



**MINUTES
KNOXVILLE HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION
KNOX COUNTY HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION
MEETING DECEMBER 18, 2014**

City HZC Present

Sean Bolen
Scott Busby
Faris Eid
Sandra Martin
Melissa McAdams
Jason Woodle

County HZC Present

Bill Belser
David Butler
Bart Carey
Mike Crowder

Others Present

Dan Butler
Kevin Murphy
Daniel Parker
Roy Payne
Arin Streeter
Bill Threlkeld

City HZC Absent

Steve Cotham (Excused)
Lorie Matthews (Excused)
Andie Ray (Excused)

County HZC Absent

None

Staff Present

Dori Caron
Crista Cuccaro
Scott Elder
Kaye Graybeal
Melvin Wright

Comm. Chair Busby called the meeting to order and noted there was a quorum. He stated that the meeting was being televised and recorded. He also asked that speakers limit their presentations to five minutes and to sign in when they reached the podium. He also noted that any appeals to Commission decisions can be taken to Chancery Court if appealed within 60 days. Comm. Chair Busby then swore in all visitors and Applicants that planned to speak on any Agenda item. Roll call was taken. There were no visitors to introduce.

Action: Comm. Martin moved to approve the November 20, 2014 Minutes. The Motion was seconded by Comm. Woodle. The Motion carried unanimously.

Reports to Commission: There were no reports to Commission.

Staff Reports: Ms. Graybeal reviewed the Level I Certificates approved since the last meeting.

It was agreed that due to scheduling commitments/conflicts that the City applications will be heard first followed by the County applications. The actual order of the meeting was Fourth and Gill: 724 Deery Street and then 933 Luttrell St.; Concord Village: 11029 Lake Ridge Road and then 818 Loop Road. In between the City and County applications Kevin Murphy representing Murphy Springs Farm presented an update on the National Register Nomination for the property.

Staff Reports. Kaye Graybeal reviewed the Level I Certificates approved this month.

CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS

Fourth and Gill H-1

724 Deery Street – Rear porch addition (12-D-14-HZ)

Discussion: Owner Dan Butler was present and had no further information. Neighborhood representative Arin Streeter noted the neighborhood was in support of staff recommendation and further, that the neighborhood had no concerns about adding the proposed details such as the brackets or railings.

Action: Comm. Bolen moved that the application submitted for 724 Deery Street be approved based on the evidence submitted and the information provided in the staff report, per staff recommendation. The Motion was seconded by Comm. Eid. The Motion carried unanimously.

933 Luttrell Street – Canopy overhangs, doors, and railings (12-F-14-HZ)

Discussion: Owner Scott Schimmel was present and handed out additional photos of ideas for the proposed metal doors to the Commission. He clarified that they planned to replace the entire door system including replacing the existing sidelights, all of which are in very poor condition. It was clarified for Mr. Schimmel that a metal roof on the proposed awnings could be appropriate if he could replicate a standing seam metal and staff offered to assist him with those specifications so that they would look more authentic. It was further noted that the roofs would have such a low slope they would not be highly visible. Neighborhood representative Arin Streeter noted the neighborhood was in agreement with staff recommendation to approve this application. He asked for clarification of the 36-inch height for the balustrade at the widow's walk and inquired as to whether it was an accessible space. Mr. Schimmel noted they will be accessing the space via a hatch and potential future ladder. Melvin Wright noted the 36-inch height is required if the space is intended to be used as deck or patio [or usable] space. He also noted that if the turret will be used as part of an egress plan it would need to meet certain minimum qualifications. Mr. Wright then noted that they would work with the Applicant to design an appropriate balustrade/egress for that space to ensure compliance. Mr. Streeter noted the neighborhood was excited about returning this original part of the home and hoped everyone could work together to make it as much like it was originally as possible.

Action: Comm. Eid moved that the application submitted for 933 Luttrell Street be approved as submitted based on the evidence submitted and the information provided in the staff report, per staff recommendation, clarifying that based on staff recommendation, an attempt be made to minimize the appearance of the height of the railing. The Motion was seconded by Comm. Martin. The Motion carried unanimously.

Knoxville HZC Comm. Chair Busby turned the meeting over to Knox County Comm. Chair Butler.

Update to the Commission. Ms. Graybeal noted that Kevin Murphy, Murphy Springs Farm, was present to discuss the National Register nomination for the property and to request a resolution to support the boundaries originally proposed in the application as submitted for the nomination from the Commission. The State Review Board voted unanimously in September 2014 to recommend the nomination; however, the Tennessee State Historic Preservation Office (SHPO) staff disagreed with the proposed boundaries of the property and supports approval of a much smaller parcel, referencing that the larger boundary contained too much vacant land that did not contribute to the historicity of the

property. The proposed boundaries are now undergoing a more extensive review by the National Park Service. Mr. Murphy then spoke and asked if the Commission would consider crafting a letter or resolution essentially stating that the Commission has reviewed the originally proposed boundaries as well as the information provided by the State Review Board and would support a nomination that includes the full boundary instead of the reduced boundary set proposed by the SHPO staff. He noted the full boundaries are important to convey the sense of an early frontier settlement farm along with associated properties. He noted the original application contained 16 family-owned parcels totaling approximately 206 acres. Mr. Murphy stated he believes the primary reason for the dispute is based on an initial boundary assessment made in early 2013 between the Tennessee Department of Transportation (TDOT) and the Tennessee SHPO for a proposed road improvement project adjacent to Murphy Springs Farm which identified a 50-acre parcel, basically consisting of the primary house/domestic complex. Mr. Murphy then stated that the citizen members of the State Review Board voted unanimously to recommend the nomination with the full boundary; however, the state staff presented their case and it was decided to send the application to the National Register Keeper for review and final determination. He noted there was discussion at the State Review Board meeting that since they made a commitment to a state agency last year they need to keep it. There was general consensus on the Commission that the reduction of the boundary set was excessive even given the need to widen Washington Pike. Ms. Graybeal offered to draft a letter for Knox County Commission Chair Butler to sign.

Action: Comm. Carey moved that the Knox County Historic Zoning Commission fully support Mr. Murphy's endeavor [to maintain the originally identified, larger boundary] and to make a resolution/write a letter in support of this endeavor, which would be copied to the mayor. The Motion was seconded by Comm. Belser. The Motion carried unanimously

Concord Village HZ

11029 Lake Ridge Road – New Construction (12-H-14-HZ)

Discussion: Project architect Bill Threlkeld was present and distributed elevations for the proposed garage for the new residential construction application. Mr. Threlkeld clarified that the proposed garage is detached and with a small carport. Ms. Graybeal noted they propose to use the same materials as will be used on the house along with the same roof pitch. Mr. Threlkeld noted there would be a wrap-around porch on two sides (front and driveway sides) and it will be over 30 inches in height. He noted he agreed with staff recommendation regarding reducing the apparent height of the balusters and noted they could attach an upper double rail (probably a 2 x 6 inches with a 2 x 4 inch board under it), 2 x 2 inch spindles [balusters] 4 inches on center, and pulling the bottom rail 4 inches off the floor, thereby reducing the appearance of the overall height of the balusters. Ms. Graybeal noted the Applicant could also have the garage door appear more like a carriage house door, consistent with other neighborhood approvals, with hardware as appropriate and a center line or the appearance of one. Ms. Graybeal noted the revised baluster design would need to be approved by Building Codes. Other than the above noted clarification on the garage door type (carriage house style would be appropriate) staff believes the garage and overall proposals are appropriate.

Action: Comm. Carey moved that the application submitted for 11029 Lake Ridge Road be approved based on the guidelines, the evidence submitted and the information provided in the staff report per staff recommendation, noting the conditions that the design for the balustrade be submitted to staff which reduces the apparent of the height of the balustrades with regard to the 36 inch-height required by Building Codes, and that the garage door have the appearance of a carriage house style door. Mr. Threlkeld stated they accept the above stated conditions. The Motion was seconded by Comm. Belser. The Motion carried unanimously.

818 Loop Road – Demolition and new construction (8-E-14-HZ)

Discussion: It was clarified that the application is for three 1-story duplexes, not four as stated in the staff report. Ms. Graybeal noted that Mr. Parker has submitted their proposal for the 3 façade designs which state that the windows will be one-over-ones as opposed to the originally proposed multi-paned ones, which she noted were actually more appropriate to a Craftsman style. The applicant, Daniel Parker, was present and noted they will be working on the existing house after receiving approval from the Metropolitan Planning Commission to subdivide the parcel and also noted renovations on it are not addressed in this proposal. He stated the house is in worse condition than they had originally thought but they have found the plans and the original deed in the house when cleaning it out. Mr. Parker clarified they have not yet drawn construction documents for the three duplexes as they are waiting for the final exterior approval from the Commission today. He noted that based on the Commission's earlier suggestions they attempted to further differentiate the three buildings by using three different colors. Mr. Parker further noted the existing shed they had planned to have removed and repurposed is riddled with termites and unsalvageable. Only the tin material is salvageable.

Action: Comm. Carey moved that the application submitted for 818 Loop Road be approved based on the evidence submitted and the information provided in the staff report per staff recommendation. The Motion was seconded by Comm. Belser. The Motion carried unanimously.

Carol Montgomery, formerly a Knox County HZC Commissioner and resident of Old Concord, noted the Concord Board supports the proposal.

There was no further business.

Action: Comm. Bolen moved to adjourn the meeting. The Motion was seconded by County Comm. Chair Butler. The Motion carried unanimously and the meeting was adjourned.