

MINUTES
KNOXVILLE HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION
KNOX COUNTY HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION
MEETING OF SEPTEMBER 15, 2011

City HZC Present

Sean Bolen
Scott Busby
Faris Eid
Lorie Huff
Sandra Martin
Melissa McAdams
Andie Ray
Melynda Whetsel

County HZC Present

Steve Cotham
Kenneth Gresham
Carol Montgomery

Others Present

Lisa Hatfield
Jessica Wright
Bernadette West
Mark Donaldson
Buz Johnson
Mike Reynolds
Charlotte West

Members Absent

Finbarr Saunders (ex.)

Members Absent

Linda Claussen (ex.)
Charles Faulkner (ex.)

Co Chair Scott Busby called the meeting to order and reminded members regarding conflicts of interest.

MOTION BY EID AND SECOND BY BOLEN TO APPROVE THE AUGUST 18 MINUTES. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

Mr. Bolen asked Lisa Hatfield regarding Andie Ray's house being built in his neighborhood. If she has recused herself, is it acceptable for him to talk about her house. Ms. Hatfield stated that would be fine.

Staff Report (Level I Certificates and other): Mike Reynolds

817 Eleanor Street - 4th and Gill H-1 - Martha Olsen (Applicant) – Certificate No. 825114GA - Repair foundation and replace tongue and groove porch flooring in kind as necessary. (Repeat of certificate issued in 2008 and since expired.)

804 N. Fourth Avenue - 4th and Gill H-1 - Martha Olsen (Applicant) – Certificate No. 825114GB - Repair foundation wall using provisions of Preservation Brief No. 2; reroof porch, replacing asphalt shingles in kind.

815 Gill Avenue - 4th and Gill H-1 - William Morris (Applicant) – Certificate No. 808114G - Replace asphalt shingle roof in kind; replace gutters and downspouts in kind; rebuild chimneys from roof up using original brick and low-Portland content mortar.

800 Wells Avenue - 4th and Gill H-1 - Elisabeth Dossey (Applicant) – Certificate No. 830114G - Replacement of wood siding in kind, as needed.

1013 Tulip Avenue - Mechanicsville H-1 - Laura Johnson (Applicant) – Certificate No. 81911MEC - Reroof and install gutters, matching shingles and gutters damaged by storms.

242 Deaderick Avenue - Mechanicsville H-1 - Zongming Cheng (Applicant) –Certificate No. 82611MEC - Repair or replace siding in kind; repair windows as necessary; repair original or replace and duplicate original porch columns; replace gutters and downspouts; repair or replace roof material if necessary; replace crawl space door.

1017 Oak Avenue - Mechanicsville H-1 - Tom Miller (Applicant) – Certificate No. 80811MEC - Repair siding and trim, in kind, as necessary. Reroof, using asphalt or dimensional shingles to replace asphalt shingles, or using metal roofing if feasible. Tuckpoint chimneys, using low-Portland mortar per Preservation Brief No. 2.

602 S. Gay Street – General - Keith Stewart The Burwell Owner’s Condominium Association – Certificate No. 81111GEN - Install balconies at several locations on south and east building facades, as shown on attachments; no balconies are to be installed on the south elevation, buff colored brick. Door glass in balcony access doors to be configured to reflect the window pane configuration, and removed windows to be stored. Balconies to be tube steel, suspended with cables from sides of building, requiring window removal and installation of full glass door to gain access to balcony. Width of balconies to encompass width of two windows on east elevations.

1365 Armstrong Avenue - Old North Knoxville H-1 - Michael Harding/Neely Realty Partnership (Applicant) – Certificate No. 82211ONK - Repair and replace roof in kind; repair siding and trim as necessary, in kind.

224 W. Glenwood Avenue - Old North Knoxville H-1 J & S Construction (Charlie Paul Applicant) – Certificate No. 81111ONKA - Reroof, replacing asphalt shingles In kind; Repair window screens.

501 E. Oklahoma Avenue - Old North Knoxville H-1 Canopy Construction (Stephen Salim Applicant) - Certificate No.81211ONK - Replace asphalt shingle roof in kind.

Certificates of Appropriateness

KNOXVILLE HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION

Mechanicsville H-1

1017 Oak Avenue – Tom Miller (Applicant/Owner) – Certificate No. 80811MEC

Work Description

Replace concrete block front steps with wood steps with wood risers. Add wood side steps to

access driveway and side yard. Replace modern porch rail with more appropriate wood or iron porch rail, with applicant to submit final design prior to September 1, 2011 deadline.

Staff Recommendation

APPROVE Certificate No. 80811MEC as follows:

- 1) APPROVE repairing siding and trim, in kind, as necessary. Reroof, using asphalt or dimensional shingles, or metal roofing if feasible. Tuckpoint chimneys, using mortar per Preservation Brief No. 2 (Certificate 80811MEC issued for Level I on 8/8/2011).
- 2) APPROVE the replacement of the existing concrete porch steps and with wood steps and wood risers.
- 3) APPROVE the addition of wood steps and wood risers the left side of the porch.
- 4) APPROVE the replacement of modern porch rail with either of the three wood porch rail options shown as attached.

Mr. Bolen asked if adding a side step on the porch is allowed by the Mechanicsville guidelines. Mike Reynolds stated it meets the present guidelines and the new ones have not been approved yet. Mr. Bolen stated that the railings do not have to meet building code requirements because they are low enough to the ground.

MOTION BY BOLEN AND SECOND BY HUFF TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION AND TO RECOMMEND TO THE HOMEOWNER (1) PREFER HISTORIC HEIGHT ON RAILING AND PREFER OPTIONS 1 OR 2 OVER OPTION 3. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

4th & Gill H-1

726 Deery Street – Josh Wright (applicant/owner), Certificate No. 819114G

Work Description

Modification to previously approved Certificate No. 218104G to insert turned columns on front porch, with brackets as shown on attached materials, modify rear elevation and deck as shown in photos, using full view glass doors, both paired and single, and to install privacy fencing and paving in rear yard.

Staff Recommendation

APPROVE Certificate No. 819114G as follows:

- 1) Install turned columns on front porch, with brackets as shown on attached materials (modification to Certificate No. 218104&G).
- 2) Modify rear elevation and deck as shown in photos, using full glass doors, both paired and single, and to install a wood privacy fence and paving in rear yard.

Mike Reynolds stated the new design for the decorative porch columns are appropriate because it simplifies the design which is more appropriate for this house style. The removal of the window windows and new doors on the back house are fine because they are on the rear.

Melynda Whetsel stated that Arin Streeter has reviewed this application, and the Fourth and Gill Neighborhood Board also reviewed it and is in agreement with the proposal. Carol Montgomery asked if the fence meets that guidelines and Mike Reynolds responded that as long as it is on the rear it is acceptable.

Jessica Wright, 111 N. Central Street, is the owner. Whetsel asked if they plan to build on the vacant lot next door. Ms. Wright stated they do not have any plans to build on that lot at this time, but bought the house and lot with the anticipation of building on the lot.

MOTION BY EID AND SECOND BY WHETSEL TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION. THE MOTION PASSED UNANIMOUSLY.

Market Square H-1

407 Union Avenue – Architects Wright (Josh Wright applicant), Market Square Hotel LLC (owner) – Certificate No. 81911MKT

Work Description

Modify previously approved sign request which located sign on corner of building; sign is installed and is on south elevation, second story.

Staff Recommendation

Certificate No. 81911MKT as submitted with sign on south elevation, second story (see attachments).

Additional Comments

The sign was originally approved to be located at the corner of the building. The sign was installed on the second story of the south elevation of the building, near the corner. This application is to request approval for the installed location. The sign design as installed is the same as approved.

Reynolds stated that staff feels the current location is appropriate.

Jessica Wright, 111 N. Central Street, is the applicant. Bolen thanked the applicant for coming back and going through the proper channels to be approved.

MOTION BY WHETSEL AND SECOND BY MARTIN TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

Other Business

28 Market Square

Mike Reynolds talked to Bernadette West and Ann Bennett regarding how the rooftop plantings fit into the approved certificate. Mr. Reynolds, in concert with Anne Bennett, determined the plantings do not violate the certificate. Plantings are not in the guidelines and do not require a building permit. If the planters were visible it might make a difference.

Andie Ray stated there has been misinformation in the press that we did not want flowers on the roof. The concern is whether it is a planter or planting. On other projects, the interpretation of a planter included plantings. Only umbrellas and awnings were discussed at the February meeting. Other applicants had to meet these guidelines. Her concern is Market Square needs to look at their guidelines. Mike Reynolds stated that we need to look at railing issues. Anything that requires a permit needs more scrutiny.

Melynda Whetsel resents that the commission is scrutinized about talking about flowers and plants. It is regrettable that we are discussing plantings. The strong relationship between the applicants and the HZC need to be maintained because it is this relationship that creates trust that each party is acting in goodwill. Sean Bolen stated that the commission has no say over plants, but might have misstated our motion. We just enforce guidelines. We agreed to have Preservation Pub come back to authorize what is up there. Codes gave them a stop work order, and we were following protocol. Andie Ray responded that Market Square is very visible with so many pedestrians, and when things happen there, people are concerned. The commission reviewed Regions Bank, and they came back with no issues. Sean Bolen stated that when the commission makes a decision, they should be consistent.

Sean Bolen stated that any level II that has expired should come before the HZC again. The one on the agenda was automatically approved. Mike Reynolds responded that regarding 602 Gay Street, the property owner already had a crane on Gay Street and found out the certificate had expired. The property owner was going to comply with the expired certificate and was therefore approved to reduce any hardship. Typically a level II will come back before the HZC.

Melynda Whetsel stated we need to be consistent and agrees with Sean Bolen.

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned.