

**MINUTES**  
**KNOXVILLE HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION**  
**KNOX COUNTY HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION**  
**MEETING OF APRIL 21, 2011**

**City HZC Present**

Sean Bolen  
Scott Busby  
Faris Eid  
Lorie Huff  
Sandra Martin  
Andie Ray  
Finbarr Saunders  
Melynda Whetsel

**Members Absent**

Melissa McAdams (ex.)

**County HZC Present**

Linda Claussen  
Steve Cotham  
Kenneth Gresham  
Carol Montgomery

**Members Absent**

Charles Faulkner (ex.)

**Others Present:**

Tom Reynolds  
Lisa Hatfield  
Melvin Wright  
Josh Flory  
Mike Reynolds  
James Pierce  
Arin Streeter  
Anne Wallace  
Benjamin Preston  
Casey Kalb  
Carl Lansden  
Tim Dunnavant  
Mike Harding  
Randall DeFord  
Ann Bennett  
Charlotte West  
Hollie Cook

Chair Finbarr Saunders called the meeting to order and reminded members regarding conflicts of interest.

Bennett noted that the sentence regarding Melvin Wright in the March 17 minutes should state, "Melvin Wright will temporarily fill the chief building inspector's job and will be attending this board and has been reviewing plans in historic districts."

**MOTION BY CLAUSSEN AND SECOND BY BUSBY TO APPROVE THE MINUTES INCLUDING THE REVISION. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.**

- Reports to Commission: Melvin Wright, Lisa Hatfield, Chair Finbarr Saunders
- Ray stated she is glad Camel Manufacturing came to the commission first regarding the awning on Market Square. Busby asked if the awnings and signs on Market Square should be a Level II. Bennett noted that the Commission can review Level I applications, and she will bring the Market Square signs and awnings to the Commission if they wish. Rewriting the guidelines will not be necessary to accomplish that. Eid asked if they are changing a building if it should be a Level II. In the past, if a proposed sign was within the guidelines, it was reported to the Commission rather than reviewed by them. However, all Market

Square signs and awnings will now be brought to the Commission for their review. Bolen supports the reviews.

- Staff Report (Level I Certificates and other): Ann Bennett

**1014 Eleanor Street** - 4<sup>th</sup> & Gill H-1 - Mike Reynolds (applicant) – Certificate No. 321114G - Replace existing 3-tab asphalt roof covering with new 3-tab asphalt roof or dimensional asphalt roof.

**714 Luttrell St** - 4<sup>th</sup> & Gill H-1 - Rudy Santore (applicant) – Certificate No. 406114G - Repainting house and replacing rotted wood in kind.

**19 Market Square** - Market Square H-1 - Christian Cain, Camel Awning (applicant) – Certificate No. 33111MKT - Construct shelf awning for two restaurants, Koi and Cocoa Moon, with restaurant names on valance, black painted aluminum poles, awning to join building above storefront and below second story.

**1132 Harvey Street** - Old North Knoxville H-1 - Jerry Crowe (applicant) – Certificate No. 33111ONK -Repair porch floor, structure, soffit, columns, fascia, siding and trim in kind as necessary, using like materials.

**204 E. Scott Avenue** - Old North Knoxville H-1 - Sandy Moses (applicant) – Certificate No. 31811ONK -Only repair roof and reshingle but no change or removal of existing chimneys are permitted.

**MOTION BY BUSBY AND SECOND BY RAY FOR BENNETT TO BEGIN REVIEWING SIGNS AND AWNINGS FOR MARKET SQUARE EVEN IF THEY ARE A LEVEL 1. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.**

- Certificates of Appropriateness

## **KNOXVILLE HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION**

### **GENERAL**

**800 World's Fair Park Drive** – David Collins, McCarty Holsaple McCarty (Applicant) – Alex Harkness, Station Eighty Two Ltd. (Owner) – Certificate No. 40511GEN

#### **Work Description**

Install handicapped ramp on north (Western Avenue) elevation, easternmost door. Ramp to be concrete, with pipe rail with top rail and intermediate rail and minimal intermediates, and extensions at outer sides, to bridge 8" difference between sidewalk and step heights.

#### **Staff Recommendation**

APPROVE Certificate No. 40511GEN. Proposed ramp is concrete, which is less intrusive than a wood ramp and is in keeping with the other pavement in the courtyard.

### **Additional Comments**

Ramp railing is a double pipe rail, which is contemporary in character and unobtrusive. The design of the rail would be benefitted by eliminating the u-shaped portions of rail at both top and bottom of both rails. The sections are very obvious, and the railing design would be enhanced by their elimination, although they are usually required by handicapped codes.

Bennett stated this is a Level 1, but she wanted the commission to review. If a ramp is wooden she approves, but this ramp will be concrete with a top and bottom rail. This is a permanent installation. She asked the commissioners if they thought the U-shape at the end of the railing could be minimized. Eid stated it could come down to the concrete and not stick out.

**MOTION BY EID AND SECOND BY WHETSEL TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.**

### **4<sup>th</sup> and Gill H-1**

*721 Luttrell Street* – Benjamin and Uta Preston (Applicant/Owner) – Certificate No. 329114G

### **Work Description**

- 1) Construct rear screened porch, not visible from Luttrell, size a size of 12'x18', gabled roof, square posts, wood steps, and supported on concrete piers, with deck level with interior floor, shingled to match existing roof shingles.
- 2) Demolish existing shed (sized at 16'x10'x13' tall) and build new smaller wood shed (12'x8'x9'4" tall) in opposite corner of rear yard, not visible from Luttrell. Shed to have double doors with lower cross bracing, one over one double hung window, wood wall cladding and side gable roof.

### **Staff Recommendation**

APPROVE Certificate No. 329114G. Proposed rear addition is at rear of building and limited in size and scale to the historic building. See Recommendations, New Additions, ## 1, 2, 4, 8, pg. 18, and outbuildings, pg. 19, Design Guidelines.

### **Additional Comments**

Current outbuilding is not contributing to district; proposed new outbuilding is consistent with Design Guidelines and the smaller size will be less apparent at the rear of the house. Neither change is clearly visible from adjacent streets.

Benjamin Preston, 721 Luttrell, stated he is the owner. Arin Streeter, 120 S. Gay Street, representing the 4<sup>th</sup> and Gill Neighborhood stated these items meet the guidelines, and the neighborhood has no objections.

**MOTION BY WHETSEL AND SECOND BY MARTIN TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.**

## **Old North Knoxville H-1**

*1410 Grainger Avenue* – Erin Kalb (Applicant/Owner) – Certificate No. 30311ONK

### **Work Description**

- 1) Install new Pella Architect series two over one double pane all wood windows (wood interior and exterior). Replaces two over one double hung windows that were in house;
- 2) Replace metal pipe railing on front steps with wood railing to match existing railing and columns on front porch;
- 3) Reroof rear portion of house with identical asphalt shingle roof;
- 4) Remove enclosure of original rear porch and restore original porch; and
- 5) Replace one rear window in kitchen with door, using half view wood door similar to other doors in house.

### **Staff Recommendation**

APPROVE Certificate No. 30311ONK.

### **Additional Comments**

The current replacement windows were installed in error; the Pella Architect series windows are the most similar to the original wood windows, which were deteriorated. The remaining work items are in keeping with the architectural design of the porch railing, in the case of the front steps, and are restoring original architectural features in the case of the rear porch enclosure being removed.

The metal cladding around the window frame will also be removed and replaced along with the new windows. Replace with wood railing.

Casey Kalb, 1410 Grainger Avenue, stated that he is the owner.

James Pierce, 122 Leonard Place, stated that the neighborhood agrees with the staff recommendation. He asked Mr. Kalb about the pane division, and he responded he will match it.

**MOTION BY RAY AND SECOND BY MARTIN TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.**

*1418 Grainger Avenue* – Carl Lansden (Applicant/Owner) – Certificate No. 40411ONK

### **Work Description**

Install gabled dormer on central portion of rear elevation, not visible from Grainger, with partial cornice returns.

### **Staff Recommendation**

APPROVE Certificate No. 40411ONK. The addition of a rear dormer allows the applicant to utilize existing attic space, retaining the original footprint of the building while utilizing attic space; the dormer will not be visible from Grainger.

**Additional Comments**

The proposed dormer addition is necessary to enhance the marketability of 1418 Grainger, which is a four room home with one bath. The dormer will not be visible from Grainger, and will assist the building in remaining marketable in today's real estate market. It will be consistent in design and materials for original building features.

Carl Lansden, 5315 Asheville Highway, is the owner of the house and has talked to a structural engineer to add the second story in the attic space. He will build the rear dormer not visible on Grainger Avenue.

James Pierce stated that the neighborhood agrees with the staff recommendation. They appreciate his taking on this project. They do not want him to replace the columns, brackets, moldings if it is not necessary. He should salvage, repair or replace them. Bennett told him what to save or replace.

Eid stated that the soffit and fascia at the back look different from the ones on the front. He should coordinate the windows for egress. Bolen added that when he converts the attic space, he is not to remove the chimney.

**MOTION BY EID AND SECOND BY MARTIN TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION IF THE SOFFITS AND FASCIA ARE MADE TO MATCH THE FRONT OF THE HOUSE. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.**

**Tazewell Pike NC-1**

*4115 Tazewell Pike* – Clifford Quinton (Applicant/Owner) – Certificate No. 40511TAZ

**Work Description**

Construct garage. NOTE: This application was approved at the meeting of 10/16/2003; that certificate has expired and the applicant wishes to reinstate, using the same design.

**Staff Recommendation**

APPROVE Certificate No. 40511TAZ. Proposed garage is an appropriate design for the property, serves a purpose currently being served by a metal canopy, and is consistent with the Tazewell Pike Design Guidelines.

The commissioners received an email from Jamie Rowe, representing the Tazewell Pike neighborhood, stating she has talked to the neighbors adjacent to and nearby the proposed project, and they are all in support of the proposed plan. This will be a picturesque addition to a stately, historic home.

**MOTION BY WHETSEL AND SECOND BY MARTIN TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.**

## **Fort Sanders NC-1**

*1416 Forest Avenue* – Neely Realty (Applicant/Owner) – Certificate No. 40711FTS

### **Work Description**

Demolish existing structure and replace with a duplex.

### **Staff Recommendation**

DENY Certificate No. 40711FTS; if demolition approved, deny design of replacement structure. The engineer's report does not indicate that demolition is the only alternative for this structure. Any replacement would need changes.

### **Additional Comments**

The structural engineering report by Mallia does not indicate that the structural deficiencies are fatal to the building, although it does acknowledge the difficulty of repairing the rotation being suffered by the foundation. In addition, if demolition were to be approved, the proposed design of the new structure omits several requirements contained in the adopted design guidelines.

- 1) The foundation height does not appear to be consistent with other pre-1940 buildings, or with the building that is to be demolished (pg. 6, #1).
- 2) The design does not appear to meet the requirements for porches with an outside entrance from the street for every 50 to 75 feet of street frontage. (pg. 6, #4).
- 3) The siding appears to duplicate board and batten siding, which is appropriate for accessory buildings, but not for primary buildings. (pg. 9, #3 and #5).
- 4) There does not appear to be at least 50% transparency on the Forest elevation, or the James Agee. (pg. 10, #8).
- 5) There does not appear to be parking provision, or provision for landscaping. (pg. 11)
- 6) The requirement for bays or porches on the side elevation adjoining James Agee does not appear to have been met. (pgs. 17 and 20)

Bennett and the Commission received an email from Randall DeFord, representing the Fort Sanders neighborhood, recommending denial of the demolition. Mr. DeFord received and forwarded a letter from Todd Duncan, an engineer with Structural Engineering Assessments, stating that helical anchors will stabilize the settlement problem and bracing the walls will prevent the wall from further rotation. Bennett is not sure about the design for the new building and has many questions, as noted in the Additional Comments section of the Staff Recommendation (above). Tim Dunnivant, architect for the owner, asked for a denial without prejudice to look at the engineering drawings. Randall DeFord, 1511 Laurel Avenue, asked the commission to deny without prejudice. Ray added that she hopes they can save the building. Mr. Dunnivant responded there are issues with this building. There is no foundation, and the brick is laid on the ground. A structural engineer stated that the building is sagging from two sides and the joists are twisting. There are no footings to do waterproofing. Additions have

been added over the years. Bolen responded that they are going to need substantial evidence that it needs to be demolished. Everyone should visit the property to make a more informed decision.

**MOTION BY BOLEN AND SECOND BY BUSBY TO DENY THE APPLICATION FOR DEMOLITION AND NEW PROPOSED BUILDING WITHOUT PREJUDICE. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.**

Bolen stated that Neely has done some nice rehabbing in the area but has been pouring slabs in front of the buildings he has been rehabbing for parking, and that is contrary to the guidelines, especially if they invite parking. Trees also need to be planted for every 50 feet of road frontage. Mike Harding, 2718 Painter Avenue, responded that when they redid the properties, they were already paved over. They did not pave them for parking but for drainage. At 1636 Clinch Avenue that area was already paved over. He went to City Engineering and talked to them, but has never heard back from them. He needs direction on what to do regarding the water issues. It looks like they did it for additional parking and that was not the intension. He has tried to deter parking on the slabs and has cracked down on it by putting out notices to that effect. He will do anything to deter parking in the front.

**Other Business**

Mayor's Report on Preservation

Staff Recommendation: APPROVE (Knoxville Historic Zoning Commission)

Saunders asked Commission to review the report.

**MOTION BY BOLEN AND SECOND BY EID TO APPROVE THE MAYOR'S REPORT ON PRESERVATION. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.**

Policy regarding chicken coops

Staff Recommendation: APPROVE (Knoxville Historic Zoning Commission)

Bennett stated that the City Ordinance has been amended for chickens and chicken coops. The City of Knoxville has adopted an ordinance that allows owners of residential property to keep up to six chickens and requires they be fenced and have a chicken coop. Since the ordinance requires only two square feet per hen, it is possible there will be individuals who wish to construct larger chicken coops that might trigger a review by the Historic Zoning Commission. Bennett proposes that the Commission review a structure that is more than six feet tall or more than twenty square feet in area. If a review is needed it will follow the guidelines for materials and designs of Accessory Structures that are included in each district's guidelines. The Law Department is reviewing this ordinance. Montgomery suggested that chicken wire be used.

**MOTION BY WHETSEL AND SECOND BY EID TO ACCEPT THE POLICIES WITH INCLUSION THAT IF CHICKEN WIRE IS USED, IT CANNOT BE VISIBLE FROM THE STREET. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.**

National Register nomination for the Contractor's Supply Building located at 1909 Schofield Street.

Staff Recommendation: APPROVE (Knoxville and Knox County Historic Zoning Commissions)

Bennett stated she is glad we are designating Mid-Century Modern buildings.

Hollie Cook, 1300 Broadway, who works for Knox Heritage, stated this building was slated for demolition. The Tennessee Department of Transportation reviewed the property, and the owner felt it was eligible for the national register. Ms. Cook prepared the nomination.

**MOTION BY BOLEN AND SECOND BY WHETSEL TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY WITH THE COUNTY VOTING ALSO.**

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned.

The next meeting will be May 19 at 8:30 a.m. in the Small Assembly Room of the City County Building.