

**MINUTES
KNOXVILLE HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION
KNOX COUNTY HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION
MEETING OF NOVEMBER 19, 2009**

City HZC Present

Nic Arning
Sean Bolen
Duane Grieve
Melissa McAdams
Finbarr Saunders
Melynda Whetsel

Members Absent:

Sandra Martin (ex.)
Scott Busby (ex.)

County HZC Present

Linda Claussen
Steve Cotham
Charles Faulkner
Kenneth Gresham
Carol Montgomery

Members Absent:

Others Present:

Tom Reynolds
Cindy Stancil
Jamie Rowe
Larry Horton
Jared Brewster
David Kerns
James Pierce
Brian Pittman
Annette Anderson
Ann Bennett
Charlotte West

Chair Melynda Whetsel called the meeting to order and reminded members regarding conflicts of interest.

MOTION BY SAUNDERS AND SECOND BY MONTGOMERY TO APPROVE THE OCTOBER 15 MINUTES. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

- Report by Nic Arning: Arning was asked by the Commission, at the request of Tazewell Pike liaison, to confirm with David Amburn who lives at 4206 Tazewell Pike that he intended to remove an existing driveway. Amburn received a Certificate to add a separate garage and new driveway and agreed to remove the existing driveway. Arning stated Mr. Amburn was apologetic and stated that the cost has slowed down the project. He is still working on the garage and wants to leave the old driveway in place until he has the concrete poured, but intends to remove the old driveway, as he promised the neighbors. The house is currently for sale and if the house sells, the timing of the project may be moved up.
- Staff Report (Level I Certificates): Ann Bennett

1918 Jefferson Avenue - Edgewood-Park City H-1 - Dave Hooper/CAC (Applicant) – Certificate No. 100209EDG - Replace existing asphalt shingle roof with like materials.

2045 Washington Avenue - Edgewood-Park City H-1 - David Kerns (Applicant) – Certificate No. 100609EDG - Replace asphalt shingle roof with 3 tab asphalt shingles; repair or replace trim and wood siding in kind, if necessary; repair or replace wood porch floor with like material, as necessary; replace wood steps accessing front porch with wood steps in same design; repair side porch steps in kind.

309 E. Oklahoma Avenue - Old North Knoxville H-1 - Dan Hugh (Applicant/Owner) – Certificate No. 100909ONK - Replace siding in kind, as necessary; repair windows as necessary.

- Certificates of Appropriateness

KNOXVILLE HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION

Mechanicsville H-1

1009 Tulip Street - Larry Horton – Applicant/Owner – Certificate No. 101309MEC – Extend rear wall, west half of rear elevation, 2-3’; add rear porch behind addition, 4’ deep; alter rear shed roof to be gable end, shingled roof covering, wood siding, matching original house; repair brick front steps and concrete buttresses; install ridge vent in roof; install gutters and downspouts. (NOTE: Level 1 Certificate is in effect for exterior rehab – Certificate No. 81209MEC. This certificate is a supplement to that one.)

Staff Recommendation

APPROVE Certificate No. 101309MEC. Proposed change is located at the rear of the house, is not visible from Tulip Street, and is consistent in design with the existing house.

MOTION BY GRIEVE AND SECOND BY SAUNDERS TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

Old North Knoxville

1417 Cornelia – Jared Brewster – Applicant/Owner – Certificate No. 110309ONK – Retain front and side walls of existing fire-damaged structure and build new structure behind it.

Staff Recommendation

APPROVE Certificate No. 110309ONK, modifying corner boards to be 5-1/2” rather than 3-1/2”.

This applicant has been before the commission in the past. Bennett stated that the corner boards should be 5-1/2” instead of 3-1/2”. Bennett also noted that although the drawings indicated two over one windows, one over one would be appropriate for the style of the house; she would recommend the use of one over one windows as an option.

Jared Brewster, 1417 Cornelia, stated that he will use one over one windows and wants to add a window to the existing right elevation. Bennett noted that the removal of the artificial siding may remove other details on the façade that could include additional windows.

James Pierce, 122 Leonard Place, representing Old North Knoxville, stated that the neighborhood is pleased with the plans. There is a concern whether the shed dormers are in keeping with the Queen Anne style and would like to see a traditional gable.

David Kerns, 410 Locust Hill Lane, stated that the drawings have a more difficult roof than they had anticipated. Bennett noted that the house has had so many additions over time, and some of them are consistent with shed dormers.

Mr. Pierce stated that the neighborhood would approve the shed dormer; the siding on the walls of those dormers should be laid horizontally. Arning noted that the house is burned out, and he commended Mr. Brewster for saving the house. Bolen also commended Mr. Kerns and Mr. Brewster for their efforts in saving the house.

MOTION BY SAUNDERS AND SECOND BY MCADAMS TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION WITH THE ADDITION OF THE WINDOW ON THE WEST ELEVATION, 5-1/2 INCH CORNER BOARDS, HORIZONTALLY LAID SIDING ON THE DORMERS, AND ONE OVER ONE WINDOWS. THE MOTION WAS ADOPTED UNANIMOUSLY.

General

623 W. Hill Avenue – Brian Pittman – Applicant/Owner – Certificate No. 101208GEN – Remove dormer on east facing portion of roof. Dormer in question was added after the building's construction, and has Masonite shingle wall covering and six over six window that does not match the original windows in the remainder of the house.

Staff Recommendation

APPROVE Certificate No. 101209GEN. The removal of the non-historic dormer is consistent with the adopted standards.

Additional Comments

The east roof dormer is not historic; its removal restores the significant historic roof shape to the building.

Brian Pittman, 623 W. Hill, stated that the dormer was not original, and he would like to remove it.

MOTION BY SAUNDERS AND SECOND BY MCADAMS TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

Edgewood-Park City H-1

2036 Jefferson Avenue - David Grant – Applicant/Owner – Certificate No. 102209EDG – Replace windows, some of which are replacement windows and other of which are deteriorated, with wood double hung sash windows with three over one upper sashes.

Staff Recommendation

APPROVE Certificate No. 102209EDG. House was used for many years as a rental house, and replacement windows and storm windows that acted as windows in various locations. Proposed replacement windows are typical of design era of house.

Additional Comments

The adopted design guidelines require that, if replacement windows are necessary, they must be the same overall size as the original openings, with the same pane division and muntin style, width and profile (See pg. 17, Windows, #3, Edgewood Park City Design Guidelines) The windows proposed by the applicant are consistent with that requirement.

Cynthia Stancil, 2003 Washington Avenue, stated that the neighborhood is pleased with the work.

MOTION BY GRIEVE AND SECOND BY BOWEN TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

Other Business

Certified local government review of Hotpoint Living House, 809 West Hills Road.

Bennett stated that the Commission is being asked to comment on the general idea of whether the Hotpoint House, as a post-World War II type, has in the opinion of the Commission achieved significance and should be placed on the National Register, as well as the state of preservation of this particular property and of the significance of Bruce McCarty as the architect..

Annette Anderson, 509 West Hills Road, who owns the Hotpoint House, noted she has always been so impressed with the uniqueness of the house that she had determined to prepare a nomination for it as soon as it was fifty years old and eligible for Register listing. The house at 509 West Hills Road was used as a model for houses in other states, and was widely publicized as a model for single family homes of that era. Mr. McCarty is still working as an architect; Ms. Anderson would like to see this house design placed on the National Register. Saunders stated that last night Knox Heritage recognized a house that was designed by Gunnison in the same era. Grieve is pleased with the nomination and with the idea of continuing to move preservation forward in time to capture additional buildings that have recently achieved the fifty-year significance level.

MOTION BY GRIEVE AND SECOND BY SAUNDERS TO APPROVE NOMINATING 809 WEST HILLS ROAD FOR THE NATIONAL REGISTER. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

Discussion: Solar Energy Systems and Historic Design by Erin Burns, Sustainability Coordinator, City of Knoxville

Ms. Burns did a presentation regarding solar energy systems.

Carol Montgomery suggested that information regarding solar should be added in the neighborhood guidelines. Bennett stated she would like to work with Ms. Burns on solar guidelines that could be used in the neighborhoods. Generally, there should be a seminar with invitations issued to neighborhood representatives from the historic districts, with suggestions about additional sections for design guidelines that will sensitively treat the addition of solar panels and other alternative energy devices. Grieve asked about including provisions for a water source heat pump or a windmill. Whetsel is pleased to see the Commission working with neighborhood liaisons on including solar designs in their guidelines. Arning asked if the Commission was saying that an applicant could install plastic panels on their roof, but could not use vinyl siding or windows. Bennett responded that artificial siding damages historic siding, while the use of plastic panels on a roof are not being installed on a historic roof for the most part, because most of the roof coverings have been replaced and are not original. Grieve added that we have to look at new technologies.

Grieve reported that he has requested to resign from the Commission because of conflict of interest after being elected to City Council. He will stay on the Commission until the end of December.

Pierce invited everyone to the Old North Knoxville Home Tour on December 5-6. Twelve houses are on the tour.

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned.

The next meeting of the Knoxville and Knox County Historic Zoning Commissions will be held on December 17, at 8:30 a.m. in the Small Assembly Room of the City-County Building.