

MINUTES

**KNOX COUNTY HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION
KNOXVILLE HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION**

OCTOBER 18, 2018

Knox County Historic Zoning Commission				
Commissioner	Present	Absent	Excused	Arrived
Bill Belser	N/A			
Mike Crowder	N/A			
George Ewart, Chair	N/A			
Kim Isenberg	N/A			
Scott Smith, Vice Chair	N/A			

Staff/Others Present	Affiliation
N/A	N/A

There was no County business therefore the Knox County Historic Zoning Commission did not convene.

Approval of Minutes

N/A.

Staff Reports

N/A

Reports to Commission

N/A

KNOX COUNTY CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS

N/A

Knoxville Historic Zoning Commission				
Commissioner	Present	Absent	Excused	Arrived
Rick Blackburn	X			
Bart Carey, Vice Chair	X			
Steve Cotham			X	
Faris Eid	X			
Dasha Lundy	X			
Lorie Matthews, Chair	X			
Dationa Mitchell	X			
Sandi Swilley			X	
Stanton Webster		X		

Staff/Others Present	Affiliation
Christina Magrans	City Law Department
Kaye Graybeal	MPC
Dori Caron	MPC
Laura Edmonds	MPC
Scott Elder	City Plans Review and Building Inspections
DeAnn Bogus	City Plans Review and Building Inspections
Arin Streeter	Fourth and Gill Neighborhood Representative
PJ Snodgrass	Applicant
Sean and Sarah Martin	Open Door Architecture
Brett Honeycutt	Applicant
Bernadette West	Applicant/Owner

Knoxville Historic Zoning Comm. Chair Lorie Matthews called the meeting to order at 8:30 a.m. Roll call was taken and it was noted there was a quorum. Comm. Matthews stated that the meeting is being televised and recorded. She also asked that speakers limit their presentations to five minutes and to sign in when they reach the podium. Applicants or members of the public who wished to speak on an Agenda Item were sworn in. She further noted that any appeals to Commission decisions can be taken to Chancery Court if appealed within 60 days.

Approval of Minutes

Action: Comm. Rick Blackburn moved to approve the September 20, 2018 Knoxville Historic Zoning Commission Minutes. The Motion was seconded by Comm. Dasha Lundy. The Motion carried unanimously.

Result: Approved.

Staff Reports

Kaye Graybeal referenced the Level 1 Certificates approved since the last meeting.

Reports to Commission

There were no reports to Commission.

KNOXVILLE CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS

Fairmont-Emoriland NC-1

2212 Emoriland Blvd – Construct rear addition (8-B-18-HZ)

Discussion: Kaye Graybeal reviewed the staff report and staff recommendation. The subject house is of Minimal Traditional style constructed c. 1940 and is a contributing in the Fairmont-Emoriland NC-1 Overlay. The plan is to construct a one-story frame rear addition. The addition will include adding two bathrooms, one bedroom and a covered patio at the rear of the house. The proposed rear addition is to be constructed completely to the rear of the house, and will be offset on the west side by 6 inches. The east end of the addition wall will end near the center of the back façade and will create an area for a recessed patio. The applicant proposed fiber cement board shingles as an appropriate material in the Fairmont-Emoriland NC-1 Overlay to distinguish the addition from the brick main block of the house, and complement the brick façade. A French style door will be the entry way into the addition from the patio. The property was re-platted and the two lots (2212 and 2216 Emoriland) were combined into one lot to provide compliance with the under-roof code requirement.

Dr. PJ Snodgrass, Applicant, was present and made herself available for questions.

Action: Comm. Rick Blackburn moved to recommend approval based on the evidence submitted, the information provided in the staff report, and per staff recommendation. The Motion was seconded by Comm. Dasha Lundy. The Motion carried unanimously.

Result: Approved.

Fourth and Gill H-1

1214 Luttrell Street – Rear Façade revisions and deck (10-G-18-HZ)

Discussion: Kaye Graybeal reviewed the staff report and staff recommendation. The house is a contributing structure within the Fourth and Gill H-1 and the National Register Historic Districts. The proposed design is based on restoring the rear of the house to resemble more closely its original configuration, using appropriately proportioned wooden materials including 1/1 double-hung windows and full light French doors. The project consists of removal and construction of a rear wood deck, removal of walls and windows from the north end of non-original enclosed back porch, installation of new tall full-glass wood double French door, and installation of a fixed skylight. The configuration, material, and windows and doors of the rear porch are not original. The brick foundation of the house does not continue under the enclosed porch; therefore, the enclosed area was not constructed at the same time as the main house. A brick pier and wood beams support the floor framing alluding to a former porch in that location. A cement block/brick stoop and staircase are located beneath the deck that indicate the former access between the house and the rear yard before the deck was constructed. Fourth and Gill Design Guidelines, adopted by the Knoxville City Council on April 1999, and June 29, 1999 states that in new construction, the proportion of the porches to the front facades should be consistent with the historic porches in the neighborhood. Details such as columns, posts, piers, balustrades and porch flooring must use materials that present a visually and physically appropriate appearance historically.

Arin Streeter, Fourth and Gill Neighborhood Representative was present. Mr. Streeter stated that the neighborhood is in support of the staff report and staff recommendation.

Action: Comm. Farris Eid moved that the application submitted for 1214 Luttrell Street be approved based on the evidence submitted, the information provided in the staff report, and per staff recommendation with the condition that the skylight is installed in an appropriate location. The Motion was seconded by Comm. Dationa Mitchell. The Motion carried unanimously.

Result: Approved.

Market Square H-1

26 Market Sq. – Installation of rooftop guardrail (10-D-18-HZ)

Discussion: Kaye Graybeal reviewed the staff report and staff recommendation. The building at 26 Market Square is a contributing building in the Market Square H-1 Overlay and National Register Historic District. The property is a two story brick building with the second story being stucco. The storefront has been altered and the windows have been replaced. The proposed work is to install a rooftop 3'-6" -high guardrail to be set 10+ feet back from building's front edge to match railing at 28 Market Square which is wire mesh. The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings is referenced by the Market Square Design Guidelines, and the principles are utilized as a basis for those guidelines. The top portion of the proposed guard railing for 26 Market Square will be visible above the top of the building's parapet from the opposite side of the Market Square public way when viewed from directly in front of the building. The HZC precedent since at least 2010 has been to deny permanent rooftop features including guard railings that can be seen from any distance from within the Market Square public way when viewing the roof edge from directly in front of the building (from 25-27 Market Square).

Brett Honeycutt, 8000 Bennington Drive, introduced himself as the Architect for the Market Square project and made himself available for any questions the Commission might have.

Bernadette West, 26 Market Street, requested clarification as to why the criteria for the height of rooftop railing is that it cannot be visible when looking directly at the storefront. Kaye Graybeal explained that the Historic Zoning Commission bases their decision Market Square precedent and Design Guidelines-- in this case – “The Secretary of Interiors Standards.”

Bart Carey expressed concerns regarding the impact previous construction may have had on the placement of the required railing. Mr. Carey also stated that the pictures provided by the applicant only show the railing location and not the actual railing or any other specific modifications needed to meet the design guidelines. Therefore, it would be hard to vote on an application without seeing a visual of the plans beforehand.

Brett Honeycutt stated his intent would be to define the visibility of the railing with specific dimensions in inches.

Faris Eid stated that there is not enough evidence provided to move forward with approval and suggested postponing this application to the November Historic Zoning Commission to give the applicant more time to provide the board with specific plans as to how they plan to meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings and the Market Square Design Guidelines in the construction of the rooftop railing for 26 Market Square.

Action: Comm. Faris Eid moved that the application submitted for 26 Market Square be postponed until the November 18, 2018 HZC Meeting to allow the applicants more opportunity to submit clarification on plans. The Motion was seconded by Comm. Dasha Lundy. The Motion carried unanimously.

Result: Approved.

Other Business

None

Action: Comm. Rick Blackburn moved to adjourn the Knoxville Historic Zoning Commission meeting at 10:00 A.M. The Motion was seconded by Comm. Faris Eid. The Motion carried unanimously the meeting was adjourned.