

MINUTES
KNOXVILLE HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION
KNOX COUNTY HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION
MEETING OF NOVEMBER 18, 2010

City HZC Present

Sean Bolen
Scott Busby
Faris Eid
Sandra Martin
Melissa McAdams
Andie Ray
Finbarr Saunders
Melynda Whetsel

County HZC Present

Linda Claussen
Steve Cotham
Charles Faulkner
Kenneth Gresham
Carol Montgomery

Others Present:

Lisa Hatfield
Arin Streeter
Brian Pittman
Ann Bennett
Charlotte West

Chair Melynda Whetsel called the meeting to order and reminded members regarding conflicts of interest.

MOTION BY SAUNDERS AND SECONDED BY EID TO APPROVE THE OCTOBER 21 MINUTES. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

Lisa Hatfield introduced herself as Sharon Boyce’s replacement in the City Law Department.

Bennett distributed window drawings for an infill house on Luttrell Street for discussion and information. The size of the opening is consistent with Victorian-era houses. The windows on the left of the drawing are the ones they wanted to use, because they are the appropriate height and width, but they are only available as custom windows. The alternative window uses a standard size double hung of the same width with a transom added at the top to fill in the gap. This item was not advertised and cannot be voted on today. The applicant is asking for a sense of the Commission that using the transom would be acceptable, and noted that there use of a transom above windows is not unusual for Victorian-era houses that are being emulated on this structure, and that there are other buildings with transoms above windows in the neighborhood. Bennett noted that the use of transoms is a way of meeting the height requirements and has been allowed by the Commission in the past.

Brian Pittman, 623 W. Hill Avenue, stated that he designed this window. Bolen asked that when they vote he would like to see pictures of houses in the neighborhood that have used this type of window. Busby wants a price on the windows with this new design, but noted the Commission cannot reach a decision until the matter is properly advertised and brought before the body. Saunders suggested that Mr. Pittman to talk to Arin Streeter, who is the neighborhood representative. Mr. Pittman stated that they want to use these on all the windows. Busby asked why he cannot make the windows smaller. Mr. Pittman stated they did not look right for the design of this house. Bennett asked if the Commission was indicating that it is not opposed to transoms but cannot give him a decision until it is advertised next month. Lisa Hatfield stated the Commission can do a “sense of the body.” The vote would not be binding but would state how

the Commission feels. Arin Streeter, 120 Gay Street, indicated he felt the use of a transom would be acceptable. Bennett polled each member, and they all agree except Bolen who wants to see documentation.

The Commission agreed that, based on the information presented the Commission has no objection to the proposed solution to window sizing, including the transom, but that decision is subject to final drawings; a vote of the Commission is necessary. The December 16, 2010 meeting could include the vote on this matter, which would be based on further information to be presented at that time.

Mr. Pittman asked if a shorter window can be used if he cannot use the windows with transoms. Bennett responded that it would be helpful to see a drawing of the front elevation with shorter windows. Whetsel noted that new construction can deviate from the original styles. Mr. Pittman stated that the contractor is trying to develop a model that can be used with slight variations to do more infill in the historic neighborhood.

MOTION BY SAUNDERS AND SECOND BY BOLEN TO APPROVE A RESOLUTION THAT BASED ON THE INFORMATION PRESENTED, THE COMMISSION HAS NO OBJECTION TO THE PROPOSED SOLUTION TO WINDOW SIZING OR USING A TRANSOM TO ACCOMMODATE SOME OF THE PROPOSED WINDOW HEIGHT; THIS OPINION IS NOT BINDING, AND IS SUBJECT TO A FINAL VOTE OF THE COMMISSION AT A REGULARLY SCHEDULED AND ADVERTISED MEETING. THAT VOTE IS TO BE BASED ON FURTHER INFORMATION THAT SHOULD BE PRESENTED AT THE TIME OF THE MEETING. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

Staff Report (Level I Certificates): Ann Bennett

810 Deery Street - 4th & Gill H-1, David Vogel, Certificate No. 1104104&G. Replace existing asphalt shingle roof with rolled seam metal roof, charcoal gray in color.

Revisions of Mechanicsville Design Guidelines

Bennett explained that the Commission has a draft of proposed revised Mechanicsville guidelines in their packets this month, and stated that these guidelines are much more specific and in line with other neighborhood guidelines. The draft as also been distributed to the Mechanicsville neighborhood residents, who have been asked to comment on the guidelines and any questions they may have in the next five weeks. The guidelines will be discussed at the next neighborhood meeting on January 11 at the Odle and Young offices on Western Avenue. The Commission has been asked to attend that meeting.

Saunders stated this examination should be done for every neighborhood periodically, with revisions if necessary. He asked if there have been discussions about new materials and Bennett responded there had been. The neighborhood still wants wood used on primary structures. Bolen added that Mechanicsville seems to be making the guidelines stricter. Whetsel added it would be important for each neighborhood to do this. Busby stated that the Commission could suggest

they review new items. Bennett asked if the Commission would like to hold a workshop with the neighborhoods after the holidays, and Whetsel agreed to reintroduce the subject after the holidays.

Certificates of Appropriateness

KNOXVILLE HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION

General

623 W. Hill Avenue – Brian Pittman – Applicant/Owner – Certificate No. 110110GEN

Work Description

Replace existing single pane of glass in casements on east (main floor), north (second floor), and west (main and second floor) elevations with diamond patterned leaded glass to fill existing openings.

Staff Recommendation

APPROVE Certificate No. 110110GEN. Proposed modification is in keeping with age and design of building, and will add detail on side elevations that enhances historic architecture.

Ray stated that the Commission would like to have had elevation drawings. Mr. Pittman responded that the house has leaded glass in the front door and other windows. These diamond panes will be installed in the casement windows on the sides and on the back, and there are four windows.

MOTION BY BUSBY AND SECOND BY SAUNDERS TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

4th & Gill H-1

918 Eleanor Street – Ron Hall - Applicant/Owner – Certificate No. 1101104&G

Work Description

1) Replace existing replacement porch columns with replicas of columns originally on porch, 8" tapered round wood columns with Ionic capitals; 2) replace trim as necessary, duplicating original materials and design; 3) replace existing porch railing spindles as necessary, duplicating current railing, with spindles set into top and bottom rails, 4) repair and replace shingles in dormers and above porch as necessary, duplicating design now found on house.

Staff Recommendation

APPROVE Certificate No. 1101104&G. Proposed tapered wood columns are consistent with Neoclassical influence and duplicate columns that were in place on the porch prior to the current turned wood columns. Remainder of proposed work is replacement.

Arin Streeter stated there has been no objection from the neighborhood except for replacing the columns. The columns on the house are not original and the exact design of the original columns is not known. There should be documentation if early pictures or drawings exist. Bennett stated that a turned wood column with ironic capitals on a brick pier was the description in the National Register nomination done prior to local designation. There was probably a full column at one time. The round wood columns would be appropriate. The columns resting on brick piers were likely a c. 1920s or '30s modification that should not be reinstalled. Mr. Streeter stated he should provide a drawing and suggested denying without prejudice until he provides more information. Bolen added that during Victorian times, people replaced columns with Roman columns. Bennett responded that the brick piers were not appropriate at the time.

MOTION BY BOLEN AND SECOND BY EID TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION AND ALLOW THE APPLICANT TO ADD COLUMNS OR POSTS AND GIVE HIM THE OPTION OF NOT REINSTALLING THE FULL HEIGHT RAILING IF CODES DID NOT REQUIRE IT.

Other

Nomination of officers

MOTION BY MONTGOMERY AND SECOND BY CLAUSSEN TO NOMINATE KENNETH GRESHAM FOR CHAIR. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

MOTION BY MONTGOMERY AND SECOND BY FAULKNER TO NOMINATE STEVE COTHAM AS VICE CHAIR. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

MOTION BY MARTIN AND SECOND BY BUSBY TO NOMINATE FINBARR SAUNDERS FOR CHAIR. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

MOTION BY MARTIN AND SECOND BY EID TO NOMINATE SCOTT BUSBY FOR VICE CHAIR. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

Bennett stated that the Commission will vote on the officers next month and additional nominations can be made at that time before voting.

Bolen distributed tickets to the Commissioners to the Old North Tour on December 4-5.

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned.

The next meeting of the Knoxville and Knox County Historic Zoning Commissions will be held on December 16, at 8:30 a.m. in the Small Assembly Room of the City-County Building.