

**MINUTES**  
**KNOXVILLE HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION**  
**KNOX COUNTY HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION**  
**MEETING AUGUST 20, 2015**

City HZC Present

Sean Bolen  
Scott Busby  
Bart Carey  
Faris Eid  
Lorie Matthews  
Melissa McAdams  
Andie Ray  
Jason Woodle

County HZC Present

Bill Belser  
Mike Crowder  
George Ewart  
Scott Smith

Others Present

Calvin Chappelle  
Carl Lansden  
Katherine McBride

City HZC Absent

Steve Cotham

County HZC Absent

David Butler

Staff Present

Dori Caron  
Crista Cuccaro  
Scott Elder  
Kaye Graybeal  
Gerald Green  
Melvin Wright

Knoxville Historic Zoning Comm. Chair Busby called the meeting to order and noted there was a quorum. Roll call was taken. He stated that the meeting was being televised and recorded. He also asked that speakers limit their presentations to five minutes and to sign in when they reached the podium. He then noted that any appeals to Commission decisions can be taken to Chancery Court if appealed within 60 days. Comm. Chair Busby then swore in all Applicants and visitors that planned to speak on any Agenda item.

**A Motion was made by Comm. McAdams to approve the July 16, 2015 Minutes. The Motion was seconded by Comm. Carey. The Motion carried unanimously.**

**Reports to Commission:** There were no reports to Commission.

**Staff Reports:** Ms. Graybeal reviewed the Level I Certificates approved since the last meeting.

## CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS

### Edgewood-Park City H-1

1802 Washington Avenue – Re-roofing (8-K-15-HZ)

**Discussion:** Owner Katherine McBride noted that although not widely used, her research has indicated that wood-stamped shingles were historically available at the turn of the century and that they would therefore be historically appropriate. She also noted that as an alternative to more expensive materials homeowners would use metal stamped shingles to imitate slate or wood. She referenced a National Park Service briefing that notes “some galvanized sheet roofing was pressed with designs and were very popular in the Victorian era”. She further quoted the briefing to support the use of stamped metal shingles. She also noted she had not explored the use/cost of pressure treated cedar shakes and noted her roof is heavily shaded, therefore, the maintenance given the pitch and accessibility would prevent her from doing so. Neighborhood representative Calvin Chappelle noted the neighborhood (Parkridge Community Organization) likes to see diversity in roofs in the neighborhood and supports the use of a metal roof. He also agreed that the Applicant’s house does sit in the shade. Regarding a traditional stamped metal shingle Ms. McBride noted she had looked at them and would consider it as an alternative if what she proposes is not approved but feels they are of lesser quality than what she is proposing. It was clarified that metal roof shingles have been found to be appropriate on Queen Anne houses in Edgewood Park-City; however, there is no documented evidence of metal shingles attempting to imitate wood shingles historically.

**Action: Comm. Eid moved that the application submitted for 1802 Washington Ave. be approved as submitted based on the evidence submitted and information provided in the staff report with the condition that a dark color shingle be utilized per the design guidelines. The Motion was seconded by Comm. Ray. The Motion carried unanimously.**

### Ft. Sanders NC-1

1201 Clinch Avenue – Complete foundation and site elements for a relocated house (8-A-15-HZ)

**Discussion:** It was clarified that the neighboring house is to the west, not the north. Applicant Carl Lansden was present and had nothing further to add. There was no neighborhood representative present. Ms. Graybeal clarified that a block foundation is appropriate in Fort Sanders but only when parged or stuccoed, a fairly common occurrence in the district. The Applicant agreed that he would parge-coat the retaining wall.

**Action: Comm. Bolen moved that the application submitted for 1201 Clinch Ave. be approved based on the evidence submitted and the information provided in the staff report per staff recommendation with its stated condition. The Motion was seconded by Comm. Woodle. The Motion carried unanimously.**

### Individual Landmark H-1 Property

114 E. Jackson Avenue – Construct dormers on rear roof (8-B-15-HZ)

**Discussion:** Owner representative Savannah Patin was present and had no additional information. There was some discussion surrounding the adequacy of the construction of the light wells. It was noted that the roof pitch of the dormers should be lower sloped or flat. It was suggested that there is a manufacturer that makes a retro series transom for flat installations that have the multi-paned windows

that may be appropriate here, reminiscent of typical commercial skylights. It was clarified that the Applicant did pull a permit for repointing, but these dormers were not included in that permit.

**Action: Comm. Eid moved that the application submitted for 114 E. Jackson Ave. be approved based on the evidence submitted and the information provided in the staff report and that the 2 clear story light wells can be reconstructed with the conditions that the final look of the roof is flat/slightly sloped and similar to the existing height, that the windows as viewed from Summit Ave. have a similar look/design/trim/division of lights as had existed before and that the other 3 windows on each dormer can be arched as they are now, noting that it would be more appropriate if they were trimmed out. The Motion was seconded by Comm. Carey. The Motion carried unanimously.**

### **Old North Knoxville H-1**

227 Leonard Place – Overall renovation (8-F-15-HZ)

**Discussion:** Ms. Graybeal reviewed comments received from the neighborhood representative, James Pierce, via email: attention should be paid to where the original window and door openings were on the front façade and to maintain them, no original materials or architectural elements should be altered or removed during the demolition phases, precedence should be given to what is revealed to be original more than what is presented in the design drawings, and that the new weatherboard for the front be similar in size and reveal as the original wood lap. The neighborhood would like to see a specific height specified to which the chimneys to be restored, and lastly, that it needs to be determined where the gabled roof for the rebuilt front porch meets the original front roof slope. It was clarified that the sawn work design for the porch balustrade needs to be approved by staff. It was noted that the Applicant cannot take the chimneys down any further but is not required to build them up to their original height, although that would be ideal. Comm. Bolen wanted to stress the use of authentic bead board strips on the porch ceiling and not bead board panels. Ms. Graybeal clarified that the recommendation noted that a porch restoration be constructed with a hipped roof rather than a shed roof as depicted in the submitted drawings.

**Action: Comm. Bolen moved that the application submitted for 227 Leonard Place be approved based on the evidence submitted and the information provided in the staff report per staff recommendation with the following conditions: the new porch design have a hipped roof similar to neighboring houses, the balusters be of sawn work and approved by staff, the chimneys cannot be taken down any further, the bead board ceiling must be wood strips and not plywood panels, that the new weatherboard siding must match the profile of the original siding [underneath the asbestos]. Comm. Bolen amended his Motion to include that gable have a decorative round sawn work vent. The Amended Motion was seconded by Comm. Eid. The Amended Motion carried unanimously.**

### **Other Business:**

There was no other business and the meeting was adjourned.