action: Comm. Matthews moved that the application submitted for 4002 Tazewell Pike be approved based on staff recommendation. The Motion was seconded by Comm. Cotham. The Motion carried unanimously.

Result: Approved.

Fourth & Gill H-1

920 Eleanor Street – Porch Renovations (5-C-19-HZ)

Discussion: Gerald Green reviewed the staff report and staff recommendation of approval.

Harrison Boyd, 920 Eleanor Street, was present to discuss the application for review. Mr. Boyd explained to the Commission that he was unaware that the front porch railing he installed was not appropriate for a Craftsman Style house until he received a formal citation. Mr. Boyd requested that the Commission consider allowing him to use the current custom-made railings with modifications to make them appropriate for a Craftsman Style house.

Arin Streeter, 925 Eleanor Street, representing Fourth and Gill Neighborhood. Mr. Streeter stated that the neighborhood is in agreement with staff recommendation that the railing isn't appropriate for this style of house. The home's original railing was removed during renovations at some point in time, which was a simple square picket. Fourth and Gill Neighborhood would like to see a new railing consistent with that of a Craftsman Style house.

Peter Ahrens, Development Services Director, asked the applicant if the drop between the porch and the adjacent grade is 30 inches or greater. If so, the applicant will be required to install a guardrail thirty-six inches in height. When the applicant gets to Building Inspections, the inspector will be checking to ensure the railing is 36 inches in height from the porch floor. If a Historic structure is needing routine maintenance, it can stay noncompliant. However, once a structure has been removed from a house, the replacement is required to meet updated Code.

Action: Comm. Blackburn moved that the application submitted for 920 Eleanor Street be approved based on staff recommendation. The Motion was seconded by Comm. Matthews. The Motion 4-1 (Cotham No).

Result: Approved.

Market Square H-1

2 Market Square – New canopy, sign board and signs (5-D-19-HZ)

Discussion: Gerald Green reviewed the staff report and staff recommendation of approval.

Stefanie Genua, 2575 Willow Point Way, Suite 105, was present to discuss the application for review. Mrs. Genua introduced herself to the Commission and explained that she could not find a historical photo taken directly from the front of the building. However, as mentioned in the staff findings, she tried to marry the designs to fit the feel of Market Square. The applicant is asking for approval of the façade of the building. Mrs. Genua stated that the owner is in agreement with staff findings and is willing to make any modifications deemed necessary by the Commission for the project to move forward.

Action: Comm. Swilley moved that the application submitted for 2 Market Square be approved based on staff recommendation. The Motion was seconded by Comm. Matthews. The Motion carried unanimously.

Result: Approved.

Fourth & Gill H-1

629 Luttrell Street – Exterior renovations; partial demolition and new addition (5-E-19-HZ)

Discussion: Gerald Green reviewed the staff report and staff recommendation of approval.

Andrew and Katelyn Seidler, owners of 629 Luttrell Street, were present.

Ted Shelton and Tricia Stuth with Curb Studio, 101 Gill Avenue, were present to discuss the application for review. Mr. Shelton presented the project on behalf of Andrew and Katelyn Seidler and reviewed all information provided to Commissioners in their packet. Mr. Shelton requested that the Commission make a decision today and recommend approval of the project. The owners would like to move forward with their construction and feel that the Architects have given sufficient information to grant approval of this request.

Arin Streeter, 925 Eleanor Street, was present on behalf of Fourth of Gill Neighborhood. Mr. Streeter stated that the neighborhood had concerns with painting the brick, metal roofing, replacement of the skylight, site wall/ garage, roof overhangs, front glass door, rear façade, and front porch railings/beams. Mr. Streeter stated that there is a lot of detail that is needed before granting approval, which is not provided in the application. Mr. Streeter and the Fourth & Gill Neighborhood feel that this item should go forth as a pre-application review in order to discuss the more complicated matters before granting any sort of approval.

Todd Shelton further clarified the concerns of the Fourth and Gill Neighborhood.

Comm. Blackburn stated that Curb Studio, LLC has come to the Commission before and that they've always done an excellent job in renovating historic homes. Comm. Blackburn appreciates the thought and their detailed analysis on the home, and trust their work. For example, Curb Studio, LLC did a great job on renovating the Hambright-Carpenter house. However, he feels that there isn't enough detailed information provided to approve the application.

Scott Elder, Plans Review & Inspections, brought to attention the current zoning which is C-3. Ms. Stuth answered by stating that they are aware of the C-3 zoning, and the set-backs of the carport are different in the C-3 as opposed to residential zoning, so the next step is to determine whether or not they wanted to rezone the property or go before Use on Review.

Action: Comm. Blackburn moved that the application submitted for 629 Luttrell Street be approved with qualifications that the description of work on the application, specifically proposed upper level work, proposed ground level work be included in the approval with the exception of the last two line items, “repair front steps and add curbs to the sides” and “Remove non-conforming columns and balustrade and replace with contemporary columns and balustrade inspired by Queen Anne flat sawn detailing” with the caveat that those design features come back before this Commission once they've been developed by the Architect, with everything else being approved internally by Staff. The Motion was seconded by Comm. Swilley. The Motion carried unanimously.

Other Business

Workshop – Morton-McCrary Building at 835 N. Central

Cody Rau, Design Innovation Architects, was present to discuss the pre-application workshop for the Morton-McCrary Building. Mr. Rau stated that after a budget analysis, it was determined through site investigations and testing as well as the overall budget of the project that to construct the previously approved windows, full width, pilaster to pilaster, on the brick down Pruitt Place was not structurally feasible. After the three fires have taken place in this building, even with the addition of significant added structure and cost, the Structural Engineer was not comfortable approving the process without completely tearing down and rebuilding the second-floor structure. Therefore, DIA is proposing a few design changes for the Commission's review.

The Commission was in agreeance that the modifications to the building are historically appropriate and look great. The Commission said that this building would make a great addition to Central, and they are excited to see this project move forward.

Action: Comm. Blackburn moved to adjourn the Knoxville Historic Zoning Commission meeting at 10:20 A.M. The Motion was seconded by Comm. Matthews. The Motion carried unanimously and the meeting was adjourned.