



MINUTES

KNOXVILLE HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION

KNOX COUNTY HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION

MEETING JUNE 19, 2014

City HZC Present

Sean Bolen
Scott Busby
Steve Cotham
Lorie Matthews
Melissa McAdams
Jason Woodle

County HZC Present

Bill Belser
Mike Crowder
Carol Montgomery

Others Present

Kathy D. Ellis
Carol Johnson
R. Bentley Marlow
Adam Miller
James Pierce
Lauren Rider
Arin Streeeter
Chris Weddig

City HZC Absent

Faris Eid
Sandra Martin (Excused)
Andie Ray (Excused)

County HZC Absent

David Butler (Excused)
Bart Carey (Excused)

Staff Present

Scott Alder
Dori Caron
Crista Cuccaro
Mark Donaldson
Kaye Graybeal
Lisa Hatfield
Melvin Wright

Comm. Chair Busby called the meeting to order and noted there was a quorum. He stated that the meeting was being televised and recorded. He also asked that speakers limit their presentations to five minutes and to sign in when they reached the podium. He also noted that any decisions can be taken to Chancery Court if appealed within 60 days. Comm. Chair Busby then swore in all visitors and Applicants that planned to speak on any Agenda item. Roll call was taken. There were no visitors to introduce.

Action: Comm. Woodle moved to approve the May 15, 2014 Minutes. The Motion was seconded by Comm. McAdams. The Motion carried unanimously.

Reports to Commission. There were no reports to Commission this month.

Staff Reports. Kaye Graybeal reviewed the Level I Certificates approved this month.

CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS

Fourth and Gill H-1

609 Caswell St - (6-C-14-HZ)

Discussion: Owner Chris Weddig was present noted the staff report was quite thorough. Arin Streeter, neighborhood representative clarified the house was built around 1905 and the porch, around 1920. He noted the current porch does not have any real design integrity and is really a design flaw. He noted the neighborhood does not object to modification of the porch closer what was original but without changing the footprint. Mr. Weddig stated that one option proposed would leave the brick columns as they are and replace the brick between them with no changes to the columns otherwise. Currently when it rains water comes onto the porch and has nowhere to go, rotting the porch. It was clarified that as one over one replacement windows were approved previously for other windows and this application includes replacing the balance of the windows with one over ones as well. The only exception would be a fixed pane window in the rear which is too small for a full one over one window. Comm. Bolen noted concern that the one proposal adds a third design element and felt the best option is to remove the brick piers completely and add back square columns with turned balusters. Arin Streeter noted his research indicates this may be a George Barber house Circa 1903.

Action: Comm. Bolen moved that Option 1 as identified in the application for 609 Caswell St. be approved based on the evidence submitted and the information provided in the staff report with the following conditions/clarifications: the balusters be of an appropriate scale with regards to height and width, and turned, and the columns be square and go from porch ceiling to floor.

The Motion fails with no second.

Further Discussion: Mr. Streeter clarified that during that particular time period if there was any kind of consistency it would be that larger houses had fancier railings and smaller houses had railings that were simpler in design.

Action: Comm. Woodle moved that Option 3 identified in the application for 609 Caswell St. be approved based on the evidence submitted and the information provided in the staff report with the following clarifications: maintain brick piers and with square balusters being used. The Motion was seconded by Comm. Matthews.

Further Discussion: Comm. Bolen again noted concern that the Commission would be approving a third design element. There was some discussion surrounding the columns and piers and what fits the house and time period. Mr. Weddig noted he and his wife would prefer Option 1 with square columns from floor to ceiling.

Action: Comm. Woodle withdrew his Motion based on owner preference.

Comm. Bolen moved that Front Porch Elevation Concept 1 as identified in the application submitted for 609 Caswell Street be approved based on the evidence submitted and the information provided in the staff report with the following clarifications/conditions: the porch columns are square and extend from floor to ceiling, the balusters be either turned or square, and the porch floor when replaced be replaced with tongue and groove. The Motion was seconded by Comm. Woodle. The Motion carried unanimously.

Individual H-1 Designation

6501 Kingston Pike - (6-G-14-HZ)

Discussion: Adam Miller, owner representative, noted the issue is a burm that restricts visibility of the monument sign. He would be open to lowering the pylon sign to 20 ft. noting it will not block any view with the pole being 25.5 inches. He noted a concern regarding needing to call 911 as the current sign is not well visible. He further noted advertising is a large part of a business's success. He stated there are many pylon signs up and down Kingston Pike in the immediate area. Mr. Miller offered additional photos showing the poor visibility due to the burm. It was clarified that the proposed new building signband signage will be on a raceway with LED internally lit letters (the raceway itself will not be illuminated). It was clarified that the property has an H-1 overlay which necessitates any signage be within the guidelines and that a pylon sign would not meet those guidelines. Mr. Miller asked the Commission to reconsider staff recommendation. There was discussion that the signband signage size cannot be more than 40 sq. ft. in total and no more than 5 ft.in height. There was clarification that the 40 sq. ft. number takes the entire signage into account, not just the individual letters. Mr. Miller noted he could reduce the lettering to the point that the entire sign will be no more than 40 sq. ft.

Action: Comm. Bolen moved that the pylon sign portion of the application submitted for 6501 Kingston Pike be denied without prejudice based on the evidence submitted and the information provided in the staff report; he further moved that staff recommendation with regards to the building signband signage be approved with the Amendment that the entire signband sign be no more than 40 sq. ft. in total.

It was clarified that the Applicant does not need to come back before the Commission if they want to reface the existing monument sign. It was further clarified that the Applicant needs to bring a revised signband signage design to staff for approval and would need to bring a proposed design for the monument sign to staff should they want to proceed with refacing it as well. Further the Applicant is responsible for obtaining all necessary permits from the City.

Comm. Bolen amended his Motion to “denial of the pylon sign portion of the application”. The Amended Motion was seconded by Comm. Woodle. The Motion was seconded by Comm. Woodle. The Motion carried unanimously.

Mechanicsville H-1

1011 McGhee Ave - (6-E-14-HZ)

Discussion: Kaye Graybeal noted this is a City owned Homemaker Program house. The contractor will be acting as the agent for a potential buyer. Bentley Marlow is one of the contractors for the project with whom the City has a contract. He noted he has restored 6 properties, 4 outside of the purview of the guidelines. He noted he felt the guidelines were not environmentally friendly. He stated they need to make this project economically feasible otherwise it will just get torn down at a later date. He stated the chimneys have already mostly been taken down. He further noted the south chimney is essentially a “deal breaker” as they need to take it out to create a third bedroom. He noted they would entertain maintaining the original chimney that goes in to the living room but they really need to take down the chimney that goes between the bedrooms and the cooking chimney. He stated the porch is non-original to the house with the columns being badly in disrepair. He noted they want to repurpose the chimney bricks to rebuild the columns with uniform brick. He further noted they wanted to do wood one over one Energy Star efficient windows as part of their proposal to the City to obtain an Energy Star rating on this house. He further stated many homes in the neighborhood have one over one windows so he felt it would certainly not change the overall feel of the neighborhood. He then note that there is a cement board that is tapered and would look much like wood siding once installed and painted.

Neighborhood representative Carol Johnson noted they did not want to lose any property in the overly as they are already tiny in size. She noted she felt the proposed French doors and clear glass storm door were OK. She noted the OMNI group generally tries to prevent chimneys from being removed. They would like them to remain if possible even though they have been reduced in size over the years. She further stated the one in the rear (cooking chimney) could come down as it is not visible from the street. She noted she had spoken to Mr. Marlow in the past about leaving the top portions of the chimneys there by bracing them underneath and then removing the interior portions of them, however he noted that would be cost prohibited. She noted she had no problem with a metal roof. She stated the neighborhood does not like the cement board siding and would want wood siding. With regards to the windows she does not feel the OMNI group would have an issue with the replacement with one over one windows. Mr. Marlow stated are 5 homes in the neighborhood with the proposed roof. It was clarified that the guidelines allow for standing seam metal roofs or the use of metal shingles, though not necessarily a 5 V patterned metal roof. Comm. Montgomery suggested repair of an older window with a storm window over it is significantly less expensive and more energy efficient than the new energy efficient replacement windows. Mr. Marlow noted the windows have lead paint which makes repair very expensive. Comm. Bolen noted the guidelines are the strictest in Mechanicsville with regards to windows which reflect replacement in-kind. It was noted the current windows are in bad disrepair. Comm. Crowder noted concern with 5V roofs is that there would be an exposed screw or nail, even with a gasket over them, which untimely will allow for water penetration over time. There was then discussion surrounding the use of fiberglass doors and the use fiber cement board as opposed to wood siding. There was extensive discussion surrounding options regarding the chimneys which resulted in a consensus that as long as the appearance of the chimneys above the roofline is maintained, their interior portions could be removed. It was further clarified that if that were to be done the design to structurally support the exterior portion of them would of course need to meet building code. Kathy Ellis with the City of Knoxville Community Development Department who administers the Homemakers Program which this property is being sold under noted currently there is an Agreement to purchase the property but it has not yet sold. Part of the Agreement is the Applicant needs to come before the appropriate infill committee to ensure all of the guidelines are adhered to. Further, she noted that her role is to ensure the community, the Board and the Applicant are all taken care of. This house has been in bad disrepair for many years which is why the City had to step in and take the home through Eminent Domain. She noted the in the Homemakers application the Applicant had indicated they would be replacing the siding with wood siding. Mr. Marlow noted that they changed their original intent for the use of wood siding is because the current siding is in such bad shape and rotted throughout.

There was consensus that as the application is so complicated the Motion would be best created by going through the Work Description.

Action: Comm. Chair Busby moved for the application submitted for 1011 McGee Avenue:

MASONRY: Approve dismantling the front porch brick pier and rebuilding them with the brick approved by staff via a mock-up of brick either from the dismantled chimneys or matched. Approve re-pointing and brick replacement on the foundation as necessary using period-appropriate bricks with staff approval via mock-up.

CHIMNEYS: Approve removal of all three chimneys; however, the existing appearance of the two front chimneys above the roof line must be maintained. The rear (cooking chimney) may be removed in its entirety. It will be necessary to re-point the two remaining chimneys above the roofline in order to retain them. Approve rebuilding the chimneys remaining above the roofline to their original height with staff approval of the utilized brick via a mock-up. Cap chimneys as approved by staff.

WINDOWS: Approve replacement of the windows with 2-over-2 simulated-divided-lights with a spacer bar between, after staff approval of specifications. Additionally, approved are 2-over-2 true divided lights. Approve new window openings on the rear façade installing new windows with approved specifications.

DOORS: Approve full-light storm door on the front of the house with the metal to match color of the trim or door. Approve restoring the existing front door. Approve replacement of the rear door with

painted smooth-finish fiberglass full-light pair of doors.

SIDING: Deny without prejudice the use of fiber cement board siding. Approve the replacement of the existing siding with new to match existing.

ROOF: Approve the installation of 5-groove metal roof or asphalt shingles.

DECK: Approve construction of a rear deck with the condition that the balusters, if needed, be of wood and set into the top and bottom rails without overlap.

The Motion was seconded by Comm. Bolen. The Motion carried unanimously.

Old NorthKnoxville H-1

416 Oklahoma Ave - (6-F-14-HZ)

Discussion: Lauren Rider, Old North Knoxville Board member, spoke on behalf the proposal and noted the “owner” is the City of Knoxville. She noted their Board unanimously supports this project. Ms. Rider then gave a brief overview of the entire gazebo project and their need for electricity at the gazebo. This proposal involves having solar panels that are tied back in to the grid via TVA, thereby generating not only electricity but with some dollars actually generated to cover LED lights, an outlet box and perhaps the HOA phone bill. The neighborhood representative James Pierce, through Ms. Rider noted the neighborhood is in full agreement of this project and thanks the City Parks Department for their support and Appalachian Renewable Resources for volunteering to be part of this project, as well as TVA for selecting them to be a part of their program.

Action: Comm. Matthews moved that the application submitted for 416 Oklahoma Avenue be approved based on the evidence submitted and the information provided in the staff report. The Motion was seconded by Comm. Woodle. The Motion carried unanimously.

Other Business:

- Kaye Graybeal announced that the Happy Holler Historic District has now been officially placed on the National and Tennessee Registers of Historic Places by the National Park Service. The nomination was primarily written by Mike Carberry, the former Manager of Long Range Planning for the MPC, who is now retired. She and Mike Reynolds, also with the MPC, finished the application.
- Ms. Graybeal noted that with regards to an update on the design guidelines revisions, she has met with all of the boards of the neighborhoods involved, as well as some of the neighborhoods themselves. She has an upcoming meeting with 4th and Gill and will be meeting with the larger group of residents out in Concord. She will also be meeting with Market Sq. Association representatives. There is a Google Doc available for persons to post their comments and she will be sending out a link to it to interested persons.

Action: Comm. McAdams moved to adjourn. The Motion was seconded by Comm. Bolen. The Motion carried unanimously and the meeting was adjourned.