



**MINUTES
KNOXVILLE HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION
KNOX COUNTY HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION
MEETING MAY 15, 2014**

City HZC Present

Sean Bolen
Scott Busby
Steve Cotham
Faris Eid
Sandra Martin
Melissa McAdams
Andie Ray
Jason Woodle

County HZC Present

Bill Belser
David Butler
Bart Carey
Mike Crowder
Carol Montgomery

Others Present

Kristin Grove
Sean Martin
James Pierce
Arin Streeter

City HZC Absent

Faris Eid (Excused)
Lorie Matthews (Excused)

County HZC Absent

None

Staff Present

Dori Caron
Kaye Graybeal
Lisa Hatfield
Melvin Wright

Comm. Chair Busby called the meeting to order and noted there was a quorum. He stated that the meeting was being televised and recorded. He also asked that speakers limit their presentations to five minutes and to sign in when they reached the podium. He also noted that any decisions can be taken to Chancery Court if appealed within 60 days. Comm. Chair Busby then swore in all visitors and Applicants that planned to speak on any Agenda item. Roll call was taken. There were no visitors to introduce.

Action: Comm. Bolen moved to approve the April 17, 2014 Minutes. The Motion was seconded by Comm. Ray. The Motion carried unanimously.

Reports to Commission. There were no reports to Commission.

Staff Reports. Kaye Graybeal, MPC Historic Preservation Planner, reviewed the Level 1 Certificates approved by staff.

Presentations and Updates. There were no presentations or updates.

CITY of KNOXVILLE HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION

Fourth and Gill Neighborhood (H-1) 5-E-14-HZ

906 Luttrell Street – reconstruction front façade and porch

Discussion: It was clarified that the owners want to rebuild with three, not four columns, and they want to re-install pilasters which would have been on the house originally, though they have not been there recently. Kaye Graybeal clarified that staff is recommending approval of square columns. Sean Martin, owner representative and project architect, noted this project was somewhat of a moving target as the owners are working with restoration experts to remove/retrieve what they can post fire, and this process is not complete. There was discussion surrounding evidence of the use of square columns. Mr. Martin stated he felt simple square columns would best suit the architecture of the house. Ms. Graybeal noted the owners do not want to replace the ionic volutes seen in an early photograph. The front door was completely destroyed in the fire. He noted the owners intend at this point to have a carpenter build a door to match the original as closely as possible and he has good photographic evidence of it. Further, narrowing of the space between the two attic windows will more closely match the space between the other paired windows on the house while allowing for code mandated egress for a bedroom. Arin Streeter, neighborhood representative, noted the neighborhood is generally in agreement with the staff recommendation; however, agreeing with what was there originally with regard to the columns was “somewhat gray,” stated that there was a slight leaning in favor of round columns as opposed to square ones. There was also some discussion over use of synthetic materials for the columns. The existing ones are fiberglass. Mr. Martin stated the owners are fine with using wood for the columns, regardless of the shape. Mr. Martin clarified that the porch ceiling would be wooden tongue-and-groove-beadboard. Mr. Martin noted he had not seen any evidence of any shifting of the front door/front double windows as they are not symmetrical in the photos, but further noted he was not necessarily looking for that. Comm. Chair Busby suggested a 9-inch square column would be more appropriate than a 10-inch.

Action: Comm. Ray moved that the application submitted for 906 Luttrell St. be approved per staff recommendation, noting the approval is for 3 square columns, further noting 9-inch columns are preferred over 10-inch ones, the columns are made of wood with pilasters included, the porch ceiling be replaced with wooden tongue and groove beadboard, and the dormer window spacing is also approved as requested. The Motion was amended to include the use of 9-inch (and not 10-inch) columns as a condition of approval. The Motion was seconded by Comm. Martin.

Further Action: Comm. Bolen moved to further amend the Motion to include the following: If the owners discover evidence (and can document such) during further demolition that the first floor windows and/or the front door have shifted over time from their original location that they be allowed to return the windows or doors to their original location, and that staff can approve the design for the newly constructed front door. Comm. Ray seconded the amended Motion. The Motion carried with Comm. Bolen voting no.

Market Square – 5-G-14-HZ

15 Market Square – install signage and flat metal awning with tiebacks

Discussion: Melvin Wright, clarified in summary that the current submittal meets the basic code requirements but they still will be required to sign a Use Agreement with the City to extend out over Market Square, as well as obtain a sign permit.

Kristen Grove with Johnson Architecture, project architectural firm was present handed out additional photos and elevations, and noted they have just submitted the their patio Use Agreement, and have also resubmitted their overall building plans as well addressing all comments from the City and codes review, as well as a height issue. She briefly discussed the owner’s business concept. She noted in their design they are trying to capture as much natural light as possible. She also pointed out examples of flat awnings on Market Square, Gay and Locust Streets. Ms. Grove noted they used metal in the awning as they wanted something more unique in addition to its longevity. Chyna Brackeen, Market Sq. representative noted the Association was in agreement with the proposal, via an email to staff. Comm. Bolen noted he felt that flat, metal awnings were within the guidelines and we have historic evidence of them.

Action: Comm. Bolen moved to that the application submitted for 15 Market Sq. be approved per staff recommendation with the amendment that the only condition for approval be that the diameter of the tie back cables be smaller than the ones at 1 Market Sq., further clarifying that it can be made of metal and be flat. The Motion was seconded by Comm. Ray. The Motion carried unanimously.

Commission Updates

Design Guidelines Update discussion

Discussion: Kaye Graybeal updated the Commission on the progress of the Tennessee Historical Commission grant funded project to update the guidelines. She reviewed the proposed Scope Statement with the chosen consultants, Cultural Resource Analysts. She briefly reviewed the resume of the 2 lead consultants; Alan Higgins out of their Indiana office, and Hallie Hearnese who is with their local office. She is in the process of contacting the local neighborhood boards to set up meetings. They will be meeting with Old North Knoxville, Mechanicsville, Concord, 4th and Gill, Edgewood/Park City and Market Square. They want to have public input meetings in each of the neighborhoods.

The Scope of work includes addressing energy efficiency issues specifically regarding the use of replacement windows versus repairing with storm windows, solar panel installation, accessory structure guidelines, clarifying the authority of the base zoning versus neighborhood guidelines in a district with things such as setbacks, lot coverage and heights, a checklist for new construction/infill to ensure all bases are covered and to cleanup inconsistencies with language used in the guidelines. Ms. Graybeal asked the Commissioners for their feedback on the actual proposed Scope as well as where they see specific inconsistencies and/or issues. She noted this will be a transparent process and that the consultant is setting up a Google Docs file so any interested party can view the progress of the project as well as offer input. Ms. Graybeal noted the contract end date (September 19, 2014) is just when the consultants are done, not the entire project which will continue to be refined beyond that date. Commissioners are encouraged to attend neighborhood meetings where the guidelines will be discussed.

Other Business.

- The Window Repair Workshop scheduled for May 30, 2014 is sold out! The morning session which is a classroom session is free and not yet full. Please visit the Knox Heritage website for more information. You can also RSVP to Kaye Graybeal or ideally Holly Cook at Knox Heritage.
- It was noted Knoxville's Fragile Fifteen list is being announced at 11:15 at 232 Each Churchwell today.
- It was noted the reception for the Westwood Waterwheel national Register designation was very well attended.
- Kaye Graybeal noted she has presented the Annual Report to City Council. In it she highlighted the need to be able to fund and use Demolition By Neglect to assist with blighted buildings of significance and as well as highlighted the need for additional City staff to ensure more code compliance in a consistent manner.

Action: Comm. Bolen moved to adjourn the meeting. The Motion was seconded by Comm. Carey. The Motion carried unanimously and the meeting was adjourned.