

MINUTES
KNOXVILLE HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION
KNOX COUNTY HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION
MEETING OF NOVEMBER 17, 2011

City HZC Present

Sean Bolen
Scott Busby
Faris Eid
Lorie Huff
Sandra Martin
Melissa McAdams
Finbarr Saunders
Melynda Whetsel

Members Absent

Andie Ray (ex.)

County HZC Present

Steve Cotham
Carol Montgomery

Members Absent

Linda Claussen (ex.)
Charles Faulkner (ex.)
Kenneth Gresham (ex.)

Others Present:

Lisa Hatfield
Melvin Wright
Mike Reynolds
Arin Streeter
Indya Kincannon
John Mahaffey
Jana Sheckles
Mark Donaldson
Charlotte West

Chair Finbarr Saunders called the meeting and reminded members regarding conflicts of interest. He stated he was elected to City Council and will resign from the HZC after the December meeting. Next month is election of officers.

He announced that Charlotte West is retiring tomorrow from MPC and thanked her for her service.

Bolen announced the Old North Knoxville tour will be held on December 3 and 4 and invited everyone to attend.

MOTION BY BUSBY AND SECOND BY EID TO APPROVE THE OCTOBER 20 MINUTES, ADDING THAT 522 E. OKLAHOMA WAS APPROVED UNANIMOUSLY. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

628 Luttrell Street - 4th & Gill H-1 - Max Grogan (Applicant/Owner) – Certificate No. 1011114G - Replacement of wood porch flooring, in-kind.

706 Luttrell Street - 4th & Gill H-1 - Adam Scott – (Applicant/Owner) – Certificate No. 1031114G -Add new deck to rear of house made of wood or trex material; approximately 6 feet deep by 30 feet wide.

710 Deery Street - 4th & Gill H-1 - Joe MacDonald – (Applicant) – Certificate No. 1006114G - Replace front porch roof with new metal roof materials to match. Repair all wood windows and add new metal storm windows. Repair damaged siding, fascia, trim and soffit as needed, in-kind. Add new aluminum five inch k-style gutters and downspouts.

831 Deery Street - 4th & Gill H-1 - Andrew Schaeffer (Applicant/Owner)– Certificate No. 101111A4G - In-kind replacement of roof.

941 Eleanor Street - 4th & Gill H-1 - Ken Bronson Construction (Applicant) – Certificate No.1025114G - Level I (approved 10/25/2011) - Replace existing 3-tab asphalt shingles with new 3-tab or dimensional asphalt shingles. Replace existing EPDM roof in front of the roof dormer with new EPDM roof or flat metal roof. Repair front porch beam, trim and soffit in-kind, as needed. Replace existing front porch EPDM roof with new EPDM roof. Replace plywood soffits on second story with new plywood in-kind, as needed. Replace bead board soffit above second story bay window on the front façade in-kind, as needed. Replace wood trim along roofline on second story in-kind, as needed. Replace guttering in-kind, as needed.

1306 Kenyon Street - Old North Knoxville H-1 - Susan Simpson (Applicant/Owner)– Certificate No. 100711ONK - Repair and replace wood siding and cedar shingles on upper sides of the house in-kind, as needed. Restore or replace window trim in-kind, as needed.

309 E. Oklahoma Avenue - Old North Knoxville H-1 - Kerns Construction Inc., David Kerns (Applicant/Owner) – Certificate No. 110111ONK - Replace existing asbestos shingle roof on front of house with faux slate roof to match existing on back half of house. (Note: This is an emergency approval because of a leaking roof.)

417 Clark Street - Mechanicsville H-1 - Melissa Hornsby (Applicant/Owner) – Certificate No. 101811 MEC - Repair wood porch flooring in-kind.

1531 Forest Avenue - Fort Sanders H-1 - Armstrong Properties (Applicant/Owner) – Certificate No. 101011FTS - Repair and/or replace existing wood railing, steps and decking as needed, in-kind. Repair or replace all rotten siding as needed, in-kind. Replace asphalt with new asphalt shingles. Replace existing double hung one-over-one aluminum windows with new one-over-one double hung windows of the same size. Add metal storm windows, as needed.

- Certificates of Appropriateness

KNOXVILLE HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION

4th & Gill H-1

941 Eleanor Street – Ken Bronson Construction (Owner) - Indya Kincannon (Applicant) – Certificate No. 1025114G

Work Description

Replace integrated guttering on front porch with new design as approved by the Historic Zoning Commission. Replace wood front porch steps with poured concrete steps. Replace existing front porch EPDM roof with new standing seam metal roof.

Staff Recommendation

APPROVE Certificate No. 1025114G subject to the following: 1) the gutter system on the front porch be stabilized in its current design or the integrated gutter system be recreated.

Additional Comments

In regard to the gutters, the Secretary of Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation state, "Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials."

Indya Kincannon, 941 Eleanor Street, is the owner and stated she values living in a historic district and wants to protect her old home. The gutters are not working and water flows off the roof and does not go into the gutters; the water passes over the gutters. She passed around pictures showing the condition during a rain shower. She had to replace the soffit and fascia board, and she wants to save the house from water damage. John Mahaffey is the contractor, 7826 Lutton Lane, Corryton.

Bolen asked if the original design of the gutters was truly an integrated system. He stated that integrated systems were a flawed design and most have been covered up.

Arin Streeter, 935 Eleanor Street, stated that there used to be a wood crown in front of the gutter and there would have been a metal lining. He asked if they are doing this on the porch or entire house. Ms. Kincannon would like to change from integrated gutter to another type and is planning to do the entire house. Mr. Streeter stated that the neighborhood agrees with staff recommendation, but are not in favor of making the steps concrete when they never have been.

Eid stated that if the gutters were rebuilt, with proper flashing they could be made not to leak.

Whetsel agrees with staff recommendation to repair the gutters rather than replaced, along with allowing the metal standing seam roof. She tore up the concrete steps on her house because they cracked and were sinking. Concrete steps are so heavy they start to sink and wood is more appropriate. The guidelines do not mention steps. She suggested she repair the wood steps. Ms. Kincannon stated that will be fine to replace wood and not use concrete, and it would be more affordable. She is concerned that integrated gutters are a flawed design. The gutters do not move water away from the house. Whetsel stated that most houses in the neighborhood probably didn't have gutters at all and being that integrated gutters were original to this house is distinctive feature. Saunders stated that the commission is charged with enforcing the guidelines and sometimes the guidelines are not clear and the commission needs to interpret the guidelines, but in this case they are clear. Ms. Kincannon asked what the guidelines say if the original gutters have been modified significantly. Mr. Mahaffey stated the original gutter was removed and a modern metal gutter was put in its place. Bolen stated he would be willing to go by the house to take a look at the gutters and hear this again next month once the commission has a better understanding of the current condition. He stated has read about integrated gutters and they do fail. We might deny without prejudice and let some of the commissioners go look at the gutters.

McAdams stated that the gutters may be too small, and they have to do something to protect the house. Whetsel responded that the gutters will be removed and reconstructed in its current design, or the original design as staff recommends.

MOTION BY WHETSEL AND SECOND BY EID TO APPROVE THE APPLICATION AS SUBMITTED SUBJECT TO THE FOLLOWING: 1) THE GUTTER SYSTEM ON THE HOUSE BE STABILIZED IN ITS CURRENT DESIGN OR THE INTEGRATED GUTTER SYSTEM BE RECREATED, AND 2) THE WOOD FRONT PORCH STEPS BE REPLACE IN-KIND. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

Edgewood-Park City H-1

1721 Jefferson Avenue – Nancy Scott (Applicant/Owner) – Certificate No. 101711EDG

Work Description

Replace existing aluminum front door with new wood craftsman style door; Repair original windows; Add new gutters.

Staff Recommendation

APPROVE Certificate 101711EDG as submitted.

Additional Comments

The Edgewood/Park City Design Guidelines state, "An entrance door should be consistent with the design of the historic house, and should have a transom and sidelights, if those were included in the original design... If (the door) must be replaced, the replacement door should be wooden or painted to resemble wood, with appropriate recessed panels."

MOTION BY WHETSEL AND SECOND BY MARTIN TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

Market Square H-1

9 Market Square - Signco, Inc., Jana Sheckles (Applicant), Soccer Taco (Owner) – Certificate No. 110111MKT

Work Description

New wall sign with 18 inch tall letters and 11 feet 9 inches wide. The sign will be internally illuminated with LED lights.

Staff Recommendation

APPROVE Certificate No. 110111MKT subject to the following condition: 1) the storefront have no more than two signs.

Additional Comments

The Market Square Design Guidelines states that "A storefront shall not have more than two signs." This storefront currently has three signs; one hanging, one window and one awning.

Jana Sheckles, 3101 Northwest Park Drive, stated they are willing to meet the guidelines and to have only two signs. She is suggesting they take out the sign in the window.

Melvin Wright stated he has talked to the sign inspector and there can only be a total of 50 square feet of signage, which they are meeting.

Eid suggested the lettering be smaller.

MOTION BY BUSBY AND SECOND BY BOLEN TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

Other Items:

Mark Donaldson stated that MPC has hired a new historic planner to replace Ann Bennett, and she will start after Christmas. Her name is Kay Graybeal, and she has been the Director of Development Services in Wilmington, NC.

Saunders stated that if the commissioners have suggestions for officers to elect in December. Martin suggested that Busby be the chair for 2012. Whetsel suggested Martin for vice chair. Montgomery wants county to stay the same.

Saunders announced that because he was elected to City Council, he will be resigning from the commission after the December meeting. He has enjoyed his time on the commission. Martin thanked Saunders for his 25 years on the commission.

Whetsel announced that Lila Wilson died last week and had served on the commission for 19 years. She was a valuable member of the commission.

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned.