



MINUTES
KNOXVILLE HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION
KNOX COUNTY HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION
MEETING FEBRUARY 20, 2014

City HZC Present

Scott Busby

Faris Eid

Sandra Martin

Melissa McAdams

Jason Woodle

City HZC Absent

Sean Bolen (excused)

Lorie Matthews (excused)

Melynda Whetsel (excused)

Andie Ray(excused)

County HZC Present

Bill Belser

David Butler

Bart Carey

Mike Crowder

Carol Montgomery

County HZC Absent

None

Others Present

Bill Hodges

Carl Lansden

Arin Streeter

Staff Present

Dori Caron

Crista Cuccaro

Rick Emmett

Kaye Graybeal

Kasey Krouse

Melvin Wright

Comm. Chair Busby called the meeting to order and noted there was a quorum. He stated that the meeting was being televised and recorded. He also asked that speakers limit their presentations to 5 minutes and to sign in when they reached the podium. He also noted that any decisions can be taken to Chancery Court if appealed within 60 days. Comm. Chair Busby then swore in all visitors and Applicants that planned to speak on any Agenda item. Roll call was taken. There were no visitors to introduce.

Action: Comm. Woodle moved that the January 16, 2013 Minutes be approved. The Motion was seconded by Comm. Butler. The Motion carried unanimously.

Reports to Commission: Chair and Vice Chairs, Lisa Hatfield, Melvin Wright. There were no reports to Commission this month.

Kaye Graybeal, MPC Historic Preservation Planner, reviewed the Level 1 Certificate approved by staff.

GENERAL BUSINESS

Knox County and City of Knoxville

Election of Officers

The Election of Officers for the Knoxville Historic Zoning Commission is postponed until next month's meeting as there were 4 Commissioners excused today.

Knoxville Historic Zoning Comm. Chair Busby turned the meeting over to the Knox County Historic Zoning Comm. Chair David Butler, who opened the floor for nominations.

Action: Comm. Carey nominated David Butler for Chair of the Knox County Historic Zoning Commission for a second year and Carol Montgomery for Vice Chair of the Knox County Historic Zoning Commission for a second year. The Motion was seconded by Comm. Crowder. The Motion carried unanimously.

CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS

City of Knoxville

Fourth and Gill H-1

1206 Luttrell St - Modifications to porch and miscellaneous exterior features (1-B-14-HZ) (Denied without prejudice at 1/16/2014 meeting)

Discussion: Ms. Graybeal noted this house has been heavily altered over its history prior to the historic overlay being established. Owner Carl Lansden was present and noted he agreed with the uniformity of the one over one the second level without the balustrades. Arin Streeter, neighborhood representative noted the neighborhood is generally pleased the house is going back to a single family dwelling and they would like the house to be fully restored but recognize the guidelines cannot require that that be done. The neighborhood is concerned with replacing something non-original with something else that is not necessarily appropriate. He noted they would like to see anything done move closer to what would be considered appropriate. Ms. Graybeal noted staff recommendation was to try and make the renovations to be at least more proportionately correct, of appropriate materials and simple in design. It was clarified that some historically accurate restorative measures would not meet code. Mr. Lansden stated he would be open to any design for the columns. It was discussed that a window would be more appropriate at the second level should there be no balustrade constructed there. It was further noted none of the current windows are original. Melvin Wright noted a fixed door with no access on the second level would not require a 36 inch balustrade and that a decorative 24 inch balustrade would meet code. Mr. Landen stated he felt a window on the second level would be better but again noted he would defer to what the Commission suggests. Mr. Streeter noted the neighborhood did not discuss a second level balustrade, decorative or otherwise.

Action: Comm. Eid moved that the application submitted for 1206 Luttrell St. be approved based on the evidence submitted and the information provided in the staff report with the following clarifications: that the balustrade at ground level be 36 inches in height and that a balustrade be constructed on the second level of 24 inches in height, and the exact door to be used will be approved by staff. The Motion was seconded by Comm. Woodle. There was further discussion that a window and no balustrade would be more appropriate. Comm. Eid amended his Motion to include that the Applicant can also choose to use a one over one window (instead of a fixed door) without a balustrade at the second level. Comm. Woodle seconded the Amended Motion. The Motion carried unanimously.

Individual Historic Landmark

9320 Kingston Pike - rear additions and parking area (2-E-14-HZ)

Discussion: There was discussion surrounding the proposed and existing stairs. It was clarified that a required egress would require handrails if there is more than 2 risers and/or 30 inches in height. Ms. Graybeal noted the original site plan showed the driveway coming around the front of the house (it actually circled the house). The Applicant was able to work with the development management team to rearrange the driveway such that it only serves the house and will not be shared with the rest of the development. The newly proposed drive aisle would not come in front of the house and would therefore eliminate the lot of the paved area in front of the house and elsewhere, further allowing for more landscaping. The Applicant has a request into the Board of Zoning Appeals to slightly reduce the width of the newly proposed drive aisle. The Applicant, Bill Hodges noted they have new information today. They recently cleared a lot of brush and subsequently triangulated an old elm tree which is approximately 150 to 200 years old. He noted they feel this tree is a significant component to this house and will need to come back before the Commission with another revised site plan as they now want to pull any pavement further back from this tree. It was clarified that currently on the table for review are the rear addition, the covered stairwell and the site plan, which will now again be revised. It was agreed that if a railing is required for the rear enclosed stairwell that staff can approve it (and it will need to meet code).

Action: Comm. Martin moved that the application submitted for 9320 Kingston Pike be approved based on the evidence submitted and the information provided in the staff report with the following clarifications: the new site plan is approved and that after taking the elm tree into consideration, staff can approve a new site plan unless there is a huge deviation. Comm. Martin added that staff can approve the railing design. The Motion was seconded by Comm. McAdams. The Motion carried unanimously.

Advisory Review

Market Square Landscaping proposal

Discussion: Ms. Graybeal clarified that the Commission does not approve landscaping and is acting in an advisory position for this project. Rick Emmett noted the City was trying to rectify a chronic issue with getting grass to grow in this location (due to lack of sunlight) but was really trying to save the (6) trees located here. Kasey Krouse, Urban Developer for the City, noted these 6 trees are some of the most valuable in the City, contributing greatly to the aesthetics of Market Square, and their goal is enhance the usability of the area while ensuring the preservation of these trees. He further noted continued sodding/regrading of the area will cause health issues for the trees. Mr. Emmett noted they reviewed the project with the Market Square District Association who was favorable. Mr. Krouse also noted that the project design allows for future tree replacement should that become necessary. There was a brief discussion surrounding the use of grass as ground cover as saw tooth oaks tend to keep their leaves year round. There are shade tolerant grasses or fescues that may be used for the ground cover. There are no current plans for benches or fencing however Mr. Emmett noted this area is most likely a work in progress.

Other Business:

Ms. Graybeal noted staff and Knox Heritage are working with the owner of the H. E. Christenberry House on Kingston Pike to find a new owner who would restore and not demolish the house (if a proposed rezoning is approved to planed residential which as where it stands now, would result in having 4 houses per acre built on the property. The rezoning request for the property was postponed for 30 days at the February MPC meeting. Ms. Graybeal noted there is no current designation on the house. Comm. Carey noted the neighborhood is vehemently opposed to having the property rezoned to allow for the proposed development.

The MPC has recommended approval to the City Council for the Knoxville High School to be rezoned Central Business District (CBD) to allow for redevelopment of it into senior housing.

The MPC also has recommended approval to City Council for the Kerns Bakery to receive an H-1 designation.

Action: Comm. Chair Busby moved to adjourn the meeting. The Motion was seconded by Carol Montgomery. The Motion carried unanimously and the meeting was adjourned.