

**MINUTES**  
**KNOXVILLE HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION**  
**KNOX COUNTY HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION**  
**MEETING OF NOVEMBER 15, 2012**

**City HZC Present**

Sean Bolen  
Faris Eid  
Sandra Martin  
Lorie Matthews  
Melissa McAdams  
Andie Ray  
Melynda Whetsel  
Jason Woodle

**County HZC Present**

David Butler  
Linda Claussen  
Steve Cotham  
Kenneth Gresham  
Carol Montgomery

**Others Present:**

Kaye Graybeal  
Arin Streater  
Bill Hodges  
Rob Boyd  
Daniel Schuh  
Arthur Seymour, Jr.  
Melvin Wright  
Kim Trent  
Dori Caron

**Members Absent**

Scott Busby (Excused)

**Members Absent**

None

Commission Vice-Chair Sandra Martin called the meeting to order and noted there was a quorum. Roll call was taken. Comm. Vice-Chair Martin stated that the meeting was being televised and recorded. She also asked that speakers limit their presentations to 5 minutes. Comm. Vice-Chair Martin then swore in all visitors and applicants that planned to speak on any Agenda item.

**Action: A Motion was made by Comm. Bolen to approve the October 18, 2012 Minutes. The Motion was seconded by Comm. Eid. The Motion carried unanimously.**

Reports to Commission: Chair and Vice Chairs, Lisa Hatfield, Melvin Wright. There were no reports to the Commission.

Staff Reports: Kaye Graybeal, MPC Historic Preservation Planner. Ms. Graybeal reviewed Level 1 Staff Reports.

**CITY of KNOXVILLE HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION**

**Fourth and Gill Neighborhood (H-1)**

**315 Gill Avenue (092812FG)**

Install ramp on west side of building and general façade improvements including the addition of wood-paneled architectural elements and lighting to facade.

**Discussion:** The Applicant has asked for postponement of the application until the December 2012 meeting as they are still working out the details of their proposal.

**Old North Knoxville Historic District (H-1)**

**1123 Harvey Street (100812ONK)**

Replace non-original six-panel metal front door with period-appropriate door.

**Discussion:** The owner was not present. Ms. Graybeal noted the house has been altered to the extent that it is no longer considered to be a contributing structure. The owner would like to restore some of the home's original features, most of which require Level 1 approval. The owner proposes to replace a non-original 6 panel front door with a wood half-light door with one or two panels below. Ms. Graybeal noted that the neighborhood supports replacement of the door.

**Action: Comm. Eid moved that the submitted application be approved based on the evidence submitted and the information provided in the staff report. The Motion was seconded by Comm. McAdams. The Motion carried unanimously.**

**230 E. Oklahoma Avenue (101012ONK)**

Replace 3 support posts on the south wrap-around side of the front porch with composite columns.

**Discussion:** Owner Daniel Schuh was present noted when he purchased the home it been divided into apartments. The previous owner had begun to convert it back into a single family home, beginning on the front porch. The previous owner had moved one original side column to the front as a replacement column. Mr. Schuh noted that all of the remaining side columns have deteriorated beyond repair, and that there are no capitals left. He noted creating replicas of these very detailed and fluted wooden columns would require a labor intensive process and further that columns of this length are also not offered off the shelf. Mr. Schuh stated he found structural grade composite columns where he could manipulate them to look like appropriate and very closely matching replacements. Neighborhood representative James Pierce was not present but it was noted that he had indicated in an email to staff that he himself supported the replacement columns as they exist now and that the neighborhood was neither in support of, nor against them. Discussion followed on the interpretation of the design guidelines and the Commissioners' role in applying them. It was noted that updates to design guidelines should include guidance on alternative materials.

**Action: Comm. Eid moved that the submitted application be approved based on the evidence submitted and the information provided in the staff report. The Motion was seconded by Comm. McAdams. The Motion carried with Comm. Bolen voting no.**

**Edgewood-Park City Historic District (H-1)**

**2011 Jefferson Avenue (102912EDG)**

After-the-fact application to replace original 3/1 deteriorated wood windows with vinyl double-pane insulated windows with faux muntins. Replace original wood 3-light front door. Replace wood board porch flooring to match later-added board floor.

**Discussion:** Owner Robert Boyd was present and clarified there was no chimney when he purchased the property and further clarified that he did replace the porch. It was noted the issues under discussion today involve the windows, the porch floor and the door. The porch floor needs to be replaced with tongue and groove flooring. The current windows and doors are both inappropriate as well. There was no neighborhood representative present; however, Ms. Graybeal did speak with the representative, John Stancil. She stated he was aware of the proposal but was unable to commit to attending the meeting and had stated he would contact Mr. Boyd. Ms. Graybeal noted that Mr. Stancil did not offer an opinion.

**Action: Comm. Whetsel moved that the submitted application be denied based on the evidence submitted and the information provided in the staff report with staff's recommended condition withdrawn. The Motion was seconded by Comm. Woodle. Comm. Whetsel withdrew her Motion due to a personal appointment.**

**Action: Comm. Bolen moved that the submitted application be denied based on the evidence submitted and the information provided in the staff report. Comm. Bolen moved that the Commission approve replacement all of the windows with 3-over-1 either vinyl or wood simulated-divided-lights, to replace the porch floor with tongue- and groove- flooring and replace the door with an historically appropriate wood door that must first be approved by staff. The Motion was seconded by Comm. Ray. The Motion carried unanimously.**

It was further noted that staff would follow up on the porch railings.

**Kennedy-Baker-Walker-Sherrill House (H-1)**

**9320 Kingston Pike (102912GEN)**

Exterior restoration proposal.

**Discussion:** Ms. Graybeal noted the Applicant, Bill Hodges was present. Ms. Graybeal explained both the restoration and rezoning applications. She noted this property is a rare example of a federal style building and it dates back to 1849. She noted staff feels the proposal meets applicable standards, which are the Secretary of the Interior Standards for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, as the intent is to repair and restore the structure with as much original material as possible. Ms. Graybeal noted the property was in a very poor state of disrepair. Ms. Graybeal noted that the second part of this proposal includes a reduction in the boundary of the H-1 Historic Overlay. The Applicant has submitted site plans to show how the reduction can still allow for feasibility of the project and future marketing of the property. Ms. Graybeal reviewed the building restoration proposal.

**Action: Comm. Bolen moved that the submitted application be approved based on the evidence submitted and the information provided in the staff report. The Motion was seconded by Comm. McAdams. The Motion carried unanimously.**

**Modification of H-1 Historic Overlay** (portion of the Sherrill House property)  
**9320 Kingston Pike (070212GEN)**

Adjust zoning boundaries of H-1 Historic Overlay on east and south sides to reflect those on submitted site plan. Add drive aisles on front, east, and west sides. Add parking on the west side. Add brick pillar signage, landscaping and black wrought iron fencing.

**Discussion:** Ms. Graybeal stated there are 3 options for the final site plan. This portion of the proposal, if approved, will go before the Metropolitan Planning Commission on December 13<sup>th</sup> as a reduction in the H-1 overlay which was a condition of the rezoning to Planned Commercial (PC1). Any changes to the H-1 overlay boundaries constitutes a rezoning. Then the proposal will go before City Council for final approval. With the rezoning to PC1, two conditions were placed on approval: 1) provide sufficient buffer for landscaping around the house and 2) ensure there is an unobstructed front view of the house. The Commission's role is to review whether or not these two conditions are met. She also noted that these plans are conceptual in nature and may be altered slightly before being finalized. The dimensions on the site plans were clarified. In order to make the project feasible and to complete the transfer of the property to Mr. Hodges for restoration, the H1 overlay boundary needs to be reduced. The proposed reduction reflects reducing the H-1 overlay boundary to within 28 feet of the house on the south side and to within 8 feet of the home on the east side. Ms. Graybeal clarified that the Applicant for the restoration is Mr. Bill Hodges and the Applicant for the boundary reduction (rezoning) is Kingston Pike, LLC. She noted that in order for this particular proposal for restoration to proceed, the boundary reduction needs to be approved.

Ms. Graybeal stated that the MPC staff feels any of the three site plan options would be workable. She further noted staff feels all three options would meet the conditions of the landscaping buffer and maintaining an unobstructed view of the house. Ms. Graybeal further reiterated the site plans have yet to be submitted to the MPC for approval and may yet be tweaked. Reviewing the three options for the site plan, Ms. Graybeal noted that Options 2 and 3 have a narrow 20 -foot one-way wide drive aisle in the front of the house and allow for some parking where Option 1 has a two-way, 32-foot road in the front. She also clarified that the north and west boundaries will not change. She also noted that there is a proposed roadway between the east boundary and the neighboring development to that side which would serve as a buffer and would prevent building right up against the east side boundary. The Applicant also proposes to install a black metal fence on all sides of the property. Ms. Graybeal noted Mr. Hodges intent is to establish control over the property independent of other neighboring development so as to maintain integrity of the site.

The drive along the east side will be a private way used by the public and Mr. Hodges noted there will be a cross- easement there for access in favor of the Sherrill property. The development will use association dues to maintain the roads, grounds and easement. Mr. Hodges noted their desire would be to have an egress easement on the east side road but share no others related to the Sherrill house property as they also want control over the parking around the house. He further noted that MPC staff has stated to him that they want circulation of traffic on the property. Mr. Hodges stated he has no knowledge of the exact orientation of the adjacent development.

Mr. Hodges also clarified that none of the options will have direct access to Kingston Pike and concern was then expressed about access. Ms. Graybeal stated that MPC staff feels that direct access to Kingston Pike would not be safe and have worked with the developers to establish a safe access plan.

Footprint of the overlay reduction was re-clarified. Discussion ensued regarding the proposed drive in front of the house. Mr. Hodges noted that this is not within his purview but lies with the developer who is working with the MPC to determine the final decision on that part of the site plan. Ms. Graybeal note that the developer has negotiated an additional 20 feet on the north side as the original proposal had the revised boundary at 8 feet from the house on both the south and east sides. Arthur Seymour, Jr., representing Kingston Pike, LLC, noted that the bank has stated that this transaction will proceed only with the approval of the proposed H-1 Historic Overlay. Mr. Hodges stated that he had met with Ms. Graybeal and discussed, and was open to an additional option whereby there would not be a road in front of the house. He further clarified that this lot is a legally platted lot in this development and as such, has legal access to all roads with the development corridors and perpetual access to this property is already in place.

Kim Trent, Executive Director of Know Heritage spoke on behalf of the project. She noted Knox Heritage has been working on this project for many years. She noted that the house is quite deteriorated and feels this proposal is a gift. Though she understands the concerns regarding reduction of the historic overlay of the site and realizes that it is not an ideal arrangement, Ms. Trent stated Knox Heritage is comfortable with the proposal. She further noted that although the bank's position is a difficult one, it is a reality and agrees that the Mr. Hodges has done a wonderful job in negotiating the proposed restoration of the house. She noted that the developer is completely behind the authentic restoration of the house and asked the Commission to consider the proposal. She noted this has been a difficult road to this point.

**Action: Comm. Eid moved that the submitted application be approved based on the evidence submitted and the information provided in the staff report such that the Commission approves the reduction of the H-1 overlay on the south side property line to ~28 feet from the base of the house and to 8 feet from the base of the house on the east side property line with the provision that a ~25-foot joint permanent easement be established along the entire length of the east side property line**

**(Sherrill House property), and further that the current south side easement is extended to the new south side property line. The Motion was seconded by Comm. Bolen. The Motion carried unanimously.**

**Other business:**

Comm. Bolen stated that Old North Knoxville is having their annual Holiday Victorian Home Tour the first weekend of December. All Commissioners will have tickets waiting for them at “will-call” located in the old St. Mary’s parking lot. The hours will be Saturday December 1<sup>st</sup> from 4 to 9 p.m. and Sunday December 2<sup>nd</sup> from 1 to 5 p.m.

Ms. Graybeal reiterated that staff applied for a Certified Local Government grant to retain a consultant to assist with updating the neighborhood guidelines on sustainable and new materials and to clarify any discrepancies.

Ms. Graybeal wanted to clarify that the Commissioners do have the ability to waive a guideline based on findings of fact about the particular property, although they do want to consider what the neighborhood states that they do or do not support.

Ms. Graybeal also noted there was a public meeting held for local property owners on the Frazier Bend National Register nomination back in October. Our consultant, Gail Guyman hopes to complete a Draft document by February of 2013 which will go to a regional reviewer in Atlanta for a possible final official notice by August 2013.

Ms. Graybeal also announced that there has been an Amendment to the Historic Zoning Commission Code that regulates membership requirements in order to bring the Code into compliance with state legislation. Subsequently, there needs to be one Historic Zoning Commissioner that also sits on the Metropolitan Planning Commission. This is being explored by the MPC staff with MPC Commissioners.

Ms. Graybeal also noted Comm. Gresham’s term has expired though the County has yet to name a replacement. She also noted Comm. Eid’s term has also expired but he indicated he was in the process of being re-appointed at the next City Council meeting.

Ms. Graybeal also noted that a Level 1 replacement COA came in after the staff reports went out that she approved. The owners at Crescent Bend on Kingston Pike are replacing the original slate roof shingles with new in-kind slate roof shingles and as such, a staff approvable Level 1 COA.

There was no other business and the meeting was adjourned.