

**MINUTES
KNOXVILLE HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION
KNOX COUNTY HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION
MEETING OF SEPTEMBER 17, 2009**

City HZC Present

Nic Arning
Sean Bolen
Scott Busby
Duane Grieve
Sandra Martin
Finbarr Saunders

County HZC Present

Steve Cotham
Charles Faulkner
Kenneth Gresham
Carol Montgomery

Others Present:

Tom Reynolds
Cynthia Stancil
Jamie Rowe
Scott Schimmel
John Craig
Ann Bennett
Charlotte West

Members Absent:

Melissa McAdams (ex.)
Melynda Whetsel (ex.)

Members Absent:

Linda Claussen

Vice Chair Nic Arning called the meeting to order and reminded members regarding conflicts of interest.

- Introduction of Visitors
- Approval of Minutes – August 18, 2009, meeting

MOTION BY GRIEVE AND SECOND BY FAULKNER TO APPROVE THE AUGUST 18 MINUTES. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

MOTION BY SAUNDERS AND SECOND BY MONTGOMERY TO APPROVE THE AUGUST 20 MINUTES. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

- Reports to Commission: Tom Reynolds, Sharon Boyce, Chair Melynda Whetsel
There were no reports.

- Staff Report (Level I Certificates): Ann Bennett

28 Market Square - Market Square H-1 - Bernadette West (Applicant) – Certificate No. 83109MKT -Install stylized metal grate on each of three second story windows.

24 Market Square - Market Square H-1 - Scott Schimmel (Applicant) – Certificate No. 90309MKT -Install 2’6” x 10’10” sign, arched from sides to center, in signboard space above storefront, indirectly lighted.

1131 Luttrell Street - 4th & Gill H-1 - Gaute Hagen (Applicant) – Certificate No. 813094&G - Replace leaking porch roof and repair railing.

1302 Luttrell Street - 4th & Gill H-1- Dwight Guinn & Barbara Simpson (Applicant) - 817094&G Repair porch columns, railing and repair siding and wood trim as necessary – all duplicating original design and in like materials.

706 Luttrell Street - 4th & Gill H-1 - Adam Scott (Applicant) – Certificate No. 821094&G - Repair porch structure, including floor, roof and ceiling, with original beadboard and tongue in groove floor; repair siding and trim in kind as necessary; repair gutters and fascia as necessary; replace roof with asphalt shingles; repair foundation as necessary.

801 Eleanor Street - 4th & Gill H-1 - John Gresham (Applicant) – Certificate No. 903094&G - Replace siding and corner trim, in kind.

1009 Tulip Avenue - Mechanicsville H-1- Larry Horton (Applicant) – Certificate No. 81209MEC -Replacement in kind for standard repairs to siding, soffits, facial and porch deck.

1537 Western Avenue - Mechanicsville H-1- John Huff, Dept. of Development (Applicant) – Certificate No. 90109MEC - Install new shelf-type awnings, front and side entrances; install soldier courses over front window; remove louvers on rear of building and brick in holes to match existing building; install hanging sign on front elevation; install brick planters in front, approximately 12" high.

2001 Washington Avenue - Edgewood-Park City - Cynthia Stancil (Applicant) – Certificate No. 90309EDG - Clean deteriorating existing stucco covering from brick foundation, where it remains; tuckpoint masonry using Preservation Brief No. 2.

2049 Washington Avenue - Edgewood-Park City - Todd Kennedy, Dept. of Community Development (Applicant) – Certificate No. 90309EDGA - Install new roofing and decking; repair fascia and rafter tails, leaving them exposed; repair stucco coating on chimney, using Preservation Brief No. 2 and lot-Portland contact mortar; install gutters and downspouts.

445 S. Gay Street – General - Wassco, Bryan Foster (Applicant) – Certificate No. 82809GEN - Repair masonry wall on rear (west) elevation; install permeable masonry coating – all in accordance with Preservation Brief No. 2 (Tammscoat)

- Certificates of Appropriateness

KNOXVILLE HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION

Market Square H-1

28 Market Square – Bernadette West, Square Dream LLC - (Applicant) – Certificate No. 83109MKT

Work Description

Install stylized metal grate on each of three second story windows.

Staff Recommendation

APPROVE Certificate No. 83109MKT. The proposed grill is in keeping with the character of the building, and will allow the applicant to satisfy a codes requirement for the interior height from the floor of the second story to the base of the window.

Additional Comments

The applicant has indicated a desire to use the second floor space of this building. She does not wish to alter the height of the windows, the bases of which are now close enough to the floor of the second story to cause safety code concerns. By installing the grates, those concerns can be addressed without altering the size of the windows.

Bennett stated that Ms. West had a design drawn that she showed her when she applied for the certificate, but she has not brought the drawing back to her.

MOTION BY BUSBY AND SECOND BY SAUNDERS TO DENY THE CERTIFICATE WITHOUT PREJUDICE UNTIL THE APPLICANT SUBMITS A DESIGN FOR THE COMMISSION TO CONSIDER. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

Arning thanked Cynthia Stancil, Jamie Rowe and John Craig for coming to the meeting as representatives from the neighborhoods.

24 Market – Scott Schimmel – (Applicant) - Certificate No. 90309MKT

Work Description

APPROVE Certificate No. 90309MKT. The proposed sign falls within the guidelines for signs contained in the Market Square Design Guidelines. The sign board, while not traditional in materials or their use, does occupy the sign board space.

Staff Recommendation

The use of non-traditional materials and design within the traditional framework reflects the current renaissance of Market Square, and the character of the building's retail occupant.

Scott Schimmel, 4215 Holston Hills Road, stated that the initial plan was to install just the sign itself. The rivets will not be that dramatic as shown in the picture. It would be a backdrop behind the sign. The Bliss sign will be made out of aluminum vinyl.

John Craig, President of the Market Square Association, 1226 Brighton Court, stated that the merchants like the sign.

Bennett stated that she is concerned about the exposed brick. Market Square has been allowing more contemporary signs. Dr. Faulkner asked if the mortar could be cleaned off. Bennett stated there had been a prism glass transom; it was removed and the area filled in with brick to become a sign board. The brick does not match in color and is unevenly laid. Mr. Craig stated that the

Market Square Association would like to see a more conservative approach to cover it. Bolen

stated that this is not a permanent addition to the building and fits the guidelines. Grieve added that the background could be done in a more conservative manner, and wants to see another design.

MOTION BY BUSBY AND SECOND BY GRIEVE TO APPROVE THE SIGN AND DENY THE BACKBOARD WITHOUT PREJUDICE. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

Other Business

The next meeting of the Knoxville and Knox County Historic Zoning Commissions will be held on October 15, at 8:30 a.m. in the Small Assembly Room of the City-County Building.

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned.