

**MINUTES
KNOXVILLE HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION
KNOX COUNTY HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION
MEETING DECEMBER 15, 2016**

Knoxville Historic Zoning Commission				
Commissioner	Present	Absent	Excused	Arrived
Sean Bolen, Vice Chair	X			
Bart Carey		X		
Steve Cotham	X			
Faris Eid	X			
Lorie Matthews, Chair			X	
Melissa McAdams	X			
Sandi Swilley	X			
Stanton Webster	X			
Jason Woodle		X		

Knox County Historic Zoning Commission				
Commissioner	Present	Absent	Excused	Arrived
Bill Belser	N/A			
David Butler, Chair	N/A			
Mike Crowder	N/A			In attendance
George Ewart, Vice Chair	N/A			
Scott Smith	N/A			

Staff/Others Present	Affiliation
Crista Cuccaro	City Law Department
Melvin Wright	City Plans Review and Inspections
Scott Elder	City Plans Review and Inspections
Kaye Graybeal	MPC
Dori Caron	MPC
Arin Streeter	Fourth and Gill Neighborhood Representative
Chad Tindell	Applicant Representative (Atty)
Cindy Rusk	Applicant
Raymond Morrow	Applicant
Adam Hadjerioua	Applicant
Tracy Miller	Scenic View Sunrooms
Helen Jamison	Owner
Mark Heinz	National Register applicant

Knoxville Historic Zoning Comm. Vice-Chair Comm. Bolen called the meeting to order at 8:35 am. City roll call was taken and it was noted there was a City quorum. It was then noted there was no County business and the Knox County Historic Zoning Commission would not convene. Comm. Bolen swore in all Applicants and visitors that planned to speak on any Agenda item. Comm. Bolen stated that the meeting was being televised and recorded. He also asked that speakers limit their presentations to five minutes and to sign in when they reached the podium. He further noted that any appeals to Commission decisions can be taken to

Chancery Court if appealed within 60 days.

Approval of Minutes

Action: Comm. Eid moved to approve the November 17, 2016 Historic Zoning Commission Minutes. The Motion was seconded by Comm. Swilley. The Motion carried unanimously.

Result: Approved.

Staff Reports: Ms. Graybeal reviewed the Level 1 Certificates approved since the last meeting.

CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS

KNOXVILLE HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION

Edgewood - Park City H-1

1709 Jefferson Ave - Enclose front porch with glass panels (12-D-16-HZ)

Discussion: Ms. Graybeal reviewed the staff report and staff recommendation. Owner representative Chad Tindell was present. He noted there has been an appeal filed for the initial denial so there is litigation involved. He also noted the owner, Ms. Jamison, and a representative from Scenic View Sunrooms, Tracy Miller, were present. He noted Scenic View Sunrooms admitted they did not apply for a building permit. He gave an overview of the history of the entire situation further noting they have met with the City Law Department and staff multiple times in order to attempt to mitigate the situation. He stated they are still in active appeal in Chancery Court with regard to the original denial. He reviewed the reasoning behind the owner's desire to have the porch enclosed. They believe they have presented viable options for approval. Neighborhood representative Calvin Chappelle was not present; however, the neighborhood has indicated to staff their concern that an approval of this proposal would set a precedent for this type of enclosure. Ms. Cuccaro gave an overview of the City Law Department's involvement with this application and noted that the Law Department could not support deferral of removal of the enclosure in response to Scenic View Sunroom's proposal to remove the enclosure when the property transfers ownership. It was clarified that the Commission does have the authority to approve a deferral for a certain length of time, but again, Ms. Cuccaro noted the Law Department would not recommend it.

Comm. Eid proposed that the railings and columns be replaced as were there originally, floating completely behind a glass enclosure, frameless or with minimal muntins, temporarily affixed, to be removed at a later date. A substantial discussion ensued with regard to Scenic View Sunroom's latest proposal before the Commission being basically as close to Comm. Eid's suggestions given code and manufacturer restrictions. Ms. Graybeal noted she understands that what they are proposing shows as few muntins and as minimal amount of frame as possible, but they would not be able to put the [porch support] posts back in as they would have been originally because they need them to be more substantial and straighter to hold the glass.

Melvin Wright, City Plans Review and Inspections, noted there needs to be a landing the width of the door and the length, in the direction of travel [for residential], should be a 36-inch landing; therefore, the door would need to be recessed in order to have a landing on each side of the door. Mr. Wright later clarified that if there is a main egress located elsewhere in the house they would not need to have the 36-inch landing on both sides of the front door. Relocating the sunroom to the rear of the house was then suggested and discussed as a potential alternative.

Comm. Bolen noted that although the Commission is sympathetic to the owner's situation, the enclosure is simply a violation of the guidelines and is therefore not approvable, further noting concern that any approval

would set a precedent for future requests for similar enclosures.

Action: Comm. Bolen moved, based on the evidence presented before us, that we [the Commission] approve staff recommendation [for the application submitted for 1709 Jefferson Avenue] which is a denial of the addition. The Motion was seconded by Comm. McAdams. The Motion carried with Comm. Eid abstaining.

Result: Denied

Ms. Jamison then addressed the Commission expressing her strong desire to keep her front porch. Ms. Graybeal noted the Applicant could still submit alternative proposals. Mr. Tindell noted they would be willing to continue to meet with staff and the Law Department to attempt to develop a proposal that may meet guidelines. Ms. Cuccaro noted the Law Department was also willing to meet.

Fourth and Gill H-1

515 Lovenia Avenue – Installation of doors on side of house (11-D-16-HZ).

Discussion: Ms. Graybeal reviewed the staff report and staff recommendation. Applicant Cindy Rusk was present and had nothing to add to the staff report. Neighborhood representative Arin Streeter noted there was not a lot of discussion surrounding this application and that the neighborhood would defer to Commission on determining what the right proportions are given the substantive discussion on them at the last meeting. Further, they are generally supportive of the idea of these doors given the particular site conditions only and that that be part of the record [so as not to set a precedent]. Ms. Graybeal stated staff would like to, or have a carpenter, verify the final dimensions/specification of the doors/glass/sashes so they match the original windows as they were more rectangular, and that the bottom portion could be more elongated to better represent a Craftsman proportion. It was noted that the door will need to be taller than 80 inches so that the alignment of the top of the casing matches that of the original windows. Ms. Rusk and staff will work with Plans Review and Inspections to identify the final kick plate specifications.

Action: Comm. Eid moved that the application submitted for 515 Lovenia Avenue be approved based on the evidence submitted and the information provided in the staff report and per staff recommendation with the following clarifications/conditions: 1) that the top of the door casing is in alignment with the top of the adjacent window casing so horizontally that line matches, and 2) the dimensions of the glass of the top portion of the door match the upper sash of the existing window, and 3) recognizing that the height of the door will be taller than 80 inches (to be field verified), and , 4) the width of the door frame on the outside of the door window be 4 inches and 3 inches each at the middle, and 5) the height (length) of the upper portion of the door window match the height (length) of the former 3/1 window, and 6) the bottom panel of the doors be of a taller dimension than the top windows with the kick plate as short as allowed by building code, and 7) the design for wooden deck landing is to be approved by staff. The Motion was seconded by Comm. Swilley. The Motion carried unanimously.

Result: Approved with conditions

817 Deery St - Revised plans for construction of residential building (12-C-16-HZ)

Discussion: Ms. Graybeal reviewed the staff report and staff recommendation for the revised application. Applicant Randall Morrow was present and noted accessibility as well as affordability have become front runners in the overall final design. He stated they have changed the placement of the side entry door and it will now be perpendicular to the driveway so that its access is parallel, thus allowing for the possibility of a

future ramp. Overall he noted that other than the height, the front of the house will not change dramatically. He noted the shed dormer was such that the windows could open into the home. He also noted the storage door will be hinged and painted to match the house. Neighborhood representative Arin Streeter noted the neighborhood discussion revolved mainly around whether the massing of this new proposal is as appropriate as what was originally approved but overall, is in general agreement with staff recommendation for approval. Mr. Morrow stated that the proposed porch depth is the same. Comm. Bolen noted concern with the proposed fiberglass door as well as the lack of windows, and additionally the stone material (as opposed to tongue and groove) of the front porch. Further, that chimney dimensions would need to be approved by staff. The narrowness of the lot in relation to the placement of the house and its neighbor was also discussed. Discussion moved to the proposed stone floor of the porch. Ms. Graybeal noted there was at least one stone/brick porch on a Craftsman house in the neighborhood. Mr. Morrow stated they would edge the stone with brick as well. Mr. Streeter noted the neighborhood did not express concerns with the stone material for the porch. There was no further concern expressed by the Commission related to the number of windows. Ms. Graybeal noted the Commission has approved painted fiberglass doors in the rear as well as in the front of houses. They had been previously approved on the rear and sides for this infill project; however the location has changed.

Action: Comm. Bolen moved that the application submitted for 817 Deery Street be approved based on the evidence submitted and the information provided in the staff report and per staff recommendation with the following conditions: 1) that a finish/trim detail for the floor of the front porch and steps be submitted to staff for approval, as well as a specification for the storage room door that opens out onto the rear deck, and 2) that if a chimney is proposed, the dimensions are to be approved by staff, and further, if a chimney is approved, smaller square windows may be installed on either side of the chimney. The Motion was seconded by Comm. Eid. The Motion carried unanimously.

Result: Approved with conditions

Samuel Lackey House H-1 Overlay

219 Twelfth St - Construct rear addition (12-H-16-HZ)

Discussion: Ms. Graybeal reviewed the staff report and staff recommendation. Applicant Adam Hadjerioua was present and had nothing further to add to the staff report and stated he was in agreement with staff's recommended conditions. He noted the house is being returned to a single family residence. Neighborhood representative Randall Deford was not present but had sent comment via e-mail to staff that he was glad to see work being done on this house. Comm. Webster, as a resident of the neighborhood, noted the neighborhood is very happy to see this house being redone and returned to a single family residence. It was clarified that any additional work beyond what is included in this application for a rear addition would need to come back before the Commission.

Action: Comm. Webster moved that the application submitted for 219 Twelfth Street be approved based on the evidence submitted and the information provided in the staff report and per staff recommendation with the following conditions: 1) wood lattice be infilled underneath the stairs, and 2) manufacturer's specifications for the windows and doors be submitted to staff for approval, and 3) the new parging on the foundation should be a natural or brick color, and 4) the proposed wood siding between the windows and each corner of the house be replaced with wood panels to appear as paneled support posts; and 5) given that the house is an individual H-1 landmark, light fixture specifications are to be reviewed for staff for appropriateness. The Motion was seconded by Comm. Eid. The Motion carried unanimously.

Result: Approved with conditions

Other Business:

- **National Register Nomination Recommendation**

Kern's Bakery – 2110 Chapman Highway

Discussion: Ms. Graybeal reviewed the nomination noting staff supports recommending approval. The complete nomination packet is available at the MPC office. The author of the nomination, Mark Heinz, was present for any questions.

Action: Comm. Bolen moved that the Commission recommend approval of the nomination of Kern's Bakery, located at 2110 Chapman Highway, to the Tennessee Historical Commission for nomination to the National Register of Historic Places. The Motion was seconded by Comm. Crowder. The Motion carried unanimously.

- 2016 Certified Local Government (CLG) Annual Report

Ms. Graybeal reviewed the Report which is required of Certified Local Governments, which is submitted to the Tennessee Historical Commission, who in turn submits it to the National Park Service. The report shows the activity of the Commission and that it is meeting the requirements of a Certified Local Government. Being a CLG allows the City to be eligible and prioritized for federal preservation grants from the Tennessee Historic Preservation office. She asked the Commissioners to notify her of any requested topics for future training sessions.

- There was general consensus that the 2017 HZC schedule would work for the Commissioners.
- Ms. Graybeal announced that the Giffin Grammar School, located at 1834 Beech Street, is going to be rehabilitated by a respondent to the City's RFP and has also now been placed on the National Register. She noted that the Commission had recommended approval of the nomination to the Register earlier this year.

Action: Comm. Eid moved to adjourn the meeting. The Motion was seconded by Comm. Bolen. The Motion carried unanimously and the meeting was adjourned.