

MINUTES
KNOXVILLE HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION
KNOX COUNTY HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION
MEETING OF AUGUST 19, 2010

City HZC Present

Sean Bolen
Scott Busby
Melissa McAdams
Andie Ray
Finbarr Saunders
Melynda Whetsel

Members Absent:

Faris Eid (ex.)
Sandra Martin (ex.)

County HZC Present

Charles Faulkner
Kenneth Gresham
Carol Montgomery

Members Absent:

Linda Claussen (ex.)
Steve Cotham (ex.)

Others Present:

Sharon Boyce
Arin Streeter
Brian Pittman
David Linge
Brett Honeycutt
Holly Cook
Ann Bennett
Charlotte West

Chair Melynda Whetsel called the meeting to order and reminded members regarding conflicts of interest. Whetsel stated that she and Ann Bennett met with Gary Norman, Tom Reynolds, Sharon Boyce, Bob Whetsel, and neighborhood representatives regarding issues of non-compliance. The procedure for noncompliance was clarified.

MOTION BY SAUNDERS AND SECOND BY BUSBY TO APPROVE THE JULY 15 MINUTES. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

Staff Report (Level I Certificates): Ann Bennett

409 W. Glenwood Avenue - Old North Knoxville H-1 - Laurence Eaton – Certificate No. 1910ONK-Repair or replace in kind fascia, soffit and trim as necessary; clean and repoint masonry as needed using Preservation Brief #2; repair wall where door for duplex was cut, using matching brick.

2003 Washington Avenue - Edgewood-Park City H-1 - Cynthia Stancil – Certificate No. 80210EDG - Replace tongue in groove porch flooring in kind, as necessary.

Certificates of Appropriateness

KNOXVILLE HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION

Whetsel recused herself and Vice Chair Busby presided.

Fourth and Gill H-1

1015 Luttrell Street – Bob Whetsel (Applicant/Owner) – Certificate No. 806104&G

Work Description

Enlarge rear stoop, using identical decking and railing. Current stoop is 5' long 7' wide. Enlarged stoop will use same 7' depth but increase length to 15', with squared 2x2 spindles set into top and bottom rails on 4-5" centers and supported by seven 6"x6" posts with lattice work screening below the extension.

Staff Recommendation

APPROVE Certificate No. 806104&G. Proposed porch addition is at rear of structure, not visible from Gill, although it is visible from other points.

Additional Comments

Adopted design guidelines do not address rear porches, but do (pg.18, #4) call for additions to be on non character-defining elevations, which describes the rear elevation.

Whetsel distributed drawings of the stoop.

Arin Streeter, 120 S. Gay Street, representing the 4th & Gill Neighborhood, stated it meets the guidelines.

MOTION BY SAUNDERS AND SECOND BY BOLEN TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

Whetsel assumed the chair.

Luttrell Street - Tax ID 94 DJ 00701 – Holrob Residential, LLC (Applicant/Owner) – Certificate No. 803104&G

Work Description

Construct new residential building on vacant lot. One and one-half story frame with wood weatherboard wall covering, cross gable roof, shingled, with imbricated shingles in inset front corner under patterned bargeboard, side through roof dormer with imbricated shingles and sawn wood attic vent on south elevation and gabled dormer with paired one light casements on north elevation, octagonal turret and bay on northeast corner, octagonal two story bay on south elevation with bellcast at bottom of second story with imbricated shingles and weatherboard on first story with central one pane horizontal window between one over one windows on first story, one story wrap around front and side porch with patterned porch columns and central, gabled portico with bracing inset in roof and patterned bargeboard, one over one wood windows and single light casement windows with dressed top and bottom treatment, stained glass window below oriel on front elevation to left of entry door with curlinear bottom braces with pendants

and ox-eye window with applied keystones to right of front entry, one light front entry door with recessed bottom panel and transom, interior central brick chimney with corbelling, wood tongue in groove flooring on front porch, single light rear entry door with recessed panel, transom, and shed roof over stoop.

Foundation height: 2'

First story height: 9'

Second story height: 9'

Top of building height: approximately 45'

Staff Recommendation

APPROVE Certificate No. 803104&G. Proposed new structure is consistent in design with existing buildings in Fourth and Gill, and with the design guidelines. The height, building materials, and overall shape are appropriate.

Additional Comments

Residential development at this degree of appropriateness will greatly enhance the residential character of this southernmost block in the 4th & Gill Historic District, and assist in creating a strong residential edge.

Brian Pittman distributed new drawings of the house. They hope to sell it before it is finished and will let the new owner make some of the decisions.

Brian Pittman, 623 W. Hill Avenue, stated that if the front porch wraps around to the back porch, the rear porch will be smaller. The shed will resemble the house. The house will have on-street parking.

Bolen asked if all the windows are going to be wood, and Mr. Pittman responded they are.

MOTION BY BOLEN AND SECOND BY SAUNDERS TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION AS PRESENTED, INCLUDING THE GABLE AND THE SHED. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

Bennett noted that the submitted drawing showed a shed at the rear of the lot, for which drawings were not received. Pittman explained that the shed would only be built if the eventual purchaser wanted it, and that the drawing had not been completed for it. The Commission explained that while they did not think their approval was necessary, since the shed would be located at the rear of the lot, they did think it was necessary to have the drawing in the file. They asked Pittman to submit a drawing of the shed to Bennett, and asked that she distribute it to them, but indicated they would not take action on it.

929 Eleanor Street – David Linge, Owner/Applicant, Certificate No. 812104&G

Work Description

Construct 8x8 shed, gable roofed with metal roof and wood siding on slab foundation. Wood double hung window, metal covered paneled door with glass half-view window. This shed is at a rear corner of the lot, and due to the privacy fence in the applicant's rear yard, only the tip of the roof is visible. The roof matches the primary structure on the lot and the siding has been carefully selected to color match the artificial siding on the primary structure.

Staff Recommendation

APPROVE Certificate No. 812104&G. Proposed shed is consistent with design guidelines as they call for small work buildings that mimic the roof lines and building materials present in the original building; the shed is also located in the rear yard.

Additional Comments

Applicant mistakenly began construction of this building without approvals; however, the design of the building and the proposed materials are consistent with the adopted design guidelines.

Arin Streeter stated that the proposed shed meets the guidelines, and the neighborhood has no objections.

MOTION BY SAUNDERS AND SECOND BY BUSBY TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

Market Square H-1

28 Market Square – Brett Honeycutt (Applicant) - Bernadette West (Owner) – Certificate No. 80510MKT

Work Description

Add penthouse stair enclosure to rear of roof using Hardiplank lap siding with 4" reveal and plank trim, with shed roof. Remove and relocate rear door and add steps to access building, removing recess, not visible from front of building.

Staff Recommendation

APPROVE Certificate No. 80510MKT. The proposed alteration is necessary to enable use of the second floor space, and the rooftop penthouse will sit at the rear of the building, and will not be visible from Market Square.

Brett Honeycutt, 8000 Benington Drive, is the applicant. Busby asked him why the penthouse is being added. He responded it is for solar panels, access to the air conditioning and maybe an option to use as a deck. They will be moving the rear door. Andie Ray stated she would have a concern about patrons being on the roof.

Bennett presented a design for wrought iron grills in the form of four treble clef signs, squared and joined to form the grill. These grills would be placed on the second story windows, in order to allow safe use of the second story space and avoid the necessity of altering the windows.

MOTION BY BUSBY AND SECOND BY SAUNDERS TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION WITH THE ADDITION OF THE DECORATIVE GRILLS ON THE SECOND STORY FRONT WINDOWS. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

29 Market Square – Scott Schimmel (Applicant) – Segundo Properties, LLC (Owner) – Certificate No. 70910MKT

Work Description

Install sign in signboard area, 2'x8'.

Staff Recommendation

APPROVE. Proposed sign is 2'x8-1/2' signboard, painted, with raised graphics; work is consistent with approved design guidelines. Proposed sign replaces a banner that currently indicates the business location.

John Craig, 12226 Brighton Court, stated that the Market Square Association approves of the sign.

MOTION BY BUSBY AND SECOND BY BOLEN TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

Fairmont-Emoriland NC-1

1900 Emoriland Boulevard - Arnold Perry (Applicant) - Gaynell Thomas (Owner) – Certificate No. 80410FEM

Work Description

Changing tile roof to metal roof. No other work is required.

Staff Recommendation

APPROVE Certificate No. 80410FEM. The adopted design guidelines for Fairmont Park do not address roof coverings, particularly when they are applied on existing roofs.

Additional Comments

Roof form is addressed, but in this application the roof form is not being altered. Although the existing roof tiles are historic materials, and appropriate, there is no basis in the adopted design guidelines for addressing altered roof coverings.

Steve Cotham told Bennett previously that the neighborhood understands there is no design guideline possible to address roof materials under NC-1 designation, and noted that several other tile roofs have been replaced with metal roofing.

MOTION BY BOLEN AND SECOND BY SAUNDERS TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

Edgewood-Park City H-1

2032 Jefferson Avenue – Emily Hall (Applicant/Owner) – Certificate No. 80510EDG

Work Description

Construct 6x8 storage shed to be located at the back left corner of the lot. Wood siding painted to match main house, asphalt shingles. Optional window is a slider window that can be omitted.

Staff Recommendation

APPROVE Certificate No. 80510EDG. Proposed storage shed is small, at rear corner and so not apparent from Jefferson, and consistent with provisions (see pg. 28, Edgewood Park City Design Guidelines) that provide for similar materials.

MOTION BY BOLEN AND SECOND BY RAY TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION WITH THE OMISSION OF THE WINDOW THAT WAS SHOWN ON THE DRAWING. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

Other Business

CLG Review: Minvilla, 447 N. Broadway

Holly Cook, 1300 N. Broadway, is the person who put this nomination together. It is being nominated for the National Register. She explained that the architect and builder are using tax credits. The building was built in 1913. This nomination is a draft, but requires only a few corrections, primarily grammatical and not substantive, to be complete. The building is still under construction. Bennett stated that as a certified local government, the Historic Zoning Commission is requested to review the application.

MOTION BY BOLEN AND SECOND BY SAUNDERS TO SUPPORT THE NOMINATION OF MINVILLA FOR THE NATIONAL REGISTER. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

Administrative Rules Revision

A memo from Bennett was included in the packet regarding two certificates that came up in the past. She issued the applicants Level 1 certificates. It was an administrative decision for 36 Market.

Bennett talked about a meeting regarding a fire escape at 6341 Middlebrook that she approved. She wants to know what the commission would like her to do and how much authority they want to give her.

Sharon Boyce stated that public notices and meetings delay the applicants. If there had been a discussion but no decision, she is uncomfortable with it. She correctly pointed out that staff did not have permission to approve Level 1 certificates in those two instances. She suggested amending the Administrative Rules of both commissions to allow for unusual instances when a Level 1 certificate could be called for.

Bennett stated that when a certificate is applied for, it must be heard within 30 days, and if not, it is approved anyway. There would have to be a called meeting if she cannot approve the certificate. The meeting must be advertised to allow time to meet the 12-day deadline. If there is a called meeting, the ad should be received by the newspaper 14 days before the meeting. There have always been some Level I applications that the Commissions have reviewed; this usually occurs when the design is acceptable, and is not a major alteration, but does change some aspect of the original design or is slightly different than the adopted design guidelines. For example, several of the signs on Market Square have been reviewed, although they are Level I applications, and although they were ultimately approved, because they differ from the language in the Market Square Design Guidelines. Additionally, the Commissions should consider that staging a second, called meeting for any month is problematic. It is difficult to find a meeting space, and difficult to accommodate the extra staff time required for the meeting and the extra time the Commissioners have to devote to the process; however, there have been called meetings in the past when that was necessary, and there will likely be called meetings in the future.

Saunders stated that we may have to have called meetings to approve exceptions to the rule. Bolen added that we would be weakening if we changed the rules. Busby does not have a problem with reissuing a certificate. McAdams is comfortable with Bennett approving Level 1 except for demolition.

MOTION BY BOLEN AND SECOND BY SAUNDERS TO DENY THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION TO REVISE THE ADMINISTRATIVE RULES. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

The next meeting of the Knoxville and Knox County Historic Zoning Commissions will be held on September 16, at 8:30 a.m., in the Small Assembly Room of the City-County Building.

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned.