

MINUTES

**KNOX COUNTY HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION
KNOXVILLE HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION**

MARCH 21, 2019

Knox County Historic Zoning Commission				
Commissioner	Present	Absent	Excused	Arrived
Bill Belser	N/A			
Mike Crowder	N/A			
George Ewart, Chair	N/A			
Kim Isenberg	N/A			
Scott Smith, Vice-Chair	N/A			

Staff/Others Present	Affiliation
N/A	N/A

There was no County business therefore the Knox County Historic Zoning Commission did not convene.

Approval of Minutes

N/A

Staff Reports

N/A

Reports to Commission

N/A

KNOX COUNTY CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS

N/A

Knoxville Historic Zoning Commission				
Commissioner	Present	Absent	Excused	Arrived
Rick Blackburn	X			
Bart Carey, Chair	X			
Steve Cotham	X			
Faris Eid			X	
Dasha Lundy	X			
Lorie Matthews	X			
Dationa Mitchell, Vice-Chair	X			
Sandi Swilley	X			
Stanton Webster			X	

Staff/Others Present	Affiliation
Christina Magrans	City Law Department
Kaye Graybeal	Knoxville-Knox County Planning
Laura Edmonds	Knoxville-Knox County Planning
Scott Elder	City Plans Review and Building Inspections
DeAnn Bogus	City Plans Review and Building Inspections
Peter Ahrens	City Plans Review and Building Inspections
John Holmes	Applicant
Bernadette West	Applicant
Brett Honeycutt	3G Studios, LLC
Teresa Matthews	Applicant

Knoxville Historic Zoning Comm. Chair Bart Carey called the meeting to order at 8:30 a.m. Roll call was taken and it was noted there was a quorum. Comm. Carey stated that the meeting is being televised and recorded. He also asked that speakers limit their presentations to five minutes and to sign in when they reach the podium. Applicants or members of the public who wished to speak on an Agenda Item were sworn in. He further noted that any appeals to Commission decisions can be taken to Chancery Court if appealed within 60 days.

Approval of Minutes

Action: Comm. Blackburn moved to approve the February 21, 2019 Knoxville Historic Zoning Commission Minutes. The Motion was seconded by Comm. Matthews. The Motion carried unanimously.

Result: Approved.

Staff Reports

Kaye Graybeal reported the Level 1 Certificates approved since the last meeting.

Reports to Commission

There were no reports to Commission.

KNOXVILLE CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS

Fourth and Gill H-1 (postponed from 2/21/2019)

703 Luttrell St – Handicap ramp (2-J-19-HZ)

Discussion: Kaye Graybeal reviewed the staff report and staff recommendation of approval.

Teresa Matthews, 703 Luttrell Street, was present and made herself available for any questions or comments the Commission may have. Ms. Matthews mentioned that there was a question in regards to the slope of the garden walk at last month's HZC meeting and wanted to clarify that the gradient is 1:8.

Action: Comm. Matthews moved that the application submitted for 703 Luttrell Street be approved based on the evidence submitted, the information provided in the staff report, and per staff recommendation. The Motion was seconded by Comm. Mitchell. The Motion carried unanimously.

Result: Approved.

Ft. Sanders NC-1 (postponed from 2/21/2019)

1601 Forest Avenue – Demo foundation, piers, and side walls; rebuild rear addition (2-F-19-HZ)

Discussion: Ms. Graybeal reviewed the staff report and recommends the following conditions for approval:

- 1) After-the-fact approval and reconstruction of the unstable foundation on the main house as determined by City Building Inspections.
- 2) If the porch foundation is also required to be demolished by City Inspections due to the inability to correct structural deficiencies, it must be faced with the original brick and the porch roof brick pier supports must be retained. If the battered posts require replacing due to rot, they must replicate the originals.
- 3) The demolished walls on the east and west sides are to be reconstructed with the condition that the window openings match the original size and locations including the replication of the original set of twin windows on the west side. The original fascia and corner trim is to be replicated.
- 4) The rear addition is recommended to be demolished since it is not historically appropriate, but may be rehabilitated as proposed if permitted by City Building Inspections with approval of the door and window specifications to be approved by staff. The shutters for the faux windows shall be louvered and placed within window framing and have hinged hardware, although they are not required to be operable.
- 5) Only one square casement window of the minimal dimension required for egress may be installed in the basement of the east side projecting bay facing 16th Street.
- 6) The proposed gabled stoop may only be placed only over the door in the rear addition, not on the side door of the main house basement façade on 16th Street.
- 7) The window opening on the east side must be located as closely to the middle of this wall section as possible in order to replicate the original placement.
- 8) The ground level must be restored at least as high along the east and west facades as shown in the submitted and approved elevation drawings.

John Holmes, 5914 Gray Gables Drive, was present to discuss the application for review. Mr. Holmes and the Commission discussed the proposed project at 1601 Forest Avenue. The Commission expressed concerns with the front porch design, existing and new façade, basement elevation, and the overall reconstruction of this Historic property. The Commission thoroughly reviewed staff recommendation and the seven conditions Ms. Graybeal suggested the applicant meet before granting approval.

Action: Comm. Matthews moved that the application submitted for 1601 Forest Avenue be approved based on staff recommendation, modifying condition #2 to repair the existing porch as-is, using either original or replacement brick and if the applicant plans to make any changes to the current design- the applicant would need to resubmit a new application to go back before the Commission. Also, the replacement brick can be approved internally by Planning staff. Lastly, clarifying condition #7 to say the “rear most wall section of the original house.” The Motion was seconded by Comm. Cotham. The Motion carried unanimously.

Result: Approved.

Market Square H-1

26 Market Square – (3-E-19-HZ)

Discussion: Kaye Graybeal reviewed the staff report and staff recommendation of approval.

Bernadette West, 26 Market Square, was present to discuss the application. Mrs. West explained that it was not her intention for the rooftop addition to be visible from within Market Square.

Brett Honeycutt, 8000 Bennington Drive, was present and made himself available for any questions or comments the Commission may have. Mr. Honeycutt specified that the Secretary of Interior Design Standards states that rooftop additions should not greatly affect the historic character of the buildings, and/or does not destroy the significant fabric of the buildings or the character of the space. The Design Standards also mention that rooftop additions should be inconspicuous, but does not say that they aren't allowed.

Discussion ensued amongst Commissioners on whether or not the rooftop addition was visible from within Market Square. In order to set a precedent, it would have to be tied specifically to the type of addition, location and specific building type/structure. The Commission expressed concern about setting a precedent on a two-story addition of a two-story building in downtown Market Square, when the Secretary of Design Standards strongly states that rooftop additions are not recommended on less than three story buildings. The Commission also felt that the elliptical arches are out of character and oversized for the type of historic building in Market Square.

Action: Comm. Swilley moved that the application submitted for 26 Market Square be approved based on the fact that it is not highly visible from the majority of Market Square and that it complies and with the Secretary of the Interior Design Standards for Rehabilitation. The Motion was seconded by Comm. Blackburn.

A roll call was taken. The Motion failed 3-4.

Action: Comm. Swilley moved that the application submitted for 26 Market Square be approved contingent on 1) lowering the arches so as not to be visible from the ground in Market Square, with the openings being lowered by a height equal to that of the elliptical arch (with dimensioned drawings submitted to staff for approval) and 2) the addition being painted a neutral color in order to blend with the surroundings. The Motion was seconded by Comm. Matthews. The Motion carried unanimously.

Result: Approved.

Other Business

None

Action: Comm. Blackburn moved to adjourn the Knoxville Historic Zoning Commission meeting at 11:10 A.M. The Motion was seconded by Comm. Matthews. The Motion carried unanimously and the meeting was adjourned.