

MINUTES

**KNOX COUNTY HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION
KNOXVILLE HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION**

MARCH 15, 2018

Knox County Historic Zoning Commission				
Commissioner	Present	Absent	Excused	Arrived
Bill Belser	N/A			
Mike Crowder	N/A			
George Ewart, Chair	N/A			
Kim Isenberg	N/A			
Scott Smith, Vice Chair	N/A			

Staff/Others Present	Affiliation
N/A	N/A

There was no County business therefore the Knox County Historic Zoning Commission did not convene.

Approval of Minutes

N/A.

Staff Reports

N/A

Reports to Commission

N/A

KNOX COUNTY CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS

N/A

Knoxville Historic Zoning Commission				
Commissioner	Present	Absent	Excused	Arrived
Rick Blackburn			X	
Bart Carey, Vice Chair			X	
Steve Cotham	X			
Faris Eid			X	
Dasha Lundy	X			
Lorie Matthews, Chair	X			
Dationa Mitchell				9:00 am
Sandi Swilley	X			
Stanton Webster	X			

Staff/Others Present	Affiliation
Crista Cuccaro	City Law Department
Kaye Graybeal	MPC
Dori Caron	MPC
DeAnn Bogus	City Plans Review and Building Inspections
Scott Elder	City Plans Review and Building Inspections
James Pierce	Old North Knoxville Neighborhood Representative
David Holmes	Applicant
Jane-Coleman Harbison	Tennessee Historical Commission

Knoxville Historic Zoning Comm. Chair Matthews called the meeting to order at 8:34 am. Roll call was taken and it was noted there was a quorum. Comm. Matthews stated that the meeting is being televised and recorded. She also asked that speakers limit their presentations to five minutes and to sign in when they reach the podium. Applicants or members of the public who wished to speak on an Agenda Item were sworn in. She further noted that any appeals to Commission decisions can be taken to Chancery Court if appealed within 60 days.

Kaye Graybeal introduced a guest today, Jane-Coleman Harbison, the Certified Local Government (CLG) Coordinator with the State Historic Preservation Office (SHPO). Ms. Graybeal noted Ms. Harbison will be leading the workshop after the meeting today.

Approval of Minutes

Action: Comm. Cotham moved to approve the February 15, 2018 Knoxville Historic Zoning Commission Minutes. The Motion was seconded by Comm. Webster. The Motion carried unanimously.

Result: Approved.

Staff Reports

Ms. Graybeal reviewed the Level 1 Certificates approved since the last meeting.

Reports to Commission

There were no reports to Commission.

KNOXVILLE CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS

Edgewood-Park City H-1

1704 Washington Avenue – Porch Balustrade (3-H-18-HZ)

Discussion: Ms. Graybeal reviewed the staff report and staff recommendation. There was no Applicant nor neighborhood representative present. There was no substantial discussion.

Action: Comm. Webster moved that the application submitted for 1704 Washington Avenue be approved based on the evidence submitted, the information provided in the staff report and per staff recommendation. The Motion was seconded by Comm. Swilley. The Motion carried unanimously.

Result: Approved.

Old North Knoxville H-1

412 E. Scott Avenue – Egress window (2-B-18-HZ)

Discussion: Ms. Graybeal reviewed the staff report. She noted the Certificate was partially approved at the February meeting for window and siding replacement and reconstruction of certain elements of the porch. Consideration of the installation of an egress window on the north gable was postponed until today's meeting. Ms. Graybeal described the Applicant's re-submitted design for that window which is to raise the existing, original diamond vent up 18 inches to accommodate a 36 x 36 sq. inch casement window with matching 4 inch trim and casing. In a written statement the Applicant noted their exploration of installation of a rear dormer in lieu of the proposed window did not result in a design that would work for the house for multiple reasons. Ms. Graybeal noted that staff would recommend approval, however, would like to hear from Plans Review and Inspections on what could be a minimum window size that would meet code. DeAnn Bogus spoke and noted an egress window has to have a minimum of a 5.7 sq. ft. net clear opening. It also has to be a minimum of 24 inches high and 20 inches wide. Applicant David Holmes was present and noted the 36 x 36 proposed window was from the vendor online calculation. Neighborhood representative James Pierce was present and wanted to clarify that the photos presented by staff (handouts) had original fixtures and openings were not relocated as part of their approval. He noted the house has another diamond shaped vent on the front gable, so if moved on the north side the vent would be offset from the one on the front elevation. He noted that although the neighborhood has supported installation of egress windows on secondary elevations and rear dormers for egress purposes they have not approved installation of an egress window/dormer that necessitated removal or relocation of an original and character defining feature of a house. He stated the location of the proposed egress window is very visible from the street and it was also noted the north elevation gable and the front gable can be viewed simultaneously. Other window options were discussed including alternate window sizes and shapes. It was clarified that staff recommendation would not include removal of the north gable diamond vent but would support relocation of it on the gable. Staff feels that supporting additional uses of the attic spaces in these larger houses increases their viability. It was clarified that approval of what is proposed would only set a precedent for a like proposal on similarly situated properties. There was further discussion surrounding a potential final size of the proposed window.

Action: Comm. Cotham moved that the application submitted for 412 E. Scott Avenue be postponed until the April meeting based on the evidence submitted and the information provided in the staff report. The Motion was seconded by Comm. Lundy. The Applicant noted the smallest window per the vendor online calculation was a 34 x 34 sq. inch window which has a special hinge to accommodate egress. It was also noted the window below the proposed one is approximately 33 inches wide. There was further discussion on possible options moving forward.

Action: Comm. Cotham withdrew his Motion.

Ms. Graybeal noted staff recommendation would support approval of a 34 in. x 34 in. casement window [with the special hinge that would allow egress, per code] as a smaller window would have the least impact. She noted although it does change the historical appearance of the façade it is on a secondary elevation, and though it [north façade] is a more prominent elevation, the gable is set back from the front. Further, a square window would clearly reflect a newer installation.

Action: Comm. Swilley moved that the application submitted for 412 E. Scott Avenue be approved based on the evidence submitted and the information provided in the staff report with the following condition: 1) That the window dimension is 34 x 34 inches [with the special hinge that would allow egress, per code]. The Motion was seconded by Comm. Cotham. The Motion carried with Comm. Lundy voting no.

Result: Approved with condition.

401 E. Oklahoma Avenue – Exterior Renovations) 3-D-18-HZ)

Discussion: Ms. Graybeal reviewed the staff report and staff recommendation.

She noted the Applicant has indicated the proposed additional window on the side of the rear addition [casement window adequate egress designed such that it looks like a double hung window] will be approximately the same size as the proposed rear windows. Applicant David Holmes was present and had nothing to add to the staff report.

Neighborhood representative James Pierce was present and asked for clarification on whether the posts to be replaced on the front porch will match the existing half post. Ms. Graybeal noted yes, and she referred to it as the engaged post in the staff report. She noted it is actually a half post applied to the house and it's turned design would guide the turn design of the new posts that would replace the existing rolled metal posts. The Applicant indicated that they could use that design for the replacement posts. Mr. Pierce requested that if not an exact match could any replacement design come back through the Commission. He noted the neighborhood would also like to request a condition that as the foundation appears to be original or close to original, as do the chimneys, that no paint or parging be added to any masonry. There was consensus that there should not be any paint or parging on any original brick on the main block of the house. Further, that repair of the original brick would be allowed. Mr. Holmes stated he was OK with that as they had no plans to paint them, however, they would need to do some parging on the rear addition where there is just cinderblocks. Regarding the turned posts he noted they would be looking for salvaged posts to replace the metal ones. It was clarified the existing turned posts [wooden] would not be removed. Ms. Graybeal noted any new turned posts would need to be as close to what is there as possible. There was consensus that staff could approved the final porch support design. Ms. Graybeal noted the Applicant is proposing to have a more substantial balustrade than what was on the north side.

Action: Comm. Swilley moved that the application submitted for 401 E. Oklahoma Avenue be approved based on the evidence submitted, the information provided in the staff report and per staff recommendation with the following conditions: 1) A section detail through the proposed wooden trim on the wainscot on the rear be provided to show the relationship of the trim to the beadboard below and the horizontal wood siding above; and 2) the size of the proposed casement window on the rear north side be provided, and 3) The final porch support design be approved by staff and be similar to the existing engaged post and, 4) that the original brick [on the main block of the house] be repaired [as necessary] and not painted or parged. The Motion was seconded by Comm. Mitchell. The Motion carried unanimously.

Result: Approved with conditions.

Other Business

There was no other business.

Action: Comm. Swilley moved to adjourn the Knoxville Historic Zoning Commission meeting. The Motion was seconded by Comm. Mitchell. The Motion carried unanimously the meeting was adjourned.

There was a Commissioner training session sponsored by the Certified Local Government (CLG) Coordinator with the State Historic Preservation Office (SHPO) after the meeting that began at 11:00 am. in the Small Assembly Room, City County Building. The public was invited.