

MINUTES
KNOXVILLE HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION
KNOX COUNTY HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION
MEETING MARCH 21, 2013

<u>City HZC Present</u>	<u>County HZC Present</u>	<u>Others Present</u>
Sean Bolen	Bart Carey	Brandon Pace
Sandra Martin	Steve Cotham	David Kerns
Lorie Matthews	Carol Montgomery	Joshua Wright
Melissa McAdams		Arin Streeter
Andie Ray		
Melynda Whetsel		
Jason Woodle		
<u>City HZC Absent</u>	<u>County HZC Absent</u>	<u>Staff Present</u>
Scott Busby (Excused)	David Butler (Excused)	Rick Emmett
Faris Eid (Excused)	Linda Claussen (Excused)	Kaye Graybeal
		Lisa Hatfield
		Dori Caron

Commission Vice Chair Martin called the meeting to order and noted there was a quorum for the City. Roll call was taken. Vice Chair Martin stated that the meeting was being televised and recorded. She also asked that speakers limit their presentations to 5 minutes and to sign in when they reached the podium. She also noted that any appeals can be taken to Chancery Court within 60 days. Vice Chair Martin then swore in all visitors and applicants that planned to speak on any Agenda item.

Correction to the February 17, 2013 Minutes: Comm. McAdams noted at 12-14 Market Square, the egress door approved on the side of the building opening into the pocket park should be identified as an “emergency” egress (identified as such by the Applicant but not required by Code).

Action: A Motion was made Comm. Carey to approve the February 21, 2013 Minutes with the correction. The Motion was seconded by Comm. Matthews. The Motion carried unanimously.

Reports to Commission: Chair and Vice Chairs, Lisa Hatfield, Melvin Wright.
Lisa Hatfield was present and noted there were no reports to commission this month.

Staff Reports: Kaye Graybeal, MPC Historic Preservation Planner
Ms. Graybeal reviewed Level I Certificates approved by staff this month.

CITY of KNOXVILLE HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION
Certificates of Appropriateness

Fourth and Gill Neighborhood (H-1)

815 N. 4th Street 020413FG

Masonry stair and utility enclosures; rear porch additions

Discussion: The Applicant has requested postponement until the May meeting so they can work out design and permitting issues.

Action: Comm. Ray moved to approve the Applicant’s request to postpone the application to the May 2013 meeting. The Motion was seconded by Comm. Whetsel. The Motion carried unanimously.

1015 Eleanor Street 022813FG
Chimney reconstruction

Discussion: There was no owner representative present. It was clarified and agreed upon that “repointing” as opposed to “tuck-pointing” brick is the preferred repair method. The neighborhood representative, Arin Streeter, stated the neighborhood supports the application and is always happy to see owners maintaining their chimneys.

Action: Comm. Whetsel moved that the submitted application be approved based on the evidence submitted and information provided in the staff report. The Motion was seconded by Comm. Ray. The Motion carried unanimously.

1003 Luttrell Street 030413FG
Rear modifications

Discussion: There was no owner present. Brandon Pace, project architect, stated that after the house burned in 1981 it was brought back to two apartments and that his firm has been hired to return it to single-family home. Arin Streeter, neighborhood representative, stated that the neighborhood supports the application, and further stated that is clear the intent of the owners is to keep the changes to the rear of the house to a minimum.

Action: Comm. Whetsel moved that the submitted application be approved based on the evidence submitted and the information provided in the staff report. The Motion was seconded by Comm. McAdams. The Motion carried unanimously.

Market Square (H-1)
1 Market Square 022813MKT
Vinyl enclosure for outdoor café

Discussion: The question before the Commission is whether or not these structures detract from the aesthetics and historic appearance of the Market Square District environment as a whole, and would they negatively impact the District. Josh Wright, the project architect was present and stated that there were no specific regulations against these structures. Discussion ensued regarding the MSDA meeting notes. It was clarified that the MSDA proposed guidelines would not alter the officially adopted Market Square guidelines. Mr. Wright stated that due to the exposed front of Tupelo Honey the historic features of the building could still be seen beyond the enclosure. Concern was noted that Market Square is the most public part of the historic overlay and it was proposed that the City be more involved in this discussion. Ms. Graybeal noted that the MSDA proposal has been reviewed by the building inspections department, the engineering department, the fire marshal’s office and the economic development division of the city and by the City’s downtown coordinator.

None of the aforementioned entities were adamantly against the proposal if regulations were to be put in place however; they all deferred to the Historic Zoning commission to determine their appropriateness. Rick Emmett, downtown coordinator for the City was present. He noted his staff has discussed this and this is not a new idea. He stated they share the same concerns as the Commissioners and are also unsure of where this would eventually lead. It was clarified that the current MSDA guidelines do not allow for these enclosures. The MSDA did vote to adopt their proposal but that it does not alter the officially adopted guidelines.

Action: Comm. Ray moved to deny the submitted application based on the evidence submitted and the information provided in the staff report. The Motion was seconded by Comm. Whetsel. The Motion carried unanimously.

27 Market Square 030513MKT

Installation of 3 vinyl-framed windows on 2nd level

Discussion: The Applicant has asked for postponement to work with Lowes to identify appropriate replacements for the vinyl windows. It was noted that City Plans Review and the Fire Marshall does not allow vinyl windows in the fire district and that they will need to be removed for that reason alone irrespective of the historic overlay guidelines. Comm. Ray disclosed that she would need to recuse herself when there is a future vote as she and her husband are former owners of this property and had previously replaced non-original windows prior to installation of the vinyl ones being discussed.

Action: Comm. Whetsel moved to approve the Applicant's request to postpone this application to the April meeting. The Motion was seconded by Comm. Woodle. The Motion carried unanimously.

Edgewood – Park City (H-1)

2329 Jefferson Avenue 030413EDG

Installation of porch balustrade

Discussion: It was clarified that the poured concrete porch is not original and there is no documentation that a balustrade ever existed. As a balustrade is needed for insurance compliance, it needs to be of a simple design to match the simple design of the house.

David Kerns, owner representative, was sworn in by Vice-Chair Martin as he was not present earlier.

There was a brief discussion as to whether or not this house ever had ever had more a more ornate design and further that it had been manipulated quite a bit in its history. Although the house may have been more ornate but there is no evidence to support that and hence, as this home is now of a simple design, more simple balusters would be appropriate.

Ms. Graybeal stated that there are ways to mitigate appearance of the code-required height of these balustrades and offered several examples. She further noted she will be glad to work with any applicants in reviewing their design to help them identify ways to do that before they install them. There was no neighborhood representative present.

Action: Comm. Bolen moved to approve the submitted application based on the evidence submitted and information provided in the staff report. The Motion was seconded by

Comm. Ray. The Motion did not carry with Comms. Bolen and Ray voting yes and Comms. Matthews, McAdams and Whetsel voting no.

Action: Comm. Whetsel moved to deny the submitted application based on the evidence submitted and the information provided in the staff report and to approve the staff recommendation of installation of square balusters, based on a sketch to be provided to staff by the Applicant. The Motion was seconded by Comm. Matthews. It was clarified they be 2 x 2 nominal square balusters. The Motion carried unanimously.

Other business:

Vice-Chair asked the Commissioners to be seated each month by 8:25 out of respect to the Applicants and other attendees.

Ms. Graybeal invited everyone to attend this weekend's Neighborhood Conference sponsored by the City's Community Development Department and noted Comm. Whetsel would be moderating a panel with herself, Comm. Carey, Comm. Montgomery and MPC staff Jeff Archer and Kaye Graybeal. There was no further business.

Action: Comm. Ray moved to adjourn. The Motion was seconded by Vice-Chair Martin and the meeting was adjourned.