

MINUTES

**KNOX COUNTY HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION
KNOXVILLE HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION**

December 19, 2019

Knox County Historic Zoning Commission				
Commissioner	Present	Absent	Excused	Arrived
Bill Belser	N/A			
Mike Crowder	N/A			
George Ewart, Chair	N/A			
Kim Isenberg	N/A			
Scott Smith, Vice-Chair	N/A			

Staff/Others Present	Affiliation
Amy Brooks	Knoxville-Knox County Planning
Lindsay Crockett	Knoxville- Knox County Planning
Mike Reynolds	Knoxville-Knox County Planning
Laura Edmonds	Knoxville- Knox County Planning
Christina Magrans	City Law Department
Peter Ahrens	City Plans Review and Building Inspections

Knoxville Historic Zoning Commission				
Commissioner	Present	Absent	Excused	Arrived
Rick Blackburn	X			
Bart Carey, Chair	X			
Faris Eid	X			
Casey Fox	X			
Dasha Lundy	X			
Lorie Matthews			X	
Dationa Mitchell, Vice- Chair	X			
Sandi Swilley			X	
Stanton Webster	X			

Staff/Others Present	Affiliation
Amy Brooks	Knoxville-Knox County Planning
Lindsay Crockett	Knoxville- Knox County Planning
Laura Edmonds	Knoxville- Knox County Planning
Mike Reynolds	Knoxville-Knox County Planning
Christina Magrans	City Law Department
Peter Ahrens	City Plans Review and Building Inspections
Adrienne Webster	Ft. Sanders Neighborhood Representative
John Holmes	Owner/Applicant

Knoxville Historic Zoning Comm. Chair Bart Carey called the meeting to order at 8:30 a.m. Roll call was taken and it was noted there was a city quorum. Comm. Carey stated that the meeting is being televised and recorded. He also asked that speakers limit their presentations to five minutes and to sign in when they reach the podium. Applicants or members of the public who wished to speak on an Agenda Item were sworn in. He further noted that any appeals to Commission decisions can be taken to Chancery Court if appealed within 60 days.

Approval of Minutes

Action: Comm. Blackburn moved to approve the November 21, 2019 Knoxville Historic Zoning Commission Minutes. The Motion was seconded by Comm. Mitchell. The Motion carried unanimously.

Result: Approved.

Staff Reports

Lindsay Crockett reported the Level 1 Certificates approved since the last meeting.

Reports to Commission

There were no reports to Commission.

KNOXVILLE CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS

Ft. Sanders NC-1

1610 Forest Ave. / Parcel ID 94 N E 015 – After-the-fact review of demolition of contributing structure (12-E-19-HZ)

Discussion: Lindsay Crockett reviewed the staff report and staff recommendation of approval.

John Holmes, 5914 Gray Gables Drive, was present to discuss the application for review.

Adrienne Webster, 1528 Highland Avenue, Ft. Sanders Neighborhood Representative, was present and stated that the neighborhood wants to stress the fact that they do not want a similar situation to happen again in the future. Ms. Webster stated that if there's anything that can be done to prevent the loss of another contributing structure in Ft. Sanders, she hopes that the Commission, Code Enforcement and Law Enforcement take the appropriate measure to do so. Ms. Webster also mentioned that the Neighborhood is more than willing to get involved and help in any way they can.

Comm. Blackburn asked Mr. Holmes if he truly understands the Commissions level of frustration with his recent project. Mr. Holmes answered by saying that he does understand and that he's also frustrated in terms of how much has to be done to the houses to make them code compliant and safe for tenants to live in. Comm. Blackburn went on to explain that he wanted to ensure that Mr. Holmes is aware of the Commission's frustrations and reiterated that the Commission wants to help him. Comm. Blackburn also stated that he's aware that the houses in Ft. Sanders are difficult and complex projects, but they affect the neighborhood and community so he's glad to hear that Mr. Holmes understands the Commission's perspective so they won't have to discuss the same issues over and over again.

John Holmes stated that he feels that he may have underestimated the work that needs to be done to the houses. So, for further projects he would request for interior demolition to check the condition of the structure to see how to proceed with the project in terms of reconstruction, replacement, or demolition.

Peter Ahrens, Chief Building Official, briefly interjected and stated that he never asked the applicant to

“over ask” in terms of permitting, but more appropriately request accurate permits. For example, it would be appropriate of Mr. Holmes to request an interior demolition permit in order to see the condition of the house before moving forward with his requests to the Historic Zoning Commission.

Mr. Holmes briefly described his plan for moving forward with applications in the future.

Action: Comm. Blackburn moved that the application submitted for 1610 Forest Avenue be approved based on the evidence submitted, the information provided, and per staff recommendation. The Motion was seconded by Comm. Mitchell. The Motion carried 5-1 (No Webster).

Result: Approved.

Ft. Sanders NC-1

1610 Forest Ave. / Parcel ID 94 N E 015 – New construction (12-F-19-HZ)

Discussion: Lindsay Crockett reviewed the staff report and staff recommendation of approval.

John Holmes, 5914 Gray Gables Drive, was present to discuss the application for review. Mr. Holmes explained to the Commission that he does not have an issue adding an additional window to the rear section of the east elevation as stated in the staff recommendation.

Comm. Eid pointed out that the roof line plan does not match the elevations. The roof line drawing does match with the site plan, the dimensions on the site plan and floor plan is not the same scale as the elevations, there is no scale on the elevations, and the site plan does not show any sidewalks, driveways, or any other important details. Comm. Eid went on to explained that he doesn’t understand how they could judge the design of a house on being appropriate unless they can see the details of it to-scale instead of from 3D not-to-scale model images.

Mr. Holmes stated that he included pictures of the actual construction with his application but that they were removed. Lindsay Crockett noted that she elected not to include the pictures of the construction in the presentation because a majority of the work was completed while securing the site for safety. Even though Mr. Holmes was not yet under a stop-work order, he continued construction and working on the house. She also noted that the Commission has pictures of the current house along with the photos that he submitted in their packets.

Comm. Eid stated that pictures do not suffice. The Commission needs drawings to-scale of the house that is going to be built before obtaining approval. Also, Plans Review and Inspections will need the same information before issuing permits as well. Therefore, Comm. Eid recommends that the applicant submits the same drawings to the Historic Zoning Commission as he does to Plans Review and Inspections to obtain building permits.

Chair Bart Carey brought to attention that there is no front porch detail in any of the plans provided by Mr. Holmes. Mr. Holmes answered by saying that the software he uses has limitations in terms of what it can show for roof, hand rails, and etc. Comm. Carey went on to explain that in new construction, the Commission requires very detailed drawings and recently postponed an item last month for lack of details.

Comm. Eid didn’t feel that it was necessary to continue discussion on the project since none of the elevations are to-scale.

Action: Comm. Eid moved that the application submitted for 1610 Forest Avenue be postponed to the January 16, 2020 Historic Zoning Commission or until the applicant can submit scaled

drawings of site plans, floor plans, roof plans, and elevations with appropriate details. The Motion was seconded by Comm. Webster. The Motion carried unanimously.

Comm. Eid briefly mentioned that whether Mr. Holmes chooses to use software or hand-drawn plans, that's his prerogative. Regardless, the Commission needs appropriate drawings to-scale for the record before determining their appropriateness and approval.

Result: Postponed.

Old North Knoxville H-1

404 E. Oklahoma Ave. / Parcel ID 81 L P 008 – Rear addition; replacement of elements on porch (12-J-19-HZ)

Discussion: Lindsay Crockett reviewed the staff report and staff recommendation of approval.

Kenneth Hamilton, Good Guys Construction, was present and made himself available to any questions or concerns the Commission may have. Mr. Hamilton stated that he can address the concerns of the windows read in the staff recommendation.

Comm. Eid inquired about the proposed roofline. He went on to say that if you look at the photo of the back of the building, and the left side elevation, he's assuming that the left side of the roofline does not stop abruptly there but continues on until it does hit the current hip roof. Mr. Hamilton answered by saying that Comm. Eid's assumption is correct.

Mr. Hamilton went on to clarify that in his initial request, he hoped to keep the same pitch throughout the roof. However, he was under the assumption that he needed to change the pitch in the roof to differentiate the original historic house from the addition.

Chair Bart Carey requested further clarification from the applicant on the proposed ridge and roof pitch.

Comm. Eid stated that he is ok with the pitch being the same as the original house since the addition is at the back of the house.

Further discussion ensued about the exact dimensions of the roof pitch and ridge line.

Lindsay Crockett read into the record the concerns provided by James Pierce, Old North Knoxville Neighborhood Representative. The Neighborhood wanted clarification on the pitch of the roof on the original house and requested more information on how the roof of the addition would tie into the original roofline. The neighborhood also requested clarification on the addition's secondary entry stair railing, and clarification that the chimney reconstruction be reviewed by the Commission at a later date.

Comm. Eid suggested that if the intent is to match the existing slope of the roof or lower, then the soffit line would need to be dropped about a foot or so to remain relevant to the existing house. The soffit and fascia would also need to be dropped accordingly, and by doing so then you've got an offset from the left and right side that will also help drop the roofline by one foot, resulting in the ridgeline not being continuous.

Action: Comm. Eid moved that the application for 404 E. Oklahoma Avenue be approved based on the submitted application, and per staff recommendation with following exception: that the roof pitch would match the existing house roof pitch and the soffit line and roof would be dropped on the addition by one foot from what is submitted in this drawing and therefore offering an offset of the ridgeline. Comm. Eid also wanted to include the Neighborhood Associations recommendations in his motion which states the following: on the stair railing for the rear entry, the pickets should be set between the top and bottom rails, and requesting an explicit clarification

that the chimney that was removed without approval would be reconstructed and details on that would be resubmitted to staff and the Commission for approval. The motion was seconded by Comm. Blackburn. The Motion carried unanimously.

Result: Approved.

Other Business

Election of Knoxville Historic Zoning Commission Chair and Vice-Chair

Action: Comm. Mitchell moved that Bart Carey be appointed as Chair for the Historic Zoning Commission. The Motion was seconded by Comm. Blackburn. The Motion carried unanimously. Bart Carey abstained from the motion.

Action: Comm. Blackburn moved that be appointed as Vice-Chair for the Historic Zoning Commission. The Motion was seconded by Comm. Lundy. The Motion carried unanimously.

Action: Comm. Blackburn moved to adjourn the Knoxville Historic Zoning Commission meeting at 9:13 A.M. The Motion was seconded by Comm. Mitchell. The Motion carried unanimously and the meeting was adjourned.