

MINUTES

**KNOX COUNTY HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION
KNOXVILLE HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION**

APRIL 19, 2018

Knox County Historic Zoning Commission				
Commissioner	Present	Absent	Excused	Arrived
Bill Belser	N/A			
Mike Crowder	N/A			
George Ewart, Chair	N/A			
Kim Isenberg	N/A			
Scott Smith, Vice Chair	N/A			

Staff/Others Present	Affiliation
N/A	N/A

There was no County business therefore the Knox County Historic Zoning Commission did not convene.

Approval of Minutes

N/A.

Staff Reports

N/A

Reports to Commission

N/A

KNOX COUNTY CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS

N/A

Knoxville Historic Zoning Commission				
Commissioner	Present	Absent	Excused	Arrived
Rick Blackburn	X			
Bart Carey, Vice Chair			X	
Steve Cotham			X	
Faris Eid			X	
Dasha Lundy	X			
Lorie Matthews, Chair	X			
Dationa Mitchell	X			
Sandi Swilley	X			8:42
Stanton Webster	X			

Staff/Others Present	Affiliation
Crista Cuccaro	City Law Department
Kaye Graybeal	MPC
Dori Caron	MPC
DeAnn Bogus	City Plans Review and Building Inspections
Scott Elder	City Plans Review and Building Inspections
Arin Streeter	Fourth and Gill Neighborhood Representative
Alice Basler	Applicant
Stephanie Drinnen	Applicant
Scott Redmond	Applicant
Tricia Roelofs	Applicant

Knoxville Historic Zoning Comm. Chair Matthews called the meeting to order at 8:32 am. Roll call was taken and it was noted there was a quorum. Comm. Matthews stated that the meeting is being televised and recorded. She also asked that speakers limit their presentations to five minutes and to sign in when they reach the podium. Applicants or members of the public who wished to speak on an Agenda Item were sworn in. She further noted that any appeals to Commission decisions can be taken to Chancery Court if appealed within 60 days.

Approval of Minutes

Action: Comm. Blackburn moved to approve the March 15, 2018 Knoxville Historic Zoning Commission Minutes. The Motion was seconded by Comm. Webster. The Motion carried unanimously.

Result: Approved.

Staff Reports

Ms. Graybeal reviewed the Level 1 Certificates approved since the last meeting.

Reports to Commission

There were no reports to Commission.

KNOXVILLE CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS

Fort Sanders NC-1

1413 Highland Avenue – Reconstruction of front porch (4-J-18-HZ)

Discussion: Ms. Graybeal reviewed the staff report and staff recommendation. Neighborhood representative Randall DeFord had noted to staff that the neighborhood is in agreement with staff recommendation. The Applicant was present and had nothing to add to the staff report and further noted they were in agreement with installing the 2 double-hung windows per staff condition #1. Ms. Graybeal noted the neighborhood also suggested the Applicant explore designs that would make the railing appear lower than the required 36 inches.

Action: Comm. Blackburn moved that the application submitted for 1413 Highland Avenue be approved based on the evidence submitted, the information provided in the staff report and per staff recommendation and per the neighborhood concurrence, and with the following conditions: 1) That a double-hung window be installed in the upper and lower levels of the front façade, based on the size indicated either by existing revealed framing or a similar size on a similar house, and 2) The porch railing will be required to be 36 inches high to meet the building code (rather than the proposed 32 inches).

The Motion was seconded by Comm. Mitchell. The Motion carried unanimously.

Result: Approved with conditions.

Fourth and Gill H-1

809 Eleanor Street – Install shingles in the front porch gable (4-H-18-HZ)

Discussion: Ms. Graybeal reviewed the staff report and staff recommendation. The Applicants were present and had nothing further to add to the staff report. Neighborhood representative Arin Streeter was present and noted it would be nice to see the gable restored to what is was originally but the neighborhood did have some disagreement on the use of fiber cement board for the shingles. He referenced the Secretary of Interior Standards noting the materials used should be the same as the original materials “where possible”. They would prefer a wood [cedar] shingle. There is concern that a precedent would be set if an alternative material was used here. Applicant Scott Redmond was present [and was sworn in as he was not present earlier] and noted cedar shingles [installed] would be twice the price as what they have proposed. Their concern is also that wood shingles would require ongoing maintenance. He noted they chose the proposed material as it most closely matches the original size and pattern and further clarified that it could be made so as to replicate the original shingles. Ms. Graybeal noted an approval would set a precedent allowing use of an alternate material on a front gable [on an historic houses]. Mr. Redman noted their contractor recommends they place the fiber cement shingles over the existing lap siding. There was then discussion on taking more of the existing lap siding off to see the shingle pattern underneath which the Applicant stated they do not want to do as it is no longer available should it not be able to be put back on. Further discussion ensued on how the proposed material could replicate the same size and pattern of the original shingles, the intent of the guidelines and the neighborhood’s challenges with the use of an alternative material here. Co-applicant Stephanie Drinnen also noted that the material they are proposing mirrors the existing shingles. Mr. Streeter, upon request, reiterated the neighborhood concern was the use of artificial materials on historic houses further noting this has not been allowed in the past. Mr. Redman clarified that there is no original siding left anywhere on the house, it is now all man-made. There was a discussion on whether or not this would actually set a precedent as there was already non-original materials there covering the original shingles.

Action: Comm. Swilley moved that the application submitted for 809 Eleanor Street be approved based on the evidence submitted, the information provided in the staff report and per staff recommendation with the following clarification: 1) That the existing shingles be replicated as closely as possible. The Motion was seconded by Comm. Lundy. It was clarified that staff would need to come out to more closely compare the actual proposed sample to the existing shingles with an onsite visit prior to the Applicant proceeding. The Motion carried with Comm. Mitchell voting no.

Result: Approved with clarification.

940 Eleanor Street – Construction of a porch addition (4-G-18-HZ)

Discussion: Ms. Graybeal reviewed the staff report and staff recommendation. Applicant Tricia Roelofs was present and had nothing further to add to the staff report. Neighborhood representative Arin Streeter was present and noted the neighborhood is in agreement with staff recommendation. Ms. Graybeal noted a clarification on the attached drawings: A1.4: On the older part of the porch (side porch) the Applicant intends to retain the round fluted columns therefore the rest of the columns would be square and would be differentiated from these.

Action: Comm. Lundy moved that the application submitted for 940 Eleanor Street be approved based on the evidence submitted, the information provided in the staff report and per staff recommendation with the following condition: 1) That the front and rear balustrade are constructed with nominal 2 x 2 pickets rather than turned (as shown in the 3-D rendering). The Motion was seconded by Comm. Swilley. The Motion carried unanimously.

Result: Approved with condition.

Other Business

- Ms. Graybeal noted she will be forwarding the Annual Report to the Commissioners electronically. It is a required document that outlines the historic preservation activities for the last year.
- Ms. Graybeal also noted Lorie Matthew's term as the HZC representative on the Downtown Design Review Board is expiring and asked that if any Commissioners are interested in representing the HZC on that Board to let her know.
- Ms. Graybeal will be sending out information on the upcoming National Alliance of Preservation Commission conference which is taking place in Des Moines, Iowa in July. She noted they have a grant from the Tennessee Historical Commission to offset costs and the MPC can match that grant 60-40. Please let her know if you have interest in attending.
- Ms. Graybeal will be scheduling another Commissioner workshop soon for those Commissioners that were unable to attend the previous one.
- Arin Streeter announced the 28th annual Fourth and Gill Home Tour is taking place April 29th from 1:00 to 6:00 pm.

Action: Comm. Webster moved to adjourn the Knoxville Historic Zoning Commission meeting. The Motion was seconded by Comm. Blackburn. The Motion carried unanimously the meeting was adjourned.