



**MINUTES  
KNOXVILLE HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION  
KNOX COUNTY HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION  
MEETING JULY 17, 2014**

City HZC Present

Steve Cotham  
Faris Eid  
Sandra Martin  
Lorie Matthews  
Melissa McAdams  
Andie Ray  
Jason Woodle

County HZC Present

David Butler  
Bart Carey  
Mike Crowder

Others Present

Travis Hunt  
Doug and Faith  
McDaniel  
Juan Mino  
James Pierce  
Arin Streeter

City HZC Absent

Sean Bolen (Excused)  
Scott Busby (Excused)

County HZC Absent

Bill Belser (Excused)  
Carol Montgomery

Staff Present

Dori Caron  
Crista Cuccaro  
Mark Donaldson  
Scott Elder  
Kaye Graybeal  
Melvin Wright

Comm. Vice Chair Martin called the meeting to order and noted there was a quorum. She stated that the meeting was being televised and recorded. She also asked that speakers limit their presentations to five minutes and to sign in when they reached the podium. She also noted that any appeals to Commission decisions can be taken to Chancery Court if appealed within 60 days. Comm. Vice Chair Martin then swore in all visitors and Applicants that planned to speak on any Agenda item. Roll call was taken. There were no visitors to introduce.

**Action: Comm. Cotham moved to approve the June 19, 2014 Minutes. The Motion was seconded by Comm. Woodle. The Motion carried unanimously.**

Report to Commission: There were no reports to Commission.

Staff Reports: Ms. Graybeal reviewed the Level 1 Certificates approved this month.

**CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS**

**Fourth and Gill H-1**

**1015 Gratz Street - Rehabilitation of front porch and window/door replacement (7-E-14-HZ)**

**Discussion:** Ms. Graybeal noted the windows replaced were either original or early and were replaced with one-over-one vinyl windows. She noted the Applicant noted they had found lead paint on the windows and that they were deteriorated and inoperable. They were of the rope and pulley system-type. The City placed a Stop Work Order on the door as apparently the contractor was also unaware that a permit was necessary. The contractor disposed of the windows after the Stop Work Order was issued.

The owner, Travis Hunt, was present and noted he was simply unaware of the need to obtain permits or a Certificate of Appropriateness.

He noted he obtained the house through a HUD housing program called A Good Neighbor Next Door, which offers significant discounts to first-time home buyers (for civil service workers). He stated that no one in the entire process told him he was in an H-1 overlay and or needed permits. He stated there were three neighbors with vinyl windows and did not think it would be a problem. He apologized that he was not in compliance but stated again that he was simply unaware. He stated he did not currently have the funds to rectify the situation and going forward, he will come before the Commission as appropriate, but it is his intent to correct the window situation at some point in the future. Arin Streeter, neighborhood representative, noted the neighborhood is in agreement with staff recommendation for denial, noting it was an unfortunate situation. It was clarified that any materials and labor costing \$100.00 or more requires a permit in the City. It was noted that these replacement windows were custom. Mr. Hunt noted he no longer intended to replace the front door. He also noted the rear door, which is not visible from the right-of-way, has a significant amount of glass and he wants to replace it for security reasons, and he has already purchased a replacement. Staff offered to visit the house and make a determination on the rear door (replacement). There was discussion surrounding Mr. Hunt being able to move in/obtain an occupancy certificate without windows. It was suggested that Mr. Hunt research less expensive alternatives for the final window replacements. Crista Cuccaro confirmed that the City cannot prevent Mr. Hunt from living in his house based on the windows not being approved.

**Action: Comm. Eid moved that the application submitted for 1015 Gratz Street be denied based on the evidence provided and the information provided in the staff report. The Applicant may have up to one year to replace the vinyl windows with wooden ones that meet the guidelines, with staff approval. The Motion was seconded by Comm. Ray. The Motion carried unanimously.**

#### **941 Eleanor Street - Replace garage door (7-G-14-HZ)**

**Discussion:** Owner Indya Kincannon noted she and the co-owner Benjamin Barton support the Historic Zoning Commission and the historic overlay (H1). She reiterated this replacement was an emergency as there are valuable contents contained within the garage, noting they have had their garage robbed in the past. She also noted that since they did not change any other entry, just an overhead door that it did not occur to them that they needed to come before the Commission and apologized for not doing so. She disagrees with staff recommendation and feels the replacement door looks fine and better than what it replaced. Arin Streeter, neighborhood representative noted the neighborhood does not object to the door as a temporary solution but agrees with staff recommendation of denial. They do not feel the replacement is appropriate to the character of the neighborhood or the house, and does not follow the intent of the guidelines. It was suggested the Applicant could create the appearance of an appropriate door i.e. a carriage house-style door. For example, the owner could have a professional paint the replacement door to appear to have a center line, and use plastic or metal handles and strap hinges purchased as kits at a store like Home Depot. There was discussion about the existing faux wood grain on the replacement door being inappropriate as well. Arin Streeter stated he felt a solution involving painting the door would be acceptable as long as it adequately represents the period/neighborhood. It was clarified for the Applicant that what the Commission is suggesting is that rather than replace the entire door, applying paint and other materials (strap hinges/handles etc.) to make it appear to be of an appropriate design. Staff offered to assist the Applicant with identifying what would be appropriate which the Applicant agreed to. Ms. Kincannon noted she was leaving the country in 4 weeks and though she was willing and happy to comply with the Commission, she is on a very tight timeline. She agreed to work with staff to identify the design/materials and who would do the work prior to leaving.

**Action: Comm. Eid moved that the application submitted for 941 Eleanor Street be approved based on the evidence submitted and the information provided in the staff report, noting approval of the existing metal door with the provision that additional hardware and other modifications including simulating a center line on the door to make it appear as side-opening, as approved by staff, with a timeframe for compliance of up to 15 months. The Motion was seconded by Comm. Ray. The Motion carried unanimously.**

### **Individual landmark**

#### **125 E Glenwood Ave - H-1 Designation request (7-I-14-HZ)**

**Discussion:** Ms. Graybeal noted the Commission's role today is to make a recommendation for an H-1 overlay to City Council. She then gave an overview of the house's design and history. Owners Doug and Faith McDaniel are proceeding with this application as the house is so unique and has a rich history upon which they expanded for the Commission. There was further discussion on the historic significance of the house and its rarity for the Knoxville area. It was clarified that the house does not fall within either the Fourth or Gill or Old North Knoxville historic districts. Ms. Graybeal clarified the application for the H-1 zoning overlay does go before the Metropolitan Planning Commission prior to going before City Council.

**Action: Comm. Ray moved that the application submitted for 125 E. Glenwood Ave. be approved based on the evidence submitted and the information provided in the staff report to recommend to City Council that the property be rezoned with an H-1 overly based on the uniqueness of its architecture and its association with persons significant to local history. The Motion was seconded by Comm. Cotham. The Motion carried unanimously.**

### **Old North Knoxville H-1**

#### **145 Leonard Place - Replace garage door (7-D-14-HZ) 37.58**

**Discussion:** There was no Owner/Applicant present. Neighborhood representative James Pierce noted they met with the Applicant and felt that the Applicant's design would meet the guidelines with a carriage house look. He stated that he did not have enough neighborhood feedback to note a preference for painted wood or metal.

**Action: Comm. Ray moved that the application submitted for 145 Leonard Place be approved based on the evidence submitted and the information provided in the staff report, per staff recommendation. The Motion was seconded by Comm. Matthews.**

**Further Discussion:** Ms. Graybeal noted then need for clarification as to which Option is approved. Staff recommendation was for Option 2. Comm. Crowder noted Option 1 with hinges and handles from the *Courtyard Collection*® as noted on the handout would also be appropriate, also allowing for glass at the top. It was clarified that glass at the top of Option 2 would be appropriate.

**Action: Comm. Ray amended her Motion for 145 Leonard Place to allow staff to work with the Applicants to choose Option 1 or 2 with the modification of obscure glass above. The Motion was seconded by Comm. Cotham. The Motion carried unanimously.**

#### **409 E Oklahoma Avenue Ave - Front porch and front gable rehabilitation (7-H-14-HZ)**

**Discussion:** Juan Mino, contractor for the Applicant, noted he and the owner have attempted to comply with the guidelines and they want the home to contribute to the neighborhood. He stated they will work with the Commission to be in compliance. There was discussion that historically this style home should have 3 porch support posts but it has been so altered that it now requires 4 from a structural standpoint. Mr. Mino noted that they do plan to reface the concrete face of the porch foundation at some point but it is not part of the current scope of work. It was further clarified the current porch is poured concrete. James Pierce, neighborhood representative, noted the neighborhood agrees with staff recommendation regarding using single, not double, columns and that they have no preference on the posts being round or square and would defer to staff's guidance for that detail. He stressed that they want to ensure that the contractor works with staff to follow through with using the type of column that is approved. He noted they wanted clarity on the porch flooring, that it be installed perpendicular to the home and that a narrower tongue-and-groove as it would be more appropriate to this style/period of house.

Discussion moved to the material proposed for the steps and the challenge of making them meet code. It was noted the risers are not even. Mr. Mino noted they were proposing to cover the stair risers with wood. There was consensus that wood risers would not be appropriate nor allow them to be compliant with building code. It was suggested they face the risers with a thinner, perhaps stone material, as an attempt to make them more even, code compliant and aesthetically correct. Staff offered

to assist Mr. Mino and the Applicant to identify a more appropriate solution to the steps that would also meet code. It was also noted that a new covering for the steps may alter the currently proposed stair railings, and how they would then be attached.

**Action: Comm. Eid moved that the application submitted for 409 E. Oklahoma Ave. be approved based on the evidence submitted and the information provided in the staff report per staff recommendation with the following clarifications: That four porch columns be used at the front with the size, style and materials of the columns to be approved by staff, and the columns be single, not double; approval of newel posts to be added to the inside of each of the two porch posts with the stair railings being approved subject to the redesign of the stair riser coverings also per staff approval; approval of hanging fish-scale shingles in the gable end of the front projecting wing also with style and material requiring staff approval; approval of wood tongue and groove porch flooring, laid perpendicular to the house, with the style and width being appropriate to the neighborhood and also approved by staff; the railings approved as submitted with the exception of the front steps redesign (subject to the resubmitted drawings); and denial of adding the proposed sawn brackets. The Motion was seconded by Comm. Ray. The Motion carried unanimously.**

**Action: Comm. Ray moved to adjourn the meeting. The Motion was unanimously seconded and the meeting was adjourned.**