

**MINUTES  
KNOXVILLE HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION  
KNOX COUNTY HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION  
MEETING OF AUGUST 16, 2012**

**City HZC Present**

Sean Bolen  
Scott Busby  
Faris Eid  
Lorie Matthews  
Sandra Martin  
Melissa McAdams  
Andie Ray  
Melynda Whetsel  
Jason Woodle

**County HZC Present**

Linda Claussen  
Steve Cotham  
Charles Faulkner  
Kenneth Gresham  
Carol Montgomery

**Others Present:**

Kaye Graybeal  
Arin Streeter  
James Pierce  
Greg Peterson  
Scott Schimmel  
Dori Caron  
Lisa Hatfield  
Melvin Wright

**Members Absent**

none

**Members Absent**

none

Commission Chair Scott Busby called the meeting to order and noted there was a quorum. Comm. Chair Busby stated that the meeting was being televised and recorded. He also asked that speakers limit their presentations to 5 minutes. Comm. Chair Busby then swore in all visitors and applicants that planned to speak on any Agenda item. Roll call was taken. Comm. Chair Busby then introduced Monte Stanley, who is the Mayor's nominee for the HZC, but not yet confirmed by the County Commission. Mr. Stanley was present to observe the Commission proceedings.

Comm. Chair Busby then introduced Dan Brown, the Certified Local Government (CLG) Coordinator with the Tennessee Historical Commission and noted that Mr. Brown would be presenting the work session information immediately following this meeting.

**Action: A Motion was made by Comm. Whetsel and seconded by Comm. McAdams to approve the July 19, 2012 Minutes with the correction. The Motion carried unanimously.**

Reports to Commission: Melvin Wright, Lisa Hatfield, Chair Scott Busby: There were no reports to the Commission.

Staff Reports (Levels I, II, III & IV): Kaye Graybeal, MPC Historic Preservation Planner

**Decertification of portions of the H-1 Historic Overlay District**

9320 Kingston Pike (portion of the Kennedy-Baker-Walker-Sherrill House H-1 Overlay boundaries)

**Discussion:** Ms. Graybeal stated that the Applicant for one Agenda item, Decertification of Portions of the H-1 Historic Overlay District for the Kennedy-Baker-Walker-Sherrill House, has asked to postpone the Commission’s consideration of the request to rezone portions of the property until the September meeting. Ms. Graybeal further stated that the MPC’s recommendation was denial of the current Application and the Applicant is researching other options and site plan arrangements. Both the HZC and the MPC’s recommendations will go to City Council but not until their October meeting at the earliest.

**Action: A Motion was made by Comm. Busby and seconded by Comm. Eid to accept the Applicant’s request to postpone the Application until the September 2012 HZC meeting. The Motion carried unanimously.**

Comm. Bolen requested that a copy of the site plan be provided.

**CITY of KNOXVILLE HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION**

**Old North Knoxville Historic District (H-1)**

**1408 Armstrong Avenue #072512ONK**

APPROVAL to replace windows in-kind with simulated-divided lights with shadow bars, add rubberized roofing to front dormer roofs, and replace shingle siding in-kind.

DENIAL to replace shingle siding w/cementitious siding until mocked-up on site.

**Discussion:** Ms. Graybeal noted the uniqueness of the house and noted there were examples of the deteriorated shingles for review. She noted the guidelines do not support the use of substitute materials to replace siding. The owner’s representative, Greg Peterson, contractor, was present. Mr. Peterson brought a mock-up of the proposed cementitious shingles. Mr. Peterson noted he could adequately simulate the look of the house with this product. He stated his intention was to give the owner an original look but with less maintenance and increased energy efficiency. This included replacing the windows with ones that will duplicate the look of the originals. He further noted there was no insulation and that he would be insulating the entire home.

James Pierce, ONK neighborhood representative, noted that the neighborhood supports the staff recommendation to deny the use of artificial siding. He further noted again the uniqueness of the cedar shingles in the neighborhood that are original to the house. Mr. Pierce also stated that the design guidelines simply do not support the use of any materials other than the original. He noted that cedar shingles would be stained where the proposed cementitious ones would be painted. With regards to the window replacements, Mr. Pierce noted that the neighborhood felt that there needs to be more research done on whether the original windows could be restored and or repaired and that there is not enough evidence to warrant full window replacement. He further noted

introducing storm windows would increase the energy efficiency of properly maintained wooden windows which would further maintain the original look of the house. Mr. Pierce also stated that with regard to the dormers, the neighborhood would like to avoid any change in pitch in the roof and they would support the application of a membrane to address the moisture issue. He further stated that gutter repair should be addressed as well and since the house has half-round gutters presently that half-round gutters need to be used as replacements.

Comm. Bolen noted that the Commission addressed some issues with this home approximately a year ago and dormers were discussed at that time. His recollection was with respect to what was identified as a design flaw, that the Commission approved a slight change in roof slope below the window and that this would still be acceptable. Comm. Bolen noted that the Commission cannot deny the replacement of windows with in-kind windows although he agreed that blanket replacement may not be as ideal as repairing and restoring the original ones. Mr. Peterson stated they would use half round gutters but he would like to change the way the gutters are directed. It was clarified that gutter replacement would only require a Level 1 approval. Mr. Peterson also stated he would be replacing the railings with identical (in-kind) railings that he will build. He further noted that the house has been painted approximately ten times and stated he would use cedar shingles.

**Action: Comm. Bolen moved that the submitted application be denied based on the evidence submitted and the information provided in the staff report. Comm. Bolen further moved to approve the replacement of the windows in-kind with wooden double-pane simulated- divided- lights of the same size and configuration with shadow bars or with single pane true divided lights, approve replacing the shingle siding in-kind with cedar shingles and same reveals, and approve the use of a rubberized membrane on the roof above the front dormers maintaining the current slope. Comm. Bolen encouraged the Applicant to meet with MPC staff and review the approved slope below the dormers. Comm. Bolen further moved to approve the replacement of half-round gutters in-kind. It was clarified that the owner can paint or stain the new cedar shingles. Additionally, it was clarified that the entire replacement window and sash need to be the same as the original profile. Mr. Peterson stated that he would not install the rubberized membrane at this point but proposed that he use copper over the dormers that matches the half-round gutters. The Motion was seconded by Comm. Eid. The Motion carried unanimously.**

#### **221 E. Oklahoma Avenue # 071812ONK**

APPROVAL for demolishing non-contributing rear sun porch and constructing new porch addition and roof dormer as per submitted drawing. Install skylight behind rear chimney. Install sash window in place of vent in west roof gable.

It was clarified that the staff report notes 4<sup>th</sup> and Gill Guidelines but the applicable actually guidelines are those of Old North Knoxville.

**Discussion:** Owner representative, Arin Streeter was present. Mr. Streeter noted that in discussion with the neighborhood representative, James Pierce, the most pressing issue with the Application is the visibility of the corner of the proposed skylight. Mr. Streeter stated he feels the small amount of the corner of the skylight, visible only from one particular angle, is minor given the increased usability of the home it would provide. He further stated that no original materials will be removed with the installation of the skylight. Mr. Pierce was present and stated the neighborhood agreed with staff recommendation to approve the addition as it meets all requirements of the design guidelines. He noted the guidelines state that a skylight should not be visible from the street; however, deferred to the Commission to decide if it was acceptable. He further noted that he did not get any input from the neighborhood regarding the skylight. Ms. Graybeal noted that staff is recommending approval of the skylight as the visibility is minimal and has little effect on the integrity of the streetscape or the house. It was clarified that the rendering of the skylight is hand-drawn and approximate. Mr. Streeter noted the skylight will be colored to match the shingles and further noted that it will be the narrowest profile available. He also stated that a smaller skylight would not be effective and the one proposed is the smallest practical skylight for the room. Comm. Busby noted that the skylight corner was not continuously nor prominently visible. It was further stated that it is on the side of the roof, not the front.

**Action: Comm. McAdams moved that the submitted application be approved based on the evidence submitted and the information provided in the staff report. The Motion was seconded by Comm. Martin. Comm. Woodle restated that the rendering of the skylight was only an estimation of visibility not a photo of the actual one proposed. The Motion carried with Comms. Bolen, Whetsel and Woodle voting no.**

#### **Fourth and Gill Neighborhood (H-1)**

##### **930 Luttrell Street #0730124G**

APPROVAL to replace front door, balcony balustrade and two inappropriate windows on north side w/wood 1/1 double-hung windows. Add triptych wood 1/1 double-hung windows on rear and fill in late rear window opening. Add lattice-type brickwork at front porch foundation.

**Discussion:** Scott Schimmel, owner and Applicant, was present. Mr. Schimmel passed out additional photos. He noted they would be glad to keep the diamond shingle-pattern on the balustrades. He stated that the front door had been re-hung with a narrower one sometime in the past and they believe the opening would actually accommodate a wider door. It was noted that the voids in the foundation were not approved and the proposed lattice-type brickwork at the front porch foundation was much more appropriate. It was further noted that there is no evidence that the current door was original and the proposed door replacement was also appropriate. Mr. Schimmel stated the porch would be redone at a later date. It was clarified that the windows replaced on the left side of the house will be wood and of the same size configuration as other original window on the house and the windows on the right elevation would be shorter to match more closely the ones on

the left elevation. Further clarified was that the windows on the right elevation were not original.

Neighborhood representative Arin Streeter stated that the neighborhood was generally agreement with staff recommendation. He noted that the side panels of the front door may be original and that the neighborhood would like the replacement to reflect the original configuration.

**Action: Comm. Whetsel moved that the submitted application be approved based on the evidence submitted and the information provided in the staff report. The Motion was seconded by Comm. Ray. The Motion carried unanimously.**

Other business:

Kaye Graybeal noted that the MPC staff report as well as the site plan for the Kennedy-Baker-Walker-Sherrill House will be included in the appropriate upcoming Agenda Packet.

### **KNOXVILLE & KNOX COUNTY ZONING ORDINANCE AMENDMENTS (Summary)**

To conform with state enabling legislation regarding the membership composition and appointments process for the Historic Zoning Commissions.

Ms. Graybeal stated that there are upcoming changes regarding appointments to both the Knoxville and Knox County Historic Zoning Commissions and reviewed the new processes. The new Commissioners must be appointed by the Mayor(s), confirmed by the City Council or County Commission respectively, and there must be representation by a member of the Metropolitan Planning Commission. This amendment has been approved by the MPC by consent and goes before City Council at their September meeting, probably as a Consent Agenda item as well.

Ms. Graybeal also noted as we are a certified local government, we are eligible for grant funding, expert technical assistance and coordination with other supportive entities. Mr. Dan Brown is our CLG coordinator from the Tennessee Historical Commission and conducts training sessions statewide. He was there to conduct our workshop immediately following the meeting.

**Action: A Motion was made by Comm. Ray and seconded by Comm. Chair Busby to adjourn. The Motion carried unanimously.**

Adjourn to Work Session (remain in Small Assembly Room)  
(with Certified Local Government Coordinator, Dan Brown)