

MINUTES
KNOXVILLE HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION
KNOX COUNTY HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION
MEETING OF JUNE 17, 2010

City HZC Present

Sean Bolen
Scott Busby
Sandra Martin
Melissa McAdams
Andie Ray
Finbarr Saunders
Melynda Whetsel

Members Absent

Faris Eid (ex)

County HZC Present

Linda Claussen
Charles Faulkner
Kenneth Gresham

Members Absent:

Steve Cotham (ex)
Carol Montgomery (ex.)

Others Present:

Russ Davidson
Mike Harding
Noel Hudson
Christopher King
Cynthia Stancil
Robert Marlino
James Pierce
Tom Reynolds
Arin Streeter
Ann Bennett

Chair Melynda Whetsel called the meeting to order and reminded members regarding conflicts of interest.

MOTION BY SAUNDERS AND SECOND BY MARTIN TO APPROVE THE MAY 20, 2010 MINUTES. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

Staff Report (Level I Certificates): Ann Bennett

300 Main Street – General - Public Building Authority (Jeff Galyon) – Certificate No. 60110GEN. Certificate 32610GEN contained the following information: Repair two historic windows, one on the east elevation that will be repaired in place, and one on the north elevation to the west of the main entrance that will be removed and repaired; both windows are on the second story. That Certificate was granted. Applicant has since contacted HZC staff to request a modification that would allow windows on the north elevation to the right of the front entry and on the east elevation one back of the north elevation to be repaired instead of the two windows originally included in the application. In addition, applicant is requesting to install storm windows on the repaired windows, the frame color to match painted trim on the building and a dividing rail that will also match the existing windows.

918 Gratz - Fourth & Gill H-1 - Virginia Douglas – Certificate No. 513104&G. Repair porch roof; repair porch ceiling with bead board replacement, if necessary; repair or replace porch floor with tongue and groove flooring; repair columns; replace balustrade with 2"x2" balusters on 4" centers set in top and bottom rail.

827 Morgan Street - Fourth & Gill H-1 - Steve and Toni Meador – Certificate No. 601044&G. Resurface dirt and gravel drive with pavers; install storm windows to match the trim; install 3 foot tall picket fence in front yard; install gutters.

1551 Western Avenue - Mechanicsville H-1 - Department of Community Development (John Huff – Certificate No. 52710MEC. Repoint and repair masonry, using Preservation Brief No. 2; repair or replace coping as necessary.

1239 Armstrong - Old North Knoxville H-1 - Russ Davidson – Certificate No. 60310ONK. Repair structure, siding and trim, replacing with like materials and design if necessary.

KNOXVILLE HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION

Mechanicsville H-1

1551 Western Avenue – Department of Community Development (Owner), (John Huff) (Agent) – Certificate No. 52710MEC

Description of Work

Replace top floor windows with wood replacement units using true divided lights for top sash with window size, profile and mullion patterns to match originals; install beadboard panels as sign boards with raised lettering; create stucco pilasters extending from base of second story to sidewalk to define storefront; restore front door or replace in kind; remove existing storefront windows and base panels and replace with same size wooden traditional storefront with divisions to suggest storefront windows and wood bulkhead bases.

Staff Recommendation

APPROVE Certificate No. 52710MEC. Proposed alterations will restore three bay storefront, with shop windows and recessed storefront entry, including transoms above storefront, improve appearance of non-contributing metal warehouse buildings.

Additional Comments

The storefront at 1551 Western is the last unrestored commercial storefront in Mechanicsville; improvements to this building will greatly improve the commercial entry to the Mechanicsville Historic District.

MOTION BY SAUNDERS AND SECOND BY BUSBY TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

Edgewood Park City H-1

1800 Jefferson Avenue – THD At Home Services (Contractor) – Casey Whaley (Owner) - Certificate No. 52010EDG

Description of Work

Replace existing wood one over one double hung windows with vinyl windows. Contractor will contact staff to either change application to wood double hung or withdraw from agenda.

Staff Recommendation

DENY Certificate No. 52010EDG. Proposed replacement windows do not meet the recommendations of the adopted design guidelines.

Additional Comments

The Edgewood-Park City Design Guidelines call for replacement windows that must be the same overall size as the originals, with the same pane division and the same muntin style and exterior depth, width and profile. (Windows, pg. 17, #3).

MOTION BY SAUNDERS AND SECOND BY MARTIN TO DENY WITHOUT PREJUDICE. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

Fort Sanders NC-1

1202 Clinch Avenue – (Neely Realty) Mike Harding (Owner) – Certificate No. 52810FTS

Description of Work

Rebuild but retain two story front porch, reducing size, using or reproducing handrail and columns dating from Victorian-era design; repair and reuse front entrance including door, transom and sidelights; replace windows with one over one windows; repair or replace artificial siding with lap siding on main body and fishscale shingles between windows on front elevation recess and side elevation bays and front gable; add "fascia truss" with pendant to front gable; rebuild various additions at rear of building so that east side elevation contains continuous end gable roof with extension on central one story bay and half octagonal roof with shingles forming belt course between first and second story windows; add gable roof to existing front extension with fishscale shingles between first and second story windows and on gable and with fascia truss; add matching bay at rear of east elevation; add two story recessed porch between rear extended bay and octagonal bay utilizing reproduced front porch railing and columns and adding entry with half view door and transom, and retaining entrance that faces front of building; rear section of house is deteriorated and will be removed and rebuilt. South and west side elevations will have artificial lap siding and one over one windows with fishscale shingles between first and second story windows; there are no entrances on the south and west elevations.

Staff Recommendation

APPROVE Certificate No. 52810FTS. Proposed alterations will retain most significant features, including front entry, two story front porch with columns in appropriate locations, spandrels and railing on second story, and gable trim.

Additional Comments

Although the east and south elevations will be altered by this proposed rehabilitation, the building's viability will be greatly enhanced through bringing it into compliance with building and safety codes. The added projecting square bays and octagonal bay will present an improved appearance on the Twelfth Street (east) elevation. The Ft. Sanders design guidelines call for the addition of bays and porches to add visual appeal on the side street (pg. 14, H-1, 4, 5, 6), and while this proposal calls for modifications to previously completed additions, the principles contained in the design guidelines are carried out in this proposal.

Ann Bennett presented the staff recommendation and explained the rationale. Pointed out that a strong point of the Ft. Sanders design guidelines is if the building is a corner house, it must present a face to both the front and side streets.

Mike Harding, 2718 Cain Avenue, manager for the owner, stated he was doing this project to make it more uniform with the area.

Sean Bolen commended the applicant on the quality of the proposal and asked about the side elevation.

Tom Reynolds, Building Inspections, commended the applicant and what they were doing with the properties in Ft. Sanders. Mr. Reynolds also determined that although it was not a concern of the Historic Zoning Commission, the zoning and the proposed number of units were consistent.

Sandra Martin asked if any of the building was original. Ann Bennett explained that part of the front of the building probably was, but it had had so many additions, on both the sides and the rear elevation, that it had drastically changed over time; determination of the original portion of the building was very difficult.

MOTION BY BOLEN AND SECOND BY SAUNDERS TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

Old North Knoxville H-1

318 E. Oklahoma Avenue – Robert Marlino (Smee+Busby, Architects) (Architect) – Noel Hudson & Andie Ray (Owner) - Certificate No. 52410ONK

Description of Work

Construct new residence, with wood siding and wood singles on brick foundation; in French Eclectic Revival style with Craftsman influence, cross gable roof with metal roof covering, front and side dormers with wood shingles and four light casement window (on west, south and north elevations), and exterior end brick chimney on north elevation, shed roof extension on south elevation; three paired half view doors on front elevation with fifteen lights, five light transoms, and five light sidelights flanking primary front entry; paired matching doors on shed roof extension; ground level front porch with

square columns on front elevation, with side extension with brick steps to south elevation; brick foundation raised at rear due to slope of lot; four light casement windows on north and east elevations; paired five light casements and paired doors matching front elevation on south elevation with centered bay of tripled pairs of five light casement windows, with balcony at rear set of paired doors above arched garage entrance with carriage doors.

Placement on lot: Front setback 25'; side setbacks 8'; rear setback 4'; lot area – 6800 sq. ft.

Staff Recommendation

APPROVE Certificate No. 52410ONK. Proposed new building is consistent with adopted design guidelines. (See pg. 26-27.)

Additional Comments

The proposed setbacks and lot coverage are necessary in order to provide consistency with existing buildings in the district. (G, 1-4). The scale and massing are appropriate to other buildings on the east side of Oklahoma; the foundation height and eave lines are consistent and the materials are wood and brick; The roof shape, with the addition of dormers to the hipped roof, is consistent with both the style (French Eclectic) and the provisions for roof shapes. The use of transoms and sidelights at the front entry provides a strong sense of entry and provided in K.1, and the size and placement of the front and side porch is consistent with K,2. The size and shape of the lot, which predates the designation, and which at the time of designation contained a deteriorated house, makes the lot size and front, rear and side setbacks necessary in order to conform to the appearance of other houses in the historic district.

ANDIE RAY RECUSED FROM DISCUSSION OR VOTING ON THIS ITEM.
SCOTT BUSBY AND SEAN BOLEN RECUSED FROM VOTING ON THIS ITEM.

Ann Bennett presented the staff recommendation and rationale. She pointed out the previous house had to be demolished and the applicant is going through the subdivision process.

Tom Reynolds, City Inspections, asked about the setbacks and pointed out that porches do not have to be included in front setback.

Noel Hudson, owner, stated the established front setback on Oklahoma is 25 feet and they made it 28 feet to align with other houses.

Ann Bennett pointed out the house does not have three front doors, but two side doors flanking a central front door. It will now have paired or single full light doors. The central front entry will also have sidelights and will be larger, while the secondary flanking doors will be paired and will not have sidelights. Bennett fears that inconsistent doors makes it look like a condo.

James Pierce, 122 Leonard Place, Old North Knoxville representative, stated the Old North Knoxville Board had concerns that the doors not be consistent; the Board felt this would further distinguish the entrance from the other doors. He also noted that they were open to that issue and flexible on the doors.

Kenneth Gresham asked if there were setbacks in the design guidelines, and suggested they approve the design of the house and not location. Approval of the design could be subject to the facade being located in line with the other properties. Saunders agreed that they approve the design and give enough flexibility in location that the details could be worked out with other entities.

Christopher King, Smee Busby Architects, stated the two side French doors look like large casement windows. They could be painted the same as the casement windows which would leave the two French doors with the appearance of side windows. He noted that since they are consistent on either side of the primary entry, there is symmetry

Scott Busby suggested they leave the doors as they are, but change the color. Busby also pointed out a driveway was being added which was not part of their application.

MOTION SAUNDERS AND SECOND MARTIN MADE TO APPROVE STAFF RECOMMENDATION WITH THE COLOR DIFFERENTIATION TO MAKE FRONT DOOR APPARENT AND EXPRESS COMFORT ON SETBACKS WITH WHATEVER VARIANCES AND ALLOW DRIVEWAY.

Sean Bolen expressed disagreement with colors, noting they were not permanent and could be easily changed.

James Pierce stated they should have no asphalt or gravel paving for the driveway and that brown river sand should be used in composing the concrete for the driveway.

Melynda Whetsel pointed out the front entrance was significant and they were losing symmetry and style with the neighborhood guidelines. The original design was the better design.

Alternative designs to make the front entry more prominent in the façade included more noticeably increasing the size of the front entry while leaving the symmetrical secondary doors on each side, or removing the shutters on the second doors but leaving the remainder of the original doors intact. Busby stated they would have a color rendering that would show the depth and how the front door stands out.

SAUNDERS, WITH MARTIN'S ASSENT, WITHDREW THEIR MOTION.

MOTION SAUNDERS AND SECOND MARTIN, TO APPROVE STAFF RECOMMENDATION, ALLOWING SETBACKS TO HAVE LEEWAY, PROVIDED SETBACKS WERE CONSISTENT WITH NEIGHBORINS HOUSES, AND APPROVING THE DRIVEWAY USING CORRECT MATERIALS FOR DRIVEWAY. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

1239 Armstrong Avenue - Russ Davidson (Owner/Applicant) – Certificate No. 60310ONK

Work Description

Repair structure, siding and trim, replacing with like materials and design if necessary. Install wood panel rear doors to replace doors destroyed by fire; reconfigure rear roof structure to provide more integrated roofline with better drainage (modification not visible from Armstrong).

Revision: Applicant has also indicated (on 6/15) that he wishes to remove the exterior stair on the north elevation and replace the door in the side gable with new windows; replace windows on the ground floor, north and south elevations, with new wood painted double hung windows matching the existing muntins on the upper sashes; replace the fixed window on the rear elevation in kind; repair and repoint the existing chimney as necessary; and reroof using dimensional shingles. Rebuilding of rear roof will also result in removal of brick vent in rear section.

Staff Recommendation

APPROVE Certificate No. 60310ONK. Proposed changes are consistent with adopted design guidelines. Proposed alterations of rear roof lines will improve the appearance and the function of a roofline that now consists of several enclosed rear porches.

Ann Bennett handed out a revised staff report and sketches and explained the staff recommendation and rationale.

Russ Davidson passed around pictures of the house.

James Pierce had concerns about 1) whether the exterior walls were being changed, and 2) the roof chimney is not on the plan. Bennett confirmed that the current footprint of the house would be retained and pointed out that the rear chimney was not visible when standing on Armstrong in front of the house, and was a cooking vent; the Commission had been consistent in allowing the removal of such vents in the past.

MOTION BY BUSBY AND SECOND BY MCADAMS TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION WITH RAILINGS ON THE FRONT STEPS IF NECESSARY. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

827 Morgan Street – Steve & Toni Mealor (Owner/Applicant) – Certificate No. 601104&G

Work Description

Install sawn wood porch rail with balusters set into top and bottom rails, with balusters on 4-5 inch center, matching shadow lines that illustrate where previous rail was located, with rail set below cast concrete caps; install splayed oversize square columns on center piers to match existing square columns at corners of front porch, made necessary by sagging porch beam; install side brick steps to porch, with brick to match existing bricks on house, to allow access to porch from driveway (NOTE: steps will be behind fence); replace deteriorating asphalt shingles on front gable with wood shingles; install 6' x 8' storage shed, 6-1/2 feet tall, in rear yard behind existing fence. Shed will have wood walls and shingled roof, and will be located at the southwest corner of the property.

Staff Recommendation

APPROVE Certificate No. 601104&G. Proposed changes are in keeping with character of house. Shed is consistent with design guidelines that recommend using materials corresponding to the original primary buildings on the lot.

Additional Comments

See Design Guidelines, pg. 19, Outbuildings.

Bennett presented the staff recommendation and rationale. Saunders asked if the tool shed was a temporary building. Bennett pointed out the guidelines allow temporary buildings, work sheds and other small structures.

Steve and Toni Mealor, 827 Morgan Street, pointed out the columns were being added to help the sag in the porch beam and that they were identical to the outer columns and that other homes in the neighborhood had such columns.

Arin Streeter, 120 S Gay Street, asked if they could repair the beam instead of using columns, stating that would be more consistent with surrounding homes. Streeter noted that the suggestion was his own and not from the homeowners association.

Andie Ray stated that while the Commission always appreciated his suggestions, if the columns meet the design guidelines, the guidelines should control.

MOTION BY RAY AND SECOND BY SAUNDERS TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

Designation Report – 1209 Scenic Drive (CLT121DC043)

Request that 1209 Scenic be added to the Scenic Drive NC-1, with Scenic Drive Design Guidelines.

Bennett explained this was one of the homes that originally declined the NC-1 designation. The house is currently on three lots. The owner learned that if the house was torn down there could be three houses built, one on each lot, and wanted the designation to protect the existing house.

Finbarr Saunders asked if those that did not have the designation had adopted deed restrictions. Bennett noted that as far as she knew, those restrictions had not been adopted.

MOTION BY SAUNDERS AND SECOND BY RAY TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

There being no other business, the meeting was adjourned at 9:51 a.m.

The next meeting of the Knoxville and Knox County Historic Zoning Commissions will be held on July 15, at 8:30 a.m. in the Small Assembly Room of the City-County Building.

A workshop on solar design guidelines should follow after the July meeting. Neighborhoods have put together comments and will share them with Bennett.