

MINUTES
KNOXVILLE HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION
KNOX COUNTY HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION
MEETING OF DECEMBER 15, 2011

City HZC Present

Sean Bolen
Scott Busby
Faris Eid
Lorie Huff
Sandra Martin
Melissa McAdams
Anyie Ray
Finbarr Saunders
Melynda Whetsel

Members Absent

County HZC Present

Steve Cotham
Linda Claussen

Members Absent

Carol Montgomery (ex.)
Charles Faulkner (ex.)
Kenneth Gresham (ex.)

Others Present:

Mark Donaldson
Melvin Wright
Mike Reynolds
Arin Streeter
James Pierce

Chair Finbarr Saunders called the meeting and reminded members regarding conflicts of interest.

MOTION BY WHETSEL AND SECOND BY EID TO APPROVE THE NOVEMBER 17 MINUTES. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

600 Morgan Street – 4th & Gill H-1 - Standard Wilson Corp. (Applicant/Owner) – Certificate No. 1108114G - New hanging sign made of painted wood like material with metal bracket; 9 square feet.

1355 Armstrong Avenue – Old North Knoxville H-1 – Kerns Construction (Applicant), Jeffrey Lockett (Owner) – Certificate No. 110911ONK – Reconstruct brick chimney using original brick and using Preservation Brief #2 for mortar.

1104 Luttrell Street – 4th & Gill H-1 – Jeff Talman (Applicant/Owner) – Certificate No. 1202114G - Replace existing asphalt roof with new asphalt roof; rebuilding two chimneys and repointing all existing brick using Preservation Brief #2; remove aluminum siding and repair/replace wood siding in-kind; remove existing rear stairs and replace with new stairs made of wood or synthetic wood material.

240 Scott Avenue – Old North Knoxville H-1 – Christine Sutherland (Applicant/Owner) – Certificate No. 12111ONK - Replace existing asphalt shingles on house with dimensional asphalt shingles. Replace existing metal roof on front porch with standing seam metal roof.

Certificates of Appropriateness

KNOXVILLE HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION

Edgewood-Park City H-1

2009 Washington Avenue – Jace Koelzer (Applicant/Owner) – Certificate No. 112311EDG

Work Description

Remodel existing one story garage, keeping block walls, creating a one and half story garage. Garage will have hardi siding that mimics that design of the wood siding on rear of the house. The roofing will be asphalt shingles to match the house. The garage doors will be made of simulated wood in a style similar as shown in the attached plans.

Staff Recommendation

APPROVE Certificate 112311EDG as submitted.

Additional Comments

The proposed garage renovation meets the requirements of the guidelines as stated in the Infill Building section of the Edgewood-Park City Design Guidelines (page 28-29).

Jace Koelzer, 2009 Washington Avenue, stated that he intends to create a garage that is much nicer than what is there now and one that will fit in with the neighborhood.

Mr. Saunders asked if the applicant has talked with neighbors about the plan. Mr. Koelzer stated that he has and everyone was pleased with the plan.

Mr. Bolen asked the applicant what type of material the door is proposed to be made of, and asked Mr. Reynolds what type of material is acceptable according to the guidelines? Mr. Koelzer stated the door will be made of vinyl and will have the look of an old door. Mr. Bolen stated the design is more Colonial than Victorian. Mr. Eid stated the roof slope is more than the house and the windows on the garage have multiple panes, where the house is one-over-one. Mr. Koelzer stated the garage windows will be one-over-one. Mr. Eid stated he is not concerned with the garage exactly matching the house.

Mr. Busby asked if the garage is visible from the street. Mr. Koelzer stated it is visible from the alley and the garage is not visible from the frontage street. Mr. Busby stated that the design presented does not match the style of the house.

Mr. Bolen stated that he would suggest coming back with a new design next month that compliments the design of the house.

Mr. Busby suggested removing the angled walls on either side of the garage to make it less Colonial. Ms. Whetsel added the angles on the garage door openings need to be removed also.

Ms. Ray stated the materials are consistent with the primary structure and it is in the rear yard, so should be commission be very concerned with the design? Mr. Bolen stated the commission

cannot take a stance on good versus bad architecture but it can require a design to meet the guidelines.

Mr. Reynolds read the guidelines for auxillary structures for the district.

Mr. Koelzer said that he likes the design as he presented it but if he is denied he will reconsider his options.

MOTION BY BUSBY AND SECOND BY WHETSEL TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION WITH THE FOLLOWING MODIFICATIONS: 1) REMOVE THE ANGLED WALLS ON EITHER SIDE OF THE GARAGE, AND 2) REMOVE THE ANGLED DESIGN ELEMENTS TO GARAGE DOOR OPENING.

Mr. Bolen asked what the guidelines state about garage door materials. Mr. Reynolds stated that the guidelines do not directly address garage door materials but the guidelines do allow for the consideration of vinyl windows.

THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

4th & Gill H-1

722 Luttrell Street – Carol Nickle (Applicant/Owner) – Certificate No. 1201114G

Work Description

Modification of a flat porch roof to a porch roof with a slope of 1.75 inch rise per 12 inch run. The roofing material will change from EPDM to asphalt shingles or metal standing seam.

Staff Recommendation

DENY Certificate No. 1201114G without prejudice.

Additional Comments

The Fourth and Gill Design Guidelines do not recommend changing original rooflines. In this case the porch has hipped roof with a very shallow slope. The porch roof at the highest point is close to the fascia board below the soffit. If the roof pitch is raised, the roofline may partially cover the soffit and will be visible from the front of the house (the roof is currently visible from the side street, though fairly unnoticeable). There is a need to create a cricket in the back right corner of the porch roof (above the door) to allow for proper drainage away from the house and solve a leaking issue. This cricket will not be visible from the street.

Carol Nickle, 722 Luttrell Street, stated the leak in the roof has been a problem for years. It was repaired once before but continues to leak.

Luke Wilkerson, 5216 Midlake Drive, stated that there is a separate contractor that is handling the structural elements of the work and put together the documents for the application.

Mr. Eid stated that his concern is that the slope proposed for the roof would still be too low to allow shingles and it would still leak. It seems that the issue is not having the cricket and not having proper flashing.

Arin Streeter, 925 Eleanor Street, stated the neighborhood is in agreement with the staff recommendation with the exception that they should be allowed to fix any sags in the roof and raise as long as the new roofline does not extend over the freeze board. The freeze board is completely visible from the street and should not be modified.

Ms. Whetsel stated that she agrees with staff recommendation and feels that the roof does not need to be changed with the exception of adding the cricket and proper flashing.

Ms. McAdams stated that it may be better to allow a slight change in the roof slope as long as it does not extend into the freeze board.

Mr. Wilkerson stated that the house is facing west which means the majority of weather will be blowing up the low slope of the roof. He feels the long term solution to this problem is to raise the slope to roof to help alleviate the water leakage issues. Mr. Wilkerson also asked if standing seam metal roofing was an option for installation. Mr. Reynolds stated that standing seam can be approved by staff so that is not a problem.

MOTION BY WHETSEL AND SECONDED BY EID TO DENY THE SLOPE CHANGE TO THE PORCH ROOF, AND APPROVE THE ADDITION OF A CRICKET IN THE BACK RIGHT CORNER OF THE PORCH ROOF, ALLOWING EPDM OR STANDING SEAM METAL ROOFING. THE MOTION CARRIED WITH MCADAMS VOTING NO.

Old North Knoxville H-1

1230 Armstrong Avenue – Ron Grazioso (Applicant/Owner) – Certificate No. 111811ONK

Work Description

Replace six existing one-over-one and two-over-two wood windows with new wood one-over-one or two-over-two windows of the same pane division and the same muntin depth, width and profile. The windows are located on the front and sides of the house.

Staff Recommendation

APPROVE Certificate 112811ONK as submitted, allowing wood one over one replacement windows in all requested locations.

Additional Comments

This Queen Anne house has been modified to have Craftman influences by adding a new front porch and changing the front windows to one over one; the windows were originally two over two. Since this house does have a strong Craftsman influence and all of the front windows are replacements, along with one window on the right side, replacement one over one wood windows for these are appropriate. The remaining windows to be replaced are on the sides of the

house and are original 2 over 2 windows that are in various states of disrepair. Only one original window is visible from the street; the left side closest to the street. The Old North Knoxville Design Guidelines states, "If replacement windows are necessary, they shall be the same overall size as the originals, the same pane division and the same muntin depth, width and profile." In this case, since the style of the house has changed, it may be appropriate to allow the window style to change to one over one which will match the craftsman influence of the house.

Ron Grazioso, 1105 Eleanor Street.

James Pierce, 122 Leonard Place, stated that he has had an opportunity to look at the windows and changing out the windows to one-over-one for uniformity seems to be appropriate. If the original windows could have been saved that would have been preferred. The appropriate window type just depends on which way is the preferred style for the house.

Ms. Ray asked if one-over-one windows are appropriate for Craftsman style homes. Mr. Reynolds stated that one-over-one windows are common on Craftsman style homes, but you would typically see multi-pane-over-one pane windows.

Ms. Ray stated that it is probably best to make sure the windows are the same with either direction the commission approves.

Mr. Bolen stated that this is a truly unique situation where you have one half of the house that looks Queen Anne and the other looks Craftsman.

Mr. Graziosa stated he does not have a true preference because eventually he will replace all the windows in the house to match whatever he installs now. Some of the newer windows on the front of the house that will remain for the time being are one-over-one. If he installs two-over-two now he will have mismatched windows for several years.

Mr. Bolen stated that on the front half of the house there are more one-over-one windows than two-over-two which means they are the majority. This is justification for allowing the new windows to conform with the majority and create a unified look.

MOTION BY BOLEN AND SECONDED BY EID TO APPROVE PER STAFF RECOMMENDATION. MOTION APPROVED UNANIMOUSLY.

1417 Cornelia Street – Old North Knoxville, LLC (Owner) –
Laurence Eaton (Applicant/Manager) – Certificate No. 120211ONK

Work Description

Construct new shed with a post and pier foundation. One story 10/x12/, wood framed with board and batten wood siding, double barn style door facing side yard (alley), wood window facing Cornelia Street, end gable roof with dimensional asphalt shingle coving, 8 inch overhang, 8/12 pitch.

Staff Recommendation

APPROVE Certificate 120211ONK as submitted.

Additional Comments

In the Old North Knoxville Design Guidelines, Section M: Auxiliary or Outbuildings states the various requirements for sheds (and other outbuildings such as garages). The proposed shed is relatively small which makes some of the recommended design elements difficult to incorporate fully (e.g. 12/12 roof pitch, exposed rafters). The shed appears to meet the intent of the guidelines.

Mr. Bolen stated that this house was proposed for demolition many years ago because of its condition and it is amazing how far it has come since with the renovations.

Mr. Pierce stated that the Old North Knoxville neighborhood is in agreement with the staff recommendation. The compromise with the roof pitch is of small concern.

Mr. Eid asked if there will be a soffit. Mr. Reynolds stated there will be a covered soffit, it will not have exposed rafters.

Mr. Bolen stated that the design is in-keeping with the intent of the guidelines and feels that there is not precedent to require a 12:12 pitch.

MOTION BY BOLEN AND SECONDED BY RAY TO APPROVE PER STAFF RECOMMENDATION. MOTION APPROVED UNANIMOUSLY.

Individual H-1

300 Main Street – Public Building Authority/Jeff Galyon (Applicant) – Knox County (Owner) – Certificate No. 112911GEN

Work Description

Repair all existing wood windows; Add non-operable, removable aluminum storm windows for each major opening component for all windows (one piece for double hung units, one piece for half-round units). The storm windows will have a middle horizontal bar to simulate the meeting rail of the windows.

Staff Recommendation

APPROVE Certificate No. 112911GEN as submitted.

Additional Comments

The prescribed restoration process of the windows is in accordance with the Secretary of Interior Standards for Rehabilitation. According to Preservation Brief #9, an appropriate method to weatherize historic windows is to add storm windows with frames made of wood, aluminum, vinyl, or plastic. The visual impact of storms may be minimized by selecting colors which match existing trim color, which is proposed in case.

Jeff Galyon, 912 Gay Street, stated the original proposal was to replace the windows but after consultation they looked into refurbishing the windows and now that is what they would like to do.

Mr. Eid asked if they are going to use insulated glass in the original window frames and if the storm windows will be brick-to-brick in width. Mr. Galyon stated they will be using single pane glass and the storm windows will be brick-to-brick in the window openings.

Ms. Whetsel asked if they would be going with option 1 or 2 for the storm windows. Mr. Galyon stated they will be doing option 2 with utilizes two pierce per window component.

Ms. Martin stated that when she worked at the Southern Depot they added storm windows and it made a big difference in their heating and cooling requirements.

MOTION BY RAY AND SECONDED BY EID TO APPROVE PER STAFF RECOMMENDATION. MOTION APPROVED UNANIMOUSLY.

Other Business

National Register Review

Hopecote – National Register of Historic Places nomination review and comments.

Mr. Reynolds stated that this item was not part of the public notice so the commission cannot take a formal vote to state a recommendation for approval or denial of the nomination. However, any comments that the commission has I can forward to the Tennessee Historical Commission for their consideration. Mr. Sauders suggested doing an advisory for the Tennessee Historical Commission.

Ms. Whetsel stated that she has admired this house and believes it is a treasure and supports the nomination.

Mr. Sauders stated that he would like to do everything possible and if it is the sense if this body to encourage the university to preserve than that is what we need to do.

Mr. Bolen asked who made this nomination. Mr. Reynolds stated it was Gail Guymon with the university.

Mr. Saunders asked for a vote for the sense of the commission on this nomination. Does the commission support this nomination? Everyone indicated that they do support the nomination.

Mr. Claussen asked if the County Historic Zoning Commission was to opine. It was determined that it would be appropriate for them to opine. The two present commissioners stated they are in support of the nomination.

Election of Officers

Mr. Saunders opened the floor for nominations of chair.

Mr. Bolen nominated Scott Busby for chair of the Knoxville Historic Zoning Commission. With there being no further nominations, the nomination was approved unanimously.

Mr. Saunders opened the floor for nominations for vice-chair.

Ms. Whetsel nominated Sandra Martin for vice-chair of the Knoxville Historic Zoning Commission. With there being no further nominations, the nomination was approved unanimously.

Other Items

Mr. Bolen congratulated Mr. Saunders on all his work and leadership on the Historic Zoning Commission.

Mr. Bolen asked if the commission has a voice on who is nominated for the Historic Zoning Commission vacancy. Mr. Saunders stated that he will formally submit his letter of resignation to the mayor and she will nominate a replacement.

Ms. Ray stated that there is no representation for Fort Sanders on the commission and feels that Randall DeFord would make a good addition.

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned.