

MINUTES
KNOXVILLE HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION
KNOX COUNTY HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION
MEETING OF JULY 19, 2012

City HZC Present

Sean Bolen
Scott Busby
Faris Eid
Sandra Martin
Lorie Matthews
Melissa McAdams
Andie Ray
Jason Woodle

County HZC Present

Linda Claussen
Steve Cotham
Charles Faulkner
Carol Montgomery

Others Present:

Mike Reynolds
Arin Streeter
Tom Donaldson
Peter Breazeale
Luke Wilkerson
Melvin Wright
Dori Caron

Members Absent

Melynda Whetsel (ex.)

Members Absent

Kenneth Gresham (ex.)

Commission Chair Scott Busby called the meeting to order. He noted to the attendees that the meeting was being broadcast as well as recorded and to please speak clearly. All attendees that wished to speak on an Agenda item were sworn in by Comm. Chair Busby. Attendees were also reminded to please sign in prior to speaking. Roll call was taken.

Action: A Motion was made by Comm. Bolen and seconded by Comm. Matthews to approve the June 21, 2012 minutes. The Motion carried unanimously.

Reports to Commission: Melvin Wright, Lisa Hatfield, Chair Scott Busby. There were no reports to the Commission.

Staff Reports (Levels I, II, III & IV): Mike Reynolds, Planner II, MPC, *for Kaye Graybeal, MPC Historic Preservation Planner.* There was no discussion.

Presentations and updates: none

CITY of KNOXVILLE HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION

Fairmont Park Neighborhood Conservation District (NC-1)

1716 Emoriland Boulevard –# 061412FPK

Approval to construct 19' x 19' freestanding carport to rear of house. Frame structure to be built of 8 x8 pressure-treated posts. Features and details include hipped roof, exposed rafter tails, curved brackets, and lattice panels on the sides.

Discussion: Owner representative, Peter Breazeale was present and had no additional information to share. (Comm.) Steve Cotham, neighborhood representative, noted the neighborhood is very supportive and happy with the work being done and supports the staff recommendation.

Mr. Reynolds noted that it may be appropriate to clarify the driveway specifications as part of the motion.

Action: Comm. Bolen moved that the submitted application be approved based on the evidence submitted and the information provided in the staff report with the modification clarifying that the concrete driveway replacing the concrete tire strips be 9 feet wide with a brushed finish. The Motion was seconded by Comm. Eid. The Motion carried unanimously.

Fourth and Gill Neighborhood (H-1)

812 Gratz Street -# 0702124G

Approval to install wooden tapered 8" porch columns w/polyurethane Doric-style column base and "Scamozzi"-style scrolled capital as indicated on submitted spec sheet. Install new 36"-high wood balustrade with approximate 2-1/2- inch turned balusters at approximately 5" on center.

Discussion: The owner representative, Luke Wilkerson, contractor, confirmed that he had spoken with Kaye Graybeal, MPC Historic Preservation Planner, and had agreed to use either 9-inch or 10- inch wooden tapered porch columns instead of the originally proposed 8-inch columns. Mr. Wilkerson had no further comments. Mr. Reynolds noted that the staff recommendation would reflect the change in column diameter. He further noted there would be a total of 11 posts.

Neighborhood representative, Arin Streeter, was present and stated the neighborhood was generally in agreement with the staff recommendation and noted with regards to the capitals, the neighborhood was comfortable with staff making the judgment that ones made of alternative materials were compatible with the original capitals. Comm. Bolen inquired if the owners had discussed replacing the porch flooring, currently plain decking, with the more traditional tongue and groove flooring, noting that going forward, now would be a more cost effective time to replace the floor. Mr. Wilkerson stated that they had not approached him about replacement of the floor. He stated he could approach them about the floor. A brief discussion ensued noting that replacement of the floor with tongue and groove would not be a condition of approval of the application but including it in the approval would allow the owners to proceed with replacement of the floor without having to come back before the Commission. Melvin Wright stated that the proposed balustrade was code compliant.

Action: Comm. Eid moved that the submitted application be approved based on the evidence submitted and the information provided in the staff report with the above noted modification of using 9-inch or 10-inch wooden tapered porch columns and allowing for replacement of the existing front porch decking with sloping tongue and groove decking if the owner chooses to do so in the future. The Motion was seconded by Comm. Woodle.

Further Discussion: Mr. Wilkerson, noting the high cost of the capitals, stated that he had discussed with the owners using the existing capitals to make a mold of them in order to replicate them himself. He asked if that alternative would be allowable as a potential option. It was clarified that this would be "replacing in kind" with a slightly different material to allow for a longer life of the capitals. Mr. Streeter noted the neighborhood

would support a plaster to plaster molded capital and agreed it would be a Level I project. A discussion ensued noting replication of the original capitals would indeed be preferable.

Action: Comm. Woodle withdrew his second of the original Motion.

Action: Comm. Eid moved that the submitted application be approved based on the evidence submitted and the information provided in the staff report with the modifications to allow for the front porch: 9-inch or 10-inch wooden tapered porch columns in lieu of 8 inch columns, the use of capitals molded from the original capitals with the specific materials used to mold the capitals be first approved by staff, and for replacement of the existing porch floor decking with sloping tongue and groove flooring if the owner chooses to do so in the future. The Motion was seconded by Comm. Ray. The Motion carried unanimously.

704 Haynes Place - # 0709124G

Approval to add wood frame 3/1 true-divided light double-hung window on south wall of rear addition. Renew 4-15-08 COA to reconstruct porch to match original, complete siding, replace east french door and sidelight, and repair central door assembly.

Discussion: Mr. Reynolds clarified that this approval was to renew the 4-15-2008 COA with the modification to relocate a window from the east elevation to the south elevation (rear). Owner representative, Tom Donaldson was present and stated they are on track with the project and have just received a final approval for the rough-in on the electrical work. He also noted he was expecting the same approval for the plumbing work today and hence, they will now move forward with those aspects of the project.

Arin Streeter, neighborhood representative, stated the neighborhood supports the staff recommendation and is excited to see the project move forward.

A brief discussion ensued clarifying where the project was with respect to both the original 2008 and 2010 COAs.

Action: Comm. Ray moved to approve the submitted application based on the evidence submitted and the information provided in the staff report. The Motion was seconded by Comm. Eid. The Motion carried unanimously.

Comm. Chair Busby noted that Dan Brown, the Certified Local Government Coordinator for the Tennessee Historical Commission will be attending the August 16, 2012 meeting and speaking afterwards.

Action: A Motion was made by Comm. Eid and seconded by Comm. Ray to adjourn the meeting. The Motion carried unanimously and the meeting was adjourned.