

MINUTES

**KNOX COUNTY HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION
KNOXVILLE HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION**

July 18, 2019

Knox County Historic Zoning Commission				
Commissioner	Present	Absent	Excused	Arrived
Bill Belser	N/A			
Mike Crowder	N/A			
George Ewart, Chair	N/A			
Kim Isenberg	N/A			
Scott Smith, Vice-Chair	N/A			

Staff/Others Present	Affiliation
N/A	

There was no county business therefore the Knox County Historic Zoning Commission did not convene.

Staff Reports

N/A

Reports to Commission

There was no report to Commission.

KNOX COUNTY CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS

Other Business

None

Knoxville Historic Zoning Commission				
Commissioner	Present	Absent	Excused	Arrived
Rick Blackburn	X			
Bart Carey, Chair	X			
Steve Cotham			X	
Faris Eid	X			
Dasha Lundy	X			
Lorie Matthews	X			
Dationa Mitchell, Vice-Chair	X			
Sandi Swilley	X			
Stanton Webster	X			

Staff/Others Present	Affiliation
Gerald Green	Knoxville-Knox County Planning
Amy Brooks	Knoxville-Knox County Planning

Lindsay Crockett	Knoxville- Knox County Planning
Michelle Portier	Knoxville- Knox County Planning
Mike Reynolds	Knoxville- Knox County Planning
Dori Caron	Knoxville- Knox County Planning
Christina Magrans	City Law Department
Lisa Hatfield	City Law Department
Scott Elder	City Plans Review and Building Inspections
DeAnn Bogus	City Plans Review and Building Inspections
Peter Ahrens	City Plans Review and Building Inspections
John Holmes	Applicant
Scott Carpenter	Owner/Applicant
Peg Hambright	Owner/Applicant
James Pierce	Old North Knoxville Neighborhood Representative

Knoxville Historic Zoning Comm. Chair Bart Carey called the meeting to order at 8:34 a.m. Roll call was taken and it was noted there was a city quorum. Comm. Carey stated that the meeting is being televised and recorded. He also asked that speakers limit their presentations to five minutes and to sign in when they reach the podium. Applicants or members of the public who wished to speak on an Agenda Item were sworn in. He further noted that any appeals to Commission decisions can be taken to Chancery Court if appealed within 60 days.

Approval of Minutes

Action: Comm. Eid moved to approve the June 20, 2019 Knoxville Historic Zoning Commission Minutes. The Motion was seconded by Comm. Swilley. The Motion carried unanimously.

Result: Approved.

Comm. Chair Carey introduced Lindsay Crockett, the new Knoxville-Knox County Planning Historic Preservation Planner.

Staff Reports

Lindsay Crockett reported the Level 1 Certificates approved since the last meeting.

Reports to Commission

There were no reports to Commission.

KNOXVILLE CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS

Fort Sanders NC-1

1610 Forest Ave. / Parcel ID 94 N E 015 - Rear addition and installation of egress windows (7-C-19-HZ)

Discussion: Lindsay Crockett reviewed the staff report and staff recommendation of approval. There was no neighborhood representative present. Applicant John Holmes was present and clarified that the front porch roof and foundation needs to be removed as it is collapsing now, and will need to be completely rebuilt as described. Mr. Holmes clarified that they will be rebuilt to what is existing now with the exception of adding the window. He also stated the brick will stay in the same line as it is now with the block being set back. He then clarified that the roof line will be the same, “without the slant”. Mr. Holmes further clarified that the addition is 26 ft. wide, inset 1 foot on each side. Regarding the roof, he acknowledged that the roof plan submitted overrides the elevations. Mr. Holmes also clarified that the soffits and overhangs will match what is existing with the exception that they will be about 2 inches shorter to accommodate new insulation guidelines.

He further stated that the roof towards the rear will not be a full gable but will have a hip as you go backwards. It was noted the front stairs will have riser kick plates.

Action: Comm. Eid moved that the application submitted for 1610 Forest Avenue be approved as submitted based on staff recommendation subject to the following conditions: 1) When reconstructed, the front porch foundation will have brick facing to match the existing brick, and the design will match what is existing in style, recognizing the roof will be leveled, and 2) For the rear addition, the roof line drawing that was submitted takes precedence over the elevation showing the proper setback or steps in the roof line and the back hip, and 3) That the overhangs are provided even though they are not shown on the elevation, and will match the existing house and style. The Motion was seconded by Comm. Matthews. The Motion carried unanimously.

Result: Approved with conditions.

Old North Knoxville H-1

1403 Armstrong Ave. / Parcel ID 81 L E 031 - Modification to existing COA requiring opening in existing stone retaining wall. (7-D-19-HZ)

Discussion: Lindsay Crockett reviewed the staff report and staff recommendation for adherence to the existing Certificate of Appropriateness. Applicant Scott Carpenter was present and noted they are here today as they have new information that was not available in February of 2018. He noted they are 4 to 5 weeks away from completing the home and would then seek a Certificate of Occupancy. He stated that they are not against building an access to the house per the previously issued Certificate of Appropriateness, however, the wall, which extends across 3 lots, is unstable and is likely to fall if they begin cutting and removing stone and creating a new gap necessary for that access. He noted the letter from the structural engineer recommends that no cutting or removing of stone for steps be undertaken until and unless the adjacent wall is stabilized. He also stated that complicating this issue is that they do not own the wall adjacent to them at 1405 Armstrong, which is closest to the area where they would need to cut and remove stone. He also stated they are not sure they could rebuild the wall as and likely where it is now, noting multiple reasons. Mr. Carpenter then stated parts of a similar wall down the street have fallen in. He also stated there was concern that the large front tree may be compromised with any work done. Mr. Carpenter further noted that they want to have the walkway down to Armstrong but addressing the recent wall issues will be a substantial undertaking and would put them in an untenable position to get a Certificate of Occupancy unless this condition is lifted. It was noted a sidewalk from the house to the sidewalk is not required under city building code nor would the material used be mandated by code, just structural integrity. The materials used would be dictated by the Historic Zoning Commission. Mr. Carpenter was unable to offer a timeline for rebuilding the wall although he stated it was their intent to do so in the future. There was further discussion surrounding the initial intent of the condition and Mr. Carpenter again noted their eventual desire to do the work. It was clarified that the Commission does want the cut and walkway to eventually be built per the original COA. It was suggested that the Applicant check in with the post office to ensure there is access to a mailbox for the property, as well as the with the fire department.

James Pierce, Old North Knoxville Neighborhood Representative was present to discuss the application. Mr. Pierce stated that the neighborhood would still like, meeting the guidelines, the entry to be aligned with the front door, not side entrance and is in agreement with Staff's recommendation for adherence to the existing Certificate of Appropriateness.

Action: Comm. Eid, based on the evidence submitted and the Applicant's testimony today, moved to amend the Certificate of Appropriateness for 1403 Armstrong Avenue issued on February 28, 2018 regarding the portion of the stone wall to be cut as to have a new sidewalk at that location, and to defer the requirement of the wall opening for a period of 1 year from today excluding that from the current Certificate of Appropriateness. It was clarified that deferring the requirement would allow Plans, Review and Inspections to issue a Certificate of Occupancy. However,

they would close the building permit, and this would basically end their involvement and specifically their ability to enforce compliance with a condition deferred for that long of a period.

Comm. Eid amended his Motion to remove the condition for the opening in the wall. This was seconded by Comm. Mitchell. There was a discussion noting that the Commission still expects that the opening be created and it was restated that the applicant has stated multiple times today that they intend to complete the work as originally approved. **The Motion carried unanimously.**

Result: Approved for removal of the condition with the distinct understanding that the Applicant will complete the work as approved in the Certificate of Appropriateness issued 2.28.18.

Old North Knoxville H-1

404 E. Oklahoma Ave. / Parcel ID 81 L P 008 - Siding replacement (7-E-19-HZ)

Discussion: Lindsay Crockett reviewed the staff report and staff recommendation of approval. The Applicant was not present.

James Pierce, Old North Knoxville Neighborhood Representative was present to discuss the application. Mr. Pierce stated that the neighborhood is in agreement and supports staff recommendation for denial of fiber cement board siding and approval of wood clapboard siding. They would like to add that wood trim that is repaired match the original in size, scale and shape. Also, they are requesting that if during the repair and replacement of the wood lap siding if any of the non-original shutters are removed that they not be replaced.

Action: Comm. Eid moved that the application submitted 404 E. Oklahoma Avenue be denied for the proposed replacement fiber cement board siding, and approved for the second option proposed by Applicant, wood clapboard siding, with new wood clapboard siding to be used to repair where possible, and replacement as necessary, per staff recommendation subject to the following conditions: 1) That that any wood trim that is replaced must match the original in size, scale and shape, and 2) If any wood shutters, not original to the house, are removed in the course of the work they are not to be replaced. The Motion was seconded by Comm. Swilley. The Motion carried unanimously.

Result: Denied for fiber cement board. Approved for wood clapboard siding with conditions.

Action: Comm. Blackburn moved to adjourn the Knoxville Historic Zoning Commission meeting at 9:30 A.M. The Motion was seconded by Comm. Matthews. The Motion carried unanimously and the meeting was adjourned.