

**MINUTES
KNOXVILLE HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION
KNOX COUNTY HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION
MEETING OF MARCH 18, 2010**

City HZC Present

Sean Bolen
Scott Busby
Faris Eid
Melissa McAdams
Sandra Martin
Andie Ray
Melynda Whetsel

Members Absent:

Finbarr Saunders (ex.)

County HZC Present

Steve Cotham
Charles Faulkner
Kenneth Gresham

Members Absent:

Linda Claussen (ex.)
Carol Montgomery

Others Present:

Sharon Boyce
James Pierce
Lauren Rider
Arin Streeter
Jamie Rowe
Cynthia Stancil
Josh Wright
Ann Bennett
Charlotte West

Chair Melynda Whetsel called the meeting to order and reminded members regarding conflicts of interest.

MOTION BY EID AND SECOND BY COTHAM TO APPROVE THE FEBRUARY 18 MINUTES. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

Staff Report (Level I Certificates): Ann Bennett

229 E. Scott Avenue - Old North Knoxville H-1 - Lauren & Steven Rider (owner/applicant) – Certificate No. 20510ONK - Re-install original screen doors to back and front door; Repair and replace in kind rotten wood on upper porch on front of house, as needed, including repair piers on second story balcony

501 E. Oklahoma Avenue - Old North Knoxville H-1 - Judy Gerstmeyer (owner/applicant) – Certificate No. 22310ONK - Repair garage/carport at rear of lot, including sagging roof.

721 Luttrell Street - 4th & Gill H-1 - Thomas Williams (owner/applicant) – Certificate No. 216104&G - Repair or replace siding in kind, as necessary; Install trim on columns to replicate bases and capitals; install beadboard porch ceiling.

918 Eleanor Street - 4th & Gill H-1 - Ron Hall – (owner/applicant) – Certificate No. 301104&G - Exterior rehabilitation, including new roof (with roof decking as required) altering present tin roof covering to shingle; removal of asbestos shingles and substitution with wood lap siding with 4" reveal; repair and replace existing wood siding as necessary, matching historic sizes and installation; install color-clad downspouts and gutters; repair masonry as necessary, using low Portland-content mortar to match historic mortar.

NOTE: Applicant has indicated an interest in constructing a small rear addition that will serve as storage and not be visible from the front of the house; he intends to submit information for that addition to the HZC in several months.

1904 Washington Avenue - Edgewood-Park City H-1 - Charles B. Hassenboehler (owner/applicant) – Certificate No. 21610EDG - Repair foundation; remove second story front added room and restore porch, if it was a porch, adding window to match historic windows; siding repair in kind; repair windows; remove added front door, replacing with matching window; remove storm door; remove rear fire stair.

REISSUE OF CERTIFICATE NO. 20608EDG. - 1 Market Square - Market Square H-1 - J & R Masonry (owner/applicant) – Certificate No. 22210MKT - Removal of chimney on rear wall, not visible from Union or Market. Chimney is collapsing into alley, causing a pedestrian and vehicular hazard. Applicant has been informed that chimney should be rebuilt when additional masonry work is performed on building. Will be torn down to approximately 18-24" above roofline.

31 Market Square - Market Square H-1 - Andy Asbury (Vexus Sign Company) (owner/applicant) –Certificate No. 22510MKT - Install blade sign, approximately of 6 sq. ft. (approximately 2' x 3'), double faced, painted aluminum, on wrought iron bracket (frame) hanging from front of building..

Certificates of Appropriateness

Bennett read what was approved for 409 E. Oklahoma at the February meeting. She passed around a sample of wood he is using that they think is particle board. He is putting in vinyl windows. The certificate cannot be changed since it has not been advertised to be changed.

James Pierce, 122 Leonard Place, representing Old North Knoxville stated that a letter was sent by Lauren Rider, President of Old North Knoxville, concerning enforcement of the Old North Knoxville guidelines. Work is being done that is against the guidelines and nothing is being done to stop them. The owner, Mr. Steve Finnegan, did not apply and the neighbors caught it. Finnegan is not using appropriate trim and is using metal soffit and vinyl windows. Mr. Pierce and Ms. Rider asked the Commission what recourse the neighborhood has. They want these issues corrected.

Lauren Rider, 229 E. Scott, stated that a chimney on a house on Grainger was removed, and the owner did not put it back on. Developers called her and said they have to follow the guidelines when working in the historic district. The owner of 409 E. Oklahoma (Finnegan) talked to her and is still not following the guidelines. Bennett stated he was issued a second stop work order.

Ms. Rider said Finnegan told her he knew if he came and asked for Hardiplank and vinyl windows that it would not pass. The neighborhood wants the windows removed.

Whetsel stated that this issue comes before the Commission frequently. The Commission interprets guidelines and issue certificates of appropriateness, but does not enforce them.

Building Inspections does that. The Commission wants the guidelines to be followed. She suggested they talk to Mr. Tom Reynolds who is the Building Inspector or their City Councilman. Bennett stated that because Finnegan was issued a stop work order, he should reapply to correct the issues for which that stop work order was issued.

Gresham stated that the bank inspector goes out and looks at whether a window has been installed, but they do not know which windows are supposed to go in. A Certificate of Occupancy is not required.

Bennett stated she will talk to Kim Trent about having a seminar with banks on why following guidelines is important to their equity.

Mr. Pierce asked Bennett if there is a complete stop work order and if the owner would have to submit an application for another certificate. It was discussed whether to allow it to be a Level 1 or 2 because he has not followed the guidelines. Gresham thanked the neighborhood representatives for participation and being aware of what is going on in the neighborhood. Whetsel stated this certificate should be a level 2 instead of a 1 because he is not following the rules.

KNOXVILLE HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION

Fourth & Gill H-1

726 Deery Street - Josh Wright (Owner/Applicant) – Certificate No. 218104&G

Work Description

Redesign front porch to be shed roof supported by turned wood columns elongating to squared base and with sawn wood brackets, connected by spindlework spandrel at roof line, with wood floor and beadboard ceiling.

Staff Recommendation

APPROVE Certificate No. 218104&G. Proposed modifications to front porch columns and rail will reintroduce the appropriate Victorian-era design details that were probably removed from the building many years ago.

Additional Comments

This building has been in poor repair and with inappropriate front porch railings and columns since at least the time of its designation as part of the Fourth & Gill H-1.

Josh Wright, 726 Deery, is the owner. Eid asked him which of the renderings would be used, and Mr. Wright stated he will use the fancy columns.

Arin Streeter, 120 S. Gay Street, stated that the neighborhood would be pleased to see improvement on this house.

MOTION BY MARTIN AND SECOND BY BOLEN TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

1222 Luttrell Street – Liz Upchurch (option holder) – Certificate No. 302104&GB

Work Description

1) Replace sashes of two front windows with wood windows, in same pane configuration (6 over 1); 2) Install exterior deck over old garage area at rear of structure, using railing of 2" balusters on 4-5" spacing set into top and bottom rails; 3) install rear basement door, 6 panel metal, located under rear deck/garage; 4) Repair brickwork, repointing as necessary, using Preservation Brief No. 2 provisions and low-Portland content mortar, to stabilize brick elements on house, including chimney.

Staff Recommendation

APPROVE Certificate No. 302104&G. Proposed work is consistent with adopted design guidelines, including windows (pg. 11-#4); rear deck (pg. 12-1) and masonry (pg. 15, 5 & 6).

Bennett stated this is a replacement of the carport in the rear of the house; the carport was damaged by fire and removed several years ago, but was in place at the time of designation.

MOTION BY BOLEN AND SECOND BY MARTIN TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

Old North Knoxville H-1

229 E. Scott Avenue – Lauren & Steven Rider (Owner/Applicant) – Certificate No. 205100NK

Work Description

Level II: Add wrought iron porch rails, white coating. Proposed porch rail will not connect to original columns; posts will be secured to porch floor. Single rail to match porch rail will be installed with concrete porch steps with brick buttresses as approved by Knoxville Historic Zoning Commission on Certificate 71708ONK.

Staff Recommendation

APPROVE Certificate No. 205100NK. Proposed repair work is necessary to maintain the structure and consistent with the adopted design guidelines. The porch railing is a necessary safety devise, although the house did not have a railing originally.

Additional Comments

The applicant has submitted a design that is contemporary in spirit, is not attached to the existing historic columns, and does not create the false impression of a historic design, all of which are consistent with the Secretary of Interior's Standards on which the Old North design guidelines are based, and particular with Standards 9 and 10 (Design Guidelines - pg.11). The railing will be powder-coated, and thus the color will remain a permanent part of the building, and white will be very obvious. It might be preferable to coat the railing in a dark color (black, dark green or brown) which would cause the railing to be less obvious.

Bennett stated that this house never had a front railing. She is concerned about the color being more obvious if it were painted white than a darker color.

Lauren Rider stated that one end of the porch is 7' high. She does not want to use black. Busby asked if the top porch railing is wood why she would not use wood on the bottom. Bennett answered there is not an example to go by. If wood was used, the railing would be larger. She was approved for wooden railings in 2006. Wrought iron is less obtrusive and wood would obscure the windows. Rider stated they will not be attached to the columns. Eid responded that a darker color would make the columns stand out more.

James Pierce read from the Old North Knoxville guidelines regarding porches. The neighborhood feels wrought iron is appropriate and less obtrusive since there were no existing railings.

MOTION BY EID AND SECOND BY MARTIN TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

Other Business

Adoption of the 2009 Preservation Report for the City of Knoxville.

Bennett stated that by city charter the Knoxville Historic Zoning Commission is to present an annual preservation report to Mayor Haslam of what has occurred in preservation during the preceding year. In addition to approval by the Historic Zoning Commission, it is approved by the Metropolitan Planning Commission and by City Council. She listed what had been added this year. A separate addendum might be included concerning the need for discussion about enforcement of Certificates; however, that is an activity that would be reported in the 2010 preservation report. Graphics will be added later.

MOTION BY MCADAMS AND SECOND BY MARTIN TO APPROVE THE 2009 PRESERVATION REPORT FOR THE CITY OF KNOXVILLE WITH A NOTATION IN THE TRANSMITTAL LETTER OF WORK TO ASSURE COMPLIANCE WITH CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

The next meeting of the Knoxville and Knox County Historic Zoning Commissions will be held on April 15, at 8:30 a.m. in the Small Assembly Room of the City-County Building.

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned.