

**MINUTES**  
**KNOXVILLE HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION**  
**KNOX COUNTY HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION**  
**MEETING JUNE 18, 2015**

City HZC Present

Sean Bolen  
Scott Busby  
Bart Carey  
Steve Cotham  
Faris Eid  
Lorie Matthews  
Melissa McAdams  
Andie Ray

County HZC Present

Bill Belser  
David Butler  
Mike Crowder  
George Ewart  
Scott Smith

Others Present

Sean Martin  
Arin Streeter

City HZC Absent

Jason Woodle (Excused)

County HZC Absent

none

Staff Present

Dori Caron  
Martin Clay  
Crista Cuccaro

Knoxville Historic Zoning Comm. Chair Busby called the meeting to order and noted there was a quorum. Roll call was taken. He stated that the meeting was being televised and recorded. He also asked that speakers limit their presentations to five minutes and to sign in when they reached the podium. He then noted that any appeals to Commission decisions can be taken to Chancery Court if appealed within 60 days. Comm. Chair Busby then swore in all Applicants and visitors that planned to speak on any Agenda item.

**A Motion was made by Comm. McAdams to approve the May 21, 2015 Minutes. The Motion was seconded by Comm. Bolen. The Motion carried unanimously.**

**Reports to Commission:** There were no reports to Commission.

**Staff Reports:** Ms. Graybeal reviewed the Level I Certificates approved since the last meeting. She reviewed an ongoing project at 415 Lovenia Street in Fourth and Gill, an after the fact Certificate of Appropriateness which may be coming before the Commission next month. She noted it is an in-kind repair and replacement of porch elements. The house has an elaborate Queen Anne/Italianate wooden porch that has a lot of detailing. If the porch is not replaced in-kind dimensionally it will need to come

before the Commission to discuss an appropriate solution for the parts of the porch that may not be able to be exactly reproduced.

## **CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS**

### **Fourth and Gill H-1**

801 Eleanor St. – Porch, window and door replacement (6-A-15-HZ)

**Discussion:** Ms. Graybeal noted this house had been severely altered prior to the historic overlay, and as such is listed in the historic survey as non-contributing. Sean Martin, project architect and representing the owners, was present and added that the rear porch is as early as 1917 via the Sanborn maps. He noted this is a rental property and the owners do not necessarily want to spend a lot of money, replacing where necessary and repairing when possible. The owners want to replace as many windows as their budget will allow over the 2 year Certificate of Appropriateness. He gave a brief overview of the development of the design, resulting in the 2 proposed phases. He stated a simple wrought iron railing is acceptable to the owners. He also noted he and the owners agree to reduce the rear columns [to be wrapped] to as close to 5 in. x 5 in. as possible. The owners want to do the trellises for privacy on the rear porch and plan to re-landscape the yard after the house is painted. Mr. Martin noted they could possibly chamfer the rear columns as well if they used a ¾ board to wrap it and then do a ½ inch chamfer. He noted they would explore doing that and if it would not work they could further explore adding a short base with a small amount of trim around the top. He noted he would be happy to submit a proposed drawing of that possibility. He did state that their intent was to keep the front posts as simple as possible as the rest of the home is very simple. There was some discussion on the ability of even pressure-treated tongue-and-groove wood to withstand the elements without the [potential] porch roof. Mr. Martin noted the Applicant intends to stain or paint the porch floor but agreed it would suffer some wear if the porch roof is not built in the next few years. Arin Streater, neighborhood representative, noted the neighborhood is in support of the application and/or the staff recommendation. Ms. Graybeal noted the Applicant is asking approval for both Phase 1 and 2 at this time, but for Phase 1 approval as stand-alone approval in case they do not end up completing Phase 2. She noted the Commission would not normally approve this type of porch (Phase 1) but that the process actually constitutes material replacement.

Crista Cuccaro noted the Certificates of Appropriateness are actually now valid for 3 years, not 2 years, based on the Vested Rights Act of 2015 which took effect at the beginning of this year. The City has not yet updated the H-1 portion of their zoning code but it can be implemented as it is now part of the state statute. She noted state legislation does not speak to its retroactive nature but typically legislation is prospective, not retroactive. Therefore any Certificates approved prior to January 1, 2015 are valid for 2 years, any Certificates approved as of January 1, 2015 are valid for 3 years. Ms. Graybeal noted staff would change the HZC database to reflect a 3 year Certificate.

It was noted the owner has been working closely with Mr. Martin as well as staff. There was discussion on what could and could not be approved with respect to the phases and that one Certificate of Appropriateness would be appropriate. It was clarified that the Commission cannot require the owner to recreate the porch roof. It was also noted that many projects in these neighborhoods often take years to complete. Mr. Martin noted he would be sure to educate the client on the potential for decreased long-term viability of the tongue and groove porch floor should they not proceed with the proposed new porch roof in the next few years.

**Action: Comm. Bolen moved that the application submitted for 801 Eleanor St. be approved based on the evidence submitted and the information provided in the staff report per staff recommendation as written with its stated conditions and with the clarification that this is an approval of Phase 2 which incorporates Phase 1, and is on one Certificate of Appropriateness in entirety. The Motion was seconded by Comm. Matthews. The Motion carried unanimously.**

800 N. 4<sup>th</sup> St. – Construction of addition or outbuilding (6-D-15-HZ)

**Discussion:** Ms. Graybeal noted this house is used by the neighborhood for community meetings and events. The Applicant was not present. She clarified that although the proposal shows a 10' x 10' shed, they would like to do a side-gabled roof (8/12) on a more rectangular, 8' x 12' building. She also noted in correction that the proposal shows a corrugated galvanized metal roof; however, the Applicant plans to use asphalt shingles. Ms. Graybeal noted the Applicant has agreed to use a flat finish composite as opposed to the originally proposed faux wood grain composite shown. Neighborhood representative Arin Streeter stated the neighborhood has no objection to this project. There was discussion surrounding appropriate texture and an alternative reverse board and batten with indentions product that is available and may be more appropriate than the 6-inch panels with 2-inch battens. It was noted the Applicant's intent is to keep costs low as they are working under a City Community Development Grant to build this tool shed.

**Action: Comm. Bolen moved that the application submitted for 804 N. 4<sup>th</sup> St. be approved based on the evidence submitted and the information provided in the staff report per staff recommendation with its listed conditions with the further amendments that composite or wood siding be used, that the neighborhood can choose between a hip or gabled roof and that the roof can be either metal or asphalt shingles. The Motion was seconded by Comm. Eid. It was clarified that the Motion includes approval of the board and batten as requested. The Motion carried unanimously.**

**Other Business:**

- Ms. Graybeal noted the nomination for Murphy Spring Farms to the National Register was heard on May 23<sup>rd</sup> for a re-review of the boundaries and has been forwarded to the keeper of the National Register and staff expects a positive outcome. Kevin Murphy has offered to give a tour of the property to the Commissioners on Thursday, June 25<sup>th</sup> at 11:00 a.m. She will send out an email confirming the time and perhaps folks can carpool out to the farm.
- Ms. Graybeal noted there has been some collapse on part of the Pryor Brown parking garage roof collapsed. Assessments are that the building can still be renovated.
- She further noted that she and Bart Carey attended the Tennessee Preservation Trust's annual meeting. She touched on several fascinating and informative presentations. Bart Carey noted that at the meeting Dan Brown from the Tennessee Historical Commission (THC) heralded Knoxville as a model in historic zoning for the state. Ms. Graybeal noted Mr. Brown who is the THC Certified Local Government Coordinator who has been here in Knoxville to speak to the Commission and has stated he was impressed with the dedication of the Commissioners.

**Action: Comm. Busby moved to adjourn. The Motion was seconded by Comm. Eid. The Motion carried unanimously and the meeting was adjourned.**