



**MINUTES
KNOXVILLE HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION
KNOX COUNTY HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION
MEETING SEPTEMBER 18, 2014**

City HZC Present

Sean Bolen
Scott Busby
Faris Eid
Sandra Martin
Lorie Matthews
Melissa McAdams
Jason Woodle

County HZC Present

David Butler
Bart Carey
Mike Crowder
Carol Montgomery

Others Present

Jerry Caldwell
James Campbell
Greg Crawford
Whitney Manahan
Arin Streeter
Jared Wilkins

City HZC Absent

Andie Ray (Excused)
Steve Cotham

County HZC Absent

Bill Belser (Excused)

Staff Present

Dori Caron
Crista Cuccaro
Scott Elder
Kaye Graybeal
Dave Hill
Melvin Wright

Comm. Chair Busby called the meeting to order and noted there was a quorum. He stated that the meeting was being televised and recorded. He also asked that speakers limit their presentations to five minutes and to sign in when they reached the podium. He also noted that any appeals to Commission decisions can be taken to Chancery Court if appealed within 60 days. Comm. Chair Busby then swore in all visitors and Applicants that planned to speak on any Agenda item. Roll call was taken. There were no visitors to introduce.

Presentation on LostKnox by Whitney Manahan and Jared Wilkins. (lostknox.tumblr.com)

Comm. Chair Busby introduced the guest speakers, both graduate students at UT's Master of Architecture Program. LostKnox was developed as part of a research project designed to enlighten the community on the importance of historic preservation, boost the movement for it as well as for more construction at a higher urban density. It was created to help spread awareness and educate the community on the changes Downtown Knoxville has seen over the years.

Action: Comm. Bolen moved that the August 21, 2014 Minutes be approved. The Motion was seconded by Comm. Matthews. The Motion carried unanimously.

Reports to Commission. There were no reports to the Commission this month.

Staff Reports. Kaye Graybeal reviewed the Level 1 Certificates approved by staff this month.

CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS

Edgewood-Park City H-1

1709 Jefferson Ave - (9-F-14-HZ)

Discussion: Owner representative Greg Crawford, Scenic View Sunrooms, was present and noted his company did not realize this house was in a Historic overlay. It was clarified that a building permit was not obtained. Comm. Bolen clarified that any sunroom addition needs a permit which would have directed him to obtain a Certificate of Appropriateness. Comm. Bolen then noted there was zero leeway with the guidelines as they specifically state that porches cannot be enclosed. Mr. Crawford confirmed that the brick piers on either side of the steps were still intact under the material they used to wrap them. Jerry Caldwell, neighborhood representative, noted the neighborhood while sympathetic to the owner want to maintain the historic feeling of the neighborhood and is not in favor of the enclosed porch. There was discussion on how to proceed with the porch going forward noting the original photograph. It was clarified that the wooden balustrade that was removed was likely original; however, the wood posts on top of the brick piers (also removed) were not. Melvin Wright noted any replacement balustrades would need to be code height. There was also discussion surrounding replacement of the posts and that they would need to meet the guidelines. Mr. Crawford noted that none of the original handrails had been saved.

Action: Comm. Bolen moved that the application submitted for 1709 Jefferson Avenue be denied without prejudice based on the evidence submitted and the information provided in the staff report with the clarification that the Applicant return with a revised plan to remove the sunroom, to address the handrails with drawings and to address the posts that are currently covered.

Christa Cuccaro from the City Law Department clarified the following options:

To deny (with prejudice) where the Applicant would submit a totally new application, or

To deny without prejudice where the Applicant would submit a revised application. She stated the Commission does not have the authority to waive any fees associated with the submittal of new applications.

Comm. Bolen retracted his Motion.

Action: Comm. Bolen moved that the application submitted for 1709 Jefferson Avenue for the sunroom be denied (with prejudice) based on the evidence submitted and the information provided in the staff report per staff recommendation. The Motion was seconded by Comm. Eid. The Motion carried unanimously.

Fourth and Gill H-1

515 Caswell Ave - window replacement (9-A-14-HZ)

Kaye Graybeal noted the owner has requested in writing that this Certificate be postponed to the October 16, 2014 meeting as he would be out of town.

Action: Comm. Eid moved that the application submitted for 515 Caswell Avenue be postponed until the October 16, 2014 meeting. The Motion was seconded by Comm. Woodle. The Motion carried unanimously.

601 Caswell Ave - Construct accessory structure (9-D-14-HZ)

Discussion: Owner Jim Campbell was present and had no additional comments. It was clarified that a site plan had been submitted with the application. Melvin Wright, in reviewing the site plan, noted specific setbacks would need to be submitted with an exact location identified relative to the property line and within the required setbacks. Mr. Campbell noted he was trying to be sensitive to his neighbors in his placement of the shed noting that he walked around the neighborhood and photographed about 30 sheds, all of which were on an alley, which he does not have. He noted he was not dead set on this location. It was clarified that the exterior would be wood board and batten with asphalt shingles. There was a brief discussion surrounding the foundation (raised on posts) and that it should have some infill like lattice or bricks unless it is less than a foot. There was significant discussion surrounding the placement of the shed on the property. Mr. Campbell noted he was open to moving the structure away from the street but that he was concerned with injuring some older trees on the other side of the lot. It was noted that as this is a corner lot there are 2 frontages. Mr. Campbell noted he was open to placing the shed in the middle of the yard as well. Neighborhood representative Arin Streeter noted the neighborhood did not discuss the location as they did not have a site plan but that they agree with staff recommendation to approve the design of the shed. Crista Cuccaro noted there were 2 separate issues being discussed, design *and* placement of the shed, and that although the Commission did have purview over the design, its purview over the final placement of the shed was limited. Therefore, she noted, in order to place the shed into the middle of the lot the Applicant would need to submit a revised site plan for approval by Plans Review and Inspections as well as submitting it to Historic Zoning Commission staff for review.

Action: Comm. Bolen moved that the portion of the application submitted for 601 Caswell Avenue for the design of the structure be approved based on the evidence submitted and the information provided in the staff report with the condition that a revised site plan be submitted to Historic Zoning Commission staff for staff approval. The Motion was seconded by Comm. McAdams. Comm. Bolen amended his Motion to include the provision that the revised site plan needs to show that the shed has been moved back away from Gratz Street. The Amended Motion was seconded by Comm. McAdams. It was clarified that the revised site plan would also need to be approved by Plans Review and Inspections. **The Motion carried unanimously.**

Mechanicsville H-1

220 Carrick St - Additions (9-C-14-HZ)

Discussion: Project architect representative Brian Pittman noted they have met with the neighborhood which was positive about the project. He also noted they were trying to remain low key with the design; however, as this project is for a Charter school they also have to meet the Knox County Schools requirements.

Action: Comm. Eid moved that the application submitted for 220 Carrick Street be approved based on the evidence submitted and the information provided in the staff report. The Motion was seconded by Comm. Matthews. The Motion carried unanimously.

David Butler, Knox County Historic Zoning Commission recognized and thanked Knox County Historic Zoning Commissioner Carol Montgomery for her superior service to the Commission during her two five-year terms, also recognizing that she has been serving currently as Vice-Chair. She will now be rotating off of the Commission. He presented her with a Certificate of Appreciation and highlighted her expertise on the Commission as a resident of Concord and that it would be greatly missed. Comm. Montgomery's commitment to preservation with respect to the environment was also recognized.

There was no further business and the meeting was adjourned.