

**MINUTES
KNOXVILLE HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION
KNOX COUNTY HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION
MEETING OF FEBRUARY 18, 2010**

City HZC Present

Sean Bolen
Scott Busby
Faris Eid
Melissa McAdams
Sandra Martin
Finbarr Saunders
Melynda Whetsel

Members Absent:

Andie Ray (ex.)

County HZC Present

Linda Claussen
Steve Cotham
Charles Faulkner
Kenneth Gresham
Carol Montgomery

Members Absent:

Others Present:

Sharon Boyce
Josh Wright
Daniel Schuh
Arin Streeter
Brian Pittman
David Arning
Rick Burnett
Justin Nicolas
James Pierce
Jamie Rowe
Erin Burns
Brandon Blevins
Ann Bennett
Charlotte West

Chair Melynda Whetsel called the meeting to order and reminded members regarding conflicts of interest.

Approval of Minutes – January 21, 2010, meeting

**MOTION BY EID AND SECOND BY MONTGOMERY TO APPROVE THE
JANUARY 21 MINUTES. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.**

Staff Report (Level I Certificates): Ann Bennett

726 Deery Street - 4th & Gill H-1 - Josh Wright (Applicant) – Certificate No. 126104&G - Repair or replace gutter system, as necessary.

806 Deery Street - 4th & Gill H-1 - David Kerns - 112104&G (Applicant) - Rebuilding collapsing foundation at rear corner, using Preservation Brief No. 2 with low Portland-content mortar.

1008 Luttrell Street - 4th & Gill H-1 - Gil Negendank - 128104&G (Applicant) - Repair or replace porch floor in kind, as necessary, removing columns to repair structure and reinstalling columns after repairs. Replace or repair front porch roof, as necessary.

1415 Fremont Place - Old North Knoxville H-1 - Daniel Schuh (Applicant) – Certificate No. 11910ONKA - Remove artificial siding and repair wood siding and trim in kind as necessary; repair and repoint masonry, using provisions of Preservation Brief No. 2, repair porch ceiling, floor and railings; replace roof if necessary, using asphalt shingles; repair or install gutters.

1421 Fremont Place - Old North Knoxville H-1 - Daniel Schuh (Applicant) – Certificate No. 11910ONKB - Repair siding, fascia, soffit & trim; repair masonry, using Preservation No. 2' reroof, using asphalt shingles; repair porch ceiling and floor in kind as necessary; install or repair gutters.

409 E. Oklahoma Avenue - Old North Knoxville H-1 - Steve Finnigan (Applicant) – Certificate No. 12510ONK - Remove fiber cement shingle siding and replace with wood lap siding with approximate 4" reveal, installing corner boards, window and door trim and skirt board, if necessary; Repair or replace gutters and downspouts; replace front door with halfview glass door.

NOTE: Applicant understands that some window replacement will be necessary, and a redesign of the front gable opening is called for. An additional application will be made to answer those concerns.

1726 Washington Avenue - Edgewood-Park City H-1 – Mike Anderson (Applicant) Certificate No. 11110EDG Repair or replace wood siding and trim in kind as necessary; repair masonry using Preservation Brief No. 2 (low Portland-content mortar); replace roofing in kind, making any necessary repairs to roof decking and using dark shade of asphalt shingles.

Certificates of Appropriateness

KNOXVILLE HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION

Fourth & Gill H-1

726 Deery Street - Josh Wright (Owner/Applicant) – Certificate No. 126104&G

Work Description

Replace second story windows in front and rear elevation, which are now storm windows only, with wood double hung one over one windows. Replace asphalt shingle roof with asphalt shingles, flashing chimney and making deck repairs as necessary. An alternative roof covering might be a metal roof with a galvalume finish.

NOTE: Owner also intends to rebuild the front porch columns and balustrade and make any necessary repairs to the decking and ceiling; the final design has not been drawn for the replacement of the front porch. The owner understands that he must seek the approval of the Knoxville Historic Zoning Commission before proceeding with work on the front porch.

Staff Recommendation

APPROVE Certificate No. 126104&G.

Additional Comments

Proposed window replacement is consistent with adopted Fourth & Gill Design Guidelines. (Windows, pg. 11, 1-4) Replacement with metal roofs is also specifically discussed in the adopted design guidelines under Roofs, pg. 9-10, #4.

Arin Streeter, 120 S. Gay Street, the neighborhood does not object to his plans.

Carol Montgomery stated she has put galvalume on a house, and it reflects the heat very well.

MOTION BY SAUNDERS AND SECOND BY MARTIN TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

Old North Knoxville H-1

1415 Fremont - Daniel Schuh/ Knoxville Preservation & Development LLC (Owner/Applicant)
– Certificate No. 11910ONKA

Work Description

Replace inappropriate replacement windows with appropriately sized one over one double hung wood windows.

Staff Recommendation

APPROVE Certificate No. 11910ONKA. Proposed work is consistent with adopted Old North Knoxville Design Guidelines.

Additional Comments

See Design Guidelines, Windows (B-22), Pg. 15; Wall covering (E), Pg. 20-21; Masonry (F), pg. 23-25; Roofs (A), pg. 13-14.

Daniel Schuh, 230 E. Oklahoma, stated that half the windows are covered over. This is a triplex.

James Pierce, 122 Leonard Place, the neighborhood agrees with his plans and appreciates what they are doing for the Old North Knoxville neighborhood.

MOTION BY EID AND SECOND BY BUSBY TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

General

625 W. Hill Avenue – Brian Pittman (Owner/Applicant) – Certificate No. 12810GEN

Work Description

Approve application for a subdivision to formally place the Mary Boyce Temple House and its one story concrete Art deco addition on separate lots, recognizing the architectural integrity of each and acknowledging that the current buildings are both contributing in the Hill Avenue H-1 Historic Overlay, regardless of how the lot size and the location of the buildings may disagree with current subdivision and zoning requirements.

Staff Recommendation

APPROVE Certificate No. 12810GEN. Proposed subdivision serves to recognize legally the existing disparity in age and design of the existing buildings.

Additional Comments

Although 619 W. Hill Avenue was constructed to function with the Mary Boyce Temple House, it was built nearly fifty years later and its design and construction materials reflect a far different design era. The owner has rehabbed 619 W. Hill Avenue successfully, and wishes to recognize legally the differences in the two buildings; this approach also improves the buildings' positions as collateral for lending that will enable him to complete the rehab of the Mary Boyce Temple House, which is well underway.

Bennett stated that the commission has already approved the certificate. When he bought it he also bought a one-story house next door. He wants to separate the houses and subdivide the two properties. Bennett was not sure it is appropriate to separate the two lots. The Mary Boyce house was built in 1907 and the smaller house built in 1950.

Brian Pittman, 623 W. Hill Avenue, stated that the houses are completely different. The little house is finished, but he cannot finish the Temple house. The bank cannot loan him any more money until the properties are separated.

MOTION BY BUSBY AND SECOND BY MARTIN TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

447 N. Broadway – David Arning/Southeastern Housing Foundation (Representative)
(Owner/Applicant) – Certificate No. 12210GEN

Work Description

PROJECTED COMPLETION DATE: Fall, 2010

NOTE: To assist in describing the two sections of the buildings Allan Associates Architects PLLC has used the terms Building A and Building B. Building A is the portion of the building facing North Broadway. Building B is the portion of the building facing West Fifth Avenue.

Façade: Brick façade will be cleaned and repaired in accordance with the recommendations of the National Park Service's Preservation Briefs; the brick will be repainted. Due to possible damage to the original brick façade, stuccoed portions of the façade will be cleaned and repainted. Existing windows will be restored; missing windows will be replaced with compatible new windows. One non-original window opening in the east end projecting bay of Building B will be removed and the opening filled in with brick and mortar to match that of the adjacent wall. Missing stone sills will be replaced. Metal cornice will be cleaned, repaired and repainted.

Porches: Brick piers will be repaired as described in the section on Brick Façade. Wood ceiling, brackets and cornice features will be repaired and replaced where missing; porch flooring will be replaced in kind. Enough molding and trim remain to replicate the missing portions.

Building A: the original porch floors and floor structure were removed in the 1960s to create a common lobby for both buildings at a new elevation between the basement and first floor. Much of the original porch material remains above the floor level. Because the first floor of Building

A will be used as the main and accessible entrance to both buildings, no aspect of these porch floors are planned to be restored. Instead, a concrete porch floor will be installed at the level of the original building floor. This new porch floor will be linked with a new ramp to provide an accessible entrance to both buildings and a single set of concrete steps and brick wing walls with brick caps will be built at one end.

Building B: These front porches will have their original floors restored in elevation and material, with the following exception. There are two sets of concrete steps and brick wing walls with concrete caps which we propose to leave in place. Three of these porch floors have been raised a few inches; we propose to return these to their original level and wood flooring. The floor of Building B is at one level and the porches of Building B were originally all at another level a few inches below the building floor level. New concrete steps and brick wing walls with brick caps will be provided from the sidewalk to the porches.

While we possess physical evidence of most of the various architectural elements of the front porches, no portions of the porch railings exist. We have been unable to locate any historic photos of the building. The only evidence we have of porch railing is the shadow on the brick piers. There is an 'over paint' shadow of the vertical board which the rail abutted. That shadow confirms the existence of a rail and its height. Our proposed rail is intended to suggest a simple and compatible reference to a historic wood porch rail without creating a false sense of history by using an elaborately turned spindle for which we have no documentation on these buildings.

Additions: Buildings A and B will be linked by a corridor and elevator core. This addition will be recessed away from the North Broadway façade to reduce visual impact. The painted brick addition will echo the simplicity of the existing building and will be compatible in scale, size, material and color of the historic building.

A new exit stair will be built behind the Building B near Queen Street in order to have a low visual impact upon the structure. The stair will be accessed via covered open air corridors placed in an area that would have originally been a recessed area between two townhouses. The painted brick addition will echo the simplicity of the existing building and will be compatible in scale, size, material and color of the historic building.

A new stair will be built behind Building A to meet exiting requirements with a low visual impact upon the structure. The stair will be placed in an area that would have originally been a recessed area between two townhouses. The addition will echo the simplicity of the existing building and will be compatible in scale, size, material and color of the historic building.

Demolition: Existing non original concrete and metal stairs will be removed. Additionally, on the rear of Building A, one of the original recessed exterior areas that would have been between two individual townhouses has been filled in with an enclosed addition. The enclosure closes off the originally open end of this area with a wood frame wall and clad with stucco. This frame addition, porch roof and concrete steps will be removed in order to return back of this portion of Building A to its original appearance.

Site

The entire rear area will be fenced with a 72 inch ornamental metal fence to provide security. The Building B (West Fifth Avenue) façade will receive a 42-48 inch ornamental metal fence and gates between the porches and city sidewalk and will tie to the existing chain link fence along the south border of the property.

Staff Recommendation

APPROVE Certificate No. 12210GEN. Proposed work has begun under authorization in Certificate No. 40208GEN, but will not be completed prior to expiration of that Certificate, making securing another Certificate necessary.

Bennett stated that this is the same application that was approved earlier. The applicant wants to extend the certificate until 2012. The fencing is all that has changed.

David Arning, 901 E. Summit Hill Drive, stated that the renovation was started last September, and they expect to have it completed by October 2010.

MOTION BY SAUNDERS AND SECOND BY MARTIN TO EXTEND THE APPLICATION UNTIL 2012. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

Market Square H-1

9 Market Square – Rick Burnett, Signco, Inc. (Contractor) – Certificate No. 20410MKT

Work Description

Install hanging sign at second story level with four rectangular panels, each 10" x 40", incorporating signage for four commercial tenants in the building. Area of each panel: 2.8 sq. ft.

Staff Recommendation

APPROVE Certificate No. 20410MKT because it creates a reduction in the total area of signs for the building.

Additional Comments

The sign provisions for Market Square call for a maximum size for each tenant's sign of 4 to 6 sq. ft. (IID -2). However, the applicant intends to incorporate signage for four tenants into one sign, with each panel size of approximately 2.8 sq. ft., which is less than that allowed for each tenant under the design guidelines. The maximum signage under the guidelines would be 24 sq. ft.; under this proposal the total area of four signs would be 11.2 sq. ft., considerably less than the signage area if each tenant had individual signs.

Bennett stated that the applicant wants all four business names on the same sign. She was reluctant to approve the certificate without commission approval because this is a different from any other sign on the mall.

Rick Burnett, 3101 W. Park Drive, stated he wants 4.44 sq. ft. per panel. The banner sign will be removed, and this will replace it and identify all four tenants.

MOTION BY MARTIN AND SECOND BY BUSBY TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

16 Market Square – Justin Nicholas (Owner/Applicant) – Certificate No. 12810MKT

Work Description

Install canvas awning; install portable fencing; install sign; install steel doors with full view glass painted to look like wood; clean masonry using Preservation Brief No. 2.

Staff Recommendation

APPROVE Certificate No. 12810MKT. The proposed alterations are consistent with the adopted design guidelines for Market Square; the fencing is not attached to the building and is not considered a permanent improvement.

Additional Comments

The proposed awning is a shelf awning in the appropriate location (E-1 through 4); signage will be located in the space above the storefront and below the second story windows as provided in the adopted design guidelines (D1).

Justin Nicolas, 18 Market Square, make the front entrance doors more durable.

MOTION BY EID AND SECOND BY MARTIN TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

Designation

1716 Emoriland Boulevard

Recommend approval to go to MPC and City Council to change the zoning map.

Steve Cotham stated that the house is owned by his brother and was one of the first houses in the neighborhood. He told about the history of the house. It has been lived in and owned by only two families and everything is original.

MOTION BY EID AND SECOND BY SAUNDERS TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION TO SEND THE DESIGNATION TO MPC.

Other Business

Discussion of Draft Solar Guidelines for Historic Districts.

Bennett stated that we are preparing guidelines to take to the historic districts. We wanted people to know where they would be placed and what they would look like and the use requirements. If someone has a concrete tile roof or slate, there are solar applications that mimic the shape and

size. Erin Burns with the City of Knoxville and Brandon Blevins, Southern Alliance, 117 S. Gay Street are here to discuss solar panels. Mr. Blevins stated that turbines should not be used because the vibrations of any type of turbines are too much for a historic building. A solar panel is the best.

Busby asked if each neighborhood has to adopt guidelines to go into one guideline. Bennett replied they do. He suggested the use of pictures as a guide so the commission can look at them if they have to approve an application. There would be one guideline for all districts. Bolen asked if this is going to be an open meeting. Bennett will go to the neighborhood meetings and will have a combined meeting for all districts. Whetsel stated she would like to hear from the neighborhoods before it comes to the commission and goes to City Council. The neighborhood representatives would like to have a combined meeting. Bolen asked if a neighborhood wanted to have their separate guidelines could they do that. Whetsel stated they could if they wanted to. Bennett replied that she would like to see all the neighborhoods approve these guidelines. Whetsel asked about mature trees on historic property. Bennett stated the solar equipment would have to be installed away from trees. Mature landscaping should not be obliterated to install solar.

Sharon Boyce stated that public right-of-way should be changed to streets.

MOTION BY MONTGOMERY AND SECOND BY CLAUSSEN TO REDRAFT THE SOLAR GUIDELINES AND PROCEED WITH THE PROCESS. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

The next meeting of the Knoxville and Knox County Historic Zoning Commissions will be held on March 18, at 8:30 a.m. in the Small Assembly Room of the City-County Building.