

MINUTES
KNOXVILLE HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION
KNOX COUNTY HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION
MEETING May 21, 2015

City HZC Present

Scott Busby
Steve Cotham
Melissa McAdams
Andie Ray
Jason Woodle

County HZC Present

David Butler
George Ewart
Scott Smith

Others Present

Matthew Hatfield
Paul Murphy
James Peirce
Arin Streeter

City HZC Absent

Sean Bolen (Excused)
Bart Carey (Excused)
Faris Eid (Excused)
Lorie Mathews (Excused)

County HZC Absent

Bill Belser
Mike Crowder (Excused)

Staff Present

Dori Caron
Scott Elder
Kaye Graybeal
Lisa Hatfield

Knoxville Historic Zoning Comm. Chair Busby called the meeting to order and noted there was a quorum. Roll call was taken. He stated that the meeting was being televised and recorded. He also asked that speakers limit their presentations to five minutes and to sign in when they reached the podium. He then noted that any appeals to Commission decisions can be taken to Chancery Court if appealed within 60 days. Comm. Chair Busby then swore in all Applicants and visitors that planned to speak on any Agenda item.

A Motion was made by Comm. Woodle to approve the April 16, 2015 Minutes. The Motion was seconded by Comm. McAdams. The Motion carried unanimously.

Knox County Historic Zoning Commission Chair David Butler noted the Knox County Historic Zoning Commission was pleased to introduce and welcome Scott Smith to the Commission. He noted Comm. Smith was from Knoxville and is president of Volunteer Realty. He further noted Comm. Smith is a long time member of the Home Builders Association of Greater Knoxville and the Knoxville Area Association of Realtors. Comm. Smith has also served on the Board of Directors of Habitat for Humanity and the Knox County Board of Zoning Appeals.

Reports to Commission: Ms. Graybeal noted she was pleased to announce 2 National Register of Historic Places nominations, Murphy Springs Farm, 4508 Murphy Road and the KUB building located at 628 S Gay Street. She gave a brief overview of each nomination. She noted that the owners of Murphy Springs Farm were able to come into agreement with the National Park Service and the Tennessee

Historical Commission regarding the final boundaries of significance and intactness [of the property] to be represented in the National Register nomination. She gave a brief overview of what parts of the property were to be included in the 176 acres in the nomination. She also noted the owner, Kevin Murphy has offered to set up a tour for the Commissioners.

Action: Knox County Comm. Chair Butler moved that the Knox County Historic Zoning Commission support the revised boundaries for the Murphy Springs Farm nomination as well as support the nomination of the Farm to the National Register of Historic Places. The Motion was seconded by Comm. Ewart. The Motion carried unanimously.

Regarding the KUB Building, Ms. Graybeal noted this nomination, along with the Murphy Spring Farms nomination, was on the Tennessee Historical Commission agenda yesterday where both nominations were recommended for forwarding on to the National Park Service. The KUB Building is an addition to the Gay Street Commercial Historic District, so a boundary increase is being requested to include the KUB Building. This building represents a unique mid-century style. She gave a brief overview of the history of the property.

Action: Comm. Ray moved that the Knoxville Historic Zoning Commission support the nomination of the KUB building to the National Register of Historic Places. The Motion was seconded by Comm. McAdams. The Motion carried unanimously.

Staff Reports: Ms. Graybeal reviewed the Level I Certificates approved since the last meeting.

CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS

Fourth and Gill H-1

915 Luttrell St. – Construct carport (5-C-15-HZ)

Discussion: It was clarified that this application has gone to the Board of Zoning Appeals for a variance on the setback and any approval will be contingent on the Applicant receiving approval on that variance. Owner Matthew Hatfield was present and noted they would comply with Commission's recommendation for the carport roof to have a [after a brief discussion by the Commission] minimum of an 8/12 roof pitch. Neighborhood representative Arin Streeter noted the neighborhood did not offer any concerns regarding this project and further noted that they had a question about the roof pitch and if the intent was to match the pitch of the front gable, and that question was answered.

Action: Comm. McAdams moved that the application submitted for 915 Luttrell be approved based on the evidence submitted and the information provided in the staff report per staff recommendation with the conditions as stated except that the condition for the pitch of the roof be that it have a minimum of an 8/12 pitch. The Motion was seconded by Comm. Ray. The Motion carried unanimously.

708 Morgan Ave. – Porch, door, window and exit stair modifications (5-E-15-HZ)

Discussion: Ms. Graybeal noted this house and its materials have been altered significantly over the years. There was no owner present. Arin Streeter, neighborhood representative, noted the neighborhood did question whether or not a fire escape was legal. It was clarified that the Applicant has been made aware that he needs to go through the Plans Review and Inspections Department for the

proposed new fire escape. Mr. Streeter also noted the neighborhood would like for the framing to be examined to ensure there was a window over the front door before the Applicant installs one. Ms. Graybeal clarified the approval to install a window there was based on being able to determine there was a window there previously. Chair Busby noted this was more about repair, not replacement and Ms. Graybeal noted the owner has stated that he agreed with trying to repair as opposed to replace as long as it was doable. It is also staff's recommendation that the doors be repaired, not replaced. Ms. Graybeal clarified that all approvals by the Historic Zoning Commissions are conditioned on their meeting building codes.

Action: Comm. Woodle moved that the application submitted for 708 Morgan Ave. be approved based on the evidence submitted and the information provided in the staff report per staff recommendation with the conditions as stated. The Motion was seconded by Comm. Ray. The Motion carried unanimously.

Individual Landmarks

3128 Kingston Pike – Rear addition (5-G-15-HZ)

Discussion: Owner Paul Murphy was present and noted he was here to answer any questions. Ms. Graybeal shared the historic significance of the home as highlighted in the original H-1 nomination. There was no significant discussion.

Action: Comm. Ray moved that the application submitted for 3128 Kingston Pike be approved based on the evidence submitted and the information provided in the staff report per staff recommendation. The Motion was seconded by Comm. Cotham. The Motion carried unanimously.

Old North Knoxville H-1

1209 Harvey St. – Window replacement (5-H-15-HZ).

Discussion: Installation of an air conditioner was a late addition to the application. Ms. Graybeal described the proposed through-wall air conditioner installation. The Applicant proposes to place this unit to the lower left hand bottom corner of the very rear window as noted in the handout from today. She noted there is a projecting roof overhang over a crawl space door that would somewhat obscure the view of the unit. She stated it was staff's opinion that although the unit would not be flush with the side of the house it would not be highly visible. The owner/applicant was not present. Neighborhood representative James Pierce noted that considering the windows on the south side are original, for the most part, the guidelines would state a preference for repair. The guidelines, he further noted, are not specific with regards to the degree of deterioration required for replacement. Such, they would have to consider staff's recommendation for replacement if they are deteriorated beyond repair if that would then be the best option. He stated he heard nothing back from the neighborhood stating a preference for one or the other. He further stated they would agree with the 2-over-2 pane division again reiterating the preference for repair over replacement if possible. Regarding the air conditioner installation he did not received feedback as it was a late addition and hence would defer to the guidelines which do not really support the removal of siding. It was noted the installation of a window or door where appropriate has always been acceptable as they become permanent features. His concern is that the unit will ultimately fail and need to be replaced, if not removed, and his fear would be that the house would be left with a patched hole. He is interested in discussion on why the unit cannot be installed in the window. Ms. Graybeal responded by noting that a window placement of the unit would cause it to appear more prominently as it would project out further. She noted that staff would not

normally approve this kind of installation on a side elevation; however, the houses here are situated so closely together and this house is so deep that the lower, less projecting placement appeared to be preferable. She stated this house as situated presents a unique situation and there are good arguments for both placements. Ms. Graybeal noted the owner agreed to explore repair of the original window rather than replacement. Comm. Ray shared her observation that the houses here are truly on top of each other, perhaps six feet apart and felt either installation option would be acceptable.

Action: Comm. McAdams moved that the application submitted for 1209 Harvey St. be approved based on the evidence submitted and the information provided in the staff report per staff recommendation and stated conditions and emphasizing a preference for repair [not replacement] of the rear, original 2 over 2 window; also moving to approve the installation of an air conditioner as proposed by the Applicant. The Motion was seconded by Comm. Ray. The Motion carried unanimously.

300 E. Oklahoma Ave. – Window and door replacement / relocation / deck (5-J-15-HZ)

Discussion: Owner Josh and Jill Anderson were present and had nothing further to add to the presentation of the staff report. Neighborhood representative James Pierce noted the neighborhood agreed with staff's recommendation on relocating the rear windows. He noted he met with the owners and what they want to do with the window placements will assist them with their interior remodeling without negatively impacting the character of the home. He also wanted to applaud them for their intent to restore the home. They also agree with staff recommendation on the basement entrances. Ms. Graybeal stated for the record the Commission cannot approve based on interior [remodeling] needs. Comm. Ray recused herself as she has been advising them as president of the neighborhood association.

Action: Comm. McAdams moved that the application submitted for 300 E. Oklahoma Ave. be approved based on the evidence submitted and the information provided in the staff report per staff recommendation. The Motion was seconded by Comm. Chair Busby. The Motion carried unanimously.

Other Business:

Ms. Graybeal stated the MPC has received a \$21,000 grant from the Tennessee Historical Commission which will provide 60% of the cost of the project to update the Historic Resource Inventory. She noted we still need the other 40% from the MPC and/or City Council. We have received a grant from the City from their Historic Preservation Fund but she does not yet have the final amount to be awarded. She had applied for \$14,000 for a total of \$35,000 to retain a consultant to assist with the update, which will be comprehensive and digitalized. She will be developing an RFQ to identify a consultant and proceed once the awards have been finalized.

Ms. Graybeal also noted she and Bart Carey, recently appointed to the Knoxville Historic Zoning Commission, attended the Tennessee Preservation Conference for a one day training in Chattanooga. Mr. Carey will report on that training at a later date.

Action: Comm. Chair Busby moved to adjourn. The Motion was seconded by Comm. Woodle. The Motion carried unanimously and the meeting was adjourned.