

**MINUTES
KNOXVILLE HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION
KNOX COUNTY HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION
MEETING
MAY 18, 2017**

Knoxville Historic Zoning Commission				
Commissioner	Present	Absent	Excused	Arrived
Rick Blackburn	X			
Bart Carey, Vice Chair	X			
Steve Cotham	X			
Faris Eid	X			
Dasha Lundy	X			
Lorie Matthews, Chair	X			
Melissa McAdams	X			
Sandi Swilley			X	
Stanton Webster	X			

Knox County Historic Zoning Commission				
Commissioner	Present	Absent	Excused	Arrived
Bill Belser			X	
Mike Crowder	X			
George Ewart, Chair		X		
Scott Smith, Vice Chair		X		
Open	N/A			

Staff/Others Present	Affiliation
Crista Cuccaro	City Law Department
Peter Ahrens	City Plans Review and Inspections
Kaye Graybeal	MPC
DeAnn Bogus	City Plans Review and Inspections
Scott Elder	City Plans Review and Inspections
Annette Wszelaki	Applicant
Alicia Basler	Applicant
Emily Wakefield	Applicant
Arin Streeter	Fourth and Gill Neighborhood Representative

Knoxville Historic Zoning Comm. Chair Matthews called the meeting to order at 8:30 am. City roll call was taken and it was noted there was a City quorum. There was no County quorum therefore County business on the Agenda will not be considered today. Comm. Mathews stated that the meeting is being televised and recorded. She also asked that speakers limit their presentations to five minutes and to sign in when they reach the podium. She further noted that any appeals to Commission decisions can be taken to Chancery Court if appealed within 60 days.

Approval of Minutes

Action: Comm. Carey moved to approve the April 20, 2017 Historic Zoning Commission Minutes. The Motion was seconded by Comm. Webster. The Motion carried unanimously.

Result: Approved

Staff Reports: Ms. Graybeal reviewed the Level 1 Certificates approved since the last meeting.

KNOX COUNTY HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION

A public hearing was not opened due to the lack of a quorum.

CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS

Concord Village HZ

10715 3rd Drive - construction of outbuilding (5-L-17-HZ). The Applicant had requested a postponement of the consideration of this Certificate until the June 15th, 2017 meeting given that he could not attend this meeting.

Other Business: Knox County Historic Zoning Commission

- **Approval of Pre-Application Review Policy** - This was not considered today due to the lack of a quorum. This will be postponed to the June 15th, 2017 meeting as well. Staff is waiting to hear back from the Concord neighborhood representative on the neighborhood's response to this proposed policy.

KNOXVILLE HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION

CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS

Fourth and Gill H-1

1206 Luttrell St. – Reconstruct front porch and dormer (5-M-17-HZ)

Discussion: Ms. Graybeal reviewed the staff report and staff recommendation. Applicant Emily Wakefield was present and had nothing further to add to the staff report. Neighborhood representative Arin Streeter was present and noted the neighborhood was really excited about the proposal and are very happy to see that the original porch will be rebuilt. Ms. Wakefield clarified that the brick foundation will match what is existing around the sides of the house which will not be painted. She noted that they found some brick that is similar to what is there. They only intend to paint the concrete stairs and stoop that are currently painted, but with a matching color.

Action: Comm. Carey moved that the application submitted for 1206 Luttrell St. be approved based on the evidence submitted and the information provided in the staff report and per staff recommendation. The Motion was seconded by Comm. Webster. The Motion carried unanimously.

Result: Approved

Ft. Sanders NC-1

315 James Agee St - roof dormer (5-J-17-HZ)

Discussion: Ms. Graybeal reviewed the staff report and staff recommendation. Owner Alicia Basler was present and had nothing further to add to the staff report. Neighborhood liaison Randall DeFord did comment to staff on the application and noted the neighborhood had not voiced any opposition to the proposal. Discussion ensued regarding clarification of the exact dormer placement from the 3D rendering vs. the elevation drawings. Ms. Basler noted the proposed dormer will match the placement of the existing dormer on the other side, noting the drawings are clearly not correct. She noted the dormer placement will align with the window below it and the face of it will align with the face of the wall below it as well. Ms. Graybeal noted

the exact placement as she described will need to be shown in a construction document in order to receive a permit.

Action: Comm. Eid moved that the application submitted for 315 James Agee St. be approved based on the evidence submitted and the information provided in the staff report and per staff recommendation with the following conditions regarding the proposed addition of the dormer; 1) the face of the dormer be aligned with the face of the wall below, and 2) the dormer being in alignment with the window below it as depicted on Page #3 of 4 on the application, and 3), that the overall placement and roof line of the dormer is in conformance with existing dormers on the other side of the roof, and 4) a final drawing is to be resubmitted to staff for approval. The Motion was seconded by Comm. Carey. The Motion carried unanimously.

Result: Approved with conditions

Old North Knoxville H-1

1335 Grainger Ave. – Install metal roof (5-K-17-HZ)

This Certificate was actually heard first as when requested, there was no opposition from the Commission nor other Applicants present. As the Applicant came in late she was sworn in at that time at the request of the law department.

Discussion: Ms. Graybeal reviewed the staff report and staff recommendation beginning with clarification of what was previously approved by the Commission in April 2017 noting the Applicant has brought forth additional information as well as a sample of what they are proposing. She noted staff now has a more complete and thorough survey of other houses in [Old North Knoxville] that have this type of roof. Ms. Graybeal reviewed the newer survey in some detail noting staff is recommending approval, treating similarly situated properties similarly. She then read an opinion from James Pierce, neighborhood representative for Old North Knoxville, submitted via email as he was unable to be in attendance today: “The opinion is that this type of roof has not been introduced on the side of Broadway where this house is located so it is a different context, and that the guidelines specifically state that standing seam is to be used for metal roofs. The neighborhood does not feel that the precedent set by the other houses is a strong argument for continued approval of a classic ribbed [metal roof].” Mr. Pierce acknowledges that there are roofs in the area that have ribbed metal but they were never approved via a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) so they should not be considered, only those approved by a COA that only state that a metal roof was approved should be considered as precedents. Five of the metal roofs that were approved state that they are approved for a metal roof, not specifying what kind of metal roof. Mr. Pierce felt that since the guidelines state standing seam, that should have been implied. His opinion also noted that as metal roofing becomes more prevalent in our historic neighborhoods it should be done with careful attention to style and finish, and to avoid distractions from the architectural character by introducing new materials and finishes. Applicant/owner Annette Wszelaki was present and stated she thought there was good precedent for a classic ribbed roof and while they aren’t present on their side of Broadway they were approved on various streets in the past. She noted metal roofs are more environmentally friendly. Comm. McAdams reiterated that she felt the Commission feels the proposed roof is appropriate as this is a new infill house and not an original one, the guidelines are vague, that that it is in a similar context, that it adequately simulates standing seam and that sufficient precedence has been set. Comm. Carey, also reiterating his stance, noted that as the Commission allows asphalt shingles to be used as replacement roof material on all types of roofs in the historic district, he feels that this type of product is much closer to a standing seam than asphalt shingle would be to any of the historic roofing materials used in this neighborhood. Ms. Wszelaki clarified that she did not know exactly how the edge profile would look finished but there would be gutters when finished. Comm. Crowder noted a roof edge that fits this profile is available and it fits under the roof deck and overhangs into the gutter, which he would recommend. Ms. Graybeal noted the contractor indicated the roof edges will be terminated with a gable trim and also noted flashing.

The Applicant noted there are existing gutters on the roof. Comm. Eid noted he was previously not in favor of this type of roof as it is typically found on sheds and farm buildings, not on a house in Old North Knoxville, noting he still feels a standing seam roof would be more appropriate. Further, it [ribbed metal] was originally created for industrial buildings. Comm. Webster shared that he felt the guidelines did denote specificity here. Ms. Graybeal noted that the Commission can consider alternative materials that adequately simulate original materials. There was further discussion surrounding potential grounds for approval.

Action: Comm. McAdams moved that the application submitted for 1335 Grainger Ave. be approved based on the evidence submitted and the information provided in the staff report and per staff recommendation and all of the contributing factors; this being a non-contributing house, a newer infill home, and with the variety in the neighborhood, that this is appropriate. The Motion was seconded by Comm. Carey. Ms. Wszelaki confirmed that the existing gutters will be put back on or replaced as necessary. Comm. Carey suggested if replaced they should consider using a matching color.

Comm. Chair Matthews called for a roll call vote on the floor.

Commissioner
Blackburn: Aye
Carey: Aye
Cotham: Aye
Eid: No
Lundy: Aye
Matthews: Aye
McAdams: Aye
Webster: Aye

7 yes, 1 no. Motion carries.

Result: Approved

Other Business:

- Ms. Graybeal noted that she and Comm. Cotham attended an all-day training session sponsored by the State Historic Preservation Office via a training grant. An attorney that specialized in preservation and land use spoke on how to conduct meetings properly, ex-parte communication etc. They also identified additional resources on traditional building materials. Comm. Cotham clarified that it was also pointed out at the training that if a commissioner recuses themselves they need to physically leave the room. It was noted by Crista Cuccaro that the recused board members on the Board of Zoning Appeals and Downtown Design Review Board sit in the audience when they have recused themselves. She noted it was the Commission's call further noting sitting in the audience is desirable, but leaving the room ideal. Ms. Graybeal noted they indicated at the training that design guidelines should ideally be updated a minimum of every 10 years.

Action: Comm. Webster moved to adjourn the Knoxville Historic Zoning Commission meeting. The Motion was seconded by Comm. Carey. The Motion carried unanimously and the Knoxville Historic Zoning Commission meeting was adjourned.