

MINUTES
KNOXVILLE HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION
KNOX COUNTY HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION
MEETING OF MAY 19, 2011

City HZC Present

Sean Bolen
Scott Busby
Lorie Huff
Sandra Martin
Melissa McAdams
Andie Ray
Finbarr Saunders
Melynda Whetsel

Members Absent

Faris Eid (ex.)

County HZC Present

Linda Claussen
Steve Cotham
Charles Faulkner
Kenneth Gresham

Members Absent

Carol Montgomery (ex.)

Others Present:

Lisa Hatfield
Melvin Wright
Mike Reynolds
James Pierce
Arin Streeter
Anne Wallace
Glenn Laiken
Kathy Ellis
Christopher King
Sean Martin
Rebecca McCurdy
George Fieser
Tom Dunavant
Mike Harding
Randall DeFord
Ann Bennett
Charlotte West

Chair Finbarr Saunders called the meeting to order and reminded members regarding conflicts of interest.

- Approval of April 21 minutes

MOTION BY BOLEN AND SECOND BY MARTIN TO APPROVE THE APRIL 21 MINUTES. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

Bolen raised a point he would like clarified about the Sunshine Law, noting that he had not talked with Ray about an agenda item because she is a member of the Commission, but also noting that Ray would recuse herself from voting on that item because she has a personal interest in it. Bolen wondered if the Sunshine Law prohibited him from talking to Ray concerning her item on the agenda, since she would not vote on that item. Hatfield will have to check and report back to the Commission on that point.

- Staff Report (Level I Certificates and other): Ann Bennett
611 Gill Avenue

Bennett stated that the house has been acquired by the city, and has suffered a fire and damages on the back. There are several hazardous conditions in the materials that are not original to the house; the city has requested a partial demolition permit in order to seal the

house and make it safe. Bennett issued a demolition permit, limited to those items that make the house unsafe and are not original to the building.

Kathy Ellis, City of Knoxville Community Development Office, stated that on May 6 she had requested a certificate to cover the partial demolition. The fire was contained to the rear portion of the house, and there is an extensive amount of damage on the left side of the house. The city is boarding it up for safety, and it is for sale. They will save everything they can. She distributed photos. Staff is bringing it up as a matter of information, but the matter has not been advertised and cannot be acted on; it will come before the Commission next month.

Bennett also distributed a draft copy of the proposed Mechanicsville Design Guidelines, noting it is finished except for final corrections, and that the neighborhood has not questioned the contents.

1701 Jefferson Avenue - Edgewood-Park City H-1 - Rebecca Loy – Certificate No. 41111EDG - Repair or replace as necessary trim, including rosettes at roof line, siding, fascia and soffit, all replacements to be identical in size and design; add risers to steps.

311 E. Scott Avenue - Old North Knoxville H-1 - Mike Jones, Paul Davis Restoration of Knoxville – Certificate No. 41511ONK - Repair damage to rear elevation roof from falling tree, including repairing damaged sheathing and rafters and replacing asphalt shingles with asphalt shingles. Repair or replace any fascia and soffit, or other trim, in kind, as needed.

- Certificates of Appropriateness

KNOXVILLE HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION

Market Square H-1

37 Market Square – Jim Odle, Odle & Young Architects (Applicant) - Glenn Laiken, Inc. - (Owner) - Certificate No. 505 MKT

Work Description

Modify signs above store windows by changing lettering coloring to black (on cream background).

Staff Recommendation

APPROVE Certificate No. 50511MKT as follows:

- 1) APPROVE the color change in lettering on the signboards above the windows on the north elevation.
- 2) APPROVE the installation of either signboard, lettering on surfboard as presented with this application.

3) APPROVE in concept the installation of a sign board, indirectly lit if possible, as the wall sign on the second floor recess at the northeast corner of the building facing Wall Avenue; APPROVE any of the three submitted designs for the signboard.

Ray stated that the Market Square Association met Monday night and reviewed the wall sign designs and felt the Volkswagen sign was the most appropriate. Busby asked about the sign guidelines for square footage. Bennett stated that a signboard maximum height is 2 ½ feet in width and can be across the storefront. There is no example for a 2nd story sign. She also noted that the building in question is a corner building, with a much larger façade and more locations for signage than interior buildings. Bolen thanked the applicant for being willing to include Market Square general information in their sign.

MOTION BY BOLEN AND SECOND BY MARTIN TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION AND ALLOW THEM TO USE ANY SIGN THEY SUBMITTED. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

Old North Knoxville H-1

410 E. Oklahoma Avenue – Sarah Beene (Applicant/Owner) - Certificate No. 50211ONK

Work Description

Construct 6x9 storage shed to be located in rear yard, with wood lap siding walls, end gable roof with wood shingles, wood board and batten door with flanking four light windows.

Staff Recommendation

APPROVE Certificate No. 50211ONK. Proposed shed is located in the rear yard, constructed of wood elements that conform to the adopted design guidelines, and not visible from Oklahoma.

James Pierce, 122 Leonard Place, stated that the neighborhood agrees with the staff recommendation.

MOTION BY RAY AND SECOND BY BUSBY TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

318 E. Oklahoma Avenue – Andie Ray and Noel Hudson (Applicant/Owner) - Certificate No. 50511ONKA

Work Description

Install wrought iron railing on south elevation and southernmost section of front and side wrap around porch; railing to match balcony railing on house.

Staff Recommendation

APPROVE Certificate No. 50511ONKA. Proposed porch railing is necessary to satisfy code requirements, and consistent with style of new building. It has the added benefit of calling attention to the central entry door.

Christopher King with Smee Busby Architects, 29 Market Square, stated that the railing on this portion of the house is necessary for safety and will address required building codes. The height of the side porch is determined by the natural topography.

James Pierce stated that the neighborhood agrees with the staff recommendation.

Bolen asked Mr. King where the railing is going. Mr. King responded that it is going to be installed on one bay of the front elevation, will turn the corner and continue across the side bays.

MOTION BY WHETSEL AND SECOND BY MARTIN TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION. THE MOTION CARRIED WITH RAY AND BUSBY RECUSING.

1000 Thompson Place – Russell and Rebecca McCurdy (Applicant/Owner) – Certificate No. 50511ONK

Work Description

- 1) Move exterior door on side porch fronting Armstrong. Door is currently to the right of the central entry and after work, will be centered on the entry. Original (or existing) door and transom will be reused and siding repaired in kind.
- 2) Rebuild side porch with like design and materials, including rebuilding and repointing brick foundation and repairing any structural damage, replacing damaged tongue and groove floor with same; repair or replace beadboard ceiling with same or similar materials.
- 3) Repair or replace rotten wood siding with like materials and design; repair or replace any trim boards with like materials and design.
- 4) Rebuild or repoint masonry as necessary including foundation, chimneys and other features, using provisions of Preservation Brief No. 2.

Staff Recommendation

APPROVE Certificate No. 50511ONK. Proposed changes are consistent with adopted Old North Knoxville Design Guidelines.

Rebecca McCurdy, 1000 Thompson Place, the porch door has been altered, and for historical accuracy, they would like to move the door to the center of the porch.

James Pierce stated that he looked at the property and could not tell if the door had been moved or not. It seems obvious the door should be in the center of the porch. When people work on old houses and take things off, if something is damaged and has to be replaced, they should come before the Commission. Bolen responded that he looked at the property, and agreed that the shadows remaining on the building show that the door was moved.

MOTION BY BOLEN AND SECOND BY WHETSEL TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

Fourth & Gill H-1

1121 Eleanor Street – Sean and Sarah Martin (Applicant/Owner) – Certificate No. 505114G

Work Description

- 1) Remove existing aluminum replacement window and vinyl siding and replace with new, wood, one-over-one double hung Pella Architect series window. Window will fill entire historic masonry opening.
- 2) Replace four additional wood double hung one over one windows on north elevation with new, wood, one-over-one double hung Pella Architect series windows. Use salvageable parts from removed windows to repair historic windows on front elevation.

Staff Recommendation

APPROVE Certificate No. 505114G, Sections 1 & 2. Section 1 change will correct improperly sized replacement window. Section 2 will allow retention of historic window fabric on windows visible from street.

Additional Comments

Proposed changes are consistent with the provisions of the adopted design guidelines for 4th & Gill that affect windows, (pg. 11).

Sean Martin, 1121 Eleanor Street, explained that replacing the bathroom window is on his immediate agenda. It does not have a storm window on it and has weathered badly. He eventually wants to replace the two windows in the back bedroom, salvaging elements from them to use on the front windows, which will be restored.

Arin Streeter, 120 S. Gay Street, stated there are no concerns in the neighborhood.

MOTION BY WHETSEL AND SECOND BY BOLEN TO APPROVE BOTH PARTS OF THE REQUEST. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

Edgewood Park City H-1

1600 Jefferson Avenue – George Fieser (Applicant/Owner) - Certificate No. 50311EDG

Work Description

Remove partial enclosure on front porch, returning front porch to original full width, and reinstalling brick piers and wood posts, tongue and groove porch floor, and bead board porch ceiling to match original; rebuild rear of structure to remove additions and construct single large room, with three sets of French doors facing rear yard and using exterior elements that include wood siding to match original wood siding; repair and restore windows, including the following (front façade-restore windows; east elevation-restore c. 1900 window and repair c. 1980 window; west elevation-restore both c.1900 windows; south elevation-install three pairs of French doors, with middle set functional); install salvage period-appropriate half-view front door; repair or replace any damaged wood siding, wood soffit and wood fascia, using wood material and original design; replace gutters.

Staff Recommendation

APPROVE Certificate No. 50311EDG. The proposed changes to the front porch would not have been approved after designation occurred, and are consistent with pg. 19, #s 1&2, of the adopted design guidelines. Rear changes are also appropriate.

Additional Comments

This corner house is the introduction to the Jefferson Avenue section of Edgewood-Park City on the west, and has been so altered on the front and rear elevations that its original architecture is obscured. The proposed changes, although they would alter the fabric that was originally part of the designation, would greatly improve the appearance of the house, correct some structural problems that are inherent in the current altered design, and return the house to a more appropriate appearance. The same is true of the proposed changes to the rear of the structure, and is consistent with the provisions that recommend changes on the rear when they are necessary, and with nos. 9 and 10 of the Secretary of Interior Guidelines included in the Edgewood-Park City Design Guidelines.

George Fieser, 2330 Woodbine Avenue, stated he wants to bring the house back to its original look and add the full front porch. He will be using the original single pane windows. The back room, which will be removed and rebuilt, has a 6 ½ foot ceiling. He wants to paint it the color it was in 1900.

Bennett received an email from a neighborhood resident who felt it was more appropriate to put turned wood columns on the front porch to emphasize the Victorian character of the building. Bennett stated that the Craftsman porch may well be the original, since houses in this era often combined Victorian styling with Craftsman elements. Even if that is not the case, the porch has acquired its own significance due to its age.

MOTION BY WHETSEL AND SECOND BY BOLEN TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

Ft. Sanders NC-1

1416 Forest Avenue – Neely Realty (Applicant/Owner) – Certificate No. 50511FTS

Work Description

Retain existing building; Remove existing deteriorated brick and reinstall red brick (contemporary wire cut, if possible); Reroof, removing chimneys; convert existing porch and access door on east elevation (sized at 2'4"x16') to two story bump out (sized at 4'6"x10'8") with hip roof (east side is not visible from Forest or James Agee); Construct two story rear addition on east read elevation, to be 12'x18' with an 8'x10' shed roofed porch with square wood columns to equal 8"x8", railing with 2"x2" sawn wood spindles set on 4"-5"centers, and set into top and bottom rails; Replace current windows with vinyl windows, retaining current pattern of windows (3-part and 2-part fronting James Agee and where applicable on Forest, with single windows flanking double windows on Forest Avenue elevation, second floor, with soldier course over windows and brick sills; remove fenestration on existing two story enclosed porch on northwest corner of building and rebuild as an integral part of the structure, retaining an entry door on the north elevation at the west side, which leads to an unroofed stoop. Reconstruct side porch fronting on James Agee with 6" square posts and railing patterned after description of rear porch, above; Install gutters.

Staff Recommendation

APPROVE Certificate No. 50511FTS. Proposals would result in saving the building with few alterations, correcting the structural problems and the problems with the displaced brick that is the brick veneer. The proposed additions are minimal.

Additional Comments

By creating additional structure where the enclosed two story corner porch now is, and to the rear of the building, the stability of the building can be improved.

Mike Harding, 2718 Painter Avenue, represents the owner of the property. Tim Dunavant stated they were here last month and talked about the structural deficiencies of the building. The brickwork has to come off for the repair. He showed the Commission a sample of the brick to be used.

Martin asked about the steps on the front elevation. Mr. Dunavant explained how the steps will go and stated there is not a soldier course there now, and he does not want to cut the brick. Busby suggested a porch where a metal awning was. Bennett asked Eid to make notes on the drawings, and she distributed the drawing of what he suggested.

Randall DeFord, 1511 Laurel Avenue, representing the Ft. Sanders neighborhood, thanked them for not demolishing the building. He reminded them that the guidelines require trees for every 50' of road frontage. They would like to see the brick to be at a soldier course level and to have windows on the east side and cornice returns on all gables. The windows should be three over one. Mr. Dunavant responded that he will use that type of window if he can find them. Bennett asked if he cannot find three over one, would they

prefer one over one. Ray thanked them for saving the building and working with the neighborhood. McAdams noted her preference for retaining the second story sleeping porch. Busby likes the low vertical windows.

Bolen thanked Mr. Harding and Mr. Dunavant for coming back and not demolishing the building. Mr. Dunavant asked if they can take chimneys down, and Bennett replied they can. Bolen is glad they are adding more windows. He added that there are very few examples of sleeping porches, and he does not want to see it covered. DeFord stated they do not think it was original. Dunavant responded that he felt they should match both sides, and he needs to rebuild that area. Everything is symmetrical, and he needs to do something to the corner porch.

MOTION BY BOLEN AND SECOND BY RAY TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION WITH MODIFICATIONS THAT THE WINDOWS BE ONE OVER ONE, SOLDIER COURSE AT THE FIRST FLOOR LEVEL, ADD AS MANY WINDOWS AS POSSIBLE ON THE EAST ELEVATION WITH AT LEAST TWO ON ONE SIDE OF THE SINGLE STORY WINDOW, PLANT TREES FOR EVERY 50 FEET, SHADE TREES SHOULD BE ADDED PER THE GUIDELINES, ORNAMENTAL TREES PLANTED IN THE FRONT AND BACK, AND ADD GABLE ENDS WITH PARTIAL CORNICE AND EAST AND SOUTH RETURNS.

AMENDMENT TO THE MOTION BY BUSBY AND SECOND BY MCADAMS TO REDESIGN THE LOWER LEVEL WINDOW ON THE FIRST FLOOR TO MIMIC THE EXISTING WINDOWS ON THE WEST ELEVATIONS.

THE MOTION AS AMENDED CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

Whetsel addressed additional concerns the Commission should discuss regarding paving front yards. Bennett stated that the guidelines emphasize new construction and do not mention rehabilitation of existing buildings. Provisions about front yards are in the new construction section. Engineering and codes will have to work this out. Yards sometimes are already graveled, and fencing could be installed to prevent parking. Bennett added that the Commission cannot vote on this issue today. Whetsel asked if the Commission could request help from City Engineering or Codes regarding this issue. Mr. DeFord stated that the guidelines deal with new and renovations on the page with parking and landscaping. This was intended not to be only to new construction but renovation, also. Bennett responded that on page 11 of the guidelines it mentions only in new construction. Bennett stated that Lisa Hatfield of the City Law Department could come back to another meeting to report on this issue. Mr. Harding stated they do not want occupants to park in front yards, and they may put trees there to stop students from parking there. He will work with the neighborhood on this.

GENERAL

402 11th Street – Tom Williams (Applicant/Owner) - Certificate No. 42111GEN

Work Description

Replace windows destroyed by fire and located on rear of building with wood two over two double hung windows; Replace existing rear metal door with half-view two panel metal door, increasing width.

Staff Recommendation

APPROVE Certificate No. 42111GEN. Proposed window changes are intended for windows that were destroyed by fire; the design is in keeping with the original windows. Proposed change to rear door is a change to a door that is not historic.

Additional Comments

All changes are to building elements on the rear of the building, not visible from 11th Street.

MOTION BY BOLEN AND SECOND BY BUSBY TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

Other Business

Designation: South High School – 953 S. Moody Avenue

Bennett stated that the owner had applied for demolition. In response to the demolition application, and recognizing the significance of the South High building, City Council had requested a designation to H-1. MPC has heard and approved the designation request; its recommendation, together with that of the Historic Zoning Commission, will be forwarded to City Council for their action.

MOTION BY WHETSEL AND SECOND BY RAY TO ENDORSE THE RECOMMENDATION TO REZONE THE PROPERTY TO H-1; MOTION TO ACCEPT DESIGN GUIDELINES. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

Saunders stated that the Commission needs to have training sessions every year. He suggested that they email Bennett when they are available for training.

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned.

The next meeting will be June 16 at 8:30 a.m. in the Small Assembly Room of the City County Building.