# **MINUTES**

# KNOX COUNTY HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION KNOXVILLE HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION

# June 20, 2019

Knox County Historic Zoning Commission					
Commissioner	Present	Absent	Excused	Arrived	
Bill Belser	N/A				
Mike Crowder	N/A				
George Ewart, Chair	N/A				
Kim Isenberg	N/A				
Scott Smith, Vice-Chair	N/A				

Staff/Others Present	Affiliation
N/A	

# **Staff Reports**

N/A

# **Reports to Commission**

There was no report to Commission.

# KNOX COUNTY CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS

# **Other Business**

None

Knoxville Historic Zoning Commission					
Commissioner	Present	Absent	Excused	Arrived	
Rick Blackburn			X		
Bart Carey, Chair	X				
Steve Cotham	X				
Faris Eid	X				
Dasha Lundy	X				
Lorie Matthews	X				
Dationa Mitchell, Vice- Chair	X				
Sandi Swilley	X				
Stanton Webster			X		

Staff/Others Present	Affiliation
Gerald Green	Knoxville-Knox County Planning
Amy Brooks	Knoxville-Knox County Planning

Lindsay Crockett	Knoxville- Knox County Planning	
Michelle Portier	Knoxville- Knox County Planning	
Mike Reynolds	Knoxville- Knox County Planning	
Laura Edmonds	Knoxville- Knox County Planning	
Christina Magrans	City Law Department	
Scott Elder	City Plans Review and Building Inspections	
DeAnn Bogus	City Plans Review and Building Inspections	
Peter Ahrens	City Plans Review and Building Inspections	
Thanh Nguyen	Owner/Applicant	
Claire Jamieson	Applicant	
Travis Watson	Owner/Applicant	
John Holmes	Applicant	
Arin Streeter	Fourth & Gill Neighborhood Representative	
Jimmy Ryan	Johnson Architecture	
Cody Rau	Design Innovations Architects	
William Ehrenclou	Owner/Applicant	
James Pierce	Old North Knoxville Neighborhood Representative	
Brittany and Garrett Bentley	Owner/Applicant	
William MacMorran	Owner/Applicant	

Knoxville Historic Zoning Comm. Chair Bart Carey called the meeting to order at 8:30 a.m. Roll call was taken and it was noted there was a quorum. Comm. Carey stated that the meeting is being televised and recorded. He also asked that speakers limit their presentations to five minutes and to sign in when they reach the podium. Applicants or members of the public who wished to speak on an Agenda Item were sworn in. He further noted that any appeals to Commission decisions can be taken to Chancery Court if appealed within 60 days.

# **Approval of Minutes**

Action: Comm. Matthews moved to approve the May 16, 2019 Knoxville Historic Zoning Commission Minutes with one minor correction. Comm. Eid is currently marked as absent and the minutes should reflect Comm. Eid as an excused absence since he notified the Chair and Historic Zoning Commission in advance of his absence. The Motion was seconded by Comm. Cotham. The Motion carried unanimously.

**Result:** Approved.

# **Staff Reports**

Gerald Green reported the Level 1 Certificates approved since the last meeting.

#### **Reports to Commission**

There were no reports to Commission.

#### KNOXVILLE CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS

## **Edgewood-Park City H-1**

2330 Jefferson Avenue – Chimney removal, rebuild chimney, window replacement. (6-B-19-HZ)

**Discussion:** Gerald Green reviewed the staff report and staff recommendation of approval.

Thanh Nguyen, 234 Morrell Road, was present to discuss the application for review. Mr. Nguyen stated the he's in agreement with the Staff Report and recommendation.

Comm. Eid mentioned that the Secretary of Interior Design Standards suggest the appropriate type of masonry and mortar to use when rebuilding a chimney, and he would request that the appropriate type of brick and mortar be used or else the original brick could potentially crack if standard mortar is used.

Action: Comm. Eid moved that the application submitted for 2330 Jefferson Avenue be approved based on staff recommendation, adding a condition that the masonry reconstruction fits within the Secretary of Interior Design Standards. The Motion was seconded by Comm. Matthews. The Motion carried unanimously.

Result: Approved.

# **Edgewood-Park City H-1**

1614 Jefferson Avenue – Window installation (6-E-19-HZ)

**Discussion:** Gerald Green reviewed the staff report and staff recommendation of approval.

Claire Jamieson, 1614 Jefferson Avenue, was present and made herself available for any questions or concerns the Commission may have.

Comm. Eid requested clarification on whether or not the fixed window on the rear façade will also be replaced. Ms. Jamieson assured him that it would be.

Action: Comm. Eid moved that the application submitted for 1614 Jefferson Avenue be approved based on staff recommendation. The Motion was seconded by Comm. Mitchell. The Motion carried unanimously.

**Result:** Approved.

#### Fourth and Gill H-1

810 Deery Street – Installation of two new windows on the north (left) side elevation. (6-N-19-HZ)

**Discussion:** Gerald Green reviewed the staff report and staff recommendation of approval.

Travis Watson, 810 Deery Street, was present and made himself available for any questions or concerns the Commission may have. Mr. Watson stated that he is in agreeance with the staff report and recommendation.

Arin Streeter, 925 Eleanor Street, Fourth & Gill Neighborhood Representative, was present and stated that the Neighborhood has no objections to this project since the proposed windows are not visible from the street, located on the far side of the house and is also behind fencing.

Action: Comm. Matthews moved that the application submitted for 810 Deery Street be approved based on staff recommendation. The Motion was seconded by Comm. Cotham. The Motion carried unanimously.

Result: Approved.

## **Fort Sanders NC-1**

119 16<sup>th</sup> Street – Replace side vent with egress window (6-R-19-HZ)

**Discussion:** Gerald Green reviewed the staff report and staff recommendation of approval.

Knox County Historic Zoning Commission - Knoxville Historic Zoning Commission Draft Minutes – June 20, 2019

John Holmes, 5914 Gray Gables Drive, was present and made himself available for anything questions or concerns the Commission may have.

Comm. Eid wanted to verify that the proposed 36" W by 42"H is to-scale with the surrounding windows and suggested that the applicant use the smallest casement window to meet egress by Codes.

Peter Ahrens, City Plans Review and Inspections Director, stated that it truly depends on the window manufacturer and Codes would need to verify the specs. Each window manufacturer builds them differently, and some 36" x 42" meet the requirements while others don't. Therefore, City Codes would need to verify the window specs before issuing approval to the applicant. Mr. Holmes stated that he has used a JELD W-2500 series on several renovated homes in Fort Sanders, and all have met City Code for egress.

Action: Comm. Eid moved that the application submitted for 119 16<sup>th</sup> Street be approved based on staff recommendation with a window size noted as being 36" W by 42" H. The Motion was seconded by Comm. Matthews. The Motion carried unanimously.

**Result:** Approved.

## **Fort Sanders NC-1**

203 16<sup>th</sup> Street – Adding an egress window in place of the attic cent. (6-S-19-HZ)

**Discussion:** Gerald Green reviewed the staff report and staff recommendation of approval.

John Holmes, 5914 Gray Gables Drive, was present and made himself available for anything questions or concerns the Commission may have.

Action: Comm. Eid moved that the application submitted for 203 16<sup>th</sup> Street be approved based on staff recommendation with a window size noted as being 36" W by 42" H. The Motion was seconded by Comm. Lundy. The Motion carried unanimously.

**Result:** Approved.

#### **Fort Sanders NC-1**

1601 Forest Avenue – Addition of a 36" by 42" egress window on the East elevation. (6-T-19-HZ)

**Discussion:** Gerald Green reviewed the staff report and staff recommendation of approval.

John Holmes, 5914 Gray Gables Drive, was present and made himself available for anything questions or concerns the Commission may have.

The Commission requested clarification as to whether or not the property has been graded to make room for the proposed egress window.

Action: Comm. Eid moved that the application submitted for 1601 Forest Avenue be approved based on staff recommendation, approving the location of the window, with the condition that the proposed window be 36" wide to match the width of the surrounding windows. The Motion was seconded by Comm. Mitchell. The Motion carried unanimously.

Result: Approved.

# Kern's Bakery H-1 Individual District

2110 Chapman Highway – Rehabilitation and addition to an existing building. Partial demolition. (6-Q-19-HZ)

**Discussion:** Gerald Green reviewed the staff report and staff recommendation of approval.

Jimmy Ryan, Johnson Architecture, 1711 Coker Avenue, was present to the discuss the application for review. Mr. Ryan gave a complete overview of the large-scale drawings of the proposed Kern's Bakery rehabilitation.

Action: Comm. Eid moved that the application submitted for 2110 Chapman Highway, Kern's Bakery be approved based on staff recommendation with the condition that the original Kerns Bakery signage be lowered to meet zoning regulations. The Motion was seconded by Comm. Matthews. The Motion carried unanimously.

Result: Approved.

## Morton McCrary Motors H-1 Individual District

835 N. Central Street – Rehabilitation and addition to an existing building (6-P-19-HZ)

Comm. Eid recused himself from this agenda item due to his Architectural Firm representing the project.

**Discussion:** Gerald Green reviewed the staff report and staff recommendation of approval.

Cody Rau, Design Innovation Architects, was present to discuss the application for review. Mr. Rau stated that the project has been before the Commission a few times as a workshop discussion item and the applicant is very excited to move forward with the rehabilitation.

The Commission asked for a few clarifications on the positioning of the helical ramp, projected height of the penthouse, and the projected completion date.

Action: Comm. Matthews moved that the application submitted for 835 N. Central Street be approved per staff recommendation. The Motion was seconded by Comm. Mitchell. The Motion carried unanimously.

#### **Old North Knoxville H-1**

517 E. Scott Avenue – Installation of four foundation buttresses. (6-A-19-HZ)

**Discussion:** Gerald Green reviewed the staff report and staff recommendation of approval.

James Pierce, 122 Leonard Place, Old North Knoxville Neighborhood Representative was present to discuss the application. Mr. Pierce stated that the neighborhood is in agreeance with Staff's recommendation for approval.

Action: Comm. Eid moved that the application submitted for 517 E. Scott Avenue be approved based on staff recommendation. The Motion was seconded by Comm. Lundy. The Motion carried unanimously.

**Result:** Approved.

#### **Old North Knoxville H-1**

1306 Kenyon Street – Infill two window opens in foundation. (6-D-19-HZ)

**Discussion:** Gerald Green reviewed the staff report and staff recommendation of approval.

William Ehrenclou, 1306 Kenyon Street, was present to discuss the application for review. Mr. Ehrenclou shared a recent photo showing the visibility of the windows from the street.

James Pierce, 122 Leonard Place, Old North Knoxville Neighborhood Representative was present to discuss the application. Mr. Pierce stated that the neighborhood is in agreeance with staff recommendation for approval. However, if the openings in the foundation were original to the home, once the foundation has been stabilized, they would request that the applicant have an offset in place that would represent the original openings.

Comm. Eid inquired about the materials being used to infill the openings, and whether or not the applicant had any objections to the offset proposed by the Neighborhood Representative.

Action: Comm. Eid moved that the application submitted 1306 Kenyon Street be approved based on staff recommendation, adding a condition that the infill be recessed by 0.5-1.0 inches or flushed with a reveal put in between the new and old brick to illustrate where the window would have been. The Motion was seconded by Comm. Matthews. The Motion carried unanimously.

**Result:** Approved.

#### **Old North Knoxville H-1**

317 E. Oklahoma Avenue – Construct two story addition to rear of house. (6-M-19-HZ)

**Discussion:** Gerald Green reviewed the staff report and staff recommendation of approval.

Brittany and Garrett Bentley, 317 E. Oklahoma Avenue, were present to discuss the application for review. Mr. Bentley addressed the complexity of the roof and is open to discussion amongst the Commission for ideas on how to make the roof addition work best both aesthetically and historically.

Commission expressed some concern with the complexity of the roof, distinguishing the addition from the original structure, and the possibility of losing a character-defining rear gable on the house.

James Pierce, 122 Leonard Place, Old North Knoxville Neighborhood Representative was present to discuss the application. Mr. Pierce was not able to present this to the Neighborhood in time and therefore will only be speaking on behalf of himself and his interpretation of the Design Guidelines. Mr. Pierce explained that the guidelines state that no work should be done to a house that would result in losing a character-defining feature and one should be able to distinguish the addition from the original historic structure. While this particular house may not be able to meet both guidelines, Mr. Pierce explained that he would prefer the option of being able to distinguish the addition from the original historic structure instead of altering the roofline. Mr. Pierce worries that altering the roofline on this home would set a precedent for future applications, and could be detrimental to an original or protected historic roofline.

Action: Comm. Eid moved that the application submitted for 317 E. Oklahoma Avenue be approved based on staff recommendation, reiterating the attached conditions:

- 1) Offset the addition a minimum of 1' from the right (northeast) corner of the house.
- 2) Submit revised plans to Planning staff to verify consistency with this approval before the issuance of permits.
- 3) Any change of exterior materials, or the inclusion of an offset, on the left (southwest) side of

- the addition for the purpose of meeting building code requirements, shall be reviewed and approved by Staff for determination of consistency with the intent of this approval and the Old North Knoxville Design Guidelines.
- 4) The addition to have a large hip roof that will intersect a large mass of the existing groove, recognizing that the one gable on the rear side of the house will need to be removed.
- 5) All materials used shall be consistent in order to match the existing materials.

The Motion was seconded by Comm. Matthews. The Motion carried unanimously.

Result: Approved.

#### **Old North Knoxville H-1**

139 Leonard Place – Replacement of siding on front dormer. (6-O-19-HZ)

**Discussion:** Gerald Green reviewed the staff report and staff recommendation of approval.

James Pierce, 122 Leonard Place, Old North Knoxville Neighborhood Representative, was present to discuss the application. Mr. Pierce stated that he is exploring the use of substitute materials similar to the one proposed in this application. Mr. Pierce explained that as long as the size, texture and finish meet the requirements, the neighborhood is supportive. With this being a small project, it's a great opportunity for the neighborhood to see how this material looks aesthetically, how well it works compared to wood, and how it handles over time. As long as the replacement hardy plank is the same size and requires the same installation method as wood siding, the neighborhood can support replacement without setting a precedent for future siding within the Old North Knoxville Historic District H-1.

Mike Reynold noted that the owner recently replaced the siding within the past couple of years and the wood is already in need of replacement again. Therefore, cementitious siding may prove to be a better fit considering the amount of weather the dormer is exposed to. Gerald Green mentioned that these newer materials were not available when the Design Guidelines were formed, so small projects like this one may help initiate which types of siding may or may not be considered appropriate throughout the Historic Districts.

Action: Comm. Eid moved that the application submitted for 139 Leonard Place be approved based on staff recommendation. The Motion was seconded by Comm. Matthews. The Motion carried unanimously.

Result: Approved.

Action: Comm. Eid moved to adjourn the Knoxville Historic Zoning Commission meeting at 10:32 A.M. The Motion was seconded by Comm. Matthews. The Motion carried unanimously and the meeting was adjourned.