

**MINUTES
KNOXVILLE HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION
KNOX COUNTY HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION
MEETING OF JANUARY 21, 2010**

City HZC Present

Sean Bolen
Scott Busby
Faris Eid
Melissa McAdams
Andie Ray
Melynda Whetsel

Members Absent:

Sandra Martin (ex.)
Finbarr Saunders (ex.)

County HZC Present

Linda Claussen
Steve Cotham
Kenneth Gresham
Carol Montgomery

Members Absent:

Charles Faulkner (ex.)

Others Present:

Sharon Boyce
Kim Trent
John Craig
Arin Streeter
Michael Harding
Jayne Burnett
Mike St. John
Kevin Murphy
Ann Bennett
Charlotte West

Chair Melynda Whetsel called the meeting to order and reminded members regarding conflicts of interest.

- Whetsel introduced Faris Eid and Andie Ray as new members of the City Commission. She also recognized Arin Streeter as the new 4th and & Gill Neighborhood representative.

MOTION BY GRESHAM AND SECOND BY MCADAMS TO APPROVE THE DECEMBER 17 MINUTES.

Whetsel pointed out that the motion by Commissioner Martin, made in the December meeting, called for two alternative bids for both repairing the Courthouse windows, and considering wood replacement windows for the Courthouse.

THE MINUTES, AS AMENDED, WERE ADOPTED UNANIMOUSLY.

- Staff Report (Level I Certificates): Ann Bennett

1408 Laurel Avenue - Ft. Sanders NC-1 - Michael Harding/Neely Realty – Certificate No. 10510FTS - Remove and reconstruct rear addition, not visible from Laurel, on exact footprint, repairing and installing footers.

236 E. Scott Avenue - Old North Knoxville H-1 - Vaughn Nave – Certificate No. 10510ONK - Roof using asphalt shingles, repairing decking as necessary; install gutters; point masonry as necessary using Preservation Brief No. 2; rebuild chimney from roof up, copying original with corbelled top; repair or replace wood siding duplicating the original; repair windows as necessary; repair soffit with identical design and fascia boards with identical design, if necessary.

1365 Armstrong Avenue - Old North Knoxville H-1 - Michael Harding – Certificate No. 121709ONK - Repair roof and sidewall using in kind materials and design.

821 Luttrell Street - 4th & Gill H-1 - Kevin Nelson – Certificate No. 1208094&G - Replace asphalt shingles with asphalt shingles; remove artificial siding and repair or replace wood wall coverings in kind if necessary.

1226 Luttrell Street - 4th & Gill H-1 - Jessica Martin – Certificate No. 1229094&G - Repair deck in rear yard.

1122 Luttrell Street - 4th & Gill H-1 - Liz Upchurch – Certificate No. 107104&G Repair roof fascia, soffit and any rotten brackets replicating original design and with like materials; Replace or add gutters where missing or in bad repair; Repair windows, including reglazing and replacing any rotten members; Add color clad storm windows; Add full view storm door at front entry.

- Certificates of Appropriateness

KNOXVILLE HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION

Fourth & Gill H-1

801 Wells Avenue – Carl Lansden – Owner/Applicant – Certificate No. 1230094&G

Work Description

Install new square wood columns to replace unoriginal porch columns; install new railing, 2x2 spindles set into top and bottom rail, with trim at top and bottom and spindles set on 4" centers.

Staff Recommendation

APPROVE Certificate No. 1230094&G. Proposed columns and railing are appropriate designs for this property, which did not have original columns or railing at the time of designation.

Arin Streeter, 120 S. Gay Street, stated that this new application is just what should be done, and the neighborhood is pleased now that he is replacing the columns with wood.

MOTION BY BUSBY AND SECOND BY MCADAMS TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

Ft. Sanders NC-1

1400 Laurel Avenue – Michael Harding – (Owner/Applicant) – Certificate No. 10710FTS

Work Description

Applicant wishes to extend the height of the southeast corner of the three-story frame residential structure. Exterior of addition will be clad in vinyl siding consistent with the siding on the remainder of the building. Remove exterior wooden access stair. Install replacement windows which duplicate the size of the existing building, with grids dividing the windows into a nine over nine pattern. Install new entry door, also with gridded half view window.

Staff Recommendation

APPROVE Certificate No. 10710FTS, with modification of proposed grid pattern so the resulting window design and half-view door design are not gridded into smaller segments.

Additional Comments

Proposed height increase is located atop a one story enclosed addition which is on the rear and east side of the building. Removal of wooden access stair is complimentary to the overall building design. The removal of the grids in the windows and door will result in a one over one window design and half-view design in the door more appropriate to the building's Queen Anne design.

Bennett stated that the motion should be to approve the proposal but ask that the applied grids be omitted.

Michael Harding, 2718 Painter Avenue, talked to the owner about the windows, and they are willing to omit the applied grids. Bolen stated that the drawing leaves off the 2nd story window over the front door. Harding stated they will install the window there.

MOTION BY EID AND SECOND BY BOLEN TO APPROVE ONE OVER ONE WINDOWS WITHOUT GRIDS AND TO ADD A SECOND STORY WINDOW ABOVE THE FRONT ENTRY, RATHER THAN WHAT IS SHOWN IN THE SUBMITTED DRAWING. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

General

300 Main Street – Jayne Burritt, Public Building Authority (Applicant), Knox County Government (Owner) – Certificate No. 10710GEN

Work Description

Applicant is requesting approval to replace all wood windows in building with metal clad windows that replicate in dimension, size and design the deteriorated wood windows now found on the building.

Replace severely deteriorated windows of various dates with exact size and profile duplicate of existing historic windows that is a painted surface, aluminum clad window. Replacement window will duplicate the oldest generation of windows in building, replacing sashes and frame, retaining brick surround and marble trim on exterior. Interior trim and/or finish surrounding windows will not be altered and interior of sash will be stained or finished wood. Transoms will be replaced with stained glass color matched to original stained glass transoms, and will also substitute for original stained glass transoms that have been altered with new clear glass; replacement transoms will have exterior metal clad grids, interior wood grids, and internal grids to provide a visual duplication of existing windows; heavy pulls on exterior of windows will be reused or replicated; lugs or dog ears on bottom of top sashes will be replicated. New windows will incorporate energy saving features and will be in better condition and easily maintained.

Staff Recommendation

DENY Certificate No. 10710GEN. Proposed replacement window top and bottom rails and meeting rail are noticeably inconsistent in size with the original window.

Additional Comments

The Public Building Authority understands the concerns expressed over the sizes of the bottom rail, top rail and meeting rail in the installed sample window, and the resulting reduction in size of the glass panes. They are in consultation with the window supplier, Marvin Windows, to determine if those elements can be made consistent with the original window, and will reapply for consideration if that is achieved.

Bennett stated that a window has been installed. She checked with PBA, and it is not appropriate and did not look like the original. She told PBA she could not write a positive staff report. They are working with the window manufacturer to correct it. Bennett is recommending denial.

Jayne Burnett, PBA, 300 Main Street, stated that they appreciate what the Historic Zoning Commission does. They are looking at energy saving windows to reduce maintenance costs. Each window will cost \$6,000 to replace. There is no funding to maintain the old windows. The aluminum clad would not require the maintenance that wood windows do. There are different windows all over the building. She showed pictures of the window that has been installed.

Andie Ray stated that the old windows have not been maintained and asked when they were painted last. Ms. Burnett stated that have checked on the cost \$5,800 per window to refurbish each window and it would be \$5,800. PBA did not maintain the windows for the last two years because they were planning to replace them.

Carol Montgomery stated that every window would not need that much refurbishment. Storm windows could be added on the inside. Ms. Burnett stated that condensation would be a problem if they were installed on the inside.

Whetsel stated that the commission requested a quote to replace the windows with wood, and the commission does not have that figure.

Bolen stated that the commission has already approved the concept of metal clad windows if it was appropriate and has true divided lights and sashes. Bennett stated it should be worded, "A metal clad window can be used if the windows replicate the existing windows and the distributor would come back with a sample replacement." Ms. Burnett stated that the windows are different, and the stained glass is not even the same for each window. Gresham asked how they are going to pick the window to use. Bennett responded that it is difficult to decide which window is the original. Ms. Burnett stated that they want to salvage the windows and give them to Knox Heritage.

Mike St. John with Marvin Windows, 7580 Thunder Lane, stated that the window they installed did not match as well as they thought it would. They considered the budget. They will redesign the window. They can match the window more closely than the one that was installed. He described the dimensions and how they can be measured.

Kim Trent, 112 S. Gay Street, President of Knox Heritage, thanked Ms. Burnett for the tour of the Old Court House and stated Knox Heritage understands the goals PBA has set. She stated that we are dealing with a national issue. She asked if there is a cost effective way to maintain the historic fabric of the windows. They want PBA to achieve their goal and have energy efficient windows. She suggested getting a new bid. She would like to see them maintained.

Bennett would like the commission to say what they want concerning, sashes, side rails, etc. Marvin Windows wants to go forward after this meeting. Busby stated that the commission is trying to match what we approved. Mr. St. John stated the original window they took out is also different from the window next to it. There was a huge cost to make the sample window.

Eid stated that a standard size needs to be developed. Bennett asked about the height of the check rail. Mr. St. John stated that they would like to do shop drawings and show the dimensions.

MOTION BY EID AND SECOND BY MCADAMS TO ACCEPT SHOP DRAWINGS SHOWING THE SURROUNDING CONTEXT. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

Eid stated he would like to look into what Knox Heritage could do with the old windows. Whetsel would like the true divided light addressed. Mr. St. John responded that in the window manufacturing that is something they cannot do. Simulated divided lights are acceptable for historic purposes.

MOTION BY BUSBY AND SECOND BY BOLEN TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION WHICH IS TO DENY WITHOUT PREJUDICE. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

Other Business

- Endorsement of Murphy House, 4508 Murphy Road, as a historic structure

The Hugh Murphy House, located at 4508 Murphy Road, was built c. 1841 in the Gothic Revival style. The house is significant for its architectural detailing and construction, including original stained glass sidelights and sawn wood trim, for its association with the Murphy family, which began with Hugh's father Robert Murphy settling in Grassy Valley in 1797, and for its prominent location as the focal point of surrounding agricultural land and outbuildings. A recent rehabilitation and restoration by the new owner and member of the fifth generation of Murphy's to occupy the land has added to that significance.

The Knoxville and Knox County Historic Zoning Commissions has been consulting with the current owner, Kevin Murphy, as he has pursued the house's restoration and rehabilitation. The significance of the house and its setting have prompted both the historic commissions to request every consideration directed at preserving the house and its setting, so that future citizens can understand the prominence and evolution of this significant farmstead.

Bennett stated that his house is in the county, but there is city zoning that will be changing nearby. It has come before MPC to seek a local overlay and national register designation.

Kevin Murphy, 4508 Murphy Road, thanked Bennett for her help in talking to the family and telling them the significance of the house and its architecture. He has restored the house and will file for a national register nomination. He will extend the total to 220 acres. He wants to restrict light and the character of anything built around it. He would estimate for the local designation there would be two acres.

MOTION BY COTHAM AND SECOND BY CLAUSSEN TO APPROVE A RESOLUTION TO SEEK A LOCAL OVERLAY AND NATIONAL REGISTER DESIGNATION FOR 4508 MURPHY ROAD. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

- Election of Officers for city and county commissioners

Gresham asked for a motion to elect a chair for the county.

MOTION BY COTHAM AND SECOND BY CLAUSSEN TO NOMINATE GRESHAM AS CHAIR. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

MOTION TO ELECT COTHAM VICE CHAIR ADOPTED UNANIMOUSLY.

Whetsel asked for nominations for Chair for the Knoxville Historic Zoning Commission.

MOTION BY RAY AND SECOND BY BUSBY TO NOMINATE WHETSEL AS CHAIR. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

MOTION BY WHETSEL TO NOMINATE MCADAMS FOR VICE CHAIR. McAdams declined, saying did not have enough experience to become Vice Chair. There was no second.

MOTION BY MCADAMS AND SECOND BY EID TO NOMINATE BUSBY AS VICE CHAIR. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

The next meeting of the Knoxville and Knox County Historic Zoning Commissions will be held on February 18, at 8:30 a.m. in the Small Assembly Room of the City-County Building.

There being no other business, the meeting was adjourned.